Supplementary Material

Virtual Reality and Collaborative Learning

A Systematic Literature Review

# Supplementary Data: Appendix A: List of all articles included

1. Abdullah, J., Mohd-Isa, W. N., & Samsudin, M. A. (2019). Virtual reality to improve group work skill and self-directed learning in problem-based learning narratives. Virtual Reality, 23(4), 461–471. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10055-019-00381-1
2. Al-Hatem, A. I., Masood, M., & Al-Samarraie, H. (2018). Fostering student nurses’ self-regulated learning with the Second Life environment: An empirical study. Journal of Information Technology Education: Research, 17, 285–307. https://doi.org/10.28945/4110
3. Allison, C., Miller, A., Sturgeon, T., Nicoll, J. R., & Perera, I. (2010). Educationally enhanced virtual worlds. Proceedings - Frontiers in Education Conference, FIE. https://doi.org/10.1109/FIE.2010.5673645
4. Andreoli, R., Corolla, A., Faggiano, A., Malandrino, D., Pirozzi, D., Ranaldi, M., Santangelo, G., & Scarano, V. (2017). A framework to design, develop, and evaluate immersive and collaborative serious games in cultural heritage. Journal on Computing and Cultural Heritage, 11(1), 1–22. https://doi.org/10.1145/3064644
5. Arlati, S., Colombo, V., Spoladore, D., Greci, L., Pedroli, E., Serino, S., Cipresso, P., Goulene, K., Stramba-Badiale, M., Riva, G., Gaggioli, A., Ferrigno, G., & Sacco, M. (2019). A social virtual reality-based application for the physical and cognitive training of the elderly at home. Sensors (Switzerland), 19(2). https://doi.org/10.3390/s19020261
6. Ashley, C., Kibbe, S., & Thornton, S. (2014). Experiential learning in second life: An application in retail management. Atlantic Marketing Journal, 3(2), 94–112.
7. Avanzato, R. (2018). Virtual technology to support student engagement and collaboration in online engineering courses. Computers in Education Journal, 9(4).
8. Aydogan, H., & Aras, F. (2019). Design, simulation and virtual implementation of a novel fundamental programmable logic controllers laboratory in a 3D virtual world. International Journal of Electrical Engineering Education. https://doi.org/10.1177/0020720919856249
9. Bani-Salameh, H., & Jeffery, C. (2015). Evaluating the Effect of 3D World Integration within a Social Software Environment. Proceedings - 12th International Conference on Information Technology: New Generations, ITNG 2015, 1, 255–260. https://doi.org/10.1109/ITNG.2015.47
10. Barmaki, R., Yu, K., Pearlman, R., Shingles, R., Bork, F., Osgood, G. M., & Navab, N. (2019). Enhancement of Anatomical Education Using Augmented Reality: An Empirical Study of Body Painting. Anatomical Sciences Education, 12(6), 599–609. https://doi.org/10.1002/ase.1858
11. Bilyatdinova, A., Karsakov, A., Bezgodov, A., & Dukhanov, A. (2016). Virtual environment for creative and collaborative learning. In Advances in Intelligent Systems and Computing (Vol. 416, pp. 371–381). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-27478-2\_26
12. Blas, N. Di, & Paolini, P. (2014). Multi-user virtual environments fostering collaboration in formal education. Educational Technology and Society, 17(1), 54–69.
13. Bluemink, J., Hämäläinen, R., Manninen, T., & Järvelä, S. (2010). Group-level analysis on multiplayer game collaboration: How do the individuals shape the group interaction? Interactive Learning Environments, 18(4), 365–383. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820802602444
14. Boese, M. J., Sheng, H., & Hall, R. (2008). Developing a grounded theory model on collaboration in learning. 14th Americas Conference on Information Systems, AMCIS 2008, 1, 156–166.
15. Bouta, H., & Retalis, S. (2013). Enhancing primary school children collaborative learning experiences in maths via a 3D virtual environment. Education and Information Technologies, 18(4), 571–596. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-012-9198-8
16. Bower, M., Lee, M. J. W., & Dalgarno, B. (2017). Collaborative learning across physical and virtual worlds: Factors supporting and constraining learners in a blended reality environment. British Journal of Educational Technology, 48(2), 407–430. https://doi.org/10.1111/bjet.12435
17. Brna, P., & Aspin, R. (1998). Collaboration in a virtual world: Support for conceptual learning? Education and Information Technologies, 3(3–4), 247–259. https://doi.org/10.1023/a:1009649631868
18. Cai, Y. (2014). 3D System for Learning Gains in the Lower Secondary Normal (Technical) Stream. 3D Immersive and Interactive Learning, 1–127. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-4021-90-6
19. Carron, T., Marty, J. C., Heraud, J. M., & France, L. (2007). Games as learning scenarios: Are you serious? European Conference on Games Based Learning, ECGBL 2007, 55–64.
20. Carron, T., Pernelle, P., & Talbot, S. (2013). Issues of learning games: From virtual to real. IADIS International Conference on Cognition and Exploratory Learning in Digital Age, CELDA 2013, October, 133–140.
21. Caruso, V., Hartley, M. D., & Mørch, A. I. (2015). End-user development in second life: Meta-design, Tailoring, and Appropriation. In Lecture Notes in Computer Science (including subseries Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence and Lecture Notes in Bioinformatics) (Vol. 9083, pp. 92–108). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-18425-8\_7
22. Champsas, I., Leftheris, I., Tsiatsos, T., Terzidou, T., & Mavridis, A. (2012). Open games: A framework for implementing 3D collaborative educational games in opensim. Proceedings of the European Conference on Games-Based Learning.
23. Chang, V., Gütl, C., Kopeinik, S., & Williams, R. (2009). Evaluation of collaborative learning settings in 3D virtual worlds. International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning, 4(SpecialIssue), 6–17. https://doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v4s3.1112
24. Chang, Y., Aziz, E. S. S., Zhang, Z., Zhang, M., & Esche, S. K. (2016). Usability evaluation of a virtual educational laboratory platform. Computers in Education Journal, 16(1), 24–36. https://doi.org/10.18260/p.24973
25. Chellali, A., Dumas, C., & Milleville, I. (2010). WYFIWIF: A haptic communication paradigm for collaborative motor skills learning. Proc. of the IADIS Int. Conf. - Computer Graphics, Visualization, Computer Vision and Image Processing, CGVCVIP 2010, Visual Commun., VC 2010, Web3DW 2010, Part of the MCCSIS 2010, 301–308.
26. Cheng, Y., & Ye, J. (2010). Exploring the social competence of students with autism spectrum conditions in a collaborative virtual learning environment - The pilot study. Computers and Education, 54(4), 1068–1077. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2009.10.011
27. Cheong, Y. G., Khaled, R., HolmgȦrd, C., & Yannakakis, G. N. (2015). Serious games for teaching conflict resolution: Modeling conflict dynamics. In Conflict and Multimodal Communication: Social Research and Machine Intelligence (pp. 449–475). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-14081-0\_21
28. Chheang, V., Saalfeld, P., Huber, T., Huettl, F., Kneist, W., Preim, B., & Hansen, C. (2019). An interactive demonstration of collaborative vr for laparoscopic liver surgery training. Proceedings - 2019 IEEE International Conference on Artificial Intelligence and Virtual Reality, AIVR 2019, 247–248. https://doi.org/10.1109/AIVR46125.2019.00055
29. Cho, Y., Park, K. S., Moher, T., Johnson, A. E., Chang, J., Whang, M. C., Lim, J. S., Rhee, D. W., Park, K. R., & Park, H. K. (2004). CLOVES: A virtual world builder for constructing virtual environments for science inquiry learning. In Lecture Notes in Computer Science (including subseries Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence and Lecture Notes in Bioinformatics) (Vol. 3166, pp. 241–247). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-540-28643-1\_31
30. Da Silva Netto, A. V., & De Fatima Queiroz Vieira, M. (2010). Virtual reality training environment a proposed architecture. VECIMS 2010 - 2010 IEEE International Conference on Virtual Environments, Human-Computer Interfaces and Measurement Systems, Proceedings, 77–81. https://doi.org/10.1109/VECIMS.2010.5609364
31. Darabkh, K. A., Alturk, F. H., & Sweidan, S. Z. (2018). VRCDEA-TCS: 3D virtual reality cooperative drawing educational application with textual chatting system. Computer Applications in Engineering Education, 26(5), 1677–1698. https://doi.org/10.1002/cae.22017
32. De Lucia, A., Francese, R., Passero, I., & Tortora, G. (2009). Development and evaluation of a virtual campus on Second Life: The case of SecondDMI. Computers and Education, 52(1), 220–233. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2008.08.001
33. De Lucia, A., Francese, R., Passero, I., & Tortora, G. (2009). Development and evaluation of a system enhancing second Life to support synchronous role-based collaborative learning. Software - Practice and Experience, 39(12), 1025–1054. https://doi.org/10.1002/spe.926
34. De Pace, F., Manuri, F., Sanna, A., & Zappia, D. (2019). A comparison between two different approaches for a collaborative mixed-virtual environment in industrial maintenance. Frontiers in Robotics and AI, 6(MAR), 1–14. https://doi.org/10.3389/frobt.2019.00018
35. Denoyelles, A., & Kyeong-Ju Seo, K. (2012). Inspiring equal contribution and opportunity in a 3d multi-user virtual environment: Bringing together men gamers and women non-gamers in Second Life®. Computers and Education, 58(1), 21–29. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2011.07.007
36. Desai, K., Belmonte, U. H. H., Jin, R., Prabhakaran, B., Diehl, P., Ramirez, V. A., Johnson, V., & Gans, M. (2017). Experiences with Multi-modal Collaborative Virtual Laboratory (MMCVL). Proceedings - 2017 IEEE 3rd International Conference on Multimedia Big Data, BigMM 2017, 376–383. https://doi.org/10.1109/BigMM.2017.62
37. Dobson, H. D., Pearl, R. K., Orsay, C. P., Rasmussen, M., Evenhouse, R., Ai, Z., Blew, G., Dech, F., Edison, M. I., Silverstein, J. C., & Abcarian, H. (2003). Virtual reality: New method of teaching anorectal and pelvic floor anatomy. Diseases of the Colon and Rectum, 46(3), 349–352. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10350-004-6554-9
38. Economou, D., Mitchell, W., Pettifer, S., Cook, J., & Marsh, J. (2001). User Centred Virtual Actor Technology. Proceedings VAST 2001 Virtual Reality, Archeology, and Cultural Heritage, 323–331. https://doi.org/10.1145/584993.585052
39. Eder, L., & Shen, J. (2008). Intentions to use virtual worlds: An exploratory study. 14th Americas Conference on Information Systems, AMCIS 2008, 5, 2992–2998.
40. Edirisingha, P., Nie, M., Pluciennik, M., & Young, R. (2009). Socialisation for learning at a distance in a 3-D multi-user virtual environment. British Journal of Educational Technology, 40(3), 458–479. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8535.2009.00962.x
41. Fominykh, M., & Prasolova-Førland, E. (2011). Collaborative work on 3D content in virtual environments: Methodology and recommendations. Proceedings of the IADIS International Conference E-Learning 2011, Part of the IADIS Multi Conference on Computer Science and Information Systems 2011, MCCSIS 2011, 1, 227–234.
42. Fominykh, M., Prasolova-Førland, E., Morozov, M., & Gerasimov, A. (2009). Virtual City as a Place for Educational and Social Activities. International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning (IJET), 4(s2), 13–18. https://doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v4s2.939
43. Francke, E., & Alexander, B. (2018). Educating the millennial learner: A case of collaborative learning with augmented reality. Proceedings of the European Conference on Games-Based Learning, 2018-Octob, 99–107.
44. Franco, J. F., Da Cruz, S. R., & Lopes, R. D. D. (2006). Computer graphics, interactive technologies and collaborative learning synergy supporting individuals’ skills development. ACM SIGGRAPH 2006 Educators Program, SIGGRAPH ’06. https://doi.org/10.1145/1179295.1179338
45. Franco, J. F., & De Deus Lopes, R. (2009). Three-dimensional digital enviroments and computer graphics influencing K-12 individuals’ digital literacy development and interdisciplinary lifelong learning. ACM SIGGRAPH ASIA 2009 Educators Program, SIGGRAPH ASIA ’09. https://doi.org/10.1145/1666611.1666626
46. Fuchs, W., & Martinico, A. (1997). V.C.net - A digital study in architecture. Automation in Construction, 6(4), 335–339. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0926-5805(97)00042-3
47. Gard, S., & McAuliffe, M. (2009). Real design of a virtual landscape designing and building a landscape in second life. VSMM 2009 - Proceedings of the 15th International Conference on Virtual Systems and Multimedia, 73–79. https://doi.org/10.1109/VSMM.20
48. Gardeli, A., & Vosinakis, S. (2019). ARQuest: A tangible augmented reality approach to developing computational thinking skills. 2019 11th International Conference on Virtual Worlds and Games for Serious Applications, VS-Games 2019 - Proceedings, 1DUUMY. https://doi.org/10.1109/VS-Games.2019.8864603
49. Gerhard, M., Moore, D. J., & Hobbs, D. J. (2001). Continuous presence in collaborative virtual environments: Towards a hybrid avatar-agent model for user representation. In Lecture Notes in Computer Science (including subseries Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence and Lecture Notes in Bioinformatics) (Vol. 2190, pp. 137–155). https://doi.org/10.1007/3-540-44812-8\_12
50. Girvan, C., & Savage, T. (2010). Identifying an appropriate pedagogy for virtual worlds: A Communal Constructivism case study. Computers and Education, 55(1), 342–349. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2010.01.020
51. Grenfell, J. (2013). Immersive Interfaces for Art Education Teaching and Learning in Virtual and Real World Learning Environments. Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 93, 1198–1211. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.10.016
52. Grimes, D., Warschauer, M., Hutchinson, T., & Kuester, F. (2005). Computer graphics instruction in VizClass. ACM Journal on Educational Resources in Computing, 5(4). https://doi.org/10.1145/1186639.1186642
53. Griol, D., Molina, J. M., & Callejas, Z. (2014). An approach to develop intelligent learning environments by means of immersive virtual worlds. Journal of Ambient Intelligence and Smart Environments, 6(2), 237–255. https://doi.org/10.3233/AIS-140255
54. Gupta, A., Cecil, J., Pirela-Cruz, M., & Ramanathan, P. (2019). A Virtual Reality Enhanced Cyber-Human Framework for Orthopedic Surgical Training. IEEE Systems Journal, 13(3), 3501–3512. https://doi.org/10.1109/JSYST.2019.2896061
55. Gütl, C., & Pirker, J. (2011). Implementation and evaluation of a collaborative learning, training and networking environment for start-up entrepreneurs in virtual 3D worlds. 2011 14th International Conference on Interactive Collaborative Learning, ICL 2011 - 11th International Conference Virtual University, VU’11, September, 58–66. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICL.2011.6059548
56. Gütl, C., Tomes, L. M., Pirker, J., & Chang, V. (2016). Exploratory and collaborative learning experience in immersive environments: Implementation and findings from an archaeological domain. Communications in Computer and Information Science, 621, 3–16. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-41769-1\_1
57. Hanafi, H. F. Bin, Said, C. S., Ariffin, A. H., Zainuddin, N. A., & Samsuddin, K. (2016). Using a collaborative Mobile Augmented Reality learning application (CoMARLA) to improve Improve Student Learning. IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering, 160(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1757-899X/160/1/012111
58. Ho, C. M. L., Nelson, M. E., & Müeller-Wittig, W. (2011). Design and implementation of a student-generated virtual museum in a language curriculum to enhance collaborative multimodal meaning-making. Computers and Education, 57(1), 1083–1097. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2010.12.003
59. Hutchinson, T. C., Kuester, F., Hsieh, T. J., & Chadwick, R. (2004). A hybrid reality environment and its application to earthquake engineering. Proceedings - Virtual Reality Annual International Symposium, 229–230. https://doi.org/10.1109/VR.2004.1310083
60. Hwang, W. Y., & Hu, S. S. (2013). Analysis of peer learning behaviors using multiple representations in virtual reality and their impacts on geometry problem solving. Computers and Education, 62, 308–319. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2012.10.005
61. Iacob, R., Popescu, D., Noel, F., & Masclet, C. (2017). Implementation and evaluation of a model processing pipeline for assembly simulation. Assembly Automation, 37(4), 400–410. https://doi.org/10.1108/AA-11-2015-104
62. Ibáñez, M. B., García Rueda, J. J., Maroto, D., & Delgado Kloos, C. (2013). Collaborative learning in multi-user virtual environments. Journal of Network and Computer Applications, 36(6), 1566–1576. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jnca.2012.12.027
63. Ibáñez, M. B., García, J. J., Galán, S., Maroto, D., Morillo, D., & Kloos, C. D. (2011). Design and implementation of a 3D multi-user virtual world for language learning. Educational Technology and Society, 14(4), 2–10.
64. Jacobs, D., & Swart, W. (2001). Incorporating shared virtual environments across the curriculum. Proceedings - Frontiers in Education Conference, 3(June), S2F/6-S2F/10. https://doi.org/10.1109/FIE.2001.964032
65. Jacucci, G., Oulasvirta, A., Salovaara, A., Psik, T., & Wagner, I. (2005). Augmented reality painting and collage: Evaluating tangible interaction in a field study. Lecture Notes in Computer Science (Including Subseries Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence and Lecture Notes in Bioinformatics), 3585 LNCS, 43–56. https://doi.org/10.1007/11555261\_7
66. Jambi, E., Gardner, M., & Callaghan, V. (2019). A Generalized Pedagogical Framework for Creating Mixed-Mode Role-Play in Multi-User Virtual Environments. In Communications in Computer and Information Science (Vol. 1044, pp. 158–171). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-23089-0\_12
67. Jara, C. A., Candelas, F. A., Torres, F., Dormido, S., & Esquembre, F. (2012). Synchronous collaboration of virtual and remote laboratories. Computer Applications in Engineering Education, 20(1), 124–136. https://doi.org/10.1002/cae.20380
68. Jarmon, L., Traphagan, T., & Mayrath, M. (2008). Understanding project‐based learning in Second Life with a pedagogy, training, and assessment trio. Educational Media International, 45(3), 157–176. https://doi.org/10.1080/09523980802283889
69. Jong, B., Lin, T., Chan, T., & Wu, Y. (2003). Using VR technology to support the formation of cooperative learning groups. Proceedings - 3rd IEEE International Conference on Advanced Learning Technologies, ICALT 2003, 37–41. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICALT.2003.1215022
70. Kaufmann, H., & Schmalstieg, D. (2006). Designing immersive virtual reality for geometry education. Proceedings - IEEE Virtual Reality, 2006, 51–58. https://doi.org/10.1109/VR.2006.48
71. Ke, F., & Lee, S. (2016). Virtual reality based collaborative design by children with high-functioning autism: design-based flexibility, identity, and norm construction. Interactive Learning Environments, 24(7), 1511–1533. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2015.1040421
72. Khan, M., Trujano, F., & Maes, P. (2018). Mathland: Constructionist mathematical learning in the real world using immersive mixed reality. In Communications in Computer and Information Science (Vol. 840). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-93596-6\_9
73. Khanal, P., Vankipuram, A., Ashby, A., Vankipuram, M., Gupta, A., Drumm-Gurnee, D., Josey, K., Tinker, L., & Smith, M. (2014). Collaborative virtual reality based advanced cardiac life support training simulator using virtual reality principles. Journal of Biomedical Informatics, 51, 49–59. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbi.2014.04.005
74. Kirner, C., Trigo, C. H., & Kirner, T. G. (2008). An adaptive Learning Management System with Support for 3D collaboration. MCCSIS’08 - IADIS Multi Conference on Computer Science and Information Systems; Proceedings of e-Learning 2008, 1, 356–362.
75. Kleanthous, S., Michael, M., Samaras, G., & Christodoulou, E. (2016). Transactive memory in task-driven 3d virtual world teams. ACM International Conference Proceeding Series, 23-27-Octo. https://doi.org/10.1145/2971485.2996728
76. Kleven, N. F., Prasolova-Førland, E., Fominykh, M., Hansen, A., Rasmussen, G., Sagberg, L. M., & Lindseth, F. (2014). Virtual operating room for collaborative training of surgical nurses. Lecture Notes in Computer Science (Including Subseries Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence and Lecture Notes in Bioinformatics), 8658 LNCS, 223–238. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-10166-8\_20
77. Kong, J. S. L., & Kwok, R. C. W. (2013). Knowledge conversion in massive peers: A preliminary study on mutualistic co-presence. Proceedings - Pacific Asia Conference on Information Systems, PACIS 2013.
78. Konstantinidis, A., Tsiatsos, T., & Pomportsis, A. (2009). Collaborative virtual learning environments: Design and evaluation. Multimedia Tools and Applications, 44(2), 279–304. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11042-009-0289-5
79. Lattemann, C., & Stieglitz, S. (2012). Challenges for lecturers in virtual worlds. ECIS 2012 - Proceedings of the 20th European Conference on Information Systems.
80. Le, Q. T., Pedro, A., & Park, C. S. (2015). A Social Virtual Reality Based Construction Safety Education System for Experiential Learning. Journal of Intelligent and Robotic Systems: Theory and Applications, 79(3–4), 487–506. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10846-014-0112-z
81. Leftheris, I., Champsas, I., Tsiatsos, T., Terzidou, T., & Mavridis, A. (2012). Design and evaluation of a 3D collaborative game to support game based learning. Proceedings of the European Conference on Games-Based Learning.
82. Li, H., Chan, G., & Skitmore, M. (2012). Multiuser Virtual Safety Training System for Tower Crane Dismantlement. Journal of Computing in Civil Engineering, 26(5), 638–647. https://doi.org/10.1061/(asce)cp.1943-5487.0000170
83. Liang, H., Chang, J., Deng, S., Chen, C., Tong, R., & Zhang, J. J. (2017). Exploitation of multiplayer interaction and development of virtual puppetry storytelling using gesture control and stereoscopic devices. Computer Animation and Virtual Worlds, 28(5). https://doi.org/10.1002/cav.1727
84. Ligorio, M. B., & Van Der Meijden, H. (2008). Teacher guidelines for cross-national virtual communities in primary education: Original article. Journal of Computer Assisted Learning, 24(1), 11–25. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2729.2007.00240.x
85. Lin, H. C. K., Su, S. H., Wang, S. T., & Tsai, S. C. (2015). Influence of cognitive style and cooperative learning on application of augmented reality to natural science learning. International Journal of Technology and Human Interaction, 11(4), 41–66. https://doi.org/10.4018/IJTHI.2015100103
86. Lin, T. J., Duh, H. B. L., Li, N., Wang, H. Y., & Tsai, C. C. (2013). An investigation of learners’ collaborative knowledge construction performances and behavior patterns in an augmented reality simulation system. Computers and Education, 68, 314–321. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2013.05.011
87. Lochmann, G., Reitz, L., Hunz, J., Sohny, A., & Schmidt, G. (2015). Haunted: Intercultural communication training via information gaps in a cooperative virtual reality. Proceedings of the European Conference on Games-Based Learning, 2015-Janua, 303–312.
88. López-Faican, L., & Jaen, J. (2020). EmoFindAR: Evaluation of a mobile multiplayer augmented reality game for primary school children. Computers and Education, 149(April 2019). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2020.103814
89. Lorenzo, C. M., Ángel Sicilia, M., & Sánchez, S. (2012). Studying the effectiveness of multi-user immersive environments for collaborative evaluation tasks. Computers and Education, 59(4), 1361–1376. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2012.06.002
90. Maria, R., Johnson, A., Moher, T., Leigh, J., Vasilakis, C., & Barnes, C. (1999). Learning and building together in an immersive virtual world. Presence, 8(3), 247–263.
91. Massey, A. P., Montoya, M. M., & Wu, P. F. (2013). 3D virtual environments and corporate learning: An empirical investigation of benefits. Proceedings of the Annual Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences, 893–902. https://doi.org/10.1109/HICSS.2013.28
92. McArdle, G., & Bertolotto, M. (2012). Assessing the application of three-dimensional collaborative technologies within an e-learning environment. Interactive Learning Environments, 20(1), 57–75. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494821003714749
93. Molka-Danielsen, J., & Brask, O. D. (2014). Designing virtual collaboration environment for distance learners: exploring socialization as a basis for collaboration. In Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing (Vol. 186, pp. 74–89). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-09546-2\_6
94. Molka-Danielsen, J., Prasolova-Forland, E., Fominykh, M., & Lamb, K. (2019). Use of a Collaborative Virtual Reality Simulation for Multi-Professional Training in Emergency Management Communications. Proceedings of 2018 IEEE International Conference on Teaching, Assessment, and Learning for Engineering, TALE 2018, 408–415. https://doi.org/10.1109/TALE.2018.8615147
95. Moll, J., & Pysander, E. L. S. (2013). A haptic tool for group work on geometrical concepts engaging blind and sighted pupils. ACM Transactions on Accessible Computing, 4(4), 1–37. https://doi.org/10.1145/2493171.2493172
96. Monahan, T., Mcardle, G., & Bertolotto, M. (2007). mCLEV-R : Design and Evaluation of an Interactive and Collaborative M-Learning Application. 1–6.
97. Mørch, A. I., Mifsud, L., & Eie, S. (2019). Developing a model of collaborative learning with minecraft for social studies classrooms using role-play theory and practice. Computer-Supported Collaborative Learning Conference, CSCL, 1, 272–279.
98. Mueller, J., Hutter, K., Fueller, J., & Matzler, K. (2011). Virtual worlds as knowledge management platform - a practice-perspective. Information Systems Journal, 21(6), 479–501. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2575.2010.00366.x
99. Mystakidis, S., Berki, E., & Valtanen, J. (2017). Toward Successfully Integrating Mini Learning Games Into Social Virtual Reality Environments – Recommendations for Improving Open and Distance Learning. EDULEARN17 Proceedings, 1(January 2020), 968–977. https://doi.org/10.21125/edulearn.2017.1203
100. Mystakidis, S., Lambropoulos, N., Fardoun, H. M., & Alghazzawi, D. M. (2014). Playful blended digital storytelling in 3D Immersive eLearning Environments: A cost effective early literacy motivation method. ACM International Conference Proceeding Series, 09-June-20, 97–101. https://doi.org/10.1145/2643604.2643632
101. Nadolny, L., Woolfrey, J., Pierlott, M., & Kahn, S. (2013). SciEthics Interactive: Science and ethics learning in a virtual environment. Educational Technology Research and Development, 61(6), 979–999. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-013-9319-0
102. Nicolalde, F. D., Freese, V., Ponto, K., Tredinnick, R., & Kinneberg, M. (2014). Poster: Applying Kanban to healthcare via immersive 3D virtual reality. IEEE Symposium on 3D User Interfaces 2014, 3DUI 2014 - Proceedings, 149–150. https://doi.org/10.1109/3DUI.2014.6798864
103. Nikolic, S., & Nicholls, B. (2018). Exploring Student Interest of Online Peer Assisted Learning Using Mixed-Reality Technology. In Advances in Intelligent Systems and Computing (Vol. 715, pp. 48–54). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-73210-7\_6
104. Nisiotis, L., & Kleanthous, S. (2019). The relationship between students’ engagement and the development of transactive memory systems in MuvE: An experience report. Annual Conference on Innovation and Technology in Computer Science Education, ITiCSE, 71–77. https://doi.org/10.1145/3304221.3319743
105. Nowlan, N. S., Hartwick, P., & Arya, A. (2018). Skill assessment in virtual learning environments. CIVEMSA 2018 - 2018 IEEE International Conference on Computational Intelligence and Virtual Environments for Measurement Systems and Applications, Proceedings. https://doi.org/10.1109/CIVEMSA.2018.8439968
106. Nuñez, M., Quirós, R., Nuñez, I., Carda, J. B., & Camahort, E. (2008). Collaborative Augmented Reality for Inorganic Chemistry Education. WSEAS International Conference. Proceedings. Mathematics and Computers in Science and Engineering, 5(January), 271–277.
107. Pak, B., & Verbeke, J. (2012). Design studio 2.0: Augmenting reflective architectural design learning. Electronic Journal of Information Technology in Construction, 17(May), 502–519.
108. Panzoli, D., Pons-Lelardeux, C., & Lagarrigue, P. (2015). Communication and Knowledge Sharing in an Immersive Learning Game. VS-Games 2015 - 7th International Conference on Games and Virtual Worlds for Serious Applications. https://doi.org/10.1109/VS-GAMES.2015.7295768
109. Pellas, N. (2014). Harnessing and evaluating open sim for the implementation of an Inquiry-Based Collaborative Learning (Ib[C]L) script in computer science: Preliminary findings from a case study in higher education. Open Source Technology: Concepts, Methodologies, Tools, and Applications, 3–4, 1223–1246. https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-4666-7230-7.ch059
110. Pellas, N., Peroutseas, E., & Kazanidis, I. (2013). Virtual communities of inquiry (VCoI) for learning basic algorithmic structures with Open Simulator and Scratch4OS: A case study from the Secondary education in Greece. ACM International Conference Proceeding Series, 187–194. https://doi.org/10.1145/2490257.2490278
111. Peppler, K., & Solomou, M. (2010). Building creativity: Collaborative learning and creativity in a virtual gaming environment. Learning in the Disciplines: ICLS 2010 Conference Proceedings - 9th International Conference of the Learning Sciences, 2, 453–454.
112. Peterson, M. (2012). EFL learner collaborative interaction in Second Life. ReCALL, 24(1), 20–39. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0958344011000279
113. Petrakou, A. (2010). Interacting through avatars: Virtual worlds as a context for online education. Computers and Education, 54(4), 1020–1027. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2009.10.007
114. Pirker, J., & Gütl, C. (2012). Iterative evaluation of a virtual three-dimensional environment for start-up entrepreneurship in different application scenarios. 2012 15th International Conference on Interactive Collaborative Learning, ICL 2012. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICL.2012.6402035
115. Quy, P. S., Lee, J., Kim, J. H., Kim, J. I., & Kim, H. S. (2009). Collaborative experiment and education based on networked virtual reality. ICCIT 2009 - 4th International Conference on Computer Sciences and Convergence Information Technology, 80–85. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICCIT.2009.53
116. Rahim, N. F. A. (2013). Collaboration and knowledge sharing using 3D virtual world on second life. Education for Information, 30(1–2), 1–40. https://doi.org/10.3233/EFI-130928
117. Rahimian, F. P., & Ibrahim, R. (2011). Impacts of VR 3D sketching on novice designers’ spatial cognition in collaborative conceptual architectural design. Design Studies, 32(3), 255–291. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.destud.2010.10.003
118. Reinoso, M., Hoang, T. N., Vetere, F., & Tanin, E. (2019). Annotating Animated AR Objects for Co-located Learning. Proceedings of 2018 IEEE International Conference on Teaching, Assessment, and Learning for Engineering, TALE 2018, 470–477. https://doi.org/10.1109/TALE.2018.8615452
119. Rogers, L. (2011). Developing simulations in multi-user virtual environments to enhance healthcare education. British Journal of Educational Technology, 42(4), 608–615. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8535.2010.01057.x
120. Sadasivan, S., Rele, R., Greenstein, J. S., Gramopadhye, A. K., Masters, J., & Duchowski, A. T. (2005). Collaborative Virtual Environment to Simulate On-The-Job Aircraft Inspection Training Aided by Hand Pointing. Human Factors, 2216–2220.
121. Sarkar, P., Pillai, J. S., & Gupta, A. (2018). ScholAR: A collaborative learning experience for rural schools using augmented reality application. Proceedings - IEEE 9th International Conference on Technology for Education, T4E 2018, 8–15. https://doi.org/10.1109/T4E.2018.00010
122. Šašinka, C., Stachoň, Z., Sedlák, M., Chmelík, J., Herman, L., Kubíček, P., Šašinková, A., Doležal, M., Tejkl, H., Urbánek, T., Svatoňová, H., Ugwitz, P., & Juřík, V. (2019). Collaborative immersive virtual environments for education in geography. ISPRS International Journal of Geo-Information, 8(1). https://doi.org/10.3390/ijgi8010003
123. Shapira, L., Amores, J., & Benavides, X. (2016). TactileVR: Integrating Physical Toys into Learn and Play Virtual Reality Experiences. Proceedings of the 2016 IEEE International Symposium on Mixed and Augmented Reality, ISMAR 2016, 100–106. https://doi.org/10.1109/ISMAR.2016.25
124. Shen, H., Zhang, J., Yang, B., & Jia, B. (2019). Development of an educational virtual reality training system for marine engineers. Computer Applications in Engineering Education, 27(3), 580–602. https://doi.org/10.1002/cae.22099
125. Shi, Y., Du, J., Ahn, C. R., & Ragan, E. (2019). Impact assessment of reinforced learning methods on construction workers’ fall risk behavior using virtual reality. Automation in Construction, 104, 197–214. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2019.04.015
126. Silverstein, J. C., & Dech, F. (2005). Precisely exploring medical models and volumes in collaborative virtual reality. Presence: Teleoperators and Virtual Environments, 14(1), 47–59. https://doi.org/10.1162/1054746053890233
127. Smorkalov, A., Morozov, M., & Fominykh, M. (2013). Collaborative work with large amount of graphical content in a 3D virtual world: Evaluation of learning tools in vAcademia. 2013 International Conference on Interactive Collaborative Learning, ICL 2013, 303–312. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICL.2013.6644587
128. Sulbaran, T., & Jones, L. F. (2012). Utilizing a collaborative virtual reality environment as a training tool for construction students. ASEE Annual Conference and Exposition, Conference Proceedings. https://doi.org/10.18260/1-2--22208
129. Terzidou, T., Tsiatsos, T., Dae, A., Samaras, O., & Chasanidou, A. (2012). Utilizing virtual worlds for game based learning: Grafica, a 3D educational game in second life. Proceedings of the 12th IEEE International Conference on Advanced Learning Technologies, ICALT 2012, 624–628. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICALT.2012.55
130. Traphagan, T. W., Chiang, Y. H. V., Chang, H. M., Wattanawaha, B., Lee, H., Mayrath, M. C., Woo, J., Yoon, H. J., Jee, M. J., & Resta, P. E. (2010). Cognitive, social and teaching presence in a virtual world and a text chat. Computers and Education, 55(3), 923–936. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2010.04.003
131. Tu, K., Thornburg, H., Campana, E., Birchfield, D., Fulmer, M., & Spanias, A. (2007). Interaction and reflection via 3D path shape qualities in a mediated constructive learning environment. Proceedings of the ACM International Multimedia Conference and Exhibition, 37–46. https://doi.org/10.1145/1290144.1290152
132. Tüzün, H., Bilgiç, H. G., & Elçi, S. Y. (2019). The effects of 3D multi-user virtual environments on collaborative learning and social presence. International Electronic Journal of Elementary Education, 11(3), 221–231. https://doi.org/10.26822/iejee.2019349247
133. Ullah, S., Richard, P., Otmane, S., Naud, M., & Mallem, M. (2010). Haptic guides in cooperative virtual environments: Design and human performance evaluation. 2010 IEEE Haptics Symposium, HAPTICS 2010, 457–462. https://doi.org/10.1109/HAPTIC.2010.5444616
134. Vallance, M., Ibayashi, K., & Goto, Y. (2015). Engineering active learning in 3D virtual worlds. In Communications in Computer and Information Science (Vol. 533, pp. 268–282). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-22629-3\_22
135. Vosinakis, S., Anastassakis, G., & Koutsabasis, P. (2018). Teaching and learning logic programming in virtual worlds using interactive microworld representations. British Journal of Educational Technology, 49(1), 30–44. https://doi.org/10.1111/bjet.12531
136. Vrellis, I., Papachristos, N. M., Bellou, J., Avouris, N., & Mikropoulos, T. A. (2010). Designing a collaborative learning activity in second life: An exploratory study in physics. Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Advanced Learning Technologies, ICALT 2010, 210–214. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICALT.2010.65
137. Whitelock, D., Romano, D., Jelfs, A., & Brna, P. (2000). Perfect presence: What does this mean for the design of virtual learning environments? Education and Information Technologies, 5(4), 277–289. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1012001523715
138. Wigham, C. R., & Chanier, T. (2013). A study of verbal and nonverbal communication in Second Life-the ARCHI21 experience. ReCALL, 25(1), 63–84. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0958344012000250
139. Yeh, S. C., Hwang, W. Y., Wang, J. L., & Chen, Y. R. (2012). Effects of multi-symbols on enhancing virtual reality based collaborative task. In Lecture Notes in Computer Science (including subseries Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence and Lecture Notes in Bioinformatics): Vol. 7220 LNCS (pp. 101–111). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-31439-1\_10