Supplementary Material

Field soil properties and experimental nutrient addition drive the nitrous oxide ratio in laboratory denitrification experiments: A systematic review

Mary E. Foltz\*, Agustín Alesso, Julie L. Zilles

\* Correspondence: Mary E. Foltz: mary.foltz@okstate.edu

# Supplementary Figures and Tables

## Supplementary Figures

****

**Supplementary Figure 1.** Model improvement assessed by likelihood ratio test, with P-values and Q test statistic (for residual heterogeneity) below each added moderator. Solid green lines show moderator additions that resulted in significant improvement, while dashed red lines show moderator additions that did not significantly improve the model.



**Supplementary Figure 2.** Results from subgroup analysis for N2O ratio treatment effect (mean difference) subdivided by soil texture with soil pH overlaid with color. Error bars represent 95% confidence intervals. The number of observations and studies included are also presented (as observations/studies).



**Supplementary Figure 3.** Results from subgroup analysis for N2O ratio treatment effect (mean difference) subdivided by soil texture with C addition overlaid with color. Error bars represent 95% confidence intervals. The number of observations and studies included are also presented (as observations/studies).

## Supplementary Tables

**Supplementary Table 1** Overview of studies included in the full database.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Obs.***a* | **Ctrl?***b* | **Study location** | **Site description(s)** | **Reference** |
| 17 | yes | Czech Republic | pasture | (Brůček et al., 2009) |
| 12 | yes | USA | agricultural (ag) field, wetland | (Ducey et al., 2015) |
| 12 | yes | USA | wetland | (Hunt et al., 2014) |
| 12 | yes | USA | ag field, forest, pasture | (Foltz et al., 2021) |
| 12 | yes | USA | ag field, grassland | (Hu et al., 2016) |
| 11 | yes | Canada | ag field | (Miller et al., 2008) |
| 10 | yes | USA | riparian buffer/zone | (Hunt et al., 2007) |
| 9 | yes | China | orchard | (Huang et al., 2015) |
| 9 | yes | USA | wetland | (Pfeifer-Meister et al., 2018) |
| 9 | yes | USA | pasture, wetland | (Hu et al., 2015) |
| 6 | yes | USA | wetland | (Miller et al., 2017) |
| 6 | yes | USA | pasture, wetland | (Hu et al., 2020) |
| 4 | yes | Denmark | ag field, forest | (Yu et al., 2000) |
| 3 | yes | Germany | not reported | (Köster et al., 2013) |
| 3 | yes | Canada | ag field | (Tenuta and Sparling, 2011) |
| 116 | no | Japan | ag field, forest, grassland | (Yanai et al., 2007) |
| 32 | no | China | ag field | (Sun et al., 2018) |
| 27 | no | Germany | ag field, grassland | (Surey et al., 2021) |
| 25 | no | Czech Republic | pasture | (Čuhel and Šimek, 2011a) |
| 24 | no | Canada | wetland | (Ma et al., 2011) |
| 24 | no | China | ag field | (Liao et al., 2021) |
| 20 | no | Denmark | ag field, forest, grassland | (Ambus, 1998) |
| 20 | no | New Zealand | ag field | (Anderson et al., 2018) |
| 18 | no | Spain | pasture | (Estavillo et al., 2002) |
| 18 | no | Spain | orchard | (Sánchez-García et al., 2016) |
| 16 | no | USA | ag field | (Cavigelli and Robertson, 2000) |
| 15 | no | France | water catchment | (Oehler et al., 2007) |
| 14 | no | Germany | grassland | (Kaleem Abbasi and Müller, 2011) |
| 12 | no | China | rice paddy | (Song et al., 2017) |
| 11 | no | Spain | ag field | (Menéndez et al., 2008) |
| 11 | no | Czech Republic | ag field | (Šimek et al., 2002) |
| 10 | no | Canada | ag field, grassland, rice paddy, vineyard | (Ma et al., 2019) |
| 9 | no | China | riparian buffer/zone | (Yan et al., 2019) |
| 7 | no | Czech Republic | grassland | (Čuhel and Šimek, 2011b) |

*a*Obs. = number of observations

*b* Crtl? = whether or not the study included control experiments without nutrient addition (if yes, study was included in the meta-analysis)

**Supplementary Table 1** **(continued)** Overview of studies included in the final database.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Obs.***a* | **Ctrl?***b* | **Study location** | **Site description(s)** | **Reference** |
| 6 | no | Spain | ag field | (Abalos et al., 2012) |
| 6 | no | Czech Republic | pasture | (Chroňáková et al., 2009) |
| 6 | no | USA | wetland | (Dodla et al., 2008) |
| 6 | no | China | urban | (Li et al., 2014) |
| 6 | no | Germany | ag field | (Surey et al., 2020) |
| 6 | no | New Zealand | pasture | (Zhong et al., 2016) |
| 5 | no | France | water catchment | (Müller et al., 2002) |
| 4 | no | UK | ag field | (Colbourn et al., 1984) |
| 4 | no | China | rice paddy | (Liu et al., 2018) |
| 4 | no | Czech Republic | pasture | (Owens et al., 2016) |
| 4 | no | New Zealand | pasture | (Zhong et al., 2015) |
| 4 | no | New Zealand | grassland | (Zhong et al., 2018) |
| 2 | no | USA | wetland | (Hunt et al., 2003) |
| 2 | no | China | riparian buffer/zone | (Liu et al., 2016) |
| 2 | no | Czech Republic | pasture | (Šimek et al., 2006) |
| 1 | no | UK | forest | (Dendooven et al., 1996) |
| 1 | no | USA | wetland | (Hunt et al., 2009) |
| 1 | no | China | ag field | (Qin et al., 2012) |

*a*Obs. = number of observations

*b* Crtl? = whether or not the study included control experiments without nutrient addition (if yes, study was included in the meta-analysis)

**Supplementary Table 2** Variable importance table for original tree-based model with 17 splits.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Variable** | **Importance** |
| pH | 19 |
| Texture | 14 |
| Soil source | 12 |
| Incubation time | 11 |
| N added | 8 |
| C/N added | 7 |
| Soil amount | 7 |
| C added | 5 |
| Headspace gas | 4 |
| Added C type | 4 |
| Incubation temperature | 4 |
| Inhibitors | 2 |

**Supplementary Table 3** Variable importance table for pruned tree-based model with 3 splits.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Variable** | **Importance** |
| pH | 28 |
| Texture | 22 |
| Soil source | 14 |
| Soil amount | 11 |
| N added | 9 |
| Incubation time | 7 |
| Inhibitors | 4 |
| Incubation temperature | 2 |
| C/N added | 2 |
| Headspace gas | 2 |

# Complete list of studies included in the full database

1. Abalos, D., Sanz-Cobena, A., Misselbrook, T., Vallejo, A., 2012. Effectiveness of urease inhibition on the abatement of ammonia, nitrous oxide and nitric oxide emissions in a non-irrigated Mediterranean barley field. Chemosphere 89, 310–318. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2012.04.043
2. Ambus, P., 1998. Nitrous oxide production by denitrification and nitrification in temperate forest, grassland and agricultural soils. Eur J Soil Sci 49, 495–502. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2389.1998.4930495.x
3. Anderson, C.R., Peterson, M.E., Frampton, R.A., Bulman, S.R., Keenan, S., Curtin, D., 2018. Rapid increases in soil pH solubilise organic matter, dramatically increase denitrification potential and strongly stimulate microorganisms from the *Firmicutes* phylum. PeerJ 6, e6090. https://doi.org/10.7717/peerj.6090
4. Banerjee, S., Siciliano, S.D., 2012. Spatially tripartite interactions of denitrifiers in arctic ecosystems: activities, functional groups and soil resources: Denitrifier spatial patterns in arctic soils. Environ Microbiol 14, 2601–2613. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1462-2920.2012.02814.x
5. Bowen, H., Maul, J.E., Cavigelli, M.A., Yarwood, S., 2020. Denitrifier abundance and community composition linked to denitrification activity in an agricultural and wetland soil. Appl Soil Ecol 151, 103521. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2020.103521
6. Brůček, P., Šimek, M., Hynšt, J., 2009. Long-term animal impact modifies potential production of N2O from pasture soil. Biol Fertil Soils 46, 27–36. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00374-009-0402-y
7. Cavigelli, M.A., Robertson, G.P., 2000. The functional significance of denitrifier community composition in a terrestrial ecosystem. Ecology 81, 1402–1414. https://doi.org/10.1890/0012-9658(2000)081[1402:TFSODC]2.0.CO;2
8. Chroňáková, A., Radl, V., Čuhel, J., Šimek, M., Elhottová, D., Engel, M., Schloter, M., 2009. Overwintering management on upland pasture causes shifts in an abundance of denitrifying microbial communities, their activity and N2O-reducing ability. Soil Biol Biochem 41, 1132–1138. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2009.02.019
9. Colbourn, P., Iqbal, M.M., Harper, I.W., 1984. Estimation of the total gaseous nitrogen losses from clay soils under laboratory and field conditions. J Soil Sci 35, 11–22. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2389.1984.tb00254.x
10. Čuhel, J., Šimek, M., 2011a. Effect of pH on the denitrifying enzyme activity in pasture soils in relation to the intrinsic differences in denitrifier communities. Folia Microbiol 56, 230–235. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12223-011-0045-x
11. Čuhel, J., Šimek, M., 2011b. Proximal and distal control by pH of denitrification rate in a pasture soil. Agr Ecosyst Environ 141, 230–233. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2011.02.016
12. Čuhel, J., Šimek, M., Laughlin, R.J., Bru, D., Chèneby, D., Watson, C.J., Philippot, L., 2010. Insights into the effect of soil pH on N2O and N2 emissions and denitrifier community size and activity. AEM 76, 1870–1878. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.02484-09
13. Dendooven, L., Anderson, J.M., 1995. Maintenance of denitrification potential in pasture soil following anaerobic events. Soil Biol Biochem 27, 1251–1260. https://doi.org/10.1016/0038-0717(95)00067-O
14. Dendooven, L., Duchateau, L., Anderson, J.M., 1996. Gaseous products of the denitrification process as affected by the antecedent water regime of the soil. Soil Biol Biochem 28, 239–245. https://doi.org/10.1016/0038-0717(95)00132-8
15. Dodla, S., Wang, J., Delaune, R., Cook, R., 2008. Denitrification potential and its relation to organic carbon quality in three coastal wetland soils. Sci Total Environ 407, 471–480. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2008.08.022
16. Ducey, T.F., Miller, J.O., Lang, M.W., Szogi, A.A., Hunt, P.G., Fenstermacher, D.E., Rabenhorst, M.C., McCarty, G.W., 2015. Soil physicochemical conditions, denitrification rates, and *nosZ* abundance in North Carolina coastal plain restored wetlands. J Environ Qual 44, 1011–1022. https://doi.org/10.2134/jeq2014.09.0403
17. Estavillo, J., Merino, P., Pinto, M., Yamulki, S., Gebauer, G., Sapek, A., Corré, W., 2002. Short term effect of ploughing a permanent pasture on N2O production from nitrification and denitrification. Plant Soil 239, 253–265. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1015062304915
18. Foltz, M.E., Kent, A.D., Koloutsou-Vakakis, S., Zilles, J.L., 2021. Influence of rye cover cropping on denitrification potential and year-round field N2O emissions. Science of The Total Environment 765, 144295. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.144295
19. Henault, C., Devis, X., Page, S., Justes, E., Reau, R., Germon, J.C., 1998. Nitrous oxide emissions under different soil and land management conditions. Biol Fertil Soils 26, 199–207. https://doi.org/10.1007/s003740050368
20. Hu, J., Inglett, K.S., Clark, M.W., Inglett, P.W., Ramesh Reddy, K., 2015. Nitrous oxide production and consumption by denitrification in a grassland: Effects of grazing and hydrology. Sci Total Environ 532, 702–710. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.06.036
21. Hu, J., Inglett, K.S., Wright, A.L., Clark, M.W., Reddy, K.R., 2020. Nitrous oxide dynamics during denitrification along a hydrological gradient of subtropical grasslands. Soil Use Manag 36, 682–692. https://doi.org/10.1111/sum.12637
22. Hu, J., Inglett, K.S., Wright, A.L., Reddy, K.R., 2016. Nitrous Oxide Production and Reduction in Seasonally-Flooded Cultivated Peatland Soils. Soil Sci Soc Am J 80, 783–793. https://doi.org/10.2136/sssaj2015.10.0381
23. Huang, Y., Long, X.-E., Chapman, S.J., Yao, H., 2015. Acidophilic denitrifiers dominate the N2O production in a 100-year-old tea orchard soil. Environ Sci Pollut Res 22, 4173–4182. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-014-3653-6
24. Hunt, P.G., Matheny, T.A., Ro, K.S., 2007. Nitrous oxide accumulation in soils from riparian buffers of a coastal plain watershed–carbon/nitrogen ratio control. J Environ Qual 36, 1368. https://doi.org/10.2134/jeq2006.0255
25. Hunt, P.G., Matheny, T.A., Szögi, A.A., 2003. Denitrification in constructed wetlands used for treatment of swine wastewater. J Environ Qual 32, 727–735. https://doi.org/10.2134/jeq2003.7270
26. Hunt, P.G., Miller, J.O., Ducey, T.F., Lang, M.W., Szogi, A.A., McCarty, G., 2014. Denitrification in soils of hydrologically restored wetlands relative to natural and converted wetlands in the Mid-Atlantic coastal plain of the USA. Ecol Eng 71, 438–447. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2014.07.040
27. Hunt, P.G., Stone, K.C., Matheny, T.A., Poach, M.E., Vanotti, M.B., Ducey, T.F., 2009. Denitrification of nitrified and non-nitrified swine lagoon wastewater in the suspended sludge layer of treatment wetlands. Ecological Engineering 35, 1514–1522. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2009.07.001
28. Iqbal, J., Parkin, T.B., Helmers, M.J., Zhou, X., Castellano, M.J., 2015. Denitrification and nitrous oxide emissions in annual croplands, perennial grass buffers, and restored perennial grasslands. Soil Sci Soc Am J 79, 239–250. https://doi.org/10.2136/sssaj2014.05.0221
29. Jahangir, M.M.R., Khalil, M.I., Johnston, P., Cardenas, L.M., Hatch, D.J., Butler, M., Barrett, M., O’flaherty, V., Richards, K.G., 2012. Denitrification potential in subsoils: A mechanism to reduce nitrate leaching to groundwater. Agr Ecosyst Environ 147, 13–23. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2011.04.015
30. Jambert, C., Serça, D., Delmas, R., 1997. Quantification of N-losses as NH3, NO, and N2O and N2 from fertilized maize fields in southwestern France. Nutr Cycl Agroecosys 48, 91–104. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1009786531821
31. Kaleem Abbasi, M., Müller, C., 2011. Trace gas fluxes of CO2, CH4 and N2O in a permanent grassland soil exposed to elevated CO2 in the Giessen FACE study. Atmos Chem Phys 11, 9333–9342. https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-11-9333-2011
32. Köster, J.R., Well, R., Dittert, K., Giesemann, A., Lewicka-Szczebak, D., Mühling, K.-H., Herrmann, A., Lammel, J., Senbayram, M., 2013. Soil denitrification potential and its influence on N 2 O reduction and N 2 O isotopomer ratios: Effect of denitrification on N 2 O reduction and N 2 O isotopomer ratios. Rapid Commun Mass Spectrom 27, 2363–2373. https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.6699
33. Li, S., Deng, H., Rensing, C., Zhu, Y.-G., 2014. Compaction stimulates denitrification in an urban park soil using 15N tracing technique. Environ Sci Pollut Res 21, 3783–3791. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-013-2355-9
34. Liao, X., Chen, Y., Ruan, H., Malghani, S., 2021. Incapability of biochar to mitigate biogas slurry induced N2O emissions: Field investigations after 7 years of biochar application in a poplar plantation. Science of The Total Environment 794, 148572. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.148572
35. Liu, W., Xiong, Z., Liu, H., Zhang, Q., Liu, G., 2016. Catchment agriculture and local environment affecting the soil denitrification potential and nitrous oxide production of riparian zones in the Han River Basin, China. Agr Ecosyst Environ 216, 147–154. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2015.10.002
36. Liu, Y., Shen, K., Wu, Y., Wang, G., 2018. Abundance and structure composition of *nirK* and *nosZ* genes as well as denitrifying activity in heavy metal-polluted paddy soils. Geomicrobiol J 35, 100–107. https://doi.org/10.1080/01490451.2017.1333175
37. Ma, S., Wang, J., Yan, X., 2019. Is nitrous oxide reduction primarily regulated by the fungi-to-bacteria abundance ratio in fertilized soils? Pedosphere 29, 569–576. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1002-0160(19)60830-1
38. Ma, W.K., Farrell, R.E., Siciliano, S.D., 2011. Nitrous oxide emissions from ephemeral wetland soils are correlated with microbial community composition. Front Microbio 2. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2011.00110
39. Menéndez, S., López-Bellido, R.J., Benítez-Vega, J., González-Murua, C., López-Bellido, L., Estavillo, J.M., 2008. Long-term effect of tillage, crop rotation and N fertilization to wheat on gaseous emissions under rainfed Mediterranean conditions. Eur J Agron 28, 559–569. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eja.2007.12.005
40. Miller, J.O., Ducey, T.F., Brigman, P.W., Ogg, C.O., Hunt, P.G., 2017. Greenhouse gas emissions and denitrification within depressional wetlands of the Southeastern US coastal plain in an agricultural landscape. Wetlands 37, 33–43. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13157-016-0837-5
41. Miller, M.N., Zebarth, B.J., Dandie, C.E., Burton, D.L., Goyer, C., Trevors, J.T., 2008. Crop residue influence on denitrification, N2O emissions and denitrifier community abundance in soil. Soil Biol Biochem 40, 2553–2562. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2008.06.024
42. Müller, C., Stevens, R.J., Laughlin, R.J., Azam, F., Ottow, J.C.G., 2002. The nitrification inhibitor DMPP had no effect on denitrifying enzyme activity. Soil Biol Biochem 34, 1825–1827. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0038-0717(02)00165-7
43. Oehler, F., Bordenave, P., Durand, P., 2007. Variations of denitrification in a farming catchment area. Agr Ecosyst Environ 120, 313–324. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2006.10.007
44. Owens, J., Clough, T.J., Laubach, J., Hunt, J.E., Venterea, R.T., Phillips, R.L., 2016. Nitrous oxide fluxes, soil oxygen, and denitrification potential of urine- and non-urine-treated soil under different irrigation frequencies. J Environ Qual 45, 1169–1177. https://doi.org/10.2134/jeq2015.10.0516
45. Pfeifer-Meister, L., Gayton, L.G., Roy, B.A., Johnson, B.R., Bridgham, S.D., 2018. Greenhouse gas emissions limited by low nitrogen and carbon availability in natural, restored, and agricultural Oregon seasonal wetlands. PeerJ 6, e5465. https://doi.org/10.7717/peerj.5465
46. Qin, S., Hu, C., Oenema, O., 2012. Quantifying the underestimation of soil denitrification potential as determined by the acetylene inhibition method. Soil Biol Biochem 47, 14–17. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2011.12.019
47. Sánchez-García, M., Sánchez-Monedero, M.A., Roig, A., López-Cano, I., Moreno, B., Benitez, E., Cayuela, M.L., 2016. Compost vs biochar amendment: a two-year field study evaluating soil C build-up and N dynamics in an organically managed olive crop. Plant Soil 408, 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11104-016-2794-4
48. Šimek, M., Brůček, P., Hynšt, J., Uhlířová, E., Petersen, S.O., 2006. Effects of excretal returns and soil compaction on nitrous oxide emissions from a cattle overwintering area. Agr Ecosyst Environ 112, 186–191. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2005.08.018
49. Šimek, M., Jı́šová, L., Hopkins, D.W., 2002. What is the so-called optimum pH for denitrification in soil? Soil Biol Biochem 34, 1227–1234. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0038-0717(02)00059-7
50. Song, A., Fan, F., Yin, C., Wen, S., Zhang, Y., Fan, X., Liang, Y., 2017. The effects of silicon fertilizer on denitrification potential and associated genes abundance in paddy soil. Biol Fertil Soils 53, 627–638. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00374-017-1206-0
51. Sun, Z., Zheng, T., Xin, J., Zheng, X., Hu, R., Subhan, F., Shao, H., 2018. Effects of alkali-treated agricultural residues on nitrate removal and N2O reduction of denitrification in unsaturated soil. J Environ Manage 214, 276–282. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2018.02.078
52. Surey, R., Kaiser, K., Schimpf, C.M., Mueller, C.W., Böttcher, J., Mikutta, R., 2021. Contribution of Particulate and Mineral-Associated Organic Matter to Potential Denitrification of Agricultural Soils. Front Environ Sci 9, 640534. https://doi.org/10.3389/fenvs.2021.640534
53. Surey, R., Schimpf, C.M., Sauheitl, L., Mueller, C.W., Rummel, P.S., Dittert, K., Kaiser, K., Böttcher, J., Mikutta, R., 2020. Potential denitrification stimulated by water-soluble organic carbon from plant residues during initial decomposition. Soil Biol Biochem 147, 107841. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2020.107841
54. Tenuta, M., Sparling, B., 2011. A laboratory study of soil conditions affecting emissions of nitrous oxide from packed cores subjected to freezing and thawing. Can J Soil Sci 91, 223–233. https://doi.org/10.4141/cjss09051
55. Yan, L., Xie, C., Xu, X., Che, S., 2019. The influence of revetment types on soil denitrification in the adjacent tidal urban riparian zones. J Hydrol 574, 398–407. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2019.04.071
56. Yanai, Y., Toyota, K., Okazaki, M., 2007. Response of denitrifying communities to successive soil freeze–thaw cycles. Biol Fertil Soils 44, 113–119. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00374-007-0185-y
57. Yu, K., Chen, G., Struwe, S., Kjoller, A., 2000. Production and reduction of nitrous oxide in agricultural and forest soils. Chi J App Ecol 11, 385–389.
58. Zhong, L., Bowatte, S., Newton, P.C.D., Hoogendoorn, C.J., Li, F.Y., Wang, Y., Luo, D., 2015. Soil N cycling processes in a pasture after the cessation of grazing and CO2 enrichment. Geoderma 259–260, 62–70. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2015.05.009
59. Zhong, L., Bowatte, S., Newton, P.C.D., Hoogendoorn, C.J., Luo, D., 2018. An increased ratio of fungi to bacteria indicates greater potential for N2O production in a grazed grassland exposed to elevated CO2. Agr Ecosyst Environ 254, 111–116. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2017.11.027
60. Zhong, L., Hoogendoorn, C.J., Bowatte, S., Li, F.Y., Wang, Y., Luo, D., 2016. Slope class and grazing intensity effects on microorganisms and nitrogen transformation processes responsible for nitrous oxide emissions from hill pastures. Agr Ecosyst Environ 217, 70–78. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2015.11.009