Supplementary Table S1. Supporting information for rating bias

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Included studies** | **Random sequence generation** | **Allocation concealment** | **Blinding of participants and personnel** | **Blinding of outcome assessment** | **Incomplete outcome data** | **Selective reporting** | **Other bias** |
| Dong 2021 | Random number table method was used for generating random sequence; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Jiang 2022 | The article only reported compliance with the principle of random allocation, but did not specify a specific method; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Kang 2022 | The article only reported compliance with the principle of random allocation, but did not specify a specific method; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Li 2021 | Random number table method was used for generating random sequence; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Wang 2020 | The article only reported compliance with the principle of random allocation, but did not specify a specific method; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Yan 2023 | The article only reported compliance with the principle of random allocation, but did not specify a specific method; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Zhang (1) 2022 | The article only reported compliance with the principle of random allocation, but did not specify a specific method; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Zhang (2) 2022 | The article only reported compliance with the principle of random allocation, but did not specify a specific method; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Zhang 2021 | The article only reported compliance with the principle of random allocation, but did not specify a specific method; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Zhou 2022 | Random number table method was used for generating random sequence; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |
| Zou 2018 | The article only reported compliance with the principle of random allocation, but did not specify a specific method; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias.  | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. | There is no missing data in the text; thus, it is low risk of bias.  | All the pre-specified outcome indicators in the research methods have been reported; thus, it is low risk of bias. | The related information in the text was not mentioned; thus, it is unclear of bias. |