

# Electrocatalytic Reduction of Nitrate via Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti Cathode Prepared by Electrodeposition Paired With IrO<sub>2</sub>-RuO<sub>2</sub> Anode

Chuan Wang<sup>1</sup>, Zhifen Cao<sup>1</sup>, Hongtao Huang<sup>1</sup>, Hong Liu<sup>2</sup> and Sha Wang<sup>2</sup>\*

<sup>1</sup>Key Laboratory for Water Quality and Conservation of the Pearl River Delta, Ministry of Education, Institute of Environmental Research at Greater Bay, Guangzhou University, Guangzhou, China, <sup>2</sup>Chongqing Institute of Green and Intelligent Technology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Chongqing, China

Nitrate pollution is already a global problem, and the electrocatalytic reduction of nitrate is a promising technology for the remediation of wastewater and polluted water bodies. In this work,  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  electrodes were prepared by electrodeposition for the electrocatalytic reduction of nitrate. The morphology, chemical, and crystal structures of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti and its catalytic activity were investigated. Then, the electrocatalytic nitrate reduction performance of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti as the cathode was evaluated by monitoring the removal efficiencies of nitrate (NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N) and total nitrogen (TN), generation of reduction products, current efficiency (CE), and energy consumption (EC) at different operating conditions. Under the catalysis of  $Co_3O_4/Ti$ ,  $NO_3^-$  was reduced to  $N_2$  and  $NH_4^+$ , while no  $NO_2^-$  was produced. After the introduction of chloride ions and IrO2-RuO2/Ti as the anode, NH4+ was selectively oxidized to N<sub>2</sub>. The removal efficiencies of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N (at 100 mg/L) and TN after 2 h were 91.12% and 60.25%, respectively (pH 7.0; Cl<sup>-</sup> concentration, 2000 mg/L; current density, 15 mA/cm<sup>2</sup>). After 4 h of operation,  $NO_3^-$ -N and TN were completely removed. However, considering the EC and CE, a 2-h reaction was the most appropriate. The EC and CE were 0.10 kWh/g NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>N and 40.3%, respectively, and electrocatalytic performance was maintained after 10 consecutive reduction cycles (2 h each). The cathode Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti, which is prepared by electrodeposition, can effectively remove NO3<sup>-</sup>-N, with low EC and high CE.

#### Keywords: nitrate removal, electrocatalytic, Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti, reduction, IrO<sub>2</sub>-RuO<sub>2</sub>

# **1 INTRODUCTION**

Nitrate (NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) contamination of surface water and groundwater is a global environmental problem associated with increasing populations, and its hazards have attracted much attention (Jasper et al., 2014; Khalil et al., 2016; Serio et al., 2018). The accumulation of plant nutrients such as NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and phosphate in water can accelerate eutrophication, a process that increases the biomass of a water body as its biological diversity decreases, for example, due to increases in invertebrates and fish. In the extreme, a state of hypoxia can exist, resulting in the loss of the aquatic ecosystems (Kubicz et al., 2018; Zhang et al., 2021). Although NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> is chemically stable, it can be microbially reduced to reactive nitrite in the oral cavity and stomach, which has been linked to liver damage, methemoglobinemia, and cancer in animals (Spalding and Exner, 1993; Elmidaoui et al., 2001; Barakat et al., 2020).

### **OPEN ACCESS**

#### Edited by:

Qingyi Zeng, University of South China, China

#### Reviewed by:

Huawei Song, Sun Yat-sen University, China Qing Lan, Guangdong Polytechnic of Environmental Protection Engineering, China

> \*Correspondence: Sha Wang wangsha@cigit.ac.cn

#### Specialty section:

This article was submitted to Inorganic Chemistry, a section of the journal Frontiers in Chemistry

Received: 21 March 2022 Accepted: 19 April 2022 Published: 03 June 2022

#### Citation:

Wang C, Cao Z, Huang H, Liu H and Wang S (2022) Electrocatalytic Reduction of Nitrate via Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti Cathode Prepared by Electrodeposition Paired With IrO<sub>2</sub>-RuO<sub>2</sub> Anode. Front. Chem. 10:900962. doi: 10.3389/fchem.2022.900962

1

Currently, microbial denitrification is widely used for the large-scale remediation of  $NO_3^-$  pollution (Clauwaert et al., 2007; Della Rocca and Belgiorno V Meriç, 2007). Many other methods of  $NO_3^-$  removal have been explored such as reverse osmosis, ion exchange, ammonia stripping, electrodialysis, catalytic reduction, and electrocatalytic reduction (Kapoor and Viraraghavan, 1997; Yang and Lee, 2005; Della Rocca and Belgiorno V Meriç, 2007). Among these techniques, the electrocatalytic reduction of  $NO_3^-$  is a promising and clean technology because the electron reductants neither introduce pollutants nor adversely affect the environment (Garcia-Segura et al., 2018; Gayen et al., 2018).

The mechanism of the electrochemical  $NO_3^-$  reduction reaction ( $NO_3^-$ -RR) involves anodic oxidation and cathodic reduction in which  $NO_3^-$  is reduced to  $NO_2^-$ ,  $NH_4^+$ , and  $N_2$  on the active sites of the cathode according to **Eqs 1–3** (Zhang et al., 2021):

$$NO_3^- + 2e^- + H_2O \rightarrow NO_2^- + 2OH^-,$$
 (1)

$$NO_2^- + 6e^- + 6H_2O \rightarrow NH_4^+ + 8OH^-,$$
 (2)

$$2NO_3^- + 10e^- + 6H_2O \rightarrow N_2 + 12OH^-.$$
 (3)

The choice of the cathode material is important in this process. To date, most studies have used high-cost noble metal cathodes, such as Pt, Rh, and Pd, which may limit their commercial application (Taguchi and Feliu, 2007; Yang et al., 2014; Soto-Hernández et al., 2019).  $Co_3O_4$  is a cost-effective catalyst, and the preparation of a CuO-Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti electrode by the sol-gel method for electrochemical reduction of  $NO_3^-$  was recently reported (Yang et al., 2020). The system demonstrated the complete removal of  $NO_3^-$  after 3 h at a current density of 20 mA/cm<sup>2</sup>.

 $NO_2^-$  and  $NH_4^+$  generated at the cathode (**Eqs. (1)** and **(2)**) diffuse to the anode where they are adsorbed onto the surface and subsequently oxidized to  $NO_3^-$  and  $N_2$  (**Eqs. (4)** and (5)) (Zhang et al., 2021):

$$NO_2^- + H_2O \to NO_3^- + 2e^- + 2H^+,$$
 (4)

$$2NH_4^+ \rightarrow N_2 + 6e^- + 6H^+.$$
 (5)

When  $Cl^-$  is present in the electrolyte, the following reactions also occur at the anode (**Eqs. 6–9**) (Zhang et al., 2021):

$$2\mathrm{Cl}^{-} \to \mathrm{Cl}_{2} + 2\mathrm{e}^{-}, \tag{6}$$

$$Cl_2 + H_2O \rightarrow HOCl + Cl^- + H^+,$$
 (7)

$$HOCl \rightarrow ClO^- + H^+,$$
 (8)

$$2NH_{4}^{+} + 3ClO^{-} \rightarrow N_{2} + 3H_{2}O + 2H^{+} + 3Cl^{-}.$$
 (9)

The electrochemical  $NO_3^-$ -RR involves  $NO_3^-$  reduction at the cathode and ammonium nitrogen ( $NH_4^+$ -N) oxidation at the anode. Cl<sub>2</sub> generated at the anode (**Eq. (6**)) immediately forms hypochlorite (**Eq. (7**)), which selectively oxidizes  $NH_4^+$  to  $N_2$  (Su et al., 2017). Hence, the efficient anodic oxidation of chloride ions is a key requirement for this process, and the anode materials used in the chlor-alkali industry, which obtain Cl<sub>2</sub> by electrolysis of sodium chloride, provide a useful reference (Yi et al., 2007). Among these materials, IrO<sub>2</sub>-RuO<sub>2</sub> is a good choice due to its low overpotential, high chlorine selectivity, and long-term stability (Chen et al., 2007). In addition, the electrocatalytic reduction of



 $NO_3^--N$  is also affected by reaction potential, current, solution pH, battery structure, and anode material.

Here, a catalytic cathode was prepared by the *in situ* electrodeposition of  $Co_3O_4$  on a titanium substrate  $(Co_3O_4/Ti)$  to obtain improved electrocatalytic performance.  $IrO_2$ -RuO<sub>2</sub>/Ti was employed as the anode for the effective removal of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N and TN. The aim of this study was to obtain simultaneous electrochemical NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction and oxidation of the *in situ*-generated NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> into N<sub>2</sub> gas. The morphology and structure of  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  were characterized using conventional methods, and its performance in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> removal was evaluated under different operating conditions. The current efficiency (CE) and energy consumption (EC) of the system were also measured to assess its commercial application.

#### **2 EXPERIMENTAL SECTION**

#### 2.1 Chemicals and Materials

The Ti mesh and Ti plate (99.5% purity, 0.6 mm, 10 mesh) were purchased from Lanruiyinde Electrochemical Materials Co., Ltd. (China). The Pt plate was obtained from Aidahengsheng Co., Ltd., (Tianjin, China). All chemicals were of analytical grade. Potassium nitrate and sodium hydroxide were purchased from Aladdin Biochemical Technology Co., Ltd. (Shanghai, China). Cobalt nitrate hexahydrate, sodium eicosyl, hexachloroiridic acid, and ruthenium (III) chloride were obtained from Macklin Biochemical Technology Co., Ltd. (Shanghai, China). Solutions were prepared using deionized water (>15 M $\Omega$  cm) obtained from an Elix<sup>®</sup> 3 purification system (Millipore, United States). Simulated wastewater was prepared by adding potassium nitrate to deionized water.

# 2.2 Preparation of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti Cathode and IrO<sub>2</sub>-RuO<sub>2</sub>/Ti Anode

Samples of the Ti mesh and Ti plate  $(3 \times 4 \text{ cm}, 12 \text{ cm}^2)$  were degreased with NaOH solution (40 wt%) at 95°C for 2 h before etching by boiling in oxalic acid solution (10 wt%) for 2 h. The treated samples were then rinsed with deionized water and stored in ethanol until further use.

As shown in **Figure 1**, the  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  electrode was prepared using an electrodeposition method. A three-electrode system was employed in a single compartment cell using the pretreated Ti mesh as the cathode, the Pt plate as the anode, and an Ag/AgCl

reference electrode. The electrodeposition solution comprised boric acid (0.5 M), cobalt nitrate hexahydrate (0.1 M), and sodium eicosyl sulfonate (2.0 g/L). Following electrodeposition at a current of 0.25 A for 5 min, the electrode was cleaned with deionized water and oven-dried (60°C) before heating at 5°C/min to 500°C (hold 2 h) in a muffle furnace to effect calcination. The treated samples were allowed to cool naturally to room temperature.

The IrO<sub>2</sub>-RuO<sub>2</sub>/Ti anode was prepared by using a thermal decomposition method. A mixed solution of hexachloroiridic acid and ruthenium (III) chloride in n-butanol (molar ratio, 2:1) was evenly coated onto the surfaces of the pretreated titanium plate, dried at 105°C for 10 min, and then calcined at 500°C for 15 min. The process was repeated until the weight of the titanium plate increased by about 10 g/cm<sup>2</sup>. Finally, the electrode was washed with deionized water before use.

## 2.3 Characterization of the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti Cathode

Surface morphology and elemental composition were studied by field-emission scanning electron microscopy (SEM) and energydispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDS) on a Phenom ProX system (Thermo Fisher Scientific, United States) at an accelerating voltage of 15 kV. The crystal structure of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> was examined by X-ray diffraction (XRD) with an X'pert Powder system (Malvern Panalytical, Malvern, UK) using Cu Ka ( $\lambda$  = 1.5406 Å) irradiation.

#### 2.4 Electrochemical Measurements

NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-RR tests were performed in a single chamber electrolytic cell (200 ml) using a three-electrode system, with Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti (or Ti as required), Pt plate, and Ag/AgCl as the working, counter, and reference electrodes, respectively. The electrolyte was prepared using Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> (0.1 M) and different concentrations of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N (KNO<sub>3</sub>) as required. Linear sweep voltammetry (LSV), and electrolysis tests were performed in an electrochemical workstation (Metrohm Autolab M204, Switzerland). Prior to the electrochemical test, oxygen was removed by bubbling high-purity N<sub>2</sub> through the electrolyte for  $\geq 20$  min, and continuously fed during the experiments.

Electrolysis measurements were performed at an optimum current density of 15 mA/cm<sup>2</sup>, and aliquots of the reaction solutions (2 ml) were removed at predetermined time intervals to measure the concentrations of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N, NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N, and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N. The effects of chlorine on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-RR and the stability of the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathode electrode were assessed at a current density of 15 mA/cm<sup>2</sup> for 2 h and an initial NO<sub>3</sub>-N concentration of 100 mg/L.

#### 2.5 Analytical Methods

During the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-RR, the formation of NO, N<sub>2</sub>O, and NH<sub>3</sub> are negligible, and hence, the generated gaseous products can be considered as N2 (Teng et al., 2018). UV-Vis spectroscopy was used to measure the concentrations of  $NO_3^{-}-N$ ,  $NO_2^{-}-N$ ,  $NH_4^{+}-N$ , and total nitrogen (TN) (Evolution 201, Thermofisher Scientific Co., Ltd.), and their removal efficiencies were calculated according to Eqs (10)-(12):

$$NO_{3}^{-} - N \ removal = \frac{C_{0} \left( NO_{3}^{-} - N \right) - C_{t} \left( NO_{3}^{-} - N \right)}{C_{0} \left( NO_{3}^{-} - N \right)} \times 100\%,$$
(10)

$$NH_{4}^{+} - N \text{ generation} = \frac{C_{t} \left( NH_{4}^{+} - N \right)}{C_{0} \left( NO_{3}^{-} - N \right)} \times 100\%, \quad (11)$$

$$TN \ removal = \frac{C_0 (TN) - C_t (TN)}{C_0 (TN)} \times 100\%,$$
(12)

where  $C_0(NO_3^--N)$  (mg/L) is the initial concentration of  $NO_3^-$ -N,  $C_t(NO_3^-N)$  (mg/L) is the concentration of  $NO_3^-N$  at time t,  $C_t(NH_4^+-N)$  (mg/L) is the concentration of  $NH_4^+-N$  at time t,  $C_0(TN)$  (mg/L) is the initial concentration of TN, and  $C_t(TN)$ (mg/L) is the concentration of TN at time t.

EC was calculated using Eq. 13 (Zhang et al., 2016):

$$EC = \frac{UIt}{V(C_0 - C_t)},$$
(13)

where U is the cell potential (V), I is the current (A), t is the reaction time (h), and V is the volume of reaction solution (L). The CE for TN removal rates was obtained using Eq. 14:

$$CE(\%) = \frac{(C_0 - C_t) \times V}{M \times Q} \times n \times 96485 \times 100\%, \quad (14)$$

where M is the molar mass of N (14 g/mol), Q is the amount of electricity passing through the electrode, and *n* is the number of electrons obtained from the complete reduction of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N (calculated according to the conversion of  $NO_3^-$  to N, n = 5).

### **3 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

### 3.1 Electrode Characterizations and **Chemical Tests**

SEM was used to depict the electrode surface morphology of  $Co_3O_4/Ti$ . Figure 2 shows that spherical particles (3-5 µm) of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> were observed on the surface of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti at different magnifications, confirming its deposition on the Ti mesh. SEM-EDS elemental mapping of a surface region of the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti cathode (Figure 3) gave a value of 26.26 atom% for Co, indicating that the element was successfully deposited on the titanium mesh.

Figure 4 shows the XRD patterns of the calcined Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti electrode and their comparison with the reference powder patterns of cubic phase Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (PDF#42-1467) and Ti (PDF#44-1294). The characteristic peaks observed at  $2\theta$  of 35.1°, 38.4°, 40.2°, 53.0°, 62.9°, 70.7°, 76.2°, and 77.4° correspond to (100), (002), (101), (102), (110), (103), (112), and (201) planes of Ti (PDF#44-1294), respectively (Figure 4A). Inspection of the enlarged pattern obtained from the Co3O4/Ti cathode (Figure 4B) showed that the main peaks of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> at 20=31.3°, 36.9°, 44.8°, 59.4°, 65.2°, and 74.1°, correspond to the (220), (311), (400), (511), (440), and (620) planes of Co3O4, respectively. These results were in good agreement with the standard cubic phase (PDF#42-1467).





LSV was used to evaluate the electrocatalytic performance of the catalysts toward  $NO_3^-$ -RR. **Figure 5A** shows the LSV curves obtained with  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  and Ti in the presence of  $NO_3^-$ -N. The onset potential for  $NO_3^-$ -RR using the  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  cathode (-0.7 V) was more positive than that using the Ti mesh (-1.0 V), indicating the improved performance with the composite catalyst. From -0.7 to -1.6 V,  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  gave a larger current response at all potentials due to its higher activity toward the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-RR compared with the Ti mesh. **Figure 5B** shows the effects of increasing NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N (0–500 mg/L) using Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti as the cathode. In the absence of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N, the onset potential (i.e., for the electrolysis of water to produce H<sub>2</sub>) was -0.9 V. The addition of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> produced a positive shift in the onset potential, and the corresponding current increased with increasing initial NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N due to the enhanced reduction reaction activity.



enlarged XRD patterns of  $Co_3O_4$ /Ti cathode.



# 3.2 Effects of Electrochemical Reaction Parameters on $NO_3^-$ -RR Using the $Co_3O_4$ /Ti Cathode

#### 3.2.1 Catalytic Activity of the Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti Cathode

To determine the effect of  $Co_3O_4$  on  $NO_3^-RR$  activity, the  $NO_3^--N$  (100 mg/L) removal efficiencies of the  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  and Ti mesh cathodes were compared at a current density of 15 mA/cm<sup>2</sup> with a Pt plate as the anode (**Figure 6**). The results showed that the  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  cathode could achieve a  $NO_3^--N$  removal efficiency of ~98% in 2 h, compared with 6.4% using the Ti mesh, demonstrating the important role of  $Co_3O_4$  in improving the performance of  $NO_3^--RR$ .

#### 3.2.2 Effects of Current Density

**Figure 7A,B** show the rate of  $NO_3^-$ -N removal using the  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  cathode and the corresponding fit of the experimental data to first-order kinetics. The increased removal efficiency with increasing current density over 5–15 mA/cm<sup>2</sup> could be attributed to enhanced electron transfer on the electrode surface of  $Co_3O_4/Ti$ , which

increased the rate of  $NO_3^-$ -RR. However, when the current density was increased from 15 to 20 mA/cm<sup>2</sup>, the removal efficiency of  $NO_3^-$ -N did not improve significantly. At higher current densities, the competing hydrogen evolution reaction consumes the extra charge, and the  $NO_3^-$ -N removal efficiency decreases. **Figure 7C** shows that there was good correspondence between the reduction of  $NO_3^-$ -N and the generation of  $NH_4^+$ -N. The reduction products were  $NH_4^+$ -N and  $N_2$ , while  $NO_2^-$ -N was not detected (**Figure 7D**).

#### 3.2.3 Effect of Initial NO3<sup>-</sup>-N Concentration

The effects of initial  $NO_3^-N$  concentration on its removal efficiency using the  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  cathode and the generation of reduction products are shown in **Figure 8**. At initial  $NO_3^--N$  concentrations of <100 mg/L, the removal efficiency of the system was close to 100% at 2 h; and the corresponding reduction products were  $NH_4^+-N$  (60%) and  $N_2$ . At an initial  $NO_3^--N$  concentration of 200 mg/L, the removal efficiency decreased to ~58%, while the  $NH_4^+-N$  generation efficiency increased to ~79%. Under this condition, the higher



initial  $NO_{1}^{-}N$  concentration suppressed the competing

initial  $NO_3^-$ -N concentration suppressed the competing hydrogen evolution reaction, thus reducing its charge consumption at the electrode.

#### 3.3 Effects of Cl<sup>-</sup>

The main product of electrocatalytic NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction is NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>, which is also a contaminant requiring removal. However, in the presence of Cl<sup>-</sup>, which is widely present in drinking water and industrial water, the active species participating in the oxidative transformation of  $NH_4^+$ -N to  $N_2$  at the anode (Eqs 6-9) will increase TN removal. The IrO2-RuO2/Ti electrode is widely employed in the chlor-alkali industry because of its high chlorine evolution performance. To investigate the effects of Cl<sup>-</sup> on NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N generation and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-N removal, various concentrations of Cl<sup>-</sup> were presented to a Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>/Ti/IrO<sub>2</sub>- $RuO_2/Ti NO_3$ -N removal system (Table 1). As the concentration of Cl<sup>-</sup> increased from 0 to 2000 mg/L, the removal efficiencies of  $NO_3$ -N were all >90%. At 4,000 mg/L Cl<sup>-</sup>, the removal efficiency decreased to 83.99% due to the oxidation of NH4<sup>+</sup> to NO3<sup>-</sup> by HClO/ClO<sup>-</sup>. The increase in Cl<sup>-</sup> concentration increased the amount of HClO/ClO<sup>-</sup> generated by anodic oxidation to reduce NH4+-N to N2. Hence, NH4+-N generation decreased and TN removal efficiency increased with increasing Cl<sup>-</sup> concentration. The TN removal efficiency reached 78.1% with negligible  $NH_4^+$ -N generation (0.34%) and without NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>-N accumulation.

#### 3.4 Long-Term Stability

In addition to the initial activity, the long-term performance of a catalyst is an essential requirement for its commercial application.





TABLE 1   Effects of Cl <sup>-</sup> on the Co <sub>3</sub> O <sub>4</sub> /Ti/lrO <sub>2</sub> -RuO <sub>2</sub> /Ti NO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup> -N removal system.				
CI <sup>−</sup> Concentration (mg/L)	NO₃ <sup>−</sup> -N removal (%)	$NO_2^-$ -N generation (%)	NH <sub>4</sub> <sup>+</sup> -N generation (%)	TN removal (%)
0	92.2	_	54.5	24.8
1000	90.7	_	37.2	38.3
2000	91.1	_	19.9	60.3
4,000	84.0	-	0.340	78.1

**Figure 9** shows the changes in  $NO_3^-$ -N removal and distribution of generated products over 4 h, and 10 consecutive cycles of 2 h each, using the system. At an initial concentration of 100 mg/L, almost all  $NO_3^-$ -N is converted into  $N_2$  after 4 h (**Figure 9A**). After 10 cycles (**Figure 9B**), the removal efficiencies of  $NO_3^-$ -N (~90%) and TN remained unchanged.

# 3.5 EC and CE

EC and CE are key evaluation factors for the commercial electrochemical treatment process (Zeng et al., 2020). The EC and CE under different process conditions using the system were calculated. It can be seen from **Figure 10A,B** that within 1 h after the start of the reaction, EC is lower and CE is higher than those of the follow-up experiments, but the  $NO_3^-$ -N removal rate is only 58.52%. After 2 h, the  $NO_3^-$ -N removal efficiency reaches 93.39% with an EC of 0.10 kW h/g  $NO_3^-$ -N and a CE of 40.3%. There was

no significant improvement in the follow-up, but the EC continued to rise, and the CE continued to decline.

The effect of the initial  $NO_3^-N$  concentration is demonstrated in **Figures 10C,D**. As the  $NO_3^-N$ concentration increased, the EC decreased and CE increased. This can be explained by the increase in the contact area between  $NO_3^-N$  and the electrode surface with increasing concentrations, which promotes the reduction reaction. From an economic viewpoint, the results indicate that the  $Co_3O_4/Ti/IrO_2$ -RuO<sub>2</sub>/Ti electrocatalytic process is more suitable for wastewater with high concentrations of  $NO_3^-$ . The small amount of  $NO_3^$ remaining in the electrochemically treated wastewater can be removed by other processes, such as the electrocatalytic removal of  $NO_3^--N$ , which can be combined with constructed wetlands for wastewater control/remediation.





# **4 CONCLUSION**

A  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  electrode was successfully prepared by electrodeposition, and the material showed good electrocatalytic performance toward  $NO_3^-$ -RR. At an initial concentration of 100 mg/L  $NO_3^-$ -N, the removal rate was ~98% in 2 h (Pt anode; pH, 7.0; current density, 15 mA/cm<sup>2</sup>). The corresponding generation of

 $\rm NH_4^{+}-N$  was ~60%, while  $\rm NO_2^{-}-N$  was not detected. When  $\rm IrO_2-RuO_2/Ti$  was employed as the anode in the presence of Cl<sup>-</sup> (2000 mg/L), the removal efficiencies for  $\rm NO_3^{-}-N$  and TN under the same operating conditions were ~91% and ~60%, respectively, with an EC of 0.10 kW h/g  $\rm NO_3^{-}-N$  and a CE of 40.3%. After 4 h of continuous operation, 100% of  $\rm NO_3^{-}-N$  was converted into  $\rm N_2$ . In addition, the system could maintain the removal efficiencies of ~90% and ~60% for  $NO_3^-$ -N and TN, respectively, after 10 consecutive cycles (2 h each). This work provides a simple preparation method of electrodeposited  $Co_3O_4/Ti$  with good catalytic performance and stability, which provides a new preparation strategy for the  $Co_3O_4$  catalytic electrode.

# DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The original contributions presented in the study are included in the article/Supplementary Material, further inquiries can be directed to the corresponding author.

#### REFERENCES

- Barakat, A., Mouhtarim, G., Saji, R., and Touhami, F. (2020). Health Risk Assessment of Nitrates in the Groundwater of Beni Amir Irrigated Perimeter, Tadla Plain, Morocco. *Hum. Ecol. Risk Assess. Int. J.* 26 (7), 1864–1878. doi:10.1080/10807039.2019.1613631
- Chen, J., Shi, H., and Lu, J. (2007). Electrochemical Treatment of Ammonia in Wastewater by RuO2-IrO2-TiO2/Ti Electrodes. J. Appl. Electrochem 37 (10), 1137–1144. doi:10.1007/s10800-007-9373-6
- Clauwaert, P., Rabaey, K., Aelterman, P., De Schamphelaire, L., Pham, T. H., Boeckx, P., et al. (2007). Biological Denitrification in Microbial Fuel Cells. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 41 (9), 3354–3360. doi:10.1021/es062580r
- Della Rocca, C., Belgiorno Vand Meriç, S. (2007). Overview of *In-Situ* Applicable Nitrate Removal Processes. *Desalination J.* 204 (1), 46–62. doi:10.1016/j.desal. 2006.04.023
- Elmidaoui, A., Elhannouni, F., Menkouchi Sahli, M. A., Chay, L., Elabbassi, H., Hafsi, M., et al. (2001). Pollution of Nitrate in Moroccan Ground Water: Removal by Electrodialysis. *Desalination J.* 136 (1), 325–332. doi:10.1016/ s0011-9164(01)00195-3
- Garcia-Segura, S., Lanzarini-Lopes, M., Hristovski, K., and Westerhoff, P. (2018). Electrocatalytic Reduction of Nitrate: Fundamentals to Full-Scale Water Treatment Applications. *Appl. Catal. B Environ.* 236, 546–568. doi:10.1016/j. apcatb.2018.05.041
- Gayen, P., Spataro, J., Avasarala, S., Ali, A.-M., Cerrato, J. M., and Chaplin, B. P. (2018). Electrocatalytic Reduction of Nitrate Using Magnéli Phase TiO2 Reactive Electrochemical Membranes Doped with Pd-Based Catalysts. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 52 (16), 9370–9379. doi:10.1021/acs.est.8b03038
- Jasper, J. T., Jones, Z. L., Sharp, J. O., and Sedlak, D. L. (2014). Nitrate Removal in Shallow, Open-Water Treatment Wetlands. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 48 (19), 11512–11520. doi:10.1021/es502785t
- Kapoor, A., and Viraraghavan, T. (1997). Nitrate Removal from Drinking Water-Review. J. Environ. Eng. 123 (4), 371–380. doi:10.1061/(asce)0733-9372(1997) 123:4(371)
- Khalil, A. M. E., Eljamal, O., Jribi, S., and Matsunaga, N. (2016). Promoting Nitrate Reduction Kinetics by Nanoscale Zero Valent Iron in Water via Copper Salt Addition. *Chem. Eng. J.* 287, 367–380. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2015.11.038
- Kubicz, J., Pawełczyk, A., and Lochyński, P. (2018). Environmental Health Risk Posed by Contamination of the Individual Water Wells. *Chemosphere* 208, 247–256. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.05.182
- Serio, F., Miglietta, P. P., Lamastra, L., Ficocelli, S., Intini, F., De Leo, F., et al. (2018). Groundwater Nitrate Contamination and Agricultural Land Use: A Grey Water Footprint Perspective in Southern Apulia Region (Italy). Sci. Total Environ. 645, 1425–1431. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.07.241
- Soto-Hernández, J., Santiago-Ramirez, C. R., Ramirez-Meneses, E., Luna-Trujillo, M., Wang, J-A., Lartundo-Rojas, L., et al. (2019). Electrochemical Reduction of NOx Species at the Interface of Nanostructured Pd and PdCu Catalysts in Alkaline Conditions. *Appl. Catal. B Environ. J.* 259, 118048.
- Spalding, R. F., and Exner, M. E. (1993). Occurrence of Nitrate in Groundwater-A Review. J. Environ. Qual. 22 (3), 392–402. doi:10.2134/jeq1993. 00472425002200030002x

## **AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS**

CW: conceptualization, methodology, data analysis, and writing—original draft. ZC: data curation. HH: validation. HL: resources and funding acquisition. SW: conceptualization, investigation, and writing—review and editing.

# FUNDING

This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (grant numbers 51978181, 51808527, 51727812, and 52131003).

- Su, L., Li, K., Zhang, H., Fan, M., Ying, D., Sun, T., et al. (2017). Electrochemical Nitrate Reduction by Using a Novel Co 3 O 4/Ti Cathode. *Water Res.* 120, 1–11. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2017.04.069
- Taguchi, S., and Feliu, J. M. (2007). Electrochemical Reduction of Nitrate on Pt(S) [n(111)×(111)] Electrodes in Perchloric Acid Solution. *Electrochimica Acta* 52 (19), 6023–6033. doi:10.1016/j.electacta.2007.03.057
- Teng, W., Bai, N., Liu, Y., Liu, Y., Fan, J., and Zhang, W.-x. (2018). Selective Nitrate Reduction to Dinitrogen by Electrocatalysis on Nanoscale Iron Encapsulated in Mesoporous Carbon. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 52 (1), 230–236. doi:10.1021/acs. est.7b04775
- Yang, G. C. C., and Lee, H.-L. (2005). Chemical Reduction of Nitrate by Nanosized Iron: Kinetics and Pathways. *Water Res.* 39 (5), 884–894. doi:10.1016/j.watres. 2004.11.030
- Yang, J., Sebastian, P., Duca, M., Hoogenboom, T., and Koper, M. T. M. (2014). pH Dependence of the Electroreduction of Nitrate on Rh and Pt Polycrystalline Electrodes. *Chem. Commun.* 50 (17), 2148–2151. doi:10.1039/c3cc49224a
- Yang, M., Wang, J., Shuang, C., and Li, A. (2020). The Improvement on Total Nitrogen Removal in Nitrate Reduction by Using a Prepared CuO-Co3O4/Ti Cathode. *Chemosphere* 255, 126970. doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2020.126970
- Yi, Z., Kangning, C., Wei, W., Wang, J., and Lee, S. (2007). Effect of IrO2 Loading on RuO2-IrO2-TiO2 Anodes: A Study of Microstructure and Working Life for the Chlorine Evolution Reaction. *Ceram. Int.* 33 (6), 1087–1091. doi:10.1016/j. ceramint.2006.03.025
- Zeng, Y., Priest, C., Wang, G., and Wu, G. (2020). Restoring the Nitrogen Cycle by Electrochemical Reduction of Nitrate: Progress and Prospects. *Small Methods* 4, 2000672. doi:10.1002/smtd.202000672
- Zhang, X., Wang, Y., Liu, C., Yu, Y., Lu, S., and Zhang, B. (2021). Recent Advances in Non-Noble Metal Electrocatalysts for Nitrate Reduction. *Chem. Eng. J.* 403, 126269. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2020.126269
- Zhang, Z., Xu, Y., Shi, W., Wang, W., Zhang, R., Bao, X., et al. (2016). Electrochemical-catalytic Reduction of Nitrate over Pd-Cu/ $\gamma$ Al 2 O 3 Catalyst in Cathode Chamber: Enhanced Removal Efficiency and N 2 Selectivity. *Chem. Eng. J.* 290, 201–208. doi:10.1016/j.cej.2016.01.063

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

**Publisher's Note:** All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors, and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

Copyright © 2022 Wang, Cao, Huang, Liu and Wang. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.