



### Validation of Reliable Reference Genes for RT-qPCR Studies of Target Gene Expression in *Colletotrichum camelliae* During Spore Germination and Mycelial Growth and Interaction With Host Plants

#### Shengnan Het, Tai Ant, Runa A and Shouan Liu\*

Laboratory of Molecular Plant Pathology, College of Plant Science, Jilin University, Changchun, China

#### **OPEN ACCESS**

#### Edited by:

Raffaella Balestrini, Institute for Sustainable Plant Protection, Italian National Research Council (IPSP-CNR), Italy

#### Reviewed by:

Taurai Tasara, University of Zurich, Switzerland Arunachalam Ramaiah, University of California, Irvine, United States Matteo Caser, University of Turin, Italy

\*Correspondence:

Shouan Liu shouan@jlu.edu.cn <sup>†</sup>These authors have contributed equally to this work

#### Specialty section:

This article was submitted to Fungi and Their Interactions, a section of the journal Frontiers in Microbiology

Received: 29 April 2019 Accepted: 20 August 2019 Published: 04 September 2019

#### Citation:

He S, An T, AR and Liu S (2019) Validation of Reliable Reference Genes for RT-qPCR Studies of Target Gene Expression in Colletotrichum camelliae During Spore Germination and Mycelial Growth and Interaction With Host Plants. Front. Microbiol. 10:2055. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2019.02055 The tea plant [Camellia sinensis (L.) O. Kuntze] is one of the most important leaf crops, and it is widely used for the production of non-alcoholic beverages worldwide. Tea also has a long history of medicinal use. Colletotrichum camelliae Massee is one of the dominant fungal pathogens that infects tea leaves and causes severe tea anthracnose disease. To analyze the molecular biology of C. camelliae, the quantification of pathogen gene expression by the RT-qPCR method is necessary. Reliable RT-qPCR results require the use of stable reference genes for data normalization. However, suitable reference genes have not been reported in C. camelliae thus far. In this study, 12 candidate genes (i.e., CcSPAC6B12.04c, CcWDR83, Cchp11, Ccnew1, CcHplo, CcRNF5, CcHpcob, CcfaeB-2, CcYER010C, CcRNM1, CcUP18, and CcACT) were isolated from C. camelliae and assessed as potential reference genes. The expression stability of these genes in C. camelliae during spore germination and mycelial growth and interaction with host plants was first evaluated using several statistical algorithms, such as geNorm, NormFinder, and Bestkeeper. A web-based analysis program, Refinder, was then used to find the most suitable reference genes. Our results indicated that Cenew1, CcHplo, and CcSPAC6B12.04c were the most stable reference genes in C. camelliae under all conditions. Our work provided the most suitable reference genes for future studies performed to quantify the target gene expression levels of C. camelliae.

Keywords: reference genes, tea plant, Colletotrichum camelliae, RT-qPCR, gene expression

### INTRODUCTION

*Colletotrichum* includes a wide range of fungal pathogens that cause serious diseases in various plants in tropical, subtropical, and temperate regions (Kubo, 2012; Yan et al., 2018). Their economic impacts have led to extensive studies on diverse aspects of fungal biology, including fungi-plant interactions, genomics and genetics, the cell biology of pathogen infection and colonization, and fungal virulence factors (De Silva et al., 2017; Villa-Rivera et al., 2017; Yan et al., 2018). Some species have been used as models for studying infection strategies and host-parasite interactions (De Silva et al., 2017; Yan et al., 2017; Yan et al., 2018). *Colletotrichum camelliae* is one of the dominant fungal pathogens that infects tea plants (Wang Y. et al., 2016; Lu et al., 2018). *C. camelliae* can damage tea leaves and cause

several tea diseases, such as tea anthracnose, tea leaf blight, and tea brown blight (Chen and Chen, 1990; Liu F. et al., 2015; Wang L. et al., 2016; Wang Y. et al., 2016; Lu et al., 2018).

The quantification of functional gene expression levels is one of the most important aspects in the systematic study of gene transcription and regulation (Marcial-Quino et al., 2016). The reverse transcription quantitative real-time polymerase chain reaction (RT-qPCR) method is frequently used to quantify target gene expression levels (Derveaux et al., 2010; Borowski et al., 2014; Mcintosh et al., 2016). The RT-qPCR method is simple, reproducible, highly sensitive, and practical in detecting gene transcription (Klein, 2002; Hao et al., 2014). However, reliable RT-qPCR results require suitable reference genes for data analysis. The use of inadequate reference genes may result in incorrect expression data (Amil-Ruiz et al., 2013; Galli et al., 2015). Thus, the suitable reference genes in C. camelliae should be constantly expressed among the samples, and their expression is assumed to be unaffected by different experimental conditions (Bustin, 2002; Galli et al., 2015).

ACT, TUB, GAPDH, and 18SRNA are often used as reference genes because of their functions in basic cellular processes, cell structure maintenance, or primary metabolism (Galli et al., 2015). Reports have shown that several traditional reference genes were used in Colletotrichum spp.; for example, the ACT gene was used in C. higginsianum not only to quantify fungal growth but also to normalize the expression of the MFS transporter gene ChMFS1 (Narusaka et al., 2009; Liu et al., 2017). In C. acutatum and C. gloeosporioides, the  $\beta$ -TUB gene was used to normalize the expression of two ABC genes, CaABC1 and CgABCF2 (Kim et al., 2014; Zhou et al., 2017). In C. lindemuthianum and C. coccodes, two conserved genes, GAPDH and 18SRNA, were also used as reference genes (Ben-Daniel et al., 2012; Pereira et al., 2013; Galli et al., 2015). However, no suitable reference genes have been reported in C. camelliae for RT-qPCR analysis, although stably expressed referenced genes are believed to occur in C. camelliae, even under different experimental conditions. Thus, suitable reference genes in *C. camelliae* should be identified.

In the present study, we evaluated the stability of 12 candidate genes to identify the most suitable reference genes for transcript normalization in *C. camelliae* during spore germination and mycelial growth and interaction with hosts. To evaluate the efficacy of selected reference genes, we investigated the expression of a target gene involved with an ABC transporter during *C. camelliae* spore germination and mycelial growth and its interaction with tea plants. To our knowledge, this is the first analysis of the expression stability of suitable reference genes in *C. camelliae*.

### MATERIALS AND METHODS

## Plants, Pathogen Materials, and Treatments

Tea plant *Camellia sinensis* cultivar Longjing 43 (LJ43) was used for all assays. Two-year-old tea were grown in a microbe-free climate chamber under 12-h light/12-h dark conditions at  $25^{\circ}$ C and 60–80% relative humidity before inoculation. For fungal inoculation, mature leaves of 2-year-old LJ43 were collected randomly. The *C. camelliae* isolate CCA was isolated from a diseased garden in Fancun, which is located in Hangzhou, China. The fungal isolate was cultivated on PDA plates at 22°C in a climate chamber (12-h light/12-h dark) for 10 days. *C. camelliae* spores were then collected, washed, and frozen at  $-80^{\circ}$ C in 0.8% NaCl with a concentration of  $10^{8}$  spores mL<sup>-1</sup> as previously indicated (Liu S. et al., 2015).

For the inoculation of tea plants, spores were diluted in  $ddH_2O$  with a final concentration of  $10^6$  spore mL<sup>-1</sup>. Six to eight droplets (20  $\mu$ L for one droplet) of diluted spores were applied to each single detached tea leaf. The leaves were wounded with a narrow razor blade before inoculation. In each treatment, at least 40 mature leaves were randomly selected from more than 20 tea plants. For the control, spores were incubated in ddH<sub>2</sub>O. Infection was carried out on a bench at room temperature. After infection for different times (e.g., 12, 14, or 24 h), the fungi were recovered from tea leaves and then frozen at  $-80^{\circ}C$  for RNA assays. Three independent biological replicates were performed.

For the effects of tea catechins (Aladdin, China) on *C. camelliae* gene expression, the fungus was incubated on PDA solid media (Lu et al., 2018). The compound was dissolved in ddH<sub>2</sub>O and then mixed with sterile melted PDA medium to obtain a final concentration of 0.25 mg mL<sup>-1</sup>. The PDA medium was then poured into 9.0 cm diameter Petri plates for the inoculation with 0.8 cm disks of *C. camelliae* CCA. Each treatment was performed in 3 replicates. The PDA plates containing ddH<sub>2</sub>O (without any tea catechins) were used as the control. Fresh spores of *C. camelliae* CCA were also used as a 0-h control. The mycelia were harvested at 3 and 6 days, respectively. The fresh spores and mycelia were frozen at  $-80^{\circ}$ C and used for RNA assays.

# Total RNA Extraction and Reverse Transcription

Approximately 0.1 mg fungal fresh mycelia or 10<sup>6</sup> spores were used for RNA extraction. The samples were first frozen in liquid nitrogen and homogenized using a Tissue Lyser (Qiagen, Hilden, Germany) for 2  $\times$  30 sec at 30 strokes/sec. RNA was then extracted using 1.0 mL TRIzol® Reagent (Life Technologies, Foster City, CA, United States) according to the manufacturer's instructions. Finally, the total RNA was dissolved in nucleasefree water. The purity and concentration of the isolated RNA were estimated by a Nanodrop ND-1000 spectrophotometer (Nanodrop Technologies, Wilmington, DE, United States). RNA with an A260/A280 ratio of 1.8-2.0 was used for cDNA synthesis. The quality and integrity of the purified RNA templates was further confirmed by agarose gel electrophoresis. cDNA was synthesized from 1.0  $\mu$ g of total RNA using the PrimeScript<sup>TM</sup> RT reagent kit with gDNA Eraser (Takara, Dalian, China) to remove the genomic DNA contamination.

## Selection of Candidate Reference Genes and Primer Design

*CcACT* was chosen as a PCR reference gene in the present study according to previous reports (Wang Y. et al., 2016;

Ning et al., 2018). Eleven candidate reference genes were chosen from the transcriptomic data of *C. camelliae* during the infection of tea plants (**Supplementary Table S1**). The open reading frame (ORF) sequences of 11 candidate reference genes from *C. camelliae* were first cloned using 2x Primer Star mix (Takara, Dalian, China) as the polymerase. The purified PCR products were ligated into the pEASY®-Blunt simple cloning vector (TranGen, Beijing, China) and then transformed into *Escherichia coli*. The bacterial liquids were sequenced by Comate Bioscience (Comate, Changchun, China). A bioinformatics analysis of the reference gene was performed by BLAST<sup>1</sup>. The RT-qPCR primers for all candidate genes were designed by Primer-BLAST<sup>2</sup> and are presented in **Table 1**.

### **Quantitative Real-Time PCR**

For qPCR analysis, approximately 20 ng of cDNA was mixed with 0.2 mM gene-specific primers and SYBR Green Supermix in a total volume of 10 µL. The qPCR was performed using a LightCycler<sup>®</sup> 480 system (Roche) according to the manufacturer's instructions. The PCR program consisted of a preliminary step of 1 min at 95°C followed by 40 cycles at 95°C for 15 s and at 60°C for 34 s. No-template and no-RT controls for each primer pair were included. Each qPCR was performed in triplicate, and each experiment was independently repeated for three times. Standard curves were drawn to determine the amplification efficiency (E) and correlation coefficient (*R*<sup>2</sup>) of the diluted series on the basis of the 10-fold diluted cDNA series (Wu et al., 2016). We used the following equation to calculate the qPCR efficiency:  $E = (10^{\{-1/slope\}} - 1) \times 100\%$ .

### Validation of Reference Genes

The expression of the 12 candidate genes was first evaluated according to the quantification cycle (Cq) value. Determination of the expression stability of the genes was then performed with three statistical algorithms (Bestkeeper, NormFinder, and geNorm) for the evaluation and selection of reference genes (Vandesompele et al., 2002; Andersen et al., 2004; Pfaffl et al., 2004; Marcial-Quino et al., 2016). The Cq values obtained for each of the analyzed genes were used to monitor the stability of the genes with these three methods, thus identifying the best reference genes for the normalization of data in RT-qPCR analyses (Marcial-Quino et al., 2016). Finally, Refinder was used to comprehensively evaluate and rank the reference genes from experimental data (Xie et al., 2011).

For the validation and quantification of the target gene (*CcABC8*) expression after pathogen infection, the  $2^{-\Delta\Delta CT}$  method was used (Livak and Schmittgen, 2001). Statistical analyses were performed using a Student's homoscedastic two-tailed *t*-test. Statistical significance is considered at \**P* < 0.05 and \*\**P* < 0.01. Three replicates of three independent experiments were performed. The qPCR primers for *CcABC8* included CcABC8S (5'-TCCCTCCTCCTGACTCTCCT-3') and CcABC8A (5'-TGGATCAATGTTGTCACGGA-3').

### RESULTS

## Isolation and Characterization of Candidate Reference Genes

The candidate reference genes were identified from the C. camelliae transcriptome by a homology analysis with Colletotrichum spp. (Supplementary Table S1). The transcripts of these genes were slightly changed during C. camelliae spore germination and during its interaction with host plants, thereby we chose them for further analysis. The ORF sequence of each gene was cloned from C. camelliae CCA based on the transcriptomic data (Supplementary Figure S1 and Supplementary Table S2). Protein-protein BLAST analysis indicated that two genes had the highest homology (89.5 and 98.9%) with C. fructicola Nara gc5, while others had the highest homology with C. gloeosporioides Cg-14 (from 82.3 to 99%) (Alkan et al., 2013; Gan et al., 2013). Among these candidate reference genes, one was similar to the ran-interacting Mog1 protein and named CcRNM1, a second gene was similar to kynurenine aminotransferase and named CcSPAC6B12.04c, a third gene was a DlpA domain-containing protein and referred to as CcYER010, and other genes were annotated as hypothetical proteins and named CcHpcob, Ccnew1, CcHplo, CcfaeB-2, CcWDR83, Cchp11, CcRNF5, and CcUP18.

The bioinformatics results for the amino acid sequence information are shown in **Supplementary Table S2**. The total amino acid number for the candidate reference gene was from 78 for Ccnew1 to 876 for CcHpcob; therefore, the lowest predicted molecular weight (MW) was 8.6 kDa for Ccnew1, and the highest MW was 100.5 kDa for CcHpcob. Most of the proteins had MWs ranging from 20 to 65 kDa. The predicted isoelectric point (pI) was from 4.3 for CcRNM1 to 11.0 for CcUP18, and many of proteins had pI values from 4.5 to 7.5.

# Determination of Primer Specificity and Efficiency

Based on the candidate reference genes observed, 12 pairs of primers were designed (**Table 1**). A traditional reference gene, *CcACT*, was also isolated and included. The cDNA was synthesized from RNA obtained from organisms isolated at 12 h after infection of the plant cultivar Longjing 43. *C. camelliae* spores inoculated with  $ddH_2O$  were used as a non-plant inoculation control (CK).

The melting curves observed from the PCR amplification products for each of the genes showed a single distinct sharp peak (**Figure 1A**). The specificity of the primers for all genes was further tested in 2.0% agarose gels. For all the candidate reference genes, a single PCR amplification band of the expected size was observed (**Figure 1B**), indicating that primer dimers and non-specific amplified products were not generated (Marcial-Quino et al., 2016).

In a second experiment, the efficiency of the primers was detected using a 10-fold dilution series of cDNA from *C. camelliae* CCA (CK and 12 h). For all of the above cDNA samples, the PCR amplification efficiencies for the candidate genes varied from 99.49% for *CcfaeB-2* to 100.00% for *Ccnew1* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>https://blast.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/Blast.cgi

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/tools/primer-blast/

Reference genes	Colletotrichum ortholog	Colletotrichum locus description	Forward/reverse primer sequence (5′–3′)	Amplicon size (bp)	<b>RT-qPCR</b> efficiency (%) 99.91–99.96	<b>Tm (°C)</b> 85.2
CcRNM1	EQB58236	Ran-interacting Mog1 protein	ACGGGCGTTATTTGGACC/ CACACAGTGAGGGTAGCGAAT	148		
CcSPAC6B12.04c	ELA24928	Kynurenine aminotransferase	CATTGCCGAGGACTACATCC/ TTCTTCAACCCACGCAGC	86	99.91	85.2
СсНрсоb	EQB50494	Hypothetical protein CGLO_10066	ACGAGCCTGTTCAGAATGCTA/ GACTTGCTATCTTGGACGGGT	87 99.98–99.99		84.9
Ccnew1	EQB44976	Hypothetical protein CGLO_16211	CGTGGCTTTGAAATCAGACC/ CCATCTCGTGACTAGGAGCAA	107	99.99–100	84.3
CcHplo	EQB45128	Hypothetical protein CGLO_16041	ACATAGCATCGCATCCCG/ TTCCTCAGGGTCGAACTCC	124	99.98–99.99	86.4
CcfaeB-2	EQB48532	Hypothetical protein CGLO_12218	GACCTGTCGGCTTGTCTGAC/ AGGTTGTGGACATTCGCATC	95 99.49–99.94		86.4
CcWDR83	EQB49172	Hypothetical protein CGLO_11518	TAATCGCTGGAGACGAGTTGA/ TCTTGGGTTCATAGCCTTCG	140	99.99	87.3
Cchp11	EQB55695	Hypothetical protein CGLO_04353	TTTCGCAAGCCCTCTTTG/ CAAGCCTTTGGTTTCCCTG	82	99.91–99.96	82.5
CcRNF5	EQB48134	Hypothetical protein CGLO_12656	TGACGACGACATCTTTGGC/ ACGCATGTAAACGCGGAC	158	99.98–99.99	85.8
CcYER010C	EQB57386	DlpA domain-containing protein	GATCAACCCTGGCGATATTCT/ TCCGCAACTCAACAAACATCT	133	99.94–99.99	85.8
CcUP18	ELA35911	Hypothetical protein CGGC5_4557	GGATCGAGAGAGGGACTTGC/ CTCTGTCGTCGTCCTTGTCC	94	99.9–99.99	86.1
CcACT	KJ954363	Actin	GTTTCGCCGGTGACGATG/ CTGGCCCATACCAATCATGA	78	99.71–99.82	86.4

TABLE 1 | Description and characterization of the candidate reference genes for RT-gPCR.

(Table 1). The primers yielded linear amplification on a range of cDNA concentrations and the correlation coefficient  $R^2$  were from 93.2% for *Ccnew1* to 99.97% for *CcSPAC6B12.04c* (Figure 2). For the gene primers, such as *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, *Cchp11*, *CcRNM1*, and *CcfaeB-2*,  $R^2$  was over 99%, indicating that these primer pairs were well-suited for amplification of the gene even when using very low cDNA input.

## Expression Profiles of Candidate Reference Genes

A reliable reference gene should present a constant expression level among different samples or different conditions (Galli et al., 2015); thus, we next checked the Cq values to evaluate the expression of these candidate reference genes. Total RNA was extracted from *C. camelliae* CCA fresh spores (un-germinated spores, CcFS0h), *C. camelliae* grown on PDA plates for 3 days (mycelium, CcPM3d) and 6 days (mycelium, CcPM6d), *C. camelliae* grown on PDA plates with tea catechins for 3 days (mycelium, CcPCM3d) and 6 days (mycelium, CcMPC6d), *C. camelliae* incubated on tea plant LJ43 for 14 h (CcTP14h) and *C. camelliae* spores incubated with ddH<sub>2</sub>O for 14 h (control, spores germinated in ddH<sub>2</sub>O, CcGe14h). Total RNA was reverse transcribed into cDNA and then used for RT-qPCR.

As shown in **Figure 3**, the 12 candidate reference genes showed a narrow Cq range among all experimental series. The Cq values ranged from 23.5 to 28.7. Transcription of *CcACT* showed the most abundant level, while the gene *CcfaeB-2* was the least abundant transcript. It indicated that each reference gene had varied expression ranges in all studied samples (Hao et al., 2014). *CcHpcob* had the lowest variation in expression across the studied reference genes, while *CcfaeB-2* showed the highest variation in expression (**Figure 3**).

## Expression Stability of the Candidate Genes

First, to calculate the reference gene expression stability, geNorm software was used (Vandesompele et al., 2002). According to geNorm, the candidate gene that had the lowest value was considered the most stable gene (Zhao et al., 2019). As shown in Table 2, Ccnew1, CcfaeB-2, CcWDR83, CcHpcob, and CcHplo were the top five stable candidate reference genes during C. camelliae spore germination and its interaction with hosts (group 1: CcFS, CcGe, and CcTP), while Ccnew1, CcfaeB-2, CcSPAC6B12.04c, CcHplo, and CcYER010C were the top five genes during mycelial growth (group 2: CcM). Three genes, Ccnew1, CcfaeB-2 and CcHplo, were detected in both groups, indicating that these genes were stable under each condition. Furthermore, in a combined group analyzed by geNorm software, the top five stable candidate reference genes were Ccnew1, CcHplo, CcWDR83, CcSPAC6B12.04c, and CcHpcob. This finding indicates that these genes are relatively stable during spore germination and mycelial growth and infection processes.

NormFinder software is based on a mathematical model of separate analyses of sample subgroups and the estimation of both intra- and intergroup expression variations (Andersen et al., 2004; Wu et al., 2016). Genes with stable expression were indicated by low average expression stability values (Wu et al., 2016). Based on NormFinder analysis, *Ccnew1*, *CcWDR83*,



*CcfaeB-2*, *CcHpcob*, and *CcHplo* were the top five stable candidate reference genes in group 1, which were the same as the genes identified by geNorm software (**Table 2**). In group 2, the top five stable genes were *Ccnew1*, *CcfaeB-2*, *CcHplo*, *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, and *CcRNM1*. Interestingly, *Ccnew1*, *CcfaeB-2*, and *CcHplo* were also observed in both groups. This result was the same as that found by the geNorm analysis and further confirmed that these genes were stable under each condition. In the combined group, the top five stable genes were *Ccnew1*, *CcHplo*, *CcWDR83*, *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, and *CcRNF5*. Based on NormFinder, these genes are relatively stable under all conditions.

Bestkeeper, which calculates the CP standard deviation (SD) and the coefficient of variance (CV) for each gene, was additionally used (Pfaffl et al., 2004; Marcial-Quino et al., 2016). Stable reference genes have a relatively low coefficient of variance and standard deviation (CV  $\pm$  SD). Genes with SD values < 1 are considered stable and thus are suitable as reference

genes (Marcial-Quino et al., 2016). The results of analysis for the 12 reference genes showed markedly stable expression in both group 1 and group 2 samples except *Cchp11* (**Table 2**). However, under the combined condition, the suitable reference genes observed by Bestkeeper were *CcHpcob*, *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, *CcRNM1*, *Ccnew1*, and *CcHplo*.

To identify the most suitable reference genes, RefFinder was used to analyze stability of the candidate reference genes. The outcome of four programs ( $\Delta$ Ct, Bestkeeper, geNorm, and NormFinder) were integrated by RefFinder (Xie et al., 2011), and *Ccnew1*, *CcfaeB-2*, *CcHpcob*, and *CcWDR83* appeared to be the most stable reference genes during *C. camelliae* spore germination and its interaction with hosts (group 1), while *Ccnew1*, *CcfaeB-2*, *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, and *CcHplo* were the most stable reference genes during mycelial growth (group 2) (**Figures 4A,B**). *Ccnew1* and *CcfaeB-2* seemed stable in each group when target gene expression was analyzed



FIGURE 2 | Validation of primers for RT-qPCR quantification of the tea pathogen. The primer efficiency for the RT-qPCR quantification of the gene was determined using a serial dilution of cDNA templates from *C. camelliae*. The respective correlation coefficients (*R*<sup>2</sup>) are indicated.



#### TABLE 2 | Gene expression stability ranked by geNorm, NormFinder, and BestKeeper software programs.

Group	Rank	geNorm		NormFinder		BestKeeper		
		Gene	Stability	Gene	Stability	Gene	SD	CV
Spore germination and	1	Ccnew1   CcfaeB-2	0.299	Ccnew1	0.269	CcSPAC6B12.04c	0.37	1.49
interaction with hosts (group 1)	2			CcWDR83	0.315	CcHpcob	0.53	2.18
	3	CcWDR83	0.338	CcfaeB-2	0.318	CcHplo	0.55	2.15
	4	CcHpcob	0.374	CcHpcob	0.356	Ccnew1	0.58	2.23
	5	CcHplo	0.404	CcHplo	0.437	CcYER010C	0.6	2.21
	6	CcACT	0.549	CcYER010C	0.581	CcfaeB-2	0.61	1.96
	7	CcYER010C	0.629	CcACT	0.672	CcACT	0.63	2.98
	8	CcUP18	0.689	CcUP18	0.726	CcRNM1	0.63	2.51
	9	CcRNM1	0.754	Cchp11	0.904	CcWDR83	0.73	2.6
	10	CcSPAC6B12.04c	0.803	CcRNM1	0.937	CcRNF5	0.96	3.67
	11	Cchp11	0.856	CcSPAC6B12.04c	0.964	CcUP18	0.97	3.28
	12	CcRNF5	0.94	CcRNF5	1.231	Cchp11	1.19	4.2
Mycelial growth (group 2)	1	Ccnew1   CcfaeB-2	0.144	Ccnew1	0.099	CcACT	0.55	2.2
	2			CcfaeB-2	0.185	Ccnew1	0.56	2.3
	3	CcSPAC6B12.04c	0.225	CcHplo	0.205	CcfaeB-2	0.56	2.07
	4	CcHplo	0.28	CcSPAC6B12.04c	0.292	CcSPAC6B12.04c	0.58	2.42
	5	CcYER010C	0.304	CcRNM1	0.326	CcHpcob	0.58	2.39
	6	CcRNF5	0.333	CcRNF5	0.338	CcHplo	0.61	2.6
	7	CcRNM1	0.38	CcYER010C	0.343	CcRNM1	0.62	2.48
	8	CcHpcob	0.426	CcHpcob	0.483	CcRNF5	0.63	2.57
	9	CcACT	0.472	CcACT	0.602	CcYER010C	0.69	2.8
	10	CcUP18	0.526	CcUP18	0.694	CcWDR83	0.7	2.67
	11	CcWDR83	0.593	CcWDR83	0.813	CcUP18	0.71	2.74
	12	Cchp11	0.652	Cchp11	0.844	Cchp11	1.09	4.21
Total (combined group)	1	Ccnew1   CcHplo	0.288	Ccnew1	0.115	CcHpcob	0.56	2.31
	2			CcHplo	0.242	CcSPAC6B12.04c	0.6	2.5
	3	CcWDR83	0.579	CcWDR83	0.545	CcRNM1	0.63	2.52
	4	CcSPAC6B12.04c	0.771	CcSPAC6B12.04c	0.673	Ccnew1	0.91	3.61
	5	CcHpcob	0.86	CcRNF5	0.746	CcHplo	0.99	4.0
	6	CcRNM1	0.896	CcYER010C	0.794	CcRNF5	1.1	4.48
	7	CcRNF5	0.95	CcHpcob	0.795	CcWDR83	1.12	4.46
	8	CcYER010C	0.991	CcRNM1	0.844	CcYER010C	1.45	5.64
	9	Cchp11	1.045	Cchp11	1.009	Cchp11	1.6	5.94
	10	CcfaeB-2	1.129	CcUP18	1.423	CcUP18	1.89	6.89
	11	CcUP18	1.18	CcfaeB-2	1.442	CcACT	1.92	8.18
	12	CcACT	1.5	CcACT	3.034	CcfaeB-2	2.08	7.26

SD, standard deviation; CV, coefficient of variation.

separately. When target gene expression was analyzed under both conditions, *Ccnew1*, *CcHplo*, *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, and *CcWDR83* were the most stable reference genes (**Figure 4C**). However, *CcfaeB-2*, *CcHpcob*, and *CcWDR83* were observed as the least stable reference genes under at least one condition (**Figures 4A–C**). In conclusion, we considered *Ccnew1*, *CcHplo*, and *CcSPAC6B12.04c* to be the most stable reference genes that could be used to compare and analyze the target gene expression in *C. camelliae* during spore germination, mycelial growth and its interaction with host plants.

### **Evaluation of Reference Genes**

To evaluate and compare the functional gene expression in *C. camelliae*, the *Cenew1*, *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, *CcHplo*, *Cchp11*,

*CcACT*, and *CcUP18* genes were selected as reference genes for RT-qPCR. *Cenew1* was the most stable reference gene under all conditions. *CcSPAC6B12.04c* was the most suitable candidate reference gene even when using a low cDNA input. *CcHplo* was also very stable during mycelial growth and under the combined condition. *CcACT* was the least stable reference gene under the combined condition, while the *Cchp11* and *CcUP18* genes were the least stable reference gene that may be involved with the ABC transporter (*CcABC8*) to test its expression.

As shown in **Figures 5D–F**, the expression level of *CcABC8* showed no significant differences between *C. camelliae* spore germination (CcGe) and interaction with the tea plant (CcTP) when we used *CcACT*, *Cchp11*, and *CcUP18* as the reference



FIGURE 4 | Expression stability of the candidate reference genes in *C. camelliae* as calculated by RefFinder. (A) Expression stability of the candidate reference genes during *C. camelliae* spore germination and interaction with tea plants. (B) Expression stability of the candidate reference genes during *C. camelliae* mycelial growth. (C) Expression stability of the candidate reference genes in *C. camelliae* under the combined condition.



biological replicates. \*P < 0.05; \*\*P < 0.01.

genes. When we used *Cenew1*, *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, or *CcHplo* as the reference genes, we detected significant *CcABC8* gene induction during pathogen interaction with the tea plant (**Figures 5A–C**).

In addition, the expression of *CcABC8* during *C. camelliae* mycelial growth was also tested. Since the *C. camelliae* spores were incubated on PDA plates at the beginning (CcFS0h) of the experiment, we used CcFS0h as the control. As shown in **Figures 6A–D**, the expression of *CcABC8* increased during *C. camelliae* growth on PDA plates (CcPM) or PDA plates with catechins (CcPCM) for 3 and 6 days when using *Cenew1*, *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, *CcHplo*, or *CcACT* as reference genes, respectively. This indicates that the gene was induced during mycelial growth. The expression of *CcABC8* was higher after growing on PDA plates for 6 days than 3 days (**Figures 6A–D**).

However, the expression of *CcABC8* was not significantly increased in fungal mycelium compared with the control when using *Cchp11* and *CcUP18* as reference genes (**Figures 6E,F**).

These results indicated that (i) the use of unstable reference genes will lead to differences in the relative transcript profile and (ii) the use of different suitable references could have diverse significant results during qPCR.

### DISCUSSION

To analyze the gene functions of the tea plant pathogen *C. camelliae*, gene expression differences might be important to analyze (Lu et al., 2018). RT-qPCR has become an important

technique for studying gene transcript profiles as its sensitivity, accuracy, and reproducibility (Klein, 2002; Bustin et al., 2005; Hao et al., 2014; Wang et al., 2017). The reliability of the results of gene expression in RT-qPCR studies is dependent on the use of suitable reference genes for the microbe and the condition under study (Galli et al., 2015; Huang et al., 2018). The expression of the reference genes should not change with time or under different experimental conditions (Bustin, 2002; Melgar-Rojas Pedro et al., 2015). However, the stability among traditionally used reference genes is relative, and there is no single gene that has a constant stable expression under all experimental conditions (Radonic et al., 2004; Czechowski et al., 2005). Under specific experimental conditions, it might be misleading to use previously identified reference genes for the normalization of target gene expression in C. camelliae without first investigating their stability (Amil-Ruiz et al., 2013; Galli et al., 2015). Therefore, CcSPAC6B12.04c, CcWDR83, Cchp11, Ccnew1, CcRNF5, CcHpcob, CcfaeB-2, CcYER010C, CcRNM1, CcUP18, and CcACT were selected here for validation under the experimental conditions.

The expression of candidate reference genes were first evaluated with the Cq value in RT-qPCR. The Cq values for most of the tested samples were approximately 25. Even after 1000-fold dilution, the Cq value for nine candidate genes was still lower than 35.0. All candidate reference genes had very good linear amplification, and four of them had  $R^2$  values greater than 99%. Notably, the  $R^2$  value of *CcSPAC6B12.04* was 100%. The Cq value comparison provided an approximation of the stability of gene expression.

The programs geNorm, NormFinder, and Bestkeeper were then used to determine which reference gene was most suitable for transcript normalization during C. camelliae spore germination, mycelial growth, and fungal interaction with the tea plants. Among the 12 candidate reference genes, Ccnew1 was ranked first in both the geNorm and NormFinder analyses under all conditions. The Cq SD value of Ccnew1 was < 1 based on the Bestkeeper program, which was consistent with reference genes with SD values < 1 that are considered stable (Pfaffl et al., 2004; Marcial-Quino et al., 2016). Taken together, Ccnew1 was the most stable reference gene for the detection of target gene expression not only during C. camelliae spore germination and its interaction with hosts, but also during mycelial growth. Here, the result indicates that Ccnew1 is a universal reference gene that is stably expressed under different experimental conditions in this study.

We further used Refinder analysis to reduce bias or avoid contradictory results caused by the use of individual methods,  $\Delta$ Ct, Bestkeeper, geNorm, and NormFinder (Xie et al., 2011; Marcial-Quino et al., 2016). Based on this, the most stable reference genes were *Ccnew1*, *CcHplo* and *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, while the least stable genes were *Cchp11* and *CcUP18*. Interestingly, *CcfaeB-2* was ranked the second most stable gene not only in *C. camelliae* spore germination but also in mycelial growth (**Figures 4A,B**), whereas it ranked the second least stable reference gene under all conditions (**Figure 4C**). One reason that explains the difference may be the highest variation in expression of *CcfaeB-2* (**Figure 3**).

During previous studies of gene expression in *Colletotrichum* spp., *ACT* was often used to normalize qPCR because it was



stably expressed in many other microbes (Narusaka et al., 2009; Liu et al., 2017). Similarly, *CcACT* seems stably expressed during *C. camelliae* mycelial growth (**Figure 4B**). However, under the combined conditions, *CcACT* was ranked as the least stably expressed reference gene (**Figure 4C**). Nevertheless, if only the expression of target genes was detected during mycelial growth, then *CcACT* could be a choice for reference gene (**Figure 6D**). In conclusion, the commonly used reference genes need to be reconfirmed according to specific experimental conditions.

To validate the suitability of potential reference genes, the expression profile of a target gene was assessed in *C. camelliae*, with *Cenew1*, *CcHplo*, *CcSPAC6B12.04c*, *CcACT*, *Cchp11*, and *CcUP18* as internal reference genes. The gene expression patterns were highly similar but the expression levels were significantly different from that of the treatments when the most stably expressed reference genes were used, while the transcript levels could be inaccurate or present no significant differences when the least stably expressed reference genes were used (**Figures 5**, **6**). Thus, using a reliable reference gene is a prerequisite for accurate RT-qPCR data analyses of *C. camelliae*.

### CONCLUSION

To our knowledge, this is the first report describing the identification of suitable reference genes for RT-qPCR analyses in *C. camelliae*. We evaluated 12 candidate reference genes for the normalization of gene expression in *C. camelliae*. Common statistical algorithms and a web-based analysis program were used and indicated that *Cenew1*, *CcHplo*, and *CcSPAC6B12.04c* were the most stable reference genes. In addition, *Cchp11* and *CcUP18* seem to be unsuitable as internal controls under the experimental conditions we tested. Additionally, the analysis of the *CcABC8* expression level confirmed the importance of selecting suitable reference genes for the normalization

### REFERENCES

- Alkan, N., Meng, X., Friedlander, G., Reuveni, E., Sukno, S., Sherman, A., et al. (2013). Global aspects of pacC regulation of pathogenicity genes in *Collectorichum gloeosporioides* as revealed by transcriptome analysis. *Mol. Plant Microbe Int.* 26, 1345–1358. doi: 10.1094/MPMI-03-13-0080-R
- Amil-Ruiz, F., Garrido-Gala, J., Blanco-Portales, R., Folta, K. M., Muñoz-Blanco, J., and Caballero, J. L. (2013). Identification and validation of reference genes for transcript normalization in strawberry (*Fragaria*× ananassa) defense responses. *PLoS One* 8:e70603. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0070603
- Andersen, C. L., Jensen, J. L., and Ørntoft, T. F. (2004). Normalization of real-time quantitative reverse transcription-PCR data: a model-based variance estimation approach to identify genes suited for normalization, applied to bladder and colon cancer data sets. *Cancer Res.* 64, 5245–5250. doi: 10.1158/0008-5472.can-04-0496
- Ben-Daniel, B.-H., Bar-Zvi, D., and Tsror Lahkim, L. (2012). Pectate lyase affects pathogenicity in natural isolates of *Colletotrichum coccodes* and in pelA genedisrupted and gene-overexpressing mutant lines. *Mol. Plant Pathol.* 13, 187– 197. doi: 10.1111/j.1364-3703.2011.00740.x
- Borowski, J. M., Galli, V., Silva Messias, R., Perin, E. C., Buss, J. H., and Anjos e Silva, S. D. (2014). Selection of candidate reference genes for real-time PCR studies in lettuce under abiotic stresses. *Planta* 239, 1187–1200. doi: 10.1007/ s00425-014-2041-2

of RT-qPCR data. The reference genes selected here provide important choices for target gene expression and functional studies in *C. camelliae*.

### DATA AVAILABILITY

All datasets generated for this study are included in the manuscript and/or the **Supplementary Files**.

### **AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS**

SL designed the experiments. SH, TA, and RA performed the experiments. SL, SH, and RA analyzed the data. SH and SL wrote the manuscript.

### FUNDING

This work was funded by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (31370689 and 30972405).

### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We sincerely thank Huchen Chen for excellent experimental assistance.

### SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

The Supplementary Material for this article can be found online at: https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fmicb. 2019.02055/full#supplementary-material

- Bustin, S. A. (2002). Quantification of mRNA using real-time reverse transcription PCR (RT-PCR): trends and problems. J. Mol. Endocrinol. 29, 23–39. doi: 10. 1677/jme.0.0290023
- Bustin, S. A., Benes, V., Nolan, T., and Pfaffl, M. W. (2005). Quantitative real-time RT-PCR-A perspective. J. Mol. Endocrinol. 34, 597–601.
- Chen, Z., and Chen, X. (1990). *Diagnosis and Treatment of Tea Tree Diseases*. China: Shanghai Scientific and Technical Publishers.
- Czechowski, T., Stitt, M., Altmann, T., Udvardi, M. K., and Scheible, W.-R. (2005). Genome-wide identification and testing of superior reference genes for transcript normalization in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* 139, 5–17. doi: 10.1104/pp.105.063743
- De Silva, D., Crous, P., Ades, P., Hyde, K., and Taylor, P. (2017). Life styles of *Collectorichum* species and implications for plant biosecurity. *Fungal Biol. Rev.* 31, 155–168. doi: 10.1016/j.fbr.2017.05.001
- Derveaux, S., Vandesompele, J., and Hellemans, J. (2010). How to do successful gene expression analysis using real-time PCR. *Methods* 50, 227–230. doi: 10. 1016/j.ymeth.2009.11.001
- Galli, V., Borowski, J. M., Perin, E. C., Messias, R., da, S., Labonde, J., et al. (2015). Validation of reference genes for accurate normalization of gene expression for real time-quantitative PCR in strawberry fruits using different cultivars and osmotic stresses. *Gene* 554, 205–214. doi: 10.1016/j.gene.2014.10.049
- Gan, P., Ikeda, K., Irieda, H., Narusaka, M., O'Connell, R. J., Narusaka, Y., et al. (2013). Comparative genomic and transcriptomic analyses reveal the

hemibiotrophic stage shift of *Colletotrichum* fungi. *New Phytol.* 197, 1236–1249. doi: 10.1111/nph.12085

- Hao, X., Horvath, D. P., Chao, W. S., Yang, Y., Wang, X., and Xiao, B. (2014). Identification and evaluation of reliable reference genes for quantitative realtime PCR analysis in tea plant (*Camellia sinensis* (L.) O. Kuntze). *Int. J Mol. Sci.* 15, 22155–22172. doi: 10.3390/ijms151222155
- Huang, N., Ling, H., Liu, F., Su, Y., Mao, H., Zhang, X., et al. (2018). Identification and evaluation of PCR reference genes for host and pathogen in sugarcane-*Sporisorium scitamineum* interaction system. *BMC Genomics* 19:479. doi: 10.1186/s12864-018-4854-z
- Kim, S., Park, S. Y., Kim, H., Kim, D., Lee, S. W., Kim, H. T., et al. (2014). Isolation and Characterization of the *Collectorichum acutatutn* ABC Transporter *CaABC1*. *Plant Pathol. J.* 30, 375–383. doi: 10.5423/PPJ.OA.08. 2014.0077
- Klein, D. (2002). Quantification using real-time PCR technology: applications and limitations. *Trends Mol. Med.* 8, 257–260. doi: 10.1016/s1471-4914(02)02355-9
- Kubo, Y. (2012). Appressorium function in Collectrichum orbiculare and prospect for genome based analysis. Morphogenesis Pathogenicity Fungi 22, 115–131. doi: 10.1007/978-3-642-22916-9\_7
- Liu, F., Weir, B. S., Damm, U., Crous, P. W., Wang, Y., Liu, B., et al. (2015). Unravelling *Collectorichum* species associated with *Camellia*: employing ApMat and GS loci to resolve species in the *C. gloeosporioides complex. Persoonia* 35, 63–86. doi: 10.3767/003158515X687597
- Liu, S., Kracher, B., Ziegler, J., Birkenbihl, R. P., and Somssich, I. E. (2015). Negative regulation of ABA signaling by WRKY33 is critical for *Arabidopsis* immunity towards *Botrytis cinerea* 2100. *Elife* 4:e07295. doi: 10.7554/eLife.07295
- Liu, L., Yan, Y., Huang, J., Hsiang, T., Wei, Y., Li, Y., et al. (2017). A Novel MFS transporter gene *ChMfs1* is important for hyphal morphology, conidiation, and pathogenicity in *Colletotrichum higginsianum. Front. Microbiol.* 8:1953. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2017.01953
- Livak, K. J., and Schmittgen, T. D. (2001). Analysis of relative gene expression data using real-time quantitative PCR and the  $2^{-\Delta\Delta}$ CT method. *Methods* 25, 402–408. doi: 10.1006/meth.2001.1262
- Lu, Q., Wang, Y., Li, N., Ni, D., Yang, Y., and Wang, X. (2018). Differences in the characteristics and pathogenicity of *Colletotrichum camelliae* and C. fructicola isolated from the tea plant (*Camellia* sinensis (L.) O. Kuntze). *Front. Microbiol.* 9:3060. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2018.03060
- Marcial-Quino, J., Fierro, F., De la Mora-De la Mora, I., Enríquez-Flores, S., Gómez-Manzo, S., Vanoye-Carlo, A., et al. (2016). Validation of housekeeping genes as an internal control for gene expression studies in *Giardia lamblia* using quantitative real-time PCR. *Gene* 581, 21–30. doi: 10.1016/j.gene.2016.01.018
- Mcintosh, C. H., Baird, J., Zinser, E., Woods, D. J., Campbell, E. M., and Bowman, A. S. (2016). Reference gene selection and RNA preservation protocol in the cat flea, *Ctenocephalides felis*, for gene expression studies. *Parasitology* 143, 1532–1542. doi: 10.1017/S0031182016001025
- Melgar-Rojas Pedro, C. A. J., Fuentes-Santamaría, V., Gabaldón-Ull María, C., Juiz José, M., and Bernd, S. (2015). Validation of reference genes for RTqPCR analysis in noise-induced hearing loss: a study in wistar rat. *PLoS One* 10:e0138027. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0138027
- Narusaka, M., Shirasu, K., Noutoshi, Y., Kubo, Y., Shiraishi, T., Iwabuchi, M., et al. (2009). *RRS1* and *RPS4* provide a dual Resistance-gene system against fungal and bacterial pathogens. *Plant J.* 60, 218–226. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-313X.2009. 03949.x
- Ning, H., Hui, L., Feng, L., Yachun, S., Weihua, S., Huaying, M., et al. (2018). Identification and evaluation of PCR reference genes for host and pathogen in sugarcane-*Sporisorium scitamineum* interaction system. *BMC Genomics* 19:479. doi: 10.1186/s12864-018-4854-z
- Pereira, M. F., de Araújo Dos Santos, C. M., de Araújo, E. F., de Queiroz, M. V., and Bazzolli, D. M. S. (2013). Beginning to understand the role of sugar carriers

in Colletotrichum lindemuthianum: the function of the gene mfs1. J. Microbiol. 51, 70–81. doi: 10.1007/s12275-013-2393-5

- Pfaffl, M. W., Tichopad, A., Prgomet, C., and Neuvians, T. P. (2004). Determination of stable housekeeping genes, differentially regulated target genes and sample integrity: bestkeeper–Excel-based tool using pair-wise correlations. *Biotechnol. Lett.* 26, 509–515. doi: 10.1023/b:bile.0000019559.84305.47
- Radonic, A., Thulke, S., Mackay, I. M., Landt, O., Siegert, W., and Nitsche, A. (2004). Guideline to reference gene selection for quantitative real-time PCR. *Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun.* 313, 856–862.
- Vandesompele, J., De Preter, K., Pattyn, F., Poppe, B., Van Roy, N., De Paepe, A., et al. (2002). Accurate normalization of real-time quantitative RT-PCR data by geometric averaging of multiple internal control genes. *Genome Biol.* 3:research0034.1.
- Villa-Rivera, M. G., Conejo-Saucedo, U., Lara-Marquez, A., Cano-Camacho, H., Lopez-Romero, E., and Zavala-Paramo, M. G. (2017). The role of virulence factors in the pathogenicity of *Colletotrichum* sp. *Curr. Protein Pept. Sci.* 18, 1005–1018. doi: 10.2174/1389203717666160813160727
- Wang, L., Wang, Y., Cao, H., Hao, X., Zeng, J., Yang, Y., et al. (2016). Transcriptome analysis of an anthracnose-resistant tea plant cultivar reveals genes associated with resistance to *Colletotrichum camelliae*. *PLoS One* 11:e0148535. doi: 10. 1371/journal.pone.0148535
- Wang, Y., Hao, X., Wang, L., Bin, X., Wang, X., and Yang, Y. (2016). Diverse Collectorichum species cause anthracnose of tea plants (Camellia sinensis (L.) O. Sci. Rep. 6:35287. doi: 10.1038/srep35287
- Wang, M., Li, Q., Xin, H., Chen, X., Zhu, X., and Li, X. (2017). Reliable reference genes for normalization of gene expression data in tea plants (*Camellia sinensis*) exposed to metal stresses. *PLoS One* 12:e0175863. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone. 0175863
- Wu, Z., Tian, C., Jiang, Q., Li, X., and Zhuang, J. (2016). Selection of suitable reference genes for qRT-PCR normalization during leaf development and hormonal stimuli in tea plant (*Camellia sinensis*). Sci. Rep. 6:19748. doi: 10. 1038/srep19748
- Xie, F., Sun, G., Stiller, J. W., and Zhang, B. (2011). Genome-Wide functional analysis of the cotton transcriptome by creating an integrated EST database. *PLoS One* 6:1–12. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0026980
- Yan, Y., Yuan, Q., Tang, J., Huang, J., Zheng, L., Hsiang, T., et al. (2018). Colletotrichum higginsianum as a model for understanding host-pathogen interactions: a Review. Int. J Mol. Sci. 19:2142. doi: 10.3390/ijms190 72142
- Zhao, Z., Wang, L., Yue, D., Ye, B., Li, P., Zhang, B., et al. (2019). Evaluation of reference genes for normalization of RT-qPCR gene expression data for *Trichoplusia ni* cells during *Antheraea pernyi* (*Lepidoptera: Saturniidae*) multicapsid nucleopolyhedrovirus (AnpeNPV) infection. J. Insect Sci. 19:4. doi: 10.1093/jisesa/iey133
- Zhou, Z., Wu, J., Wang, M., and Zhang, J. (2017). ABC protein CgABCF2 is required for asexual and sexual development, appressorial formation and plant infection in *Colletotrichum gloeosporioides*. *Microb. Pathog.* 110, 85–92. doi: 10.1016/j.micpath.2017.06.028

**Conflict of Interest Statement:** The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Copyright © 2019 He, An, A and Liu. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.