#### Check for updates

#### **OPEN ACCESS**

EDITED BY Guosong Zeng, Southern University of Science and Technology, China

REVIEWED BY Cheng Zhan, Nanjing University of Science and Technology, China Shenghua Chen, Tsinghua University, China Fan Zheng, ShanghaiTech University, China

\*CORRESPONDENCE Xuecheng Yan, ⊠ x.yan@griffith.edu.au

RECEIVED 31 August 2023 ACCEPTED 27 September 2023 PUBLISHED 17 October 2023

#### CITATION

Han Y, Xu H, Li Q, Du A and Yan X (2023), DFT-assisted low-dimensional carbonbased electrocatalysts design and mechanism study: a review. *Front. Chem.* 11:1286257. doi: 10.3389/fchem.2023.1286257

#### COPYRIGHT

© 2023 Han, Xu, Li, Du and Yan. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.

# DFT-assisted low-dimensional carbon-based electrocatalysts design and mechanism study: a review

Yun Han<sup>1,2</sup>, Hongzhe Xu<sup>1,2</sup>, Qin Li<sup>1,2</sup>, Aijun Du<sup>3</sup> and Xuecheng Yan<sup>1</sup>\*

<sup>1</sup>Queensland Micro- and Nanotechnology Centre, Griffith University, Nathan Campus, Brisbane, QLD, Australia, <sup>2</sup>School of Engineering and Built Environment, Griffith University, Nathan Campus, Brisbane, QLD, Australia, <sup>3</sup>School of Chemistry and Physics and Centre for Materials Science, Queensland University of Technology, Gardens Point Campus, Brisbane, QLD, Australia

Low-dimensional carbon-based (LDC) materials have attracted extensive research attention in electrocatalysis because of their unique advantages such as structural diversity, low cost, and chemical tolerance. They have been widely used in a broad range of electrochemical reactions to relieve environmental pollution and energy crisis. Typical examples include hydrogen evolution reaction (HER), oxygen evolution reaction (OER), oxygen reduction reaction (ORR), carbon dioxide reduction reaction (CO<sub>2</sub>RR), and nitrogen reduction reaction (NRR). Traditional "trial and error" strategies greatly slowed down the rational design of electrocatalysts for these important applications. Recent studies show that the combination of density functional theory (DFT) calculations and experimental research is capable of accurately predicting the structures of electrocatalysts, thus revealing the catalytic mechanisms. Herein, current wellrecognized collaboration methods of theory and practice are reviewed. The commonly used calculation methods and the basic functionals are briefly summarized. Special attention is paid to descriptors that are widely accepted as a bridge linking the structure and activity and the breakthroughs for highvolume accurate prediction of electrocatalysts. Importantly, correlated multiple descriptors are used to systematically describe the complicated interfacial electrocatalytic processes of LDC catalysts. Furthermore, machine learning and high-throughput simulations are crucial in assisting the discovery of new multiple descriptors and reaction mechanisms. This review will guide the further development of LDC electrocatalysts for extended applications from the aspect of DFT computations.

#### KEYWORDS

density functional theory, descriptor, carbon-based materials, electrocatalysis, molecular dynamics

# 1 Introduction

Environmental pollution and energy crisis are the two main critical issues of modern society caused by the excessive use of fossil fuels. Acid rain, haze, and greenhouse effects have disastrously affected the normal life of human beings (Turner John, 2004; Hubert and Nenad, 2009; Dai et al., 2015). On the one hand, great efforts have been devoted to the investigation and utilization of renewable clean energy and the efficient conversion between



electrical and chemical energy, i.e., electrocatalytic hydrolysis and fuel cells (Chu and Majumdar, 2012; Abas et al., 2015). Greenhouse gas recycling, on the other hand, is also regarded as one of the most promising techniques to reduce air pollution, for example, the reduction of CO<sub>2</sub>. Therefore, effective electrochemical reactions, such as hydrogen evolution reaction (HER) and oxygen evolution reaction (OER) for water splitting, oxygen reduction reaction (ORR) for fuel cell, and carbon-dioxide reduction reaction (CO<sub>2</sub>RR) are highly expected to solve the above issues (Figure 1). (Karunadasa et al., 2010; Seh et al., 2017) However, the performance of these electrochemical reactions is severely hampered by their sluggish kinetics, which can be significantly improved with the introduction of efficient electrode catalysts (Liang et al., 2013; Zou and Zhang, 2015).

Noble metal-based materials such as platinum (Pt) and ruthenium (Ru) are widely used as benchmark catalysts. However, the scarcity and high cost impede their industrial mass production. Therefore, non-noble metals and even metal-free electrocatalysts have been intensively studied and remarkable progress has been reached (Yan X et al., 2016; Sui et al., 2017; Zhang L et al., 2018; Liu et al., 2019; Han et al., 2023a; He et al., 2023). Up to now, low-dimensional carbon materials, such as 2D graphene nanosheets (G), 1D carbon nanotubes (CNT), and 0D fullerenes, have been widely used for fabricating a series of nonnoble metals and even metal-free catalysts for energy conversion. This is because of their unique properties such as tunable molecular structures, spatial confinement and surface effect, abundance and excellent oxidation, and corrosion resistance. Various defects and heteroatoms are embedded into carbon substrates, such as transition metals, nitrogen, and boron, which can greatly improve their catalytic efficiency (Kroto et al., 1985; Chen et al., 2002; Novoselov et al., 2004; Hsieh et al., 2009; Chen et al., 2013; Zhuo

# et al., 2013; Jia et al., 2016; Yan Y et al., 2016; He et al., 2017; Guo et al., 2018; Mao et al., 2019a).

It is difficult to reveal the catalytic mechanism and actual active sites of electrocatalysts only via experimental study. For instance, previous studies show that pyridinic nitrogen is responsible for the ORR in N-doped carbon-based metal-free catalysts (Wu et al., 2015; Liu and Dai, 2016), while other studies suggest that the active sites are graphitic nitrogen (Liu et al., 2010; Lin et al., 2013). Therefore, the current quest is to develop appropriate methodologies to provide a comprehensive understanding of the catalyst structures at electronic levels, which will promote the comprehension of the reaction mechanisms and guide future experimental studies (Bora et al., 2019). Nowadays, based on the first principles, the modern density functional theory (DFT) calculation has become an irreplaceable modeling toolkit for scientists in a variety of research areas. Two main strategies of DFT calculation-assisted design of electrocatalysts have been established by theoretical and experimental chemists. The first one is dominated by theoretical calculations, dedicated to achieving a rational design of highperformance catalysts. It is crucial to identify the most important parameters to reveal the relationships between structures and performance, which are the so-called descriptors and can considerably boost the traditional trial-and-error approach. Machine-learning and high-throughput calculations have also been developed to efficiently screen active sites and descriptors for the targeted catalysts. The second one is dominated by experimental testing and characterizations, assisted by calculating the change during the catalysis process such as step-energy, molecular and electronic structure, and electron transition that can reveal the reaction mechanism accurately. In this review, we will mainly summarize the history and concepts of modern DFT, the

heterogeneous electrocatalytic surface-related descriptors, the combination of experiment and calculation, and recent achievements of low-dimensional carbon-based electrocatalysts for energy storage and conversion applications.

# 2 Overview of DFT

Quantum chemistry is mainly based on quantum mechanics principles, and the main goal of all first-principle calculations is to obtain the electronic wave function  $\psi$  that characterizes the state of the system, for which the Schrödinger equation must be solved. Theoretical computing has received increasing attention from the chemistry community as computer technology has progressed. However, the traditional Wave Function Theory (WFT) method has two fatal shortcomings. First, the wave function  $\psi$  of a system with N electrons will contain 3N coordinate variables. Therefore, a 3N-dimensional wave function image, which is difficult to describe visually, will be a stumbling block in solving the Schrödinger equation. Second, the Schrödinger equation for a multi-electron system is too computationally intensive to be calculated accurately. Modern DFT has become a viable option to solve these drawbacks.

## 2.1 History of modern DFT

The homogeneous electron-gas model, commonly known as the Thomas–Fermi model, was proposed by Thomas and Fermi in 1927, and it has established a firm foundation for DFT. The ground state energy of the electron system is directly represented in terms of electron density instead of the wave function, which drastically reduces the freedom degree of the system (Thomas, 1927). In 1964, Hohenberg and Kohn proposed an inhomogeneous electron-gas model based on the Thomas–Fermi model and proved that two theorems served as the fundamentals of modern DFT (Hohenberg and Kohn, 1964). The first theorem stated that the nuclear potential energy V(r) of all electrons in a system that has *n* interacting electrons is a unique function of the electronic density  $\rho(r)$ . This could be presented as the Hohenberg-Kohn (HK) equation as shown in Eq. (2.1).

$$E_V[\rho] = \rho(r)V(r)dr + F_{HK}[\rho]$$
(2.1)

Here,  $F_{HK}[\rho] = T[\rho] + E_{ee}[\rho]$ , where  $T[\rho]$  is the sum of electronic kinetic energy and  $E_{ee}[\rho]$  is electron–electron repulsion. Clearly,  $F_{HK}[\rho]$  is independent of the external potential field. However, the HK equation cannot be directly employed for the calculation of the total energy of the system due to the unknown specific form of  $F_{HK}[\rho]$ . The second theory proposed a density minimum principle, stating that the ground state energy of any trial electron density  $\rho(r)$  cannot be lower than the true ground system. Hence, it can be inferred that as the  $\rho(r)$ approaches the true electron density, the calculated system energy becomes closer to the ground-state energy of the system. Then the Euler-Lagrange equation can be obtained as shown in Eq. (2.2).

$$\mu = \frac{\delta E_V[\rho]}{\delta \rho(r)} = V_{cxt}(r) + \frac{\delta F_{HK}[\rho]}{\delta \rho(r)}$$
(2.2)

Where,  $V_{cxt}(r)$  represents an external potential. Therefore, if  $F_{HK}[\rho]$  is confirmed,  $\rho(r)$  and  $E_V[\rho]$  can be solved by Eq. (2.2).



**FIGURE 2** Illustration of Jacob's Ladder of DFT. Reproduced with permission. (Zhang et al., 2020). Copyright 2020, John Wiley and Sons.

However, the exact expression for  $F_{HK}[\rho]$  remains an unsolved challenge until now. In 1965, building upon the Thomas–Fermi model's shortcomings and drawing inspiration from the Hartree-Fock method, Kohn and Sham revealed a brand-new approach to derive the  $F_{HK}[\rho]$  approximately.  $F_{HK}[\rho]$  can be divided into three parts and can be presented: (Kohn and Sham, 1965).

$$F_{HK}[\rho] = T_s[\rho] + J[\rho] + E_{xc}[\rho]$$
(2.3)

Where,  $T_s[\rho]$  and  $J[\rho]$  are the kinetic energy and coulombic correlation energy of independent electrons, respectively.  $E_{xc}[\rho]$  is a functional with a small magnitude called exchange–correlation (XC) energy that can be approximated, and it can be presented as:

$$E_{xc}[\rho] = T[\rho] - T_s[\rho] + V_{ee}[\rho] - J[\rho]$$
(2.4)

Due to  $T_s[\rho]$  and  $J[\rho]$  comprising the primary components of Fock exchange energy  $F_{HK}[\rho]$ , the remaining  $E_{xc}[\rho]$  is a functional with relatively small values. Even when subjected to approximate treatment, the errors associated with this part are not particularly large. By variation, we can get the famous Kohn–Sham (KS) equation:

$$\hat{H}_{KS} \emptyset_{i} \equiv \left[ -\frac{1}{2} \nabla^{2} + V(r) + \int \rho(r') / |r - r'| dr' + V_{xc}(r) \right] \emptyset_{i}(r)$$
  
=  $\varepsilon_{i} \vartheta_{i}(r)$  (2.5)

And XC potential can be defined by:

$$V_{xc}(r) = \delta E_{xc}[\rho] / \delta \rho(r)$$
(2.6)

Overall, there is no approximation and the Kohn–Sham equation is accurate. However, the  $E_{xc}[\rho]$  component of the Kohn–Sham equation still lacks a rigorous expression form, making it impossible to use in practical calculations. Instead, several types of approximate XC generalized functionals must be built to gradually approximate the real system. In simple terms, when solving the KS equations, we need to start with an initial guess for the electron density, use it to solve the KS orbitals, and then calculate the electron density distribution function with the obtained KS orbitals. This distribution function is then used in the KS equations for further iterations, repeating this process until the electron density distribution converges. This iterative approach, which progressively refines the solution through approximations, is the main source of errors in DFT calculations.

## 2.2 Exchange-correlation (XC) functional

Typical approximations such as local density approximation (LDA), generalized gradient approximation (GGA), meta-GGA, and hybrid functional are shown in the well-known Jacob's ladder from Hartree world to Chemical accuracy heaven (Figure 2). (Mattsson, 2002; Tao et al., 2003; Zhang and Xu, 2020)

The approximation for LDA is that the charge density changes slowly with position and behaves similarly to the local heterogeneous electron cloud, so the XC energy can be presented as:

$$E_{XC}^{LDA}[n] = \int dr n(r) \varepsilon_{XC}(n)$$
(2.7)

The LDA method only considers local charge density, which is accurate for a uniform electron gas model but is clearly not applicable to real systems where the electron density is not perfectly uniform. Therefore, this method provides a rough approximation when computing the real systems and tends to overestimate binding energies.

To improve the accuracy of the LDA method, the GGA method describes electron density with the assistance of density gradient and can be presented as:

$$E_{XC}^{GGA} \propto \int dr f(n, \nabla n)$$
 (2.8)

BLYP (Becke, 1988; Lee et al., 1988), PW91 (Perdew et al., 1992; White and Bird, 1994), and PBE (Perdew et al., 1996) are the commonly used approximated density functionals of the GGA method. The Becke exchange functional is a gradient-corrected exchange functional that considers the gradient of the electron density. The Lee-Yang-Parr (LYP) correlation functional incorporates the correlation energy of electrons. By combining these two components, BLYP aims to provide a more accurate description of electron-electron interactions and correlation effects in molecular systems. PW91 combines the Perdew-Wang exchange functional with the Perdew-Wang correlation functional. The exchange functional accounts for the exchange energy of electrons, while the correlation functional deals with electronelectron correlation effects. The PBE functional captures both the exchange and correlation effects in the electron-electron interaction. It has been found to perform well for a wide range of systems, including molecules, solids, and surfaces, making it a popular option in DFT calculations.

Based on the GGA method, meta-GGAs, such as TPSS, TPSSh, and M06-L (Zhao et al., 2006; Zhao and Truhlar, 2006; Zhao and Truhlar, 2008), introduced kinetic energy density variables but with better accuracy accompanied by a significant increase in computational cost.

By partially combining accurate XC functional in the DFT, the hybrid functional could improve the calculation accuracy. The most popular one is the B3LYP functional (Stephens et al., 1994), which can be described as:

$$E_{XC}^{B3LYP} = A \cdot E_X^{LDA} + (1-A)E_X^{HF} + B \cdot \Delta E_X^{Beck} + C \cdot E_C^{LYP} + (1-C)E_C^{VWN}$$
(2.9)

Where A = 0.8, B = 0.72, and C = 0.81.  $E_X^{LDA}$  is the LDA exchange functional,  $E_X^{HF}$  is the Hartree–Fock exact exchange functional,  $\Delta E_X^{Beck}$  is the Becke exchange functional,  $E_C^{LYP}$  is the LYP correlation functional, and  $E_C^{VWN}$  is the VWN local spin density approximation to the correlation functional.

Calculations involving periodic systems frequently employ the HSE functional (Heyd and Scuseria, 2004), which is represented by the following equation:

$$E_{XC}^{HSE} = A \cdot E_X^{HF,SR}(\omega) + (1-A)E_X^{PBE,SR}(\omega) + E_X^{PBE,LR}(\omega) + E_C^{PBE}$$
(2.10)

Where A is the mixing parameter, and  $\omega$  is an adjustable parameter controlling the short range of the interaction. The standard values of A = 0.25 and  $\omega = 0.2$  of HSE06 (Heyd et al., 2003) have been shown to give good results for most systems.  $E_X^{HF,SR}(\omega)$  is the short-range Hartree-Fock exact exchange functional,  $E_X^{PBE,SR}(\omega)$  and  $E_X^{PBE,LR}(\omega)$  are the short- and longrange components of the PBE exchange functional, and  $E_C^{PBE}$  is the PBE correlation functional.

### 2.3 Periodic system

To deal with periodic systems, supercell models (primitive cells in three dimensions (X, Y, and Z) with periodic repetition) are frequently used. Vacuum space greater than 10 Å is added in the Z-direction to eliminate the interaction. In condensed matter physics, Bloch's theorem states that solutions to the Schrödinger equation in a periodic potential take the form of a plane wave modulated by a periodic function and can be written as:

$$\Psi(r) = u_k(r)e^{ikr} \tag{2.11}$$

Where *r* is the position,  $\Psi$  is the wave function, and *k* is the wave vector. Based on the Bloch theorem, the electronic band structure is involved in investigating surface science, and electronic states at numerous *k* points should be calculated. In practical calculations, however, a finite number of *k* points is used; the higher the density of the *k* points, the lower the inaccuracy will be. In general, the number of *k* points for metal systems is higher than that of the oxide systems.

For periodic systems, the electron wave function can be expanded with numerous plane wave functions. However, only plane-wave basis sets with kinetic energy lower than the cut-off energy are considered in practical calculations, which would result in a systematic error (Kresse and Furthmüller, 1996a; Kresse and Furthmüller, 1996b). Therefore, a pseudopotential that can replace the true atomic potential of the nucleus and inner electrons is introduced to reduce systematic error. Currently, the most widely used plane-wave methods are the ultra-soft pseudopotential (US-PP) plane wave method and the projector augmented wave (PAW) method (Kresse and Joubert, 1999).

## 2.4 DFT + U scheme

DFT calculations cannot adequately describe systems with physical properties that are controlled by many body electronic interactions (correlated systems) because it is typically challenging to model the dependence of the XC functional on electronic charge density. The over-delocalize valence electrons and over-stabilize metallic ground states are considered to be the main problems of DFT to describe correlated systems. Therefore, the DFT + U approach has been developed to enhance the description of the ground state of correlated systems (Dudarev et al., 1998). The key advantage of the DFT + U method is that it is within the realm of DFT, making it easy to implement in the existing DFT codes. Besides, its computational cost is only slightly higher than that of normal DFT computations. The local and semi-local density functionals that allow LDA + U and GGA + U computational operations can be enhanced with this 'U' correction. The primary function of the 'U' correction is to add an additional Hubbard-like term to the strong on-site Coulomb interaction of localized electrons. The on-site Coulomb term U and the site exchange term J are the two parameters that represent the strength of the on-site interactions for the purpose of practical DFT + U implementation in computational chemistry. Parameters 'U and J' are typically derived semi-empirically although ab initio computations can yield them (Tolba et al., 2018).

$$E(DFT+U) = E(DFT) + \frac{U_{eff}}{2} \sum_{\sigma} Tr[\rho^{\sigma} - \rho^{\sigma}\rho^{\sigma}] \qquad (2.12)$$

It has become a standard to use the parameter:  $U_{eff} = U - J$  in place of the interaction U in the simplified LDA + U form.  $U_{eff}$  is frequently utilized because the 'J' has been shown to be essential for describing the electronic structure of specific classes of materials, typically those subject to high spin-orbit coupling.

### 2.5 Molecular dynamics simulation

Molecular dynamics (MD) simulation, which is based on Newton's laws of motion, can simulate the trajectory of each atom in a system at a certain temperature, thus the system's dynamic properties can be calculated. However, the standard DFT can only be used to calculate a system's static properties at 0 K. Briefly, for a given configuration and initial velocity of each atom, the MD simulation can be divided into three steps. Firstly, the forces acting on each atom in the system are calculated to determine the system's acceleration. Secondly, the configuration of the system after  $\Delta t$  time can be obtained according to Newton's three laws. Thirdly, the calculation of the forces in the first step is continued based on this configuration, and the results of the system evolving with time can be finally obtained by repeated recurrence. MD simulation can be further classified into two types: Classic MD simulation and *ab initio* MD (AIMD) simulation, depending on how the forces are calculated in the first step. Classic MD simulation builds the potential energy function from the empirical force field and calculates the force at each step using the gradient of the potential energy function. AIMD simulation, on the other hand, can be used to accurately calculate the force at each step by the *ab initio* quantum chemical method (Nosé, 1984; Hoover, 1985; Kresse and Hafner, 1993).

Unfortunately, AIMD is constrained by its suitability for small simulation systems and limited simulation durations. The utilization of force fields, however, can expedite the computation process. Nevertheless, for an extended period, there existed a gap between computationally demanding electronic structure-based DFT calculations and the more efficient yet less precise empirical potentials or force fields founded on physical approximations and intuition (Kocer et al., 2022). This situation witnessed substantial improvement with the emergence of machine learning potentials (MLPs) in 1995 (Blank et al., 1995). Modern MLPs have the capacity to discern the shape of multidimensional potential energy surfaces from high-level DFT calculations and subsequently incorporate the derived analytical atomic interactions (force fields) into large-scale simulations, such as MD, with negligible accuracy compromise (Handley and Popelier, 2010; Friederich et al., 2021; Unke et al., 2021). Over the last two decades, numerous types of MLPs have been introduced, including neural network potentials (NNPs) (Lorenz et al., 2004; Behler and Parrinello, 2007), Gaussian approximation potentials (GAPs) (Bartók et al., 2010), and gradient domain machine learning (GDML) (Chmiela et al., 2019). Among them, NNPs exhibit a formidable combination of neural network expressive capabilities and the availability of extensive datasets like the QM9 dataset (Ruddigkeit et al., 2012), Material Project (Jain et al., 2013), and Open Catalyst 2020 (Chanussot et al., 2021), rendering them exceptionally well-suited for expediting highaccuracy MD calculations (Takamoto et al., 2022). Additionally, beyond reliance on existing databases, on-the-fly machine learning enables the construction of precise force fields from newly sampled data with minimal training overhead (Jinnouchi et al., 2019; Jinnouchi et al., 2020). In this adaptive process, during each step, a decision is made whether to perform an *ab initio* calculation and potentially incorporate the data into the force field or to employ the existing force field and skip the learning phase for that specific step.

Furthermore, Metadynamics is an atomistic simulation technique based on MD that operates within the same system to expedite the exploration of rare events and calculate the free energies of intricate molecular systems (Laio and Parrinello, 2002; Iannuzzi et al., 2003). This technique functions by iteratively 'filling' the system's potential energy surface using a series of Gaussian functions centered along its trajectory, all guided by a carefully selected set of collective variables (CVs). This process compels the system to transition from one energy minimum to another (Bussi and Laio, 2020). Metadynamics provides several advantages in free energy calculations. Firstly, it accelerates the sampling of highenergy events within the studied system by progressively moving it from low-energy regions to high-energy areas via the inclusion of a sequence of repulsive potentials. Secondly, it facilitates the establishment of high-dimensional reaction pathways, enabling the computation of multidimensional free energy data, including two-dimensional free energy potential surfaces. Thirdly, because it gradually elevates the studied system's energy from low to high regions, this approach excels in discovering optimal reaction pathways. Lastly, this method does not require a prior prediction of the reaction pathway within the studied system (Barducci et al., 2011). One limitation of Metadynamics lies in the difficulty of determining the optimal point for terminating the simulation. Without proper termination, the bias potential keeps increasing, possibly leading the system intoreaction regions that hold no interest in our study. The application of Well-Tempered Metadynamics effectively mitigates this limitation (Barducci et al., 2008).

## 2.6 Transition state theory

The transition state (TS), also known as the saddle point, is the highest energy point on the potential energy surface (PES) where the reactants (initial state, IS) generate products (final state, FS) along the minimum energy path. Within the transition state theory (TST), we assume that IS and TS are in quasi-equilibrium, and the main task is to find out the free energy barrier for the transition, which is the energy difference between IS and FS. Based on TST, the transition rate can also be calculated. The Dimer method (Henkelman and Jónsson, 1999) and the climbing image nudged elastic band (CINEB) approach (Henkelman et al., 2000) are the two most popular calculating techniques.

The dimer method can be used to find out the saddle points by two images of the system, which is the so-called 'dimer'. Driven by the saddle point search algorithm, the dimer is moved uphill on the potential energy surface, away from the vicinity of the potential energy minimum of the IS and toward a saddle point. The dimer is rotated along the way to identify the potential energy mode with the lowest curvature at the dimer's location. Since the Dimer technique only uses the first derivatives of the energy, the major benefit is not requiring the time-consuming computation of the minimal eigenvalue of the Hessian matrix. The Dimer technique also has the advantage of having less stringent initial configuration requirements.

The nudged elastic band (NEB) method is an efficient method for identifying the minimum energy path (MEP) between a given initial and the final state of a transition, which has also been widely used to estimate transition rates. A set of images between the IS and FS of the system are created, often on the order of 4-20. Then the adjacent images are contacted by a collection of spring interactions, which can form an elastic band and ensure the continuity of the path. The band is brought to the MEP by an optimization process that minimizes the force acting on the images. The drawback of the NEB method is that it requires the intermediates to be evenly spaced throughout the optimization process, and the predicted TS may be slightly deviated from the actual TS. The CINEB method was developed to address this issue. The force on the highest image is the full force resulting from the potential with the component along the elastic band inverted, showing that it will not be influenced by spring forces. As a result, the intermediates will gradually move to the higher energy direction and reach the actual TS.

## 2.7 Advanced simulation tools and methods

Currently, the computational hydrogen electrode (CHE) model is the most commonly employed and straightforward model for assessing catalytic activity (Peterson et al., 2010). This model uses half of the chemical potential of H<sub>2</sub> in the gas phase at 0 V to represent the chemical potential of a proton-electron pair  $(G(\frac{1}{2}H_2) = G(H^+ + e^-))$ . When a potential U is applied to the catalytic system, the chemical potential can be adjusted as (Peterson et al., 2010):

$$G\left(\frac{1}{2}H_2\right) - eU = G(H^+ + e^-)$$
 (2.13)

Where *e* is the positive charge. Consequently, it becomes feasible to calculate the reaction-free energy ( $\Delta G$ ) of proton-coupled electron transfer (PCET) reactions, enabling a qualitative assessment of catalytic activity. Nonetheless, the CHE model falls short of representing the exact catalytic environment due to the neglection of sensitive parameters affecting catalytic performance, such as solvent, pH, and applied potential. To achieve a more precise simulation of electrochemical reactions, multiple approaches and tools have been developed and applied to consider the impact of the reaction environment.

### 2.7.1 Solvent effect

Two primary approaches can be used to address the solvent effects: implicit and explicit solvation models. The implicit solvation model employs a polarizable medium, typically characterized by the dielectric constant ( $\varepsilon$ ), to represent the solvent, while an electric field is constructed to depict the solvent's charge distribution (Xu and Carter, 2019). Currently, two representative implicit solvation models are the solvation model based on solute electron density (SMD) (Marenich et al., 2009) and the conductor-like solution model (COSMO) (Klamt and Schüürmann, 1993). While the implicit solvation model permits a qualitative description of solvent effects at minimal computational cost, it falls short in describing specific interactions, such as hydrogen bonds (Ling et al., 2022).

On the other hand, the explicit solvation model precisely incorporates solvent molecules, atoms, and cations into the calculation systems, enabling direct observation of electrode/ electrolyte and adsorbates/electrolyte interactions. When considering the most common water/electrode interfaces in electrocatalysis, two explicit solvation models are generally employed: icelike water bilayers and the electric double layer (Gross and Sakong, 2022). In the meantime, AIMD is typically employed to obtain reliable atomic configurations of the electrode/ electrolyte interfaces, incurring significantly higher computational costs. Therefore, to strike a balance between computational accuracy and cost-effectiveness, the Quantum Mechanics/Molecular Mechanics (QMMM) method has been developed. With this approach, quantum mechanical (QM) computations are employed to simulate critical reaction components, such as adsorbates and electrode/electrolyte interfaces, while classical force fields or implicit solvation models are employed to handle the surrounding solvent environment. The primary challenge in the QMMM method is effectively partitioning the QM and MM fields to ensure an accurate representation of critical effects (Li et al., 2020).

### 2.7.2 Applied electrode potential (U)

In experimental macroscopic systems, both reaction temperatures and the chemical potential of the electrolyte and electrode remain constant throughout the reaction. However, in most common DFT calculations, a limited number of atoms is typically treated within the canonical (NVT) or NPT ensemble and the total number of electrons in the simulated cells remains constant. Consequently, this leads to significant variations in the electrochemical potential (Fermi level) during a reaction. To address this problem and achieve a setup closer to the fluctuating particle numbers found in experimental conditions, the combination of the grand-canonical (GC) ensemble  $(VT\mu)$ with DFT emerges as a natural choice for atomistic simulations (Melander et al., 2018). GC-DFT provides a method to investigate electrochemical microscopic systems in thermodynamic equilibrium, offering insights into phenomena characterized by long-time and length scales (Groß, 2021). During the fixed-potential grand canonical calculations, varying the total charge of the system can result in the fixed electrode potential (Fermi level) (Gao and Wang, 2021). Furthermore, by the fixed-potential method, we can easily calculate the potential-dependent reaction barriers and avoid the inaccurate assumption about the charge transfer coefficients in the constant-charge calculations. Currently, great developments have been reached in the field of methodology and models, such as continuum charging methods (Gauthier et al., 2019) and constant-potential hybridsolvation dynamical model (CP-HS-DM) (Zhao and Liu, 2021), making complicated NEB and AIMD simulations stable and possible.

# 3 Theoretical guidance in catalyst design and mechanism study

Nowadays, a series of well-known carbon-based electrocatalysts have been fabricated through the combinations of various modification methods and substrate materials, such as heteroatom-doped graphene, defective graphene, Mxenes, heteroatom-doped carbon nanotubes/ribbons, and modified carbon dots (Yan et al., 2020; Zhou et al., 2020; Li et al., 2021; Ding et al., 2022; Song et al., 2022; Sun et al., 2022; Tang et al., 2022; Wu Q. et al., 2022; Wu Y. et al., 2022). However, the design of stateof-the-art electrocatalysts still relies on inefficient trial-and-error approaches, and the catalytic mechanism is still controversial and difficult to reveal only through experimental research. DFT calculations are thus utilized to address two issues: 1) predicting catalytic performance and guiding the synthesis of electrocatalysts and 2) investigating and corroborating the mechanism of electrocatalysis in conjunction with experimental study.

# 3.1 Application of theoretical guidance in designing electrocatalysts: descriptors

To predict the performance of electrocatalysts, computational scientists mainly focus on the most important microscopic properties of the catalysts that determine the macroscopic catalytic performance. Since the early 20th century, catalysts with high activity, according to the traditional Sabatier principle, should bind atoms and molecules with an ideal bond strength: not too weak to activate the reactants and not too strong to desorb the products. Therefore, a volcano-shape relationship between bond strength and catalytic activity has been proposed to represent the predictivity of many descriptors (Che, 2013). Due to the lack of quantitativeness and inability to undergo experimental validation, this principle is not very predictive. The "bond strength" between the relevant intermediates and the catalysts has been described during the past decades by the extraction of electronic and structural properties such as the descriptors.

### 3.1.1 d-band center theory

The well-known d-band center theory proposed by Nørskov et al. has laid the foundation for a series of descriptors (Nørskov, 1991; Hammer and Norskov, 1995; Nilsson et al., 2005). It explains the interactions between atoms or molecules and the surface based on adsorbate orbitals and *d*-orbitals of atoms on the surface. The energy of the *d* states (the center of the *d* states) relative to the Fermi level is a good indicator of the bond strength. The higher the *d* states are in energy relative to the Fermi level, the higher in energy the antibonding states and the stronger the bond will be (Figure 3). Stamenkovic et al., for example, investigated the ORR activity of various Pt<sub>3</sub>M (M = Ti, V, Fe, Co, and Ni) alloys with Pt-skin and Ptskeleton surface structures, employing both experimental and computational methods (Stamenkovic et al., 2007). They constructed a volcano plot using experimentally measured activity and theoretically calculated d-band center values. This analysis revealed that Pt3Co, Pt3Fe, and Pt3Ni exhibited significantly enhanced ORR activity compared to pure Pt.

The d-band center theory can also be applied to lowdimensional electrocatalysts (Wu et al., 2016; Gao G. et al., 2018; Tao et al., 2019; Ye et al., 2020; Jiao et al., 2022). For instance, Ling et al. established correlations between the d-band center and the adsorption strengths of \*OH, \*O, and \*OOH, along with the potential of elementary reactions for OER on  $\beta_{12}$  boron monolayer ( $\beta_{12}$ -BM)-supported single-atom catalysts (SACs) (Ling et al., 2017). Ni SACs supported on  $\beta_{12}$ -BM exhibited a moderate energy level of the d-band center, resulting in a lower overpotential for OER compared to the other systems under study. Additionally, they proposed an optimal d-band center at -2.82 eV, at which  $\beta_{12}$ -BM-supported SACs would theoretically have the lowest overpotential for OER. Deng et al. designed a series of N-doped graphene-supported transition metal atom-pair catalysts (TM APCs) models for efficient NRR (Deng et al., 2020). Twenty kinds of transition metal atoms were systematically studied and were proven by COHP and orbital interaction analysis; the *d*-band center can be used as a descriptor to describe the NRR performance of the TM APCs. For defective graphene-supported Fe and Al nanoparticles, Lim and co-workers found that the *d*-band center of the Fe and Al nanoparticles shifts closer to the Fermi level, indicating a potential increase in the catalytic reactivity associated with the graphene surface. Zhou et al. systematically explored the HER activity of transition metals, transition metal oxides, and carbide substrates covered by nitrogen-doped graphitic sheets and found that the HER activity is correlated to the C  $p_z$ -band center, which is similar to the *d*-band center theory and determined in turn by the degree of electronic coupling between the graphitic



sheet and the metal substrate, enabling the rational design of high-performance hybrid graphitic carbon/transition metal electrocatalysts (Zhou et al., 2018).

#### 3.1.2 Fermi softness

When oxygen atoms are adsorbed on Pt<sub>3</sub>Y (111) surface, even though the surface d-band center of Y is higher than that of Pt, the binding strength of Pt-O is stronger than Y-O, defying the d-band center theory. However, it can be reasonably explained by the "Fermi softness" (S<sub>F</sub>), which was developed by Huang and co-workers to describe the electronic structures of a solid surface (Huang et al., 2016). All the bands' occupied and unoccupied states contribute to the bonding, but those closer to the Fermi level  $(E_F)$  are more significant (Figure 4A). A reactivity weight function *w*(*E*) with a Fermi level peak is created to determine a weighted summation of the density of states of a solid surface (|g(E)w(E)dE) (Figure 4B). The resultant property is the finite-temperature chemical softness, known as  $S_{F_2}$  which is an accurate descriptor of the surface reactivity. This property is obtained when such a weight function is defined as the derivative of the Fermi-Dirac distribution function at a certain non-zero temperature. For example, the  $S_F$  is identical to the density of states at the Fermi level  $(g(E_F))$  without spreading (i.e., kT = 0 eV), which does not closely resemble the surface reactivity (Figure 4C). Then, the  $S_F$  displays a substantial association with the surface reactivity when the nominal electronic temperature is changed to 0.4 eV (Figure 4D).

Fermi softness can also be an efficient descriptor to predict the catalytic performance of carbon-based catalysts (Gao R. et al., 2018; Gao Z. et al., 2018; Yang et al., 2018; Xiong et al., 2020; Wang and Zhang, 2022). Gao and co-workers designed a series of catalysts named Fe/GS, which are composed of Fe atom that serves as the active site and different graphene such as single and double vacancy graphene that serve as the substrate (Gao Z. Y. et al., 2018). They further found that the Fermi softness of Fe/GS and the O<sub>2</sub> adsorption energy exhibit a strong positive linear correlation ( $R^2 = 0.81$ ) at kT = 1.15 eV. The Fermi softness is also used to describe the adsorption activity of Mn-modified graphene catalyst by Wu's group (Xie et al., 2022). They discovered a substantial

negative correlation ( $R^2 = 0.93$ ) between Fermi softness and adsorption energy at kT = 2.8 eV. The Fermi softness is increased with the increase of the adsorption energy.

#### 3.1.3 Energy-based descriptors

Adsorption-free energies ( $\Delta G$ ) of key intermediates are utilized as activity descriptors for recognized reactions, including  $\Delta G_H$  for HER (Han et al., 2023b),  $\Delta G_O$  for ORR (Han et al., 2023a),  $\Delta G_{CO}$  for  $CO_2RR$  (Chen et al., 2022a), and  $\Delta G_N$  for NRR (Fang et al., 2023). For instance, DFT calculations were conducted on the MoS<sub>2</sub> edge, yielding a  $\Delta G_H$  of 0.08 eV, which closely approaches the optimal value of 0 eV (Hinnemann et al., 2005). Subsequently, experimental confirmation established that MoS<sub>2</sub> edges serve as the catalytically active sites for HER (Jaramillo et al., 2007). Through the calculation of free energies of N2 adsorption and the formation energy of the key intermediate \*NCON, Kou et al. found that V2N6 sites efficiently catalyze the cleavage of N-N bonds and the coupling of C-N bonds, facilitating effective urea production (Liu J. et al., 2023). Through calculating ORR energy profiles on various active sites within defective graphene, including pyridinic N sites, adjacent carbon atoms, and edge-located pentagon defects, Yao and colleagues determined that pentagon defects serve as the primary active sites for acidic ORR. Subsequent experimental studies have also validated these findings (Jia et al., 2019).

In multi-step catalytic processes, the adsorption and desorption of the intermediates occur during the concerted proton-electron transfer steps, and the adsorption energies of the intermediates follow a linear scaling relationship (Man et al., 2011; J. K. Nørskov et al., 2005; Nørskov et al., 2004). For example, the relationship between the adsorption energies of the intermediates of OER and ORR, such as \*O, \*OH, and \*OOH, can be presented by:

$$\Delta G_2^{(i)} = A_{1,2}^{(i)} \cdot \Delta G_1^{(i)} + B_{1,2}^{(i)}$$
(3.1)

Where  $\Delta G_1^{(i)}$  and  $\Delta G_2^{(i)}$  represent the chemisorption energies of oxygen intermediates and  $A_{1,2}^{(i)}$  and  $B_{1,2}^{(i)}$  represent the slope and intercept, respectively, derived from the fitting of adsorption energy



data (Abild-Pedersen et al., 2007; Calle-Vallejo et al., 2015a). Fundamentally, the quantity of valence electrons of the atoms attached to the surface has a significant impact on the slope of Eq. (3.1) on closed-packed and low-index surfaces. Since the oxygen atom in OH\* only requires one electron to comply with the octet rule, whereas O\* requires two, the slope between the adsorption energies of \*OH and \*O is roughly 1/2. Scaling relationships offer a possible solution to use a few descriptors to fully present the numerous factors influencing a catalytic reaction. Combined with the Sabatier principle, volcano curves can be derived from this linear relationship to reveal the connection between structures and performance. In many cases,  $\Delta G_{OH}$  and  $\Delta G_O - \Delta G_{OH}$  are considered as the descriptors for ORR and OER, respectively (Zheng et al., 2015; Seh et al., 2017; Mao et al., 2018). According to the statistical findings, the free energy difference for monodentate adsorbates can be concluded as  $\Delta G_{OOH}$  =  $\Delta G_{OH}$  + 3.2 ± (0.2) eV (Man et al., 2011).

#### 3.1.4 Multiple descriptors

The excellent descriptors include  $e_g$ -filling (Matsumoto et al., 1977a; Matsumoto et al., 1977b), average O-2*p*-state energy ( $\bar{\epsilon}_{2p}$ ),

(Lee et al., 2011; Grimaud et al., 2013) surface distortion (Chattot et al., 2018), and generalized coordination numbers ( $\overline{CN}$ ). (Calle-Vallejo et al., 2014; Calle-Vallejo et al., 2015b) Normally, a single descriptor cannot completely predict the performance and synergistic effect of complicated mixed-phase catalysts. Some interface parameters that can demonstrate or influence electron distribution reconfiguration, for instance, adsorption energy (Tran and Ulissi, 2018; Guo C. et al., 2019; Wan et al., 2021), charge transfer (Guan et al., 2019; Mao et al., 2021), surface properties (defects/microstructure/facet) (Back et al., 2019; Parker et al., 2020), and bond length (Wexler et al., 2018; Zhu et al., 2019; Zheng et al., 2020), may serve as the descriptors to predict the best catalysts. Furthermore, a variety of descriptors have been used for describing the reactions with the assistance of machine learning and high-throughput calculations.

Different reaction mechanisms can be used to explain the complex NRR, including distal, alternating, and enzymatic (Figure 5A). To identify the viable routes and theoretical onset potentials by the classical approach, all chemical intermediates will be systematically investigated, which will be inefficient for large-



#### FIGURE 5

(A) Schematic depiction of different mechanisms for N<sub>2</sub> reduction. (B) Flowchart of the two-step screening procedure for NRR catalysts. Reproduced with permission (Ling et al., 2018a). Copyright 2018, John Wiley and Sons.

scale catalyst screening. Ling *et al.* focused on two "stable to instable" transitions in the NRR process (Eq. 3.2 and 3.3). They set up a twostep method (Figure 5B) to efficiently and accurately screen the nitride-doped-graphene-supported single-atom catalysts (N-G-supported SACs) (Ling et al., 2018a).

$$^{*}N_{2} + H^{+} + e^{-} = ^{*}N_{2}H \tag{3.2}$$

$$^{*}NH_{2} + H^{+} + e^{-} = ^{*}NH_{3}$$
(3.3)

In the first step, the systems with low activity are disregarded by using the descriptors  $\Delta E_{N_2}$  (adsorption energy of N<sub>2</sub>) and  $\Delta G_{N_2-N_2H}$ (free energy change of Eq. (3.2)). In the second step, among the systems that meet the requirements of the first step, highperformance catalysts are sought after using the descriptors  $\Delta G_{NH_3-des}$  (free energy for NH<sub>3</sub> desorption) and  $\Delta G_{NH_2-NH_3}$ (free energy change of Eq. (3.3)). Out of 540 N-G-supported SAC systems, 10 interesting candidates with high NRR catalytic activity were selected using the two-step high-throughput screen approach. For example, W<sub>1</sub>C<sub>3</sub> demonstrates the best performance with a low onset potential of 0.25 V. Zhou and co-workers also used multiple descriptors to predict the NRR performance of transition metal atoms filled with boron nitride nanotubes (BNNTs) (Zhou et al., 2020). The diameter of BNNTs, work function, and electron transfer from metal to BNNTs, which have negative correlations with the adsorption energy of  $N_2$ , can serve as efficient descriptors to select highly active catalysts.

# 3.2 Application of theoretical calculations in revealing the reaction mechanism

With the development of modern characterization techniques, an increasing number of *in situ* characterization tools are used to observe the catalytic reaction processes, aiming to accurately uncover the catalytic mechanism. However, it is still difficult to identify the actual active site and reaction intermediates of complex catalytic reactions by pure experimental study. In terms of  $CO_2RR$ , through different reaction routes, the products of  $CO_2RR$  can be carbon monoxide, formic acid, ethylene, or ethanol. Depending on whether the adsorption sites change or not during the catalytic processes, the actual reaction paths and intermediates and the competition between the carbon-carbon coupling reaction and HER are all unknown and difficult to elucidate experimentally (Zhang et al., 2021). For instance, Dual-atom catalysts (DACs)

have been considered promising candidates for C2 product generation due to their ability to offer two metal sites that enhance \*CO coverage on the surface. However, experimental results indicate that most DACs exhibit high Faradic efficiency for CO, while the formation of multi-carbon products is seldom observed (Gong et al., 2022; Hao et al., 2022; Zhao et al., 2022). Li and colleagues conducted DFT calculations and discovered a deviation from the conventional hypothesis, suggesting that C-C coupling typically does not occur at the metal-top sites (Yang et al., 2023). Surface Pourbaix analyses indicate that CO preferably occupies the bridge sites between two metals, potentially impeding subsequent C-C coupling reactions. Furthermore, based on energy variations, it is not feasible for C-C coupling to occur on the surface of a DAC, both in terms of thermodynamics and kinetics. In experimental settings, oxide-derived copper (OD-Cu) has demonstrated exceptional performance, displaying remarkable selectivity toward C2+ products even at low potentials (Cheng et al., 2021; Chen et al., 2022b). Nevertheless, the understanding of the atomic structures of active sites in OD-Cu remains limited due to its inherent complexity. Cheng et al. conducted multiscale computations based on first principles to simulate the synthesis, characterization, and performance assessment of Cu nanoparticles deposited on carbon nanotubes (CNTs) (Cheng et al., 2017). Their investigation identified two active sites that show an undercoordinated surface square structure adjacent to a subsurface stacking fault and exhibit lower formation energies for \*COCOH compared to the Cu (100) surface sites.

Meanwhile, theoretical calculation is a key method to compensate for experimental shortcomings because it can investigate the electronic-scale change during the catalytic reaction. In the past decades, the use of theoretical simulations in defective electrocatalysis has greatly aided the catalytic mechanism analysis of novel catalysts (Hu et al., 2021; Khan et al., 2021; Lan et al., 2021; Liu A et al., 2021).

With the assistance of DFT calculations, Zhang et al. systematically investigated the origins of the high-performance atomic Co-Pt embedded into nitrogen-doped graphene (A-CoPt-NC) (Zhang B-W et al., 2018). A stable adsorption state of the intermediate in the HER is proved by the electron distribution calculations. The disappearance of charge depletion on the surface of the outer layer can improve the adsorption of protons to the catalyst. Li and co-workers synthesized a new HER electrocatalyst (Li M. et al., 2018). Carbon quantum dots were used to support ruthenium nanoparticles (Ru@CQDs). It shows superior catalytic activity and durability in alkaline conditions. DFT calculations provide compelling evidence of the excellent HER catalytic activity of Ru supported in the N-doped CQDs layer. The calculation results show the synergistic effect of doped N atoms and Ru clusters, and both are beneficial in reducing the dissociation energy of H<sub>2</sub>O. The electron transfer from Ru and H2O to C atoms, which is proved by the difference charge density analysis, can polarize Ru clusters, thus contributing to the dissociation of H2O. Meanwhile, the dissociated H atoms are held together by Ru and H interactions to form the H<sub>2</sub> molecule (Figure 6).

As can be seen from the above discussions, theoretical calculation is an indispensable method to investigate the relationship between structures and performance. A reaction model will be built to thoroughly study the basic reaction path of the reaction, identify the crucial steps that determine the reaction rate, and then optimize the chemical reaction conditions. It is obvious that theoretical calculations are beneficial in identifying the basic process and reaction paths of electrocatalysis at the atomic level. Furthermore, the design of catalysts and the controllable synthesis of the desired structures can be aided by the DFT simulations, which can be utilized as a prediction tool. Theoretical modelings can also be used in catalyst structure optimization and validation of the design outcomes, as well as to support experimental study.

## 4 Recent advances in computational studies on low-dimensional carbonbased electrocatalysts

### 4.1 Hydrogen evolution reaction (HER)

Hydrogen is one of the most promising clean energy sources to replace fossil fuels, and it also has the highest energy density among existing fuels. Water splitting is a sustainable way of producing hydrogen compared to industrial reduction of natural gas (CH<sub>4</sub>). Hydrogen evolution reaction (HER) is the cathodic half-cell reaction of water electrolysis (Karunadasa et al., 2010). The large overpotential restricts its practical application and highperformance electrocatalysts are needed to boost the HER. Noble metal-based catalysts such as Pt/C and RuO2 are commonly considered to be the most efficient HER electrocatalysts; however, scarcity and low durability limit their mass industrial production (Andreadis and Tsiakaras, 2006; Hao et al., 2016). To date, many high-performance low-dimensional carbon-based non-noble metals and even metal-free electrocatalysts have been designed and fabricated to be the alternatives of noble metal materials. In this part, the fundamental concepts and recent developments in HER electrocatalysts will be summarized.

HER is a two proton-electron transfer step (PETS) process. The first step is the Volmer reaction, i.e., the adsorption of hydrogen, which is presented in Eq. (4.1a) (acidic condition) and 4.1b (alkaline condition).

$$H^+ + e^- + * \to H^*$$
 (4.1a)

$$H_2O + e^- + * \to H^* + OH^-$$
 (4.1b)

The second step can be the Heyrovsky reaction or the Tafel reaction. Equation (4.2a) (acidic condition) and 4.2b (alkaline condition) show the Heyrovsky reaction and Eq. (4.3) shows the Tafel reaction.

$$H^* + H^+ + e^- \to H_2 + *$$
 (4.2a)

$$H^* + H_2O + e^- \rightarrow H_2 + OH^- + *$$
 (4.2b)

$$2H^* \to H_2 + * \tag{4.3}$$

In which, \* represents the active site on the catalyst surface.

For the design of low-cost and efficient electrocatalysts, it is crucial to reduce the amount of precious metals being used, which can be achieved in two ways. Firstly, the specific activity per metal atom usually increases with the downsize of metal particles (Figure 7). (Yang et al., 2013) Therefore, single-atom catalysts (SAC) that contain isolated metal atoms singly dispersed on



FIGURE 6

different surfaces. Reproduced with permission (Li M. et al., 2018). Copyright 2018, John Wiley and Sons.

supports have attracted extensive research attention. Alternatively, non-noble metal atoms or functional groups can also be anchored on the substrate to tune the electronic structures of noble-metal active sites (Sun et al., 2013; Gao G. et al., 2018; Li W. et al., 2018; Ren et al., 2020; Yang et al., 2022). Ye and co-workers designed a novel Pt SAC using aniline-stacked graphene as the support (Pt SASs/AG). It shows excellent HER performance with  $\eta = 12 \text{ mV}$  at 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> and a mass current density of 22,400  $Ag_{Pt}^{-1}$  at  $\eta = 50$  mV, which is 46 times higher than that of the commercial 20 wt% Pt/C (Ye et al., 2019). Moreover, the Pt SASs/AG catalyst presents outstanding stability. With the assistance of DFT calculations, they found that the interaction between the atomical Pt and the nitrogen of aniline makes the *d*-band center of Pt downshift to -2.465 eV, which is close to that of Pt (111) (-2.687 eV). Additionally, the density of states (DOS) near the Fermi level of Pt in Pt SASs/AG catalyst is as large as that of Pt in Pt (111), eventually promoting the HER activity.

Secondly, non-noble metals such as transition metals are used as efficient HER catalysts, and even metal-free catalysts with excellent performance were designed and synthesized experimentally (Fan et al., 2016; He et al., 2017; Zhang L et al., 2018; He et al., 2019; Ahsan et al., 2021; Yasin et al., 2022; Han et al., 2023b; Yin and Du, 2023). For example, using the first principle DFT calculations, 3D, 4D, and 5D transition metal SACs in N-doped 2D graphene and nanographene of various sizes are screened for HER by Fung et al. (Fung et al., 2020) For most SACs, a d-band center downshift will occur when moving from graphene to nanographene, indicating that the hydrogen adsorption on metal SACs can be tuned by adjusting the size and dimension of the substrate. V, Rh, and Ir embedded in N-doped nanographene show much better HER activity than those on the extended 2D graphene. The machine learning models (kernel ridge regression, decision trees (random forest), and neural networks) and the SISSO (Sure Independence Screening and Sparsifying Operator) method are employed to accurately predict the  $\Delta G_H$  using various proposed descriptors; the results are shown in Figures 8A-D. Topological defect-based and complex defect-based carbon materials are also promising electrocatalysts. Yao and co-workers synthesized a series of defective carbons via a facile nitrogen removal procedure from





N-doped graphene, and the edge-defect model called 7557-4 shows outstanding HER performance with the lowest calculated free energy of 0.187 eV (Figures 8E,F). (Jia et al., 2016) DFT calculations were also performed to better understand the underlying catalytic mechanisms. The analysis of the frontier molecular orbitals shows that the catalytic activity of edge atoms is laid on their most contribution to the highest occupied molecular orbital (HOMO) and lowest unoccupied molecular orbital (LUMO), which are highly correlated with the catalytic reactions (Figures 8G,H).

# 4.2 Oxygen evolution reaction (OER) and oxygen reduction reaction (ORR)

Oxygen evolution reaction (OER,  $2H_2O(l) \rightarrow O_2(g) + 4e^- + 4H^+$ ) is the anode half-cell reaction of water splitting containing four electron transitions, as shown in Eq. 4.4. Oxygen reduction reaction (ORR,  $O_2(g) + 4e^- + 4H^+ \rightarrow 2H_2O(l)$ , Eq. 4.5) is the revise reaction of the OER, which is the cathodic reaction of fuel cells and zincair batteries (Gasteiger et al., 2005).

$$H_2O(l) + * \rightarrow OH^* + e^- + H^+$$
 (4.4a)

$$OH^* \to O^* + e^- + H^+$$
 (4.4b)

$$O^* + H_2O(l) \rightarrow OOH^* + e^- + H^+$$
 (4.4c)

$$OOH^* \to O_2 + e^- + H^+ \tag{4.4d}$$

$$O_2 + e^- + H^+ \to OOH^* \tag{4.5a}$$

$$OOH^* + e^- + H^+ \rightarrow O^* + H_2O(l)$$
 (4.5b)

$$O^* + e^- + H^+ \to OH^*$$
 (4.5c)

$$OH^* + e^- + H^+ \to H_2O(l) + *$$
 (4.5d)

Both the OER and ORR are restricted by the sluggish kinetic and high reaction energy barriers, thus electrocatalysts are needed to accelerate their reaction rates. However, the high cost and low abundance of current commercial noble metal-based catalysts, i.e., Pt/C for ORR, RuO2 and IrO2 for OER severely hinder their widespread applications. Similarly, the strategies of lowering the cost and improving the performance of the HER catalysts are also applicable to the OER and ORR electrocatalysts, and great achievements have been accomplished (Zhu et al., 2018; He et al., 2020a; Wang et al., 2020a; Yan et al., 2020; Yang et al., 2020; Yan et al., 2021; Xu et al., 2023). Zhang et al. anchored atomical distributed Ni atoms onto an N-doped hollow carbon matrix (HCM@Ni-N) (Zhang et al., 2019). In alkaline conditions, the HCM@Ni-N only requires an OER overpotential of 304 mV to reach the current density of 10 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>, which is much lower than that of the RuO<sub>2</sub> (393 mV), suggesting excellent OER activity of the prepared catalyst. Through the calculated distributions of charge density, they found that the electronic distribution of N-doped HCM was changed obviously after the Ni decoration (Figure 9A). In addition, the 3d orbital of Ni in HCM@Ni-N shows a leftward shift, and the d-band center of the Ni was downshifted from -0.94 eV to -2.04 eV as a result of the Ni-N interaction (Figure 9B). According to the d-band center theory, this change could facilitate the desorption of adsorbates and reduce the energy barrier. The free energy pathways of the OER can also be calculated by DFT simulations and they are in good agreement with the experimental results (Figures 9C,D). By encapsulating Co and  $\beta$ -Mo<sub>2</sub>C into N-doped carbon nanotubes (Co/  $\beta$ -Mo<sub>2</sub>C@N-CNT), Ouyang and co-workers successfully fabricated a bifunctional electrocatalyst for the HER and OER in an alkaline electrolyte (Ouyang et al., 2019). Based on the heterointerface between Co and  $\beta$ -Mo<sub>2</sub>C, the OER activity of  $\beta$ -Mo<sub>2</sub>C is enhanced significantly. With the assistance of DFT calculations, they proved that the joint effect of N-CNTs, Co, and  $\beta$ -Mo<sub>2</sub>C resulted in the low energy barriers of the intermediates, thus greatly improving the HER and OER kinetics.

Under the guidance of DFT calculations, Wang et al. successfully synthesized a series of topological carbon defects through a facile N-removing strategy, among which adjacent pentagons (A-C5) show the best catalytic performance for the ORR and the edge divacancy defects (C585-2) are favorable for the HER (Wang et al., 2020b). DFT calculations were applied to investigate the relationship between the original carbon structure, the type of N configuration obtained, and the corresponding defect structures, for example, perfect carbon network versus graphitic-N versus C585 (Figure 10A), edge-rich hexagonal structure versus pyridinic-N versus S-C5 (Figure 10B), and edge-rich pentagon versus pyrrolic-N versus A-C5 (Figure 10C). By a spontaneous gas-foaming method, Jiang and co-workers fabricated a range of promising trifunctional electrocatalysts named defect-rich N-doped ultrathin carbon nanosheets for HER, OER, and ORR (Jiang et al., 2019). In rechargeable Zn-air batteries, NCN-1000-5 exhibits a high energy density (806 Wh/kg), a low charge/recharge voltage gap (0.77 V), and an extremely long cycle life (over 300 h). DFT calculations were used to identify the intrinsic active sites for the electrochemical reactions. The catalytic performance of various active sites for the ORR and OER was investigated, and the results are shown in the volcano plot (Figure 10D). The armchair edge carbon atoms, which are adjacent to the graphitic-N, possess the lowest overpotential, thus they should be the optimal catalytic active center for the specific electrocatalysis (Figures 10E-G).



#### FIGURE 8

Comparison of DFT-calculated *versus* machine learning-predicted  $\Delta G_H$  using (A) kernel ridge regression, (B) random forest regression, (C) neural network regression, and (D) SISSO regression. Reproduced with permission (Fung et al., 2020). Copyright 2020, American Chemical Society. (E) Mechanism study model of 7557defect. (F) Schematic energy profiles for the HER pathway. (G) HOMO and (H) LUMO orbitals for 7557 defect. Reproduced with permission (Jia et al., 2016). Copyright 2016, John Wiley and Sons.



#### FIGURE 9

(A) Calculated distribution of charge density for HCM@Ni-N. (B) Schematic band diagrams of HCM@Ni and HCM@Ni-N. (C) Proposed mechanism of O<sub>2</sub> evolution over HCM@Ni-N. (D) Free energy diagram at 0 V for OER over HCM, HCM@N, HCM@Ni, and HCM@Ni-N. The bold lines indicate the rate-determining step. Reproduced with permission (Zhang et al., 2019). Copyright 2019, John Wiley and Sons.

# 4.3 Carbon dioxide reduction reaction (CO<sub>2</sub>RR)

Carbon dioxide reduction reaction ( $CO_2RR$ ) could convert  $CO_2$  to many value-added chemicals, such as CO, CH<sub>4</sub>, CH<sub>3</sub>OH, and C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>5</sub>OH (Eq. 4.6) (Whipple and Kenis, 2010; Chen J. et al., 2021; Chen S. et al., 2021), which can be directly used as fuels to replace fossil fuels like gasoline and natural gas. Therefore, the  $CO_2RR$  could significantly relieve the greenhouse gas effect. However, the hydrogen atoms necessary for the reduction of  $CO_2$  molecules are transported from the aqueous solution, so the HER must be considered as the competitive reaction. The high cost of the currently used noble metal-based catalysts and the low selectivity of  $CO_2RR$  are still the biggest obstacles to its industrialization. Therefore, developing highly efficient and selective non-noble metal  $CO_2RR$  catalysts based on earth-abundant elements has attracted the most attention in this promising research field (Back et al., 2017; Mao et al., 2020a; He et al., 2020b; Er et al., 2021; Zha et al., 2021; Powar et al., 2022).

$$CO_2 + e^- \to CO_2^- \quad E^{\Theta} = -1.90 V$$
 (4.6a)

$$CO_2 + 2H^+ + 2e^- \rightarrow CO + H_2O \quad E^{\Theta} = -0.52V$$
 (4.6b)

$$CO_2 + 2H^+ + 2e^- \rightarrow HCOOH \quad E^{\Theta} = -0.61 V \quad (4.6c)$$

$$CO_2 + 4H^+ + 4e^- \rightarrow HCOH + H_2O \quad E^{\Theta} = -0.51 V \quad (4.6d)$$

$$CO_2 + 6H^+ + 6e^- \rightarrow CH_3OH + H_2O \quad E^{\Theta} = -0.38V \quad (4.6e)$$

$$CO_2 + 8H^+ + 8e^- \rightarrow CH_4 + 2H_2O \quad E^{\Theta} = -0.24V \quad (4.6f)$$

$$CO_2 + 12H^+ + 12e^- \rightarrow C_2H_4 + 4H_2O \quad E^{\Theta} = -0.34V \quad (4.6g)$$

The initial stage of  $CO_2$  reduction is  $CO_2$  adsorption, which is a crucial step of the  $CO_2RR$ . Zhu *et al.* systematically investigated the adsorption of CO2 on the g-C3N4 surface by DFT calculations (Zhu et al., 2017). Through analyzing the electronic properties such as the band gap, density of states, work function, HOMO, and LUMO, they found that the twocoordinated N atoms, which contributed to both valance band and conduction band edge, have the most negative adsorption energy (-0.4181) for CO2 molecule. CO2 can be effectively captured and activated on Si due to the "acceptance and back-donation" of electrons between the Si dopant and CO<sub>2</sub> molecule. Accordingly, Mao and co-workers designed an experimentally synthesizable electrocatalyst called silicondoped graphene edges (Si chain@G) (Mao et al., 2019b). The catalytic performance of the Si@ZZG (Si atoms doped into the zigzag edge of graphene) and Si@ACG (Si atoms doped into the armchair edge of graphene) was exhaustively studied through DFT calculations (Figure 11A). CO<sub>2</sub> can be well captured and efficiently activated on Si@G. The binding energy at the zigzag and armchair edges is -0.65 eV and -0.83 eV, respectively. Remarkably, CO<sub>2</sub> can be converted to CH<sub>3</sub>OH effectively when the Si@ACG is served as the active site. Moreover, Si chain@G with multiple Si active sites which are beneficial to product multiple-carbon productions was also investigated. They found that the Si chain@ZZG has a high selectivity to transform CO<sub>2</sub> to C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>5</sub>OH with an extreme low limiting potential of -0.6 V under the optimal theoretical reaction pathway (Figures 11B,C).

Transition metal atoms can also be excellent  $CO_2RR$  active centers. Guo *et al.* established calculation models with Fe, Co, and Ni single atoms embedded onto graphitic carbon nitride (Fe/Co/Ni-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub>) and systematically investigated the structures of the

(



calculations of transformation from edge-rich carbon to PDN-dominated carbon and then to pentagon-rich carbon. (C) Schematic and formation energy calculations of transformation from pentagon-edge-rich carbon to PON-dominated carbon and then to special carbon reconstruction. Reproduced with permission (Wang et al., 2020b). Copyright 2020, Elsevier. (D) The volcano plot for the ORR and OER by plotting the overpotential as a function of  $\Delta G(*O)$  at various possible active sites. The top and side views of the active site (E) A-1 for the ORR, (F) A-3 for the OER with OOH adsorbed, and (G) A-1 for the HER; the green ball represents the adsorbed H ( $\theta$  = 2.27%). Reproduced with permission (Jiang et al., 2019). Copyright 2008, Royal Society of Chemistry.

electrocatalysts,  $CO_2$  adsorption configurations, and the reduction mechanisms (Guo X. et al., 2019). g-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> with six-fold cavities was selected as the substrate, and the introduced Ni, Co, and Fe atoms are located from the corner to the center of the cavity. The PDOS of the metal *d* orbital and adsorbed  $CO_2$  indicated that  $CO_2$  could be chemically adsorbed on  $Co-C_3N_4$  and Fe-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> but physically adsorbed on Ni-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> (Figures 12A,B). Guo *et al.* also probed the reaction pathway and mechanism of different C1 products and thoroughly calculated

the limiting potentials for the production of CO, HCOOH, CH<sub>3</sub>OH, and CH<sub>4</sub>. They found that Co-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> has superior CO<sub>2</sub>RR activity and selectivity for CH<sub>3</sub>OH (Figure 12C). Currently, copper (Cu) is found to be one of the best catalysts for achieving the high activity reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to hydrocarbons since \*CO<sub>2</sub> and \*COOH can be effectively collected from Cubased catalysts (Raciti and Wang, 2018). Due to the hydration of non-adsorbing CO<sub>2</sub> molecules, Pb, Hg, Cd, and Bi also demonstrate good catalytic performance for producing



#### FIGURE 11

(A) Possible reaction pathways for the electrocatalytic reduction of  $CO_2$  to six different products. (B) Gibbs free energy diagrams of  $CO_2$  reduction reactions to  $CH_3OH$  and  $C_2H_4$  on Si chain@ZZG and Si chain@ACG. (C) The optimized structures for  $CO_2$  reduction to  $CH_3OH$  on the zigzag edge. Reproduced with permission (Mao et al., 2019b). Copyright 2011, Royal Society of Chemistry.



#### FIGURE 12

(A) The most stable  $CO_2$  adsorption configurations. (B) PDOS of the metal *d* orbital before and after adsorption (including the adsorbent  $CO_2$  total DOS). (C) Summary of the limiting potentials for the productions of CO, HCOOH,  $CH_3OH$ , and  $CH_4$ . Reproduced with permission (Guo X et al., 2019). Copyright 2019, John Wiley and Sons.



formate (Mao et al., 2020b). Other transition metals such as Ni, Fe, Pd, and Ti exhibit low  $CO_2RR$  selectivity because the HER is much more favorable due to the strong H-bonding (Back et al., 2017).

## 4.4 Nitrogen reduction reaction (NRR)

Nitrogen is the most abundant element on the earth, and it is essential for all organisms including animals and plants. Ammonia (NH<sub>3</sub>) is one of the most important industrial compounds due to its wide use in different fields. However, the ultra-stable N≡N triple bond greatly impedes the nitrogen fixation reaction. The industrial Haber-Bosch process uses N2 and H<sub>2</sub> as the raw materials, consuming excessive energy because of the high reaction temperature (350°C-550°C) and pressure (150-350 atm) (van der Ham et al., 2014; Chen Jingguang et al., 2018). Therefore, the conversion of  $N_2$  to NH<sub>3</sub> under ambient conditions is a promising research area. Recently, electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction reaction (NRR) has attracted increasing research attention because of its obvious advantages such as low energy consumption, reduced reaction temperature, and enhanced productivity (Li et al., 2016; Cui et al., 2018; He et al., 2020c; Liu Y et al., 2021; Ruiyi et al., 2021; Samal et al., 2021; Wang and Mao, 2021; Zhou et al., 2022; Fang et al., 2023; Liu H. et al., 2023). Figure 13 shows the possible reaction pathways of the catalytic conversion of  $N_2$  to  $NH_3$ .

The first and most important step of the NRR is the adsorption of  $N_2$  to the active sites, which requires the atoms containing not fully occupied orbitals to accept the lone-pair electrons from the  $\sigma$  orbital of  $N_2$ . Therefore, transition metals

would be ideal electron acceptors due to their half-occupied dorbitals, and they have the potential to be promising NRR electrocatalysts (Lan et al., 2013; Le et al., 2014; Han et al., 2019). Ling and co-workers established a computational model that anchored Mo atoms onto N-doped carbon (Mo<sub>1</sub>-N<sub>1</sub>C<sub>2</sub>) and studied its NRR catalytic performance using the first principle calculations (Ling et al., 2018b). Firstly, the bonding energy of N<sub>2</sub> adsorbed on M<sub>1</sub>-N<sub>1</sub>C<sub>2</sub> (M = Cu, Pd, Pt, and Mo) is investigated; only Mo1-N1C2 shows strong adsorption of N2 with the adsorption energy of -1.19 and -1.18 eV for side-on and endon adsorption, respectively. In addition, the N≡N bond length has increased from 1.12 Å (isolated N2 molecule) to 1.18 Å (sideon) and 1.14 Å (end-on) (Figures 14A-C). Accordingly, Mo is selected as the potential electrocatalyst, and the possible reaction pathways are calculated. As shown in Figure 14 D, Mo<sub>1</sub>-N<sub>1</sub>C<sub>2</sub> has a low overpotential of 0.24 V and it can catalyze the NRR through an enzymatic pathway. It is worth noting that the generated NH<sub>3</sub> can be removed quickly from the Mo<sub>1</sub>-N<sub>1</sub>C<sub>2</sub> catalyst with a freeenergy uphill of only 0.47 eV, which is much lower than that of the previously reported catalysts.

In recent years, metal-free catalysts have also emerged as an important category of electrocatalysts for ammonia formation. Boron (B) has the potential to be used in NRR processes because of its Lewis acid-like characteristics and electron-deficient nature, which is different from other main group elements. The outer orbital of B undergoes hybridization to produce  $sp^2$  orbitals, which can accept electrons from the N<sub>2</sub>  $\sigma$ -bond and donate electrons from the filled 2p orbitals to the antibonding  $\pi^*$ -orbitals of N<sub>2</sub>. This finding has been supported by a number of recent investigations (Ling et al., 2018c; Yu et al., 2018; Mao et al., 2019c). For instance, Yu's group reported that B-doped graphene could effectively catalyze the NRR with a high Faradic efficiency



#### FIGURE 14

Top and side views of the structures of (A)  $Mo_1-N_1C_2$ , and  $Mo_1-N_1C_2$  with  $N_2$  adsorption through (B) side-on and (C) end-on patterns. N–N bond lengths and charge transfer from  $Mo_1-N_1C_2$  to  $N_2$  are also presented. Free-energy diagrams for  $N_2$  reduction through (D) enzymatic and (E) consecutive mechanisms at different applied potentials as well as (F) the corresponding structures of the reaction intermediates. Gray, cyan, yellow, and blue balls represent the C, Mo, doped N, and adsorbed N atoms, respectively. Reproduced with permission (Ling et al., 2018b). Copyright 2018, American Chemical Society.

of 10.8% for  $NH_3$  production in aqueous solutions under ambient conditions at -0.5 V (*versus* RHE), with the electron redistribution at the active site constituting the reduction process (Yu et al., 2018). However, the theoretically calculated overpotential remains very high, so there is still a great need for more suitable substrates to sustain B atoms. In addition, the detailed reaction mechanism of the N<sub>2</sub> activation and reduction for non-metallic catalysts is yet to be uncovered, suggesting that new methods of nitrogen capture and activation should be exploited to increase the efficiency of nitrogen fixation.

## 5 Conclusions and outlook

In summary, the development of modern DFT was briefly introduced, and the applications of theoretical calculations such as descriptors suited to material screening and mechanism studies in carbon-based heterogeneous catalysts were reviewed. Afterward,

recent achievements of carbon-based electrocatalysts were presented. As shown in Figure 15, the development of supercomputer technology could improve the accuracy of the theoretical calculations. With the assistance of machine learning and high-throughput computing, the prediction and screening ability of computational simulation has gradually enhanced and become more closely integrated with experimental work. Besides, DFT calculations can simulate a more realistic reaction environment and material structures, which could improve the efficiency and accuracy of the mechanism explanation. Particularly, lowcarbon-based materials have dimensional demonstrated tremendous potential in electrocatalysis due to their distinctive features, including 1) diverse and controllable structures as well as excellent environmental tolerance; 2) inherent substrate materials can be easily doped by heteroatoms; 3) various defects can serve as the active sites. However, similar to other kinds of excellent electrocatalysts, carbon-based electrocatalysts also face severe limitations in the rational design and practical application. More



universal, accurate, and measurable descriptors should be developed, and additional research attention should be focused on the synthesis of catalysts. The following important issues and challenges deserve further investigation.

(1) Microkinetic modeling is a bridge that can connect quantumchemical data with macroscopic behaviors in surface reactions. However, the existing theoretical approaches and functionals describing interface charge cannot meet the requirement of evaluating kinetics and reaction barriers of elementary steps under realistic reaction environments. For example, the widely used CHE model can only obtain the reaction-free energies, without the consideration of the non-electrochemical processes, proton-electron transfer, and the recombination of electrons and holes. More advancements in kinetic modeling are needed to fully uncover the relationship between coverage, potential dependency of activation energies, adsorbate-adsorbate interactions, and pH effects. For interfacial catalytic can processes, multiscale modeling facilitate the understanding of the transport effects. Alternatively, assisted by advanced sampling methods, such as slow-growth (SG), metadynamics, and umbrella sampling, AIMD can compensate for the shortcomings of the CHE models. Meanwhile, grand-canonic fixed-potential DFT calculations offer a feasible way to evaluate the catalytic performance at equilibrium states, which is the same as the experimental setup.

- (2) The combination of multiple descriptors to effectively describe the relationship between structures and performance is indispensable. This is because it may be impossible to accurately predict the activity trends of complicated multiphase catalysts only using one descriptor. Meanwhile, the simulation results of completed calculations, such as explicit SG-AIMD simulation, are highly dependent on the selection of collective variables. Importantly, machine learning, highthroughput calculations, and force-field approaches should be applied to uncover more general descriptors and advanced models, leading to higher efficient reaction mechanisms investigation and catalytic performance prediction.
- (3) In addition to kinetics and reaction barriers, the stability of the catalysts plays a pivotal role in practical applications. Several commonly employed simulation methods are used to assess the stability of designed catalysts. For instance, retaining a stable structure during AIMD simulations is often interpreted as a sign of catalyst stability; nevertheless, the limited simulation duration reduces the reliability of the results. Another commonly used method, Pourbaix diagrams, cannot fully

overcome the limitation of thermodynamic formation energy, even considering factors such as pH and applied potential. Hence, there is a pressing need to develop a dependable approach for evaluating the stability of electrocatalysts, which deserves more attention in research.

- (4) Selectivity is also a critical parameter in assessing the catalytic performance of electrocatalysts. In simulations, the selectivity of electrocatalysts is often evaluated by comparing formation energies, adsorption energies of reactants, or energy barriers of potential determining steps (PDS). However, these evaluations are typically based on the CHE model and do not consider the real reaction environment, which substantially impacts the selectivity of catalysts. Consequently, it is still unclear how to effectively assess the selectivity, while microkinetic models that consider various environmental factors may prove to be a successful solution.
- (5) Synthesis of electrocatalysts with abundant active sites is also crucial, for instance, the formation process of specific defect structures and the synthesis of SACs with specific density are yet to be improved. Theoretical scientists have been focusing on improving the activity of electrocatalysts. However, rational design and synthesis strategies for large-scale production of carbon-based electrocatalysts are also one of the stumbling blocks for practical applications. More attention should be focused on the synthesis of electrocatalysts with the targeted active site for a specific reaction.
- (6) The scaling relationship between oxygen adsorbates in OER, ORR, and CO<sub>2</sub>RR has the possibility to develop efficient descriptors. However, it also restricts the lowest overpotential of electrocatalytic reactions, for example, the predicted lowest overpotential is (3.2–2.46) eV/2e ≈ 0.4 V for both ORR and OER. Therefore, how to break the scaling relationship is also a prospective research topic in the near future. One possible solution is stabilizing the key intermediates, and the other method is exploring new reaction mechanisms to avoid the formation of key intermediates.

# References

Abas, N., Kalair, A., and Khan, N. (2015). Review of fossil fuels and future energy technologies. *Futures* 69, 31-49. doi:10.1016/j.futures.2015.03.003

Abild-Pedersen, F., Greeley, J., Studt, F., Rossmeisl, J., Munter, T. R., Moses, P. G., et al. (2007). Scaling properties of adsorption energies for hydrogen-containing molecules on transition-metal surfaces. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **99**, 016105. doi:10.1103/PhysRevLett.99.016105

Ahsan, M. A., He, T., Eid, K., Abdullah, A. M., Curry, M. L., Du, A., et al. (2021). Tuning the intermolecular electron transfer of low-dimensional and metal-free BCN/ $C_{60}\,$  electrocatalysts via interfacial defects for efficient hydrogen and oxygen electrochemistry. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 143, 1203–1215. doi:10.1021/jacs.0c12386

Andreadis, G., and Tsiakaras, P. (2006). Ethanol crossover and direct ethanol PEM fuel cell performance modeling and experimental validation. *Chem. Eng. Sci.* 61, 7497–7508. doi:10.1016/j.ces.2006.08.028

Back, S., Lim, J., Kim, N. Y., Kim, Y. H., and Jung, Y. (2017). Single-atom catalysts for CO<sub>2</sub> electroreduction with significant activity and selectivity improvements. *Chem. Sci.* 8, 1090–1096. doi:10.1039/c6sc03911a

Back, S., Tran, K., and Ulissi, Z. W. (2019). Toward a design of active oxygen evolution catalysts: insights from automated density functional theory calculations and machine learning. *ACS Catal.* 9, 7651–7659. doi:10.1021/acscatal.9b02416

Barducci, A., Bonomi, M., and Parrinello, M. (2011). Metadynamics. WIREs Comput. Mol. Sci. 1, 826–843. doi:10.1002/wcms.31

Barducci, A., Bussi, G., and Parrinello, M. (2008). Well-tempered metadynamics: a smoothly converging and tunable free-energy method. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 100, 020603. doi:10.1103/PhysRevLett.100.020603

# Author contributions

YH: Conceptualization, Writing-original draft. HX: Writing-review and editing. QL: Supervision, Writing-review and editing. AD: Conceptualization, Funding acquisition, Project administration, Supervision, Writing-review and editing. XY: Conceptualization, Funding acquisition, Project administration, Supervision, Writing-review and editing.

# Funding

The author(s) declare financial support was received for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. Australian Research Council (DP200103043, DP210100721, and DP210100331).

# Conflict of interest

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

The author(s) declared that they were an editorial board member of Frontiers, at the time of submission. This had no impact on the peer review process and the final decision

## Publisher's note

All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

Bartók, A. P., Payne, M. C., Kondor, R., and Csányi, G. (2010). Gaussian approximation potentials: the accuracy of quantum mechanics, without the electrons. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 104, 136403. doi:10.1103/PhysRevLett.104.136403

Becke, A. D. (1988). Density-functional exchange-energy approximation with correct asymptotic behavior. *Phys. Rev. A* 38, 3098–3100. doi:10.1103/PhysRevA.38.3098

Behler, J., and Parrinello, M. (2007). Generalized neural-network representation of high-dimensional potential-energy surfaces. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 98, 146401. doi:10.1103/ PhysRevLett.98.146401

Blank, T. B., Brown, S. D., Calhoun, A. W., and Doren, D. J. (1995). Neural network models of potential energy surfaces. J. Chem. Phys. 103, 4129–4137. doi:10.1063/1. 469597

Bora, T., Dousse, A., Sharma, K., Sarma, K., Baev, A., Hornyak, G. L., et al. (2019). Modeling nanomaterial physical properties: theory and simulation. *Int. J. Smart Nano Mater.* 10, 116–143. doi:10.1080/19475411.2018.1541935

Bussi, G., and Laio, A. (2020). Using metadynamics to explore complex free-energy landscapes. *Nat. Rev. Phys.* 2, 200–212. doi:10.1038/s42254-020-0153-0

Calle-Vallejo, F., Loffreda, D., Koper, M. T., and Sautet, P. (2015a). Introducing structural sensitivity into adsorption-energy scaling relations by means of coordination numbers. *Nat. Chem.* 7, 403–410. doi:10.1038/nchem.2226

Calle-Vallejo, F., Martínez, J. I., García-Lastra, J. M., Sautet, P., and Loffreda, D. (2014). Fast prediction of adsorption properties for platinum nanocatalysts with generalized coordination numbers. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 53, 8316–8319. doi:10. 1002/anie.201402958

Calle-Vallejo, F., Tymoczko, J., Colic, V., Vu Quang, H., Marcus, D. P., Morgenstern, K., et al. (2015b). Finding optimal surface sites on heterogeneous catalysts by counting nearest neighbors. *Science* 350, 185–189. doi:10.1126/science.aab3501

Chanussot, L., Das, A., Goyal, S., Lavril, T., Shuaibi, M., Riviere, M., et al. (2021). Open catalyst 2020 (OC20) dataset and community challenges. *ACS Catal.* 11, 6059–6072. doi:10.1021/acscatal.0c04525

Chattot, R., Le Bacq, O., Beermann, V., Kühl, S., Herranz, J., Henning, S., et al. (2018). Surface distortion as a unifying concept and descriptor in oxygen reduction reaction electrocatalysis. *Nat. Mater* 17, 827–833. doi:10.1038/s41563-018-0133-2

Che, M. (2013). Nobel prize in chemistry 1912 to sabatier: organic chemistry or catalysis? *Catal. Today* 218-219, 162–171. doi:10.1016/j.cattod.2013.07.006

Chen, B., Parker, G., Han, J., Meyyappan, M., and Cassell, A. M. (2002). Heterogeneous single-walled carbon nanotube catalyst discovery and optimization. *Chem. Mater* 14, 1891–1896. doi:10.1021/cm0116828

Chen, J., Wang, T., Li, Z., Yang, B., Zhang, Q., Lei, L., et al. (2021). Recent progress and perspective of electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction towards C<sub>2</sub>-C<sub>5</sub> products over non-precious metal heterogeneous electrocatalysts. *Nano Res.* 14, 3188–3207. doi:10.1007/s12274-021-3335-x

Chen Jingguang, G., Richard, M. C., Seefeldt Lance, C., L Bren Kara, R. M. B., Marcetta, Y. D., et al. (2018). Beyond fossil fuel-driven nitrogen transformations. *Science* 360, eaar6611. doi:10.1126/science.aar6611

Chen, S., Li, W.-H., Jiang, W., Yang, J., Zhu, J., Wang, L., et al. (2022a). MOF encapsulating N-heterocyclic carbene-ligated copper single-atom site catalyst towards efficient methane electrosynthesis. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 61, e202114450. doi:10.1002/anie.202114450

Chen, S., Wang, B., Zhu, J., Wang, L., Ou, H., Zhang, Z., et al. (2021). Lewis acid sitepromoted single-atomic Cu catalyzes electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> methanation. *Nano Lett.* 21, 7325–7331. doi:10.1021/acs.nanolett.1c02502

Chen, S., Zhang, Z., Jiang, W., Zhang, S., Zhu, J., Wang, L., et al. (2022b). Engineering water molecules activation center on multisite electrocatalysts for enhanced CO<sub>2</sub> methanation. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 144, 12807–12815. doi:10.1021/jacs.2c03875

Chen, Y., Wang, J., Meng, X., Zhong, Y., Li, R., Sun, X., et al. (2013). Pt–SnO<sub>2</sub>/ nitrogen-doped CNT hybrid catalysts for proton-exchange membrane fuel cells (PEMFC): effects of crystalline and amorphous SnO<sub>2</sub> by atomic layer deposition. *J. Power Sources* 238, 144–149. doi:10.1016/j.jpowsour.2013.03.093

Cheng, D., Zhao, Z.-J., Zhang, G., Yang, P., Li, L., Gao, H., et al. (2021). The nature of active sites for carbon dioxide electroreduction over oxide-derived copper catalysts. *Nat. Commun.* 12, 395. doi:10.1038/s41467-020-20615-0

Cheng, T., Xiao, H., and Goddard, W. A. (2017). Nature of the active sites for CO reduction on copper nanoparticles; suggestions for optimizing performance. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 139, 11642–11645. doi:10.1021/jacs.7b03300

Chmiela, S., Sauceda, H. E., Poltavsky, I., Müller, K.-R., and Tkatchenko, A. (2019). sGDML: constructing accurate and data efficient molecular force fields using machine learning. *Comput. Phys. Commun.* 240, 38–45. doi:10.1016/j.cpc.2019.02.007

Chu, S., and Majumdar, A. (2012). Opportunities and challenges for a sustainable energy future. *Nature* 488, 294–303. doi:10.1038/nature11475

Cui, X., Tang, C., and Zhang, Q. (2018). A review of electrocatalytic reduction of dinitrogen to ammonia under ambient conditions. Adv. Energy Mater 8. doi:10.1002/aenm.201800369

Dai, L., Xue, Y., Qu, L., Choi, H.-J., and Baek, J.-B. (2015). Metal-free catalysts for oxygen reduction reaction. *Chem. Rev.* 115, 4823–4892. doi:10.1021/cr5003563

Deng, T., Cen, C., Shen, H., Wang, S., Guo, J., Cai, S., et al. (2020). Atom-pair catalysts supported by N-doped graphene for the nitrogen reduction reaction: d-band center-based descriptor. *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.* 11, 6320–6329. doi:10.1021/acs.jpclett.0c01450

Ding, P., Song, H., Chang, J., and Lu, S. (2022). N-doped carbon dots coupled NiFe-LDH hybrids for robust electrocatalytic alkaline water and seawater oxidation. *Nano Res.* 15, 7063–7070. doi:10.1007/s12274-022-4377-4

Dudarev, S. L., Botton, G. A., Savrasov, S. Y., Humphreys, C. J., and Sutton, A. P. (1998). Electron-energy-loss spectra and the structural stability of nickel oxide: an LSDA+U study. *Phys. Rev. B* 57, 1505–1509. doi:10.1103/PhysRevB.57.1505

Er, C.-C., Tang, J.-Y., Fung, C.-M., Tan, L.-L., Medhekar, N. V., and Chai, S.-P. (2021). Atomistic insights into the reformation of  $CH_4$  with  $CO_2$  on metal-free  $gC_3N_4$ : unraveling the reaction mechanisms using first-principles DFT calculations. *J. Phys. Chem. C* 125, 23021–23028. doi:10.1021/acs.jpcc.1c06981

Fan, L., Liu, P. F., Yan, X., Gu, L., Yang, Z. Z., Yang, H. G., et al. (2016). Atomically isolated nickel species anchored on graphitized carbon for efficient hydrogen evolution electrocatalysis. *Nat. Commun.* 7, 10667. doi:10.1038/ncomms10667

Fang, Q., Yin, H., Mao, X., Han, Y., Yan, C., O'Mullane, A. P., et al. (2023). Theoretical evaluation of highly efficient nitrate reduction to ammonia on InBi. *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.* 14, 2410–2415. doi:10.1021/acs.jpclett.2c03900

Friederich, P., Häse, F., Proppe, J., and Aspuru-Guzik, A. (2021). Machine-learned potentials for next-generation matter simulations. *Nat. Mater* 20, 750–761. doi:10.1038/ s41563-020-0777-6

Fung, V., Hu, G., Wu, Z., and Jiang, D.-E. (2020). Descriptors for hydrogen evolution on single atom catalysts in nitrogen-doped graphene. *J. Phys. Chem. C* 124, 19571–19578. doi:10.1021/acs.jpcc.0c04432 Gao, G., and Wang, L.-W. (2021). A potential and pH inclusive microkinetic model for hydrogen reactions on Pt surface. *Chem. Catal.* 1, 1331–1345. doi:10.1016/j.checat. 2021.10.006

Gao, G., Bottle, S., and Du, A. (2018). Understanding the activity and selectivity of single atom catalysts for hydrogen and oxygen evolution via ab initial study. *Catal. Sci. Technol.* 8, 996–1001. doi:10.1039/C7CY02463K

Gao, R., Pan, L., Wang, H., Zhang, X., Wang, L., and Zou, J.-J. (2018). Ultradispersed nickel phosphide on phosphorus-doped carbon with tailored d-band center for efficient and chemoselective hydrogenation of nitroarenes. *ACS Catal.* 8, 8420–8429. doi:10. 1021/acscatal.8b02091

Gao, Z., Sun, Y., Li, M., Yang, W., and Ding, X. (2018). Adsorption sensitivity of Fe decorated different graphene supports toward toxic gas molecules (CO and NO). *Appl. Surf. Sci.* 456, 351–359. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2018.06.112

Gao, Z. Y., Yang, W. J., Ding, X. L., Lv, G., and Yan, W. P. (2018). Support effects on adsorption and catalytic activation of  $O_2$  in single atom iron catalysts with graphene-based substrates. *Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.* 20, 7333–7341. doi:10.1039/ c7cp08301g

Gasteiger, H. A., Kocha, S. S., Sompalli, B., and Wagner, F. T. (2005). Activity benchmarks and requirements for Pt, Pt-alloy, and non-Pt oxygen reduction catalysts for PEMFCs. *Appl. Catal. B Environ.* 56, 9–35. doi:10.1016/j.apcatb.2004.06.021

Gauthier, J. A., Dickens, C. F., Heenen, H. H., Vijay, S., Ringe, S., and Chan, K. (2019). Unified approach to implicit and explicit solvent simulations of electrochemical reaction energetics. *J. Chem. Theory Comput.* 15, 6895–6906. doi:10.1021/acs.jctc. 9b00717

Gong, Y.-N., Cao, C.-Y., Shi, W.-J., Zhang, J.-H., Deng, J.-H., Lu, T.-B., et al. (2022). Modulating the electronic structures of dual-atom catalysts via coordination environment engineering for boosting CO<sub>2</sub> electroreduction. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 61, e202215187. doi:10.1002/anie.202215187

Grimaud, A., May, K. J., Carlton, C. E., Lee, Y.-L., Risch, M., Hong, W. T., et al. (2013). Double perovskites as a family of highly active catalysts for oxygen evolution in alkaline solution. *Nat. Commun.* 4, 2439. doi:10.1038/ncomms3439

Gross, A., and Sakong, S. (2022). Ab initio simulations of water/metal interfaces. Chem. Rev. 122, 10746–10776. doi:10.1021/acs.chemrev.1c00679

Groß, A. (2021). Grand-canonical approaches to understand structures and processes at electrochemical interfaces from an atomistic perspective. *Curr. Opin. Electrochem.* 27, 100684. doi:10.1016/j.coelec.2020.100684

Guan, D., Zhou, J., Hu, Z., Zhou, W., Xu, X., Zhong, Y., et al. (2019). Searching general sufficient-and-necessary conditions for ultrafast hydrogen-evolving electrocatalysis. *Adv. Funct. Mater* 29, 1900704. doi:10.1002/adfm.201900704

Guo, C., Zhang, T., Deng, X., Liang, X., Guo, W., Lu, X., et al. (2019). Electrochemical  $CO_2$  reduction to  $C_1$  products on single nickel/cobalt/iron-doped graphitic carbon nitride: a DFT study. *ChemSusChem* 12, 5126–5132. doi:10.1002/cssc.201902483

Guo, X., Lin, S., Gu, J., Zhang, S., Chen, Z., and Huang, S. (2019). Simultaneously achieving high activity and selectivity toward two-electron O<sub>2</sub> electroreduction: the power of single-atom catalysts. *ACS Catal.* 9, 11042–11054. doi:10.1021/acscatal. 9b02778

Guo, Y., Yuan, P., Zhang, J., Xia, H., Cheng, F., Zhou, M., et al. (2018). Co<sub>2</sub>P–CoN double active centers confined in N-doped carbon nanotube: heterostructural engineering for trifunctional catalysis toward HER, ORR, OER, and Zn–air batteries driven water splitting. *Adv. Funct. Mater* 28, 1805641. doi:10.1002/adfm.201805641

Hammer, B., and Norskov, J. K. (1995). Why gold is the noblest of all the metals. *Nature* 376, 238–240. doi:10.1038/376238a0

Han, L., Liu, X., Chen, J., Lin, R., Liu, H., Lü, F., et al. (2019). Atomically dispersed molybdenum catalysts for efficient ambient nitrogen fixation. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 58, 2321–2325. doi:10.1002/anie.201811728

Han, Y., Yan, X., Wu, Q., Xu, H., Li, Q., Du, A., et al. (2023a). Defect-derived catalysis mechanism of electrochemical reactions in two-dimensional carbon materials. *Small Struct.*, 2300036. doi:10.1002/sstr.202300036

Han, Y., Mao, X., Yan, X., Wu, Q., Xu, H., Fang, Q., et al. (2023b). Carbon nanotubes encapsulated transition metals for efficient hydrogen evolution reaction: coupling effect of 3d orbital and π-bond. *Mater. Today Chem.* 30, 101573. doi:10.1016/j.mtchem.2023. 101573

Handley, C. M., and Popelier, P. L. A. (2010). Potential energy surfaces fitted by artificial neural networks. J. Phys. Chem. A 114, 3371-3383. doi:10.1021/jp9105585

Hao, Q., Zhong, H.-X., Wang, J.-Z., Liu, K.-H., Yan, J.-M., Ren, Z.-H., et al. (2022). Nickel dual-atom sites for electrochemical carbon dioxide reduction. *Nat. Synth.* 1, 719–728. doi:10.1038/s44160-022-00138-w

Hao, Y., Wang, X., Shen, J., Yuan, J., Wang, A.-J., Niu, L., et al. (2016). One-pot synthesis of single-crystal Pt nanoplates uniformly deposited on reduced graphene oxide, and their high activity and stability on the electrocalalytic oxidation of methanol. *Nanotechnology* 27, 145602. doi:10.1088/0957-4484/27/14/145602

He, T., Gao, G., Kou, L., Will, G., and Du, A. (2017). Endohedral metallofullerenes (M@C60) as efficient catalysts for highly active hydrogen evolution reaction. *J. Catal.* 354, 231–235. doi:10.1016/j.jcat.2017.08.025

He, T., Kong, Y., Zhou, T., Zhang, J., Santiago, A. R. P., Du, A., et al. (2023). Rational modulation of single atom coordination microenvironments in a BCN monolayer for multifunctional electrocatalysis. *Small*, 2302429. doi:10.1002/smll.202302429

He, T., Santiago, A. R. P., and Du, A. (2020c). Atomically embedded asymmetrical dual-metal dimers on N-doped graphene for ultra-efficient nitrogen reduction reaction. *J. Catal.* 388, 77–83. doi:10.1016/j.jcat.2020.05.009

He, T., Zhang, C., and Du, A. (2019). Single-atom supported on graphene grain boundary as an efficient electrocatalyst for hydrogen evolution reaction. *Chem. Eng. Sci.* 194, 58–63. doi:10.1016/j.ces.2018.03.028

He, T., Zhang, C., Will, G., and Du, A. (2020b). Cobalt porphyrin supported on graphene/Ni (111) surface: enhanced oxygen evolution/reduction reaction and the role of electron coupling. *Catal. Today* 351, 113–118. doi:10.1016/j.cattod.2018.10.056

He, T., Zhang, L., Kour, G., and Du, A. (2020a). Electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide on precise number of Fe atoms anchored graphdiyne. *J. CO2 Util.* 37, 272–277. doi:10.1016/j.jcou.2019.12.025

Henkelman, G., and Jónsson, H. (1999). A dimer method for finding saddle points on high dimensional potential surfaces using only first derivatives. *J. Chem. Phys.* 111, 7010–7022. doi:10.1063/1.480097

Henkelman, G., Uberuaga, B. P., and Jónsson, H. (2000). A climbing image nudged elastic band method for finding saddle points and minimum energy paths. *J. Chem. Phys.* 113, 9901–9904. doi:10.1063/1.1329672

Heyd, J., and Scuseria, G. E. (2004). Efficient hybrid density functional calculations in solids: assessment of the Heyd–Scuseria–Ernzerhof screened Coulomb hybrid functional. *J. Chem. Phys.* 121, 1187–1192. doi:10.1063/1.1760074

Heyd, J., Scuseria, G. E., and Ernzerhof, M. (2003). Hybrid functionals based on a screened Coulomb potential. J. Chem. Phys. 118, 8207-8215. doi:10.1063/1.1564060

Hinnemann, B., Moses, P. G., Bonde, J., Jørgensen, K. P., Nielsen, J. H., Horch, S., et al. (2005). Biomimetic hydrogen evolution: MoS2 nanoparticles as catalyst for hydrogen evolution. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 127, 5308–5309. doi:10.1021/ja0504690

Hohenberg, P., and Kohn, W. (1964). Inhomogeneous electron gas. Phys. Rev. 136, B864–B871. doi:10.1103/PhysRev.136.B864

Hoover, W. G. (1985). Canonical dynamics: equilibrium phase-space distributions. *Phys. Rev. A* 31, 1695–1697. doi:10.1103/PhysRevA.31.1695

Hsieh, C.-T., Lin, J.-Y., and Wei, J.-L. (2009). Deposition and electrochemical activity of Pt-based bimetallic nanocatalysts on carbon nanotube electrodes. *Int. J. Hydrogen Energy* 34, 685–693. doi:10.1016/j.ijhydene.2008.11.008

Hu, C., Hu, Y., Fan, C., Yang, L., Zhang, Y., Li, H., et al. (2021). Surface-enhanced Raman spectroscopic evidence of key intermediate species and role of NiFe dual-catalytic center in water oxidation. *Angewandte Chemie Int. ed Engl.* 60, 19774–19778. doi:10.1002/anie.202103888

Huang, B., Xiao, L., Lu, J., and Zhuang, L. (2016). Spatially resolved quantification of the surface reactivity of solid catalysts. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 55, 6239–6243. doi:10. 1002/anie.201601824

Hubert, A. G., and Nenad, M. M. (2009). Just a dream—or future reality? *Science* 324, 48–49. doi:10.1126/science.1172083

Iannuzzi, M., Laio, A., and Parrinello, M. (2003). Efficient exploration of reactive potential energy surfaces using car-parrinello molecular dynamics. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 90, 238302. doi:10.1103/PhysRevLett.90.238302

Jain, A., Ong, S. P., Hautier, G., Chen, W., Richards, W. D., Dacek, S., et al. (2013). Commentary: the Materials Project: a materials genome approach to accelerating materials innovation. *Apl. Mater.* 1, 011002. doi:10.1063/1.4812323

Jaramillo, T. F., Jørgensen, K. P., Bonde, J., Nielsen, J. H., Horch, S., and Chorkendorff, I. (2007). Identification of active edge sites for electrochemical  $H_2$  evolution from  $MoS_2$  nanocatalysts. *Science* 317, 100–102. doi:10.1126/science.1141483

Jia, Y., Zhang, L., Du, A., Gao, G., Chen, J., Yan, X., et al. (2016). Defect graphene as a trifunctional catalyst for electrochemical reactions. *Adv. Mater* 28, 9532–9538. doi:10. 1002/adma.201602912

Jia, Y., Zhang, L., Zhuang, L., Liu, H., Yan, X., Wang, X., et al. (2019). Identification of active sites for acidic oxygen reduction on carbon catalysts with and without nitrogen doping. *Nat. Catal.* 2, 688–695. doi:10.1038/s41929-019-0297-4

Jiang, H., Gu, J., Zheng, X., Liu, M., Qiu, X., Wang, L., et al. (2019). Defect-rich and ultrathin N doped carbon nanosheets as advanced trifunctional metal-free electrocatalysts for the ORR, OER and HER. *Energy Environ. Sci.* 12, 322–333. doi:10.1039/c8ee03276a

Jiao, S., Fu, X., and Huang, H. (2022). Descriptors for the evaluation of electrocatalytic reactions: d-band theory and beyond. *Adv. Funct. Mater* 32, 2107651. doi:10.1002/adfm. 202107651

Jinnouchi, R., Karsai, F., Verdi, C., Asahi, R., and Kresse, G. (2020). Descriptors representing two- and three-body atomic distributions and their effects on the accuracy of machine-learned inter-atomic potentials. *J. Chem. Phys.* 152, 234102. doi:10.1063/5.0009491

Jinnouchi, R., Lahnsteiner, J., Karsai, F., Kresse, G., and Bokdam, M. (2019). Phase transitions of hybrid perovskites simulated by machine-learning force fields trained on the fly with bayesian inference. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 122, 225701. doi:10.1103/PhysRevLett.122.225701

Karunadasa, H. I., Chang, C. J., and Long, J. R. (2010). A molecular molybdenum-oxo catalyst for generating hydrogen from water. *Nature* 464, 1329–1333. doi:10.1038/ nature08969

Khan, K., Liu, T., Arif, M., Yan, X., Hossain, M. D., Rehman, F., et al. (2021). Laserirradiated holey graphene-supported single-atom catalyst towards hydrogen evolution and oxygen reduction. *Adv. Energy Mater* 11, 2101619. doi:10.1002/aenm.202101619

Kibler, L. A., El-Aziz, A. M., Hoyer, R., and Kolb, D. M. (2005). Tuning reaction rates by lateral strain in a palladium monolayer. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 44, 2080–2084. doi:10. 1002/anie.200462127

Klamt, A., and Schüürmann, G. (1993). COSMO: a new approach to dielectric screening in solvents with explicit expressions for the screening energy and its gradient. *J. Chem. Soc. Perkin Trans.* 2, 799–805. doi:10.1039/P29930000799

Kocer, E., Ko, T. W., and Behler, J. (2022). Neural network potentials: a concise overview of methods. *Annu. Rev. Phys. Chem.* 73, 163–186. doi:10.1146/annurev-physchem-082720-034254

Kohn, W., and Sham, L. J. (1965). Self-consistent equations including exchange and correlation effects. *Phys. Rev.* 140, A1133–A1138. doi:10.1103/PhysRev.140.A1133

Kresse, G., and Furthmüller, J. (1996a). Efficiency of ab-initio total energy calculations for metals and semiconductors using a plane-wave basis set. *Comput. Mater Sci.* 6, 15–50. doi:10.1016/0927-0256(96)00008-0

Kresse, G., and Furthmüller, J. (1996b). Efficient iterative schemes for *ab initio* totalenergy calculations using a plane-wave basis set. *Phys. Rev. B* 54, 11169–11186. doi:10. 1103/PhysRevB.54.11169

Kresse, G., and Hafner, J. (1993). Ab initio molecular dynamics for liquid metals. Phys. Rev. B 47, 558–561. doi:10.1103/PhysRevB.47.558

Kresse, G., and Joubert, D. (1999). From ultrasoft pseudopotentials to the projector augmented-wave method. *Phys. Rev. B* 59, 1758–1775. doi:10.1103/PhysRevB.59.1758

Kroto, H. W., Heath, J. R., O'Brien, S. C., Curl, R. F., and Smalley, R. E. (1985).  $\rm C_{60}:$  buckminsterfullerene. Nature 318, 162–163. doi:10.1038/318162a0

Laio, A., and Parrinello, M. (2002). Escaping free-energy minima. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 99, 12562–12566. doi:10.1073/pnas.202427399

Lan, J., Luo, M., Han, J., Peng, M., Duan, H., and Tan, Y. (2021). Nanoporous  $B_{13}C_2$  towards highly efficient electrochemical nitrogen fixation. Small 17, 2102814. doi:10. 1002/smll.202102814

Lan, R., Irvine, J. T. S., and Tao, S. (2013). Synthesis of ammonia directly from air and water at ambient temperature and pressure. *Sci. Rep.* 3, 1145. doi:10.1038/srep01145

Le, Y. Q., Gu, J., and Tian, W. Q. (2014). Nitrogen-fixation catalyst based on graphene: every part counts. *Chem. Commun. (Camb)* 50, 13319–13322. doi:10. 1039/c4cc01950d

Lee, C., Yang, W., and Parr, R. G. (1988). Development of the Colle-Salvetti correlation-energy formula into a functional of the electron density. *Phys. Rev. B* 37, 785–789. doi:10.1103/PhysRevB.37.785

Lee, Y.-L., Kleis, J., Rossmeisl, J., Shao-Horn, Y., and Morgan, D. (2011). Prediction of solid oxide fuel cell cathode activity with first-principles descriptors. *Energy Environ. Sci.* 4. doi:10.1039/c1ee02032c

Li, D., Wang, B., Long, X., Xu, W., Xia, Y., Yang, D., et al. (2021). Controlled asymmetric charge distribution of active centers in conjugated polymers for oxygen reduction. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 60, 26483–26488. doi:10.1002/anie.202109057

Li, M., Zhu, Y., Song, N., Wang, C., and Lu, X. (2018). Fabrication of Pt nanoparticles on nitrogen-doped carbon/Ni nanofibers for improved hydrogen evolution activity. *J. Colloid Interface Sci.* 514, 199–207. doi:10.1016/j.jcis.2017.12.028

Li, Q., Ouyang, Y., Lu, S., Bai, X., Zhang, Y., Shi, L., et al. (2020). Perspective on theoretical methods and modeling relating to electro-catalysis processes. *Chem. Commun.* 56, 9937–9949. doi:10.1039/D0CC02998J

Li, W., Liu, Y., Wu, M., Feng, X., Redfern, S. A. T., Shang, Y., et al. (2018). Carbonquantum-dots-loaded ruthenium nanoparticles as an efficient electrocatalyst for hydrogen production in alkaline media. *Adv. Mater* 30, e1800676. doi:10.1002/ adma.201800676

Li, X.-F., Li, Q.-K., Cheng, J., Liu, L., Yan, Q., Wu, Y., et al. (2016). Conversion of dinitrogen to ammonia by FeN3-embedded graphene. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 138, 8706–8709. doi:10.1021/jacs.6b04778

Liang, Y., Li, Y., Wang, H., and Dai, H. (2013). Strongly coupled inorganic/ nanocarbon hybrid materials for advanced electrocatalysis. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 135, 2013–2036. doi:10.1021/ja3089923

Lin, Z., Waller, G. H., Liu, Y., Liu, M., and Wong, C.-P. (2013). 3D Nitrogen-doped graphene prepared by pyrolysis of graphene oxide with polypyrrole for electrocatalysis of oxygen reduction reaction. *Nano Energy* 2, 241–248. doi:10.1016/j.nanoen.2012. 09.002

Ling, C., Bai, X., Ouyang, Y., Du, A., and Wang, J. (2018a). Single molybdenum atom anchored on N-doped carbon as a promising electrocatalyst for nitrogen reduction into ammonia at ambient conditions. *J. Phys. Chem. C* 122, 16842–16847. doi:10.1021/acs. jpcc.8b05257

Ling, C., Cui, Y., Lu, S., Bai, X., and Wang, J. (2022). How computations accelerate electrocatalyst discovery. *Chem* 8, 1575–1610. doi:10.1016/j.chempr.2022.03.015

Ling, C., Niu, X., Li, Q., Du, A., and Wang, J. (2018b). Metal-free single atom catalyst for  $N_2$  fixation driven by visible light. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 140, 14161–14168. doi:10.1021/jacs.8b07472

Ling, C., Ouyang, Y., Li, Q., Bai, X., Mao, X., Du, A., et al. (2018c). A general two-step strategy-based high-throughput screening of single atom catalysts for nitrogen fixation. *Small Methods* 3. doi:10.1002/smtd.201800376

Ling, C., Shi, L., Ouyang, Y., Zeng, X. C., and Wang, J. (2017). Nanosheet supported single-metal atom bifunctional catalyst for overall water splitting. *Nano Lett.* 17, 5133–5139. doi:10.1021/acs.nanolett.7b02518

Liu, Smith, S. C., Gu, Y., and Kou, L. (2023). C–N coupling enabled by N–N bond breaking for electrochemical urea production. *Adv. Funct. Mater* 2305894. doi:10.1002/adfm.202305894

Liu, H., Qu, M., Du, A., and Sun, Q. (2023).  $N_2$  reduction in uranium-doped  $\rm C_2N/C_3N_4$  monolayers: a DFT computational study. New J. Chem. 47, 13880–13887. doi:10. 1039/D3NJ01668D

Liu, M., Zhao, Z., Duan, X., and Huang, Y. (2019). Nanoscale structure design for high-performance Pt-based ORR catalysts. *Adv. Mater* 31, 1802234. doi:10.1002/adma. 201802234

Liu, R., Wu, D., Feng, X., and Müllen, K. (2010). Nitrogen-doped ordered mesoporous graphitic arrays with high electrocatalytic activity for oxygen reduction. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 49, 2565–2569. doi:10.1002/anie.200907289

Liu, X., and Dai, L. (2016). Carbon-based metal-free catalysts. Nat. Rev. Mater 1, 16064. doi:10.1038/natrevmats.2016.64

Liu, Y., Xue, Y., Hui, L., Yu, H., Fang, Y., He, F., et al. (2021). Porous graphdiyne loading CoO<sub>x</sub> quantum dots for fixation nitrogen reaction. *Nano Energy* 89, 106333. doi:10.1016/j.nanoen.2021.106333

Liu, A, Yang, Y., Kong, D., Ren, X., Gao, M., Liang, X., et al. (2021). DFT study of the defective carbon materials with vacancy and heteroatom as catalyst for NRR. *Appl. Surf. Sci.* 536, 147851. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2020.147851

Lorenz, S., Groß, A., and Scheffler, M. (2004). Representing high-dimensional potential-energy surfaces for reactions at surfaces by neural networks. *Chem. Phys. Lett.* 395, 210–215. doi:10.1016/j.cplett.2004.07.076

Man, I. C., Su, H.-Y., Calle-Vallejo, F., Hansen, H. A., Martínez, J. I., Inoglu, N. G., et al. (2011). Universality in oxygen evolution electrocatalysis on oxide surfaces. *ChemCatChem* 3, 1159–1165. doi:10.1002/cctc.201000397

Mao, X., Kour, G., Zhang, L., He, T., Wang, S., Yan, C., et al. (2019a). Silicon-doped graphene edges: an efficient metal-free catalyst for the reduction of  $CO_2$  into methanol and ethanol. *Catal. Sci. Technol.* 9, 6800–6807. doi:10.1039/c9cy01709g

Mao, X., Ling, C., Tang, C., Yan, C., Zhu, Z., and Du, A. (2018). Predicting a new class of metal-organic frameworks as efficient catalyst for bi-functional oxygen evolution/ reduction reactions. J. Catal. 367, 206–211. doi:10.1016/j.jcat.2018.09.012

Mao, X., Tang, C., He, T., Wijethunge, D., Yan, C., Zhu, Z., et al. (2020b). Computational screening of  $MN_4$  (M = Ti-Cu) based metal organic frameworks for  $CO_2$  reduction using the d-band centre as a descriptor. *Nanoscale* 12, 6188–6194. doi:10. 1039/c9nr09529b

Mao, X., Wang, L., Xu, Y., Wang, P., Li, Y., and Zhao, J. (2021). Computational high-throughput screening of alloy nanoclusters for electrocatalytic hydrogen evolution. *npj Comput. Mater.* 7, 46. doi:10.1038/s41524-021-00514-8

Mao, X., Wijethunge, D., Zhang, L., Wang, S., Yan, C., Zhu, Z., et al. (2020a). Metalfree graphene/boron nitride heterointerface for CO<sub>2</sub> reduction: surface curvature controls catalytic activity and selectivity. *EcoMat* 2, e12013. doi:10.1002/eom2.12013

Mao, X., Zhang, L., Kour, G., Zhou, S., Wang, S., Yan, C., et al. (2019c). Defective graphene on the transition-metal surface: formation of efficient bifunctional catalysts for oxygen evolution/reduction reactions in alkaline media. *ACS Appl. Mater Interfaces* 11, 17410–17415. doi:10.1021/acsami.9b02588

Mao, X., Zhou, S., Yan, C., Zhu, Z., and Du, A. (2019b). A single boron atom doped boron nitride edge as a metal-free catalyst for N2 fixation. *Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.* 21, 1110–1116. doi:10.1039/c8cp07064d

Marenich, A. V., Cramer, C. J., and Truhlar, D. G. (2009). Universal solvation model based on solute electron density and on a continuum model of the solvent defined by the bulk dielectric constant and atomic surface tensions. *J. Phys. Chem. B* 113, 6378–6396. doi:10.1021/jp810292n

Matsumoto, H. Y., and Tamura, H. (1977b). Catalytic activity for electrochemical reduction of oxygen of lanthanum nickel oxide and related oxides. *J. Electroanal. Chem. Interfacial Electrochem.* 79, 319–326. doi:10.1016/S0022-0728(77)80453-1

Matsumoto, H. Y., and Tamura, H. (1977a). Influence of the nature of the conduction band of transition metal oxides on catalytic activity for oxygen reduction. *J. Electroanal. Chem. Interfacial Electrochem.* 83, 237–243. doi:10.1016/S0022-0728(77)80169-1

Mattsson, A. E. (2002). In pursuit of the "divine" functional. Science 298, 759–760. doi:10.1126/science.1077710

Melander, M. M., Kuisma, M. J., Christensen, T. E. K., and Honkala, K. (2018). Grand-canonical approach to density functional theory of electrocatalytic systems: thermodynamics of solid-liquid interfaces at constant ion and electrode potentials. *J. Chem. Phys.* 150, 041706. doi:10.1063/1.5047829

Nilsson, A., Pettersson, L. G. M., Hammer, B., Bligaard, T., Christensen, C. H., and Nørskov, J. K. (2005). The electronic structure effect in heterogeneous catalysis. *Catal. Lett.* 100, 111–114. doi:10.1007/s10562-004-3434-9

Nørskov, J. K. (1991). Electronic factors in catalysis. Prog. Surf. Sci. 38, 103–144. doi:10.1016/0079-6816(91)90007-Q

Nørskov, J. K., Rossmeisl, J., Logadottir, A., Lindqvist, L., Kitchin, J. R., Bligaard, T., et al. (2004). Origin of the overpotential for oxygen reduction at a fuel-cell cathode. *J. Phys. Chem. B* 108, 17886–17892. doi:10.1021/jp047349j

Nørskov, J. K., Bligaard, T., Logadottir, A., Kitchin, J. R., Chen, J. G., Pandelov, S., et al. (2005). Trends in the exchange current for hydrogen evolution. *J. Electrochem Soc.* 152. doi:10.1149/1.1856988

Nosé, S. (1984). A unified formulation of the constant temperature molecular dynamics methods. J. Chem. Phys. 81, 511-519. doi:10.1063/1.447334

Novoselov, K. S., Geim, A. K., Morozov, S. V., Jiang, D., Zhang, Y., Dubonos, S. V., et al. (2004). Electric field effect in atomically thin carbon films. *Science* 306, 666–669. doi:10.1126/science.1102896

Ouyang, T., Ye, Y. Q., Wu, C. Y., Xiao, K., and Liu, Z. Q. (2019). Heterostructures composed of N-doped carbon nanotubes encapsulating cobalt and beta-Mo<sub>2</sub>C nanoparticles as bifunctional electrodes for water splitting. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 58, 4923–4928. doi:10.1002/anie.201814262

Parker, A. J., Opletal, G., and Barnard, A. S. (2020). Classification of platinum nanoparticle catalysts using machine learning. *J. Appl. Phys.* 128, 014301. doi:10.1063/5. 0009129

Perdew, J. P., Burke, K., and Ernzerhof, M. (1996). Generalized gradient approximation made simple. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 77, 3865–3868. doi:10.1103/ PhysRevLett.77.3865

Perdew, J. P., Chevary, J. A., Vosko, S. H., Jackson, K. A., Pederson, M. R., Singh, D. J., et al. (1992). Atoms, molecules, solids, and surfaces: applications of the generalized gradient approximation for exchange and correlation. *Phys. Rev. B* 46, 6671–6687. doi:10.1103/PhysRevB.46.6671

Peterson, A. A., Abild-Pedersen, F., Studt, F., Rossmeisl, J., and Nørskov, J. K. (2010). How copper catalyzes the electroreduction of carbon dioxide into hydrocarbon fuels. *Energy Environ. Sci.* 3, 1311–1315. doi:10.1039/C0EE00071J

Powar, N. S., Hiragond, C. B., Bae, D., and In, S.-I. (2022). Two-dimensional metal carbides for electro- and photocatalytic  $\rm CO_2$  reduction: review. J. CO2 Util. 55, 101814. doi:10.1016/j.jcou.2021.101814 (

Raciti, D., and Wang, C. (2018). Recent advances in CO $_2$  reduction electrocatalysis on copper. ACS Energy Lett. 3, 1545–1556. doi:10.1021/acsenergylett.8b00553

Ren, X., Lv, Q., Liu, L., Liu, B., Wang, Y., Liu, A., et al. (2020). Current progress of Pt and Pt-based electrocatalysts used for fuel cells. *Sustain. Energy Fuels* 4, 15–30. doi:10. 1039/c9se00460b

Ruddigkeit, L., van Deursen, R., Blum, L. C., and Reymond, J.-L. (2012). Enumeration of 166 billion organic small molecules in the chemical universe database GDB-17. *J. Chem. Inf. Model* 52, 2864–2875. doi:10.1021/ci300415d

Ruiyi, L., Keyang, H., Pengwu, X., Wendong, W., Nana, L., Haiyan, Z., et al. (2021). Synthesis of a ruthenium–graphene quantum dot–graphene hybrid as a promising single-atom catalyst for electrochemical nitrogen reduction with ultrahigh yield rate and selectivity. J. Mater Chem. A 9, 24582–24589. doi:10.1039/d1ta07158k

Samal, P. P., Poonam, and Krishnamurty, S. (2021). Substrate augmented catalytic activity towards NRR: a case study of Li doped Al clusters on defective graphene. *Appl. Surf. Sci.* 566, 150586. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2021.150586

Seh, Z. W., Kibsgaard, J., Dickens, C. F., Chorkendorff, I., Nørskov, J. K., and Jaramillo, T. F. (2017). Combining theory and experiment in electrocatalysis: insights into materials design. *Science* 355, eaad4998. doi:10.1126/science.aad4998

Song, H., Yu, J., Tang, Z., Yang, B., and Lu, S. (2022). Halogen-doped carbon dots on amorphous cobalt phosphide as robust electrocatalysts for overall water splitting. *Adv. Energy Mater* 12, 2102573. doi:10.1002/aenm.202102573

Stamenkovic, V. R., Mun, B. S., Arenz, M., Mayrhofer, K. J. J., Lucas, C. A., Wang, G., et al. (2007). Trends in electrocatalysis on extended and nanoscale Pt-bimetallic alloy surfaces. *Nat. Mater* 6, 241–247. doi:10.1038/nmat1840

Stephens, P. J., Devlin, F. J., Chabalowski, C. F., and Frisch, M. J. (1994). Ab initio calculation of vibrational absorption and circular dichroism spectra using density functional force fields. J. Phys. Chem. 98, 5. doi:10.1021/j100096a001

Sui, S., Wang, X., Zhou, X., Su, Y., Riffat, S., and Liu, C.-J. (2017). A comprehensive review of Pt electrocatalysts for the oxygen reduction reaction: nanostructure, activity, mechanism and carbon support in PEM fuel cells. *J. Mater Chem. A* 5, 1808–1825. doi:10.1039/C6TA08580F

Sun, S., Zhang, G., Gauquelin, N., Chen, N., Zhou, J., Yang, S., et al. (2013). Singleatom catalysis using Pt/graphene achieved through atomic layer deposition. *Sci. Rep.* 3, 1775. doi:10.1038/srep01775

Sun, Y., Cai, P., Yang, D., and Yao, X. (2022). Single-site catalysis in heterogeneous electro-Fenton reaction for wastewater remediation. *Chem. Catal.* 2, 679–692. doi:10. 1016/j.checat.2022.02.002

Takamoto, S., Shinagawa, C., Motoki, D., Nakago, K., Li, W., Kurata, I., et al. (2022). Towards universal neural network potential for material discovery applicable to arbitrary combination of 45 elements. *Nat. Commun.* 13, 2991. doi:10.1038/s41467-022-30687-9 Tang, Y., Yang, C., Xu, X., Kang, Y., Henzie, J., Que, W., et al. (2022). MXene nanoarchitectonics: defect-engineered 2D MXenes towards enhanced electrochemical water splitting. *Adv. Energy Mater* 12, 2103867. doi:10.1002/aenm.202103867

Tao, J., Perdew, J. P., Staroverov, V. N., and Scuseria, G. E. (2003). Climbing the density functional ladder: nonempirical meta--generalized gradient approximation designed for molecules and solids. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 91, 146401. doi:10.1103/ PhysRevLett.91.146401

Tao, L., Qiao, M., Jin, R., Li, Y., Xiao, Z., Wang, Y., et al. (2019). Bridging the surface charge and catalytic activity of a defective carbon electrocatalyst. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 58, 1019–1024. doi:10.1002/anie.201810207

Thomas, L. H. (1927). The calculation of atomic fields. Math. Proc. Camb. Philosophical Soc. 23, 542-548. doi:10.1017/S0305004100011683

Tolba, S. A., Gameel, K. M., Ali, B. A., Almossalami, H. A., and Allam, N. K. (2018). The DFT+ U: approaches, accuracy, and applications. *Density Funct. Calculations-Recent Progresses Theory Appl.* 1, 5772.

Tran, K., and Ulissi, Z. W. (2018). Active learning across intermetallics to guide discovery of electrocatalysts for  $CO_2$  reduction and  $H_2$  evolution. *Nat. Catal.* 1, 696–703. doi:10.1038/s41929-018-0142-1

Turner John, A. (2004). Sustainable hydrogen production. Science 305, 972–974. doi:10.1126/science.1103197

Unke, O. T., Chmiela, S., Sauceda, H. E., Gastegger, M., Poltavsky, I., Schütt, K. T., et al. (2021). Machine learning force fields. *Chem. Rev.* 121, 10142–10186. doi:10.1021/acs.chemrev.0c01111

van der Ham, C. J., Koper, M. T., and Hetterscheid, D. G. (2014). Challenges in reduction of dinitrogen by proton and electron transfer. *Chem. Soc. Rev.* 43, 5183–5191. doi:10.1039/c4cs00085d

Wan, X., Zhang, Z., Niu, H., Yin, Y., Kuai, C., Wang, J., et al. (2021). Machinelearning-accelerated catalytic activity predictions of transition metal phthalocyanine dual-metal-site catalysts for CO<sub>2</sub> reduction. *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.* 12, 6111–6118. doi:10. 1021/acs.jpclett.1c01526

Wang, B., and Zhang, F. (2022). Main descriptors to correlate structures with the performances of electrocatalysts. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 61, e202111026. doi:10.1002/anie.202111026

Wang, F., and Mao, J. (2021). Effect of N-doping on graphene: NRR activity and N-source. *Diam. Relat. Mater* 118, 108494. doi:10.1016/j.diamond.2021.108494

Wang, X., Jia, Y., Mao, X., Liu, D., He, W., Li, J., et al. (2020a). Edge-rich Fe–N<sub>4</sub> active sites in defective carbon for oxygen reduction catalysis. *Adv. Mater* 32, 2000966. doi:10. 1002/adma.202000966

Wang, X., Jia, Y., Mao, X., Zhang, L., Liu, D., Song, L., et al. (2020b). A directional synthesis for topological defect in carbon. *Chem* 6, 2009–2023. doi:10.1016/j.chempr. 2020.05.010

Wexler, R. B., Martirez, J. M. P., and Rappe, A. M. (2018). Chemical pressure-driven enhancement of the hydrogen evolving activity of Ni<sub>2</sub>P from nonmetal surface doping interpreted via machine learning. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 140, 4678–4683. doi:10.1021/jacs. 8b00947

Whipple, D. T., and Kenis, P. J. A. (2010). Prospects of CO<sub>2</sub> utilization via direct heterogeneous electrochemical reduction. *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.* 1, 3451–3458. doi:10. 1021/jz1012627

White, J. A., and Bird, D. M. (1994). Implementation of gradient-corrected exchangecorrelation potentials in Car-Parrinello total-energy calculations. *Phys. Rev. B* 50, 4954–4957. doi:10.1103/PhysRevB.50.4954

Wu, J., Ma, L., Yadav, R. M., Yang, Y., Zhang, X., Vajtai, R., et al. (2015). Nitrogendoped graphene with pyridinic dominance as a highly active and stable electrocatalyst for oxygen reduction. ACS Appl. Mater Interfaces 7, 14763–14769. doi:10.1021/acsami. 5b02902

Wu, J., Ma, S., Sun, J., Gold, J. I., Tiwary, C., Kim, B., et al. (2016). A metal-free electrocatalyst for carbon dioxide reduction to multi-carbon hydrocarbons and oxygenates. *Nat. Commun.* 7, 13869. doi:10.1038/ncomms13869

Wu, Q., Jia, Y., Liu, Q., Mao, X., Guo, Q., Yan, X., et al. (2022). Ultra-dense carbon defects as highly active sites for oxygen reduction catalysis. *Chem.* doi:10.1016/j.chempr. 2022.06.013

Wu, Y., Wei, W., Yu, R., Xia, L., Hong, X., Zhu, J., et al. (2022). Anchoring subnanometer Pt clusters on crumpled paper-like MXene enables high hydrogen evolution mass activity. *Adv. Funct. Mater* 32, 2110910. doi:10.1002/adfm.202110910,

Xie, T., Wang, P., Tian, C., Zhao, G., Jia, J., He, C., et al. (2022). Adsorption characteristics of gas molecules adsorbed on graphene doped with Mn: a first principle study. *Molecules* 27. doi:10.3390/molecules27072315

Xiong, Y., Dong, J., Huang, Z.-Q., Xin, P., Chen, W., Wang, Y., et al. (2020). Singleatom Rh/N-doped carbon electrocatalyst for formic acid oxidation. *Nat. Nanotechnol.* 15, 390–397. doi:10.1038/s41565-020-0665-x

Xu, H., Han, Y., Wu, Q., Jia, Y., Li, Q., Yan, X., et al. (2023). Iridium-based electrocatalysts for the acidic oxygen evolution reaction: engineering strategies to enhance the activity and stability. *Mater Chem. Front.* 7, 1248–1267. doi:10.1039/D2QM01220K

Xu, S., and Carter, E. A. (2019). Theoretical insights into heterogeneous (Photo) electrochemical CO $_2$  reduction. Chem. Rev. 119, 6631–6669. doi:10.1021/acs.chemrev.8b00481

Yan, X., Jia, Y., Chen, J., Zhu, Z., and Yao, X. (2016). Defective-activated-carbonsupported Mn-Co nanoparticles as a highly efficient electrocatalyst for oxygen reduction. *Adv. Mater* 28, 8771–8778. doi:10.1002/adma.201601651

Yan, X., Jia, Y., Wang, K., Jin, Z., Dong, C.-L., Huang, Y.-C., et al. (2020). Controllable synthesis of Fe-N<sub>4</sub> species for acidic oxygen reduction. *Carbon Energy* 2, 452–460. doi:10.1002/cey2.47

Yan, X., Zhuang, L., Zhu, Z., and Yao, X. (2021). Defect engineering and characterization of active sites for efficient electrocatalysis. *Nanoscale* 13, 3327–3345. doi:10.1039/d0nr08976a

Yan, Y., Xia, B. Y., Zhao, B., and Wang, X. (2016). A review on noble-metal-free bifunctional heterogeneous catalysts for overall electrochemical water splitting. *J. Mater Chem. A* 4, 17587–17603. doi:10.1039/c6ta08075h

Yang, Q., Jia, Y., Wei, F., Zhuang, L., Yang, D., Liu, J., et al. (2020). Understanding the activity of Co-N<sub>4</sub>–xC<sub>x</sub> in atomic metal catalysts for oxygen reduction catalysis. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 59, 6122–6127. doi:10.1002/anie.202000324

Yang, Q., Liu, H., Yuan, P., Jia, Y., Zhuang, L., Zhang, H., et al. (2022). Single carbon vacancy traps atomic platinum for hydrogen evolution catalysis. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 144, 2171–2178. doi:10.1021/jacs.1c10814

Yang, W., Gao, Z., Ding, X., Lv, G., and Yan, W. (2018). The adsorption characteristics of mercury species on single atom iron catalysts with different graphene-based substrates. *Appl. Surf. Sci.* 455, 940–951. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2018.06.031

Yang, W., Jia, Z., Zhou, B., Chen, L., Ding, X., Jiao, L., et al. (2023). Why is C–C coupling in  $CO_2$  reduction still difficult on dual-atom electrocatalysts? ACS Catal., 9695–9705. doi:10.1021/acscatal.3c01768

Yang, X.-F., Wang, A., Qiao, B., Li, J., Liu, J., and Zhang, T. (2013). Single-atom catalysts: a new frontier in heterogeneous catalysis. *Acc. Chem. Res.* 46, 1740–1748. doi:10.1021/ar300361m

Yasin, G., Ibraheem, S., Ali, S., Arif, M., Ibrahim, S., Iqbal, R., et al. (2022). Defectsengineered tailoring of tri-doped interlinked metal-free bifunctional catalyst with lower gibbs free energy of OER/HER intermediates for overall water splitting. *Mater. Today Chem.* 23, 100634. doi:10.1016/j.mtchem.2021.100634

Ye, L., Ying, Y., Sun, D., Zhang, Z., Fei, L., Wen, Z., et al. (2020). Highly efficient porous carbon electrocatalyst with controllable N-species content for selective CO<sub>2</sub> reduction. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 59, 3244–3251. doi:10.1002/anie.201912751

Ye, S., Luo, F., Zhang, Q., Zhang, P., Xu, T., Wang, Q., et al. (2019). Highly stable single Pt atomic sites anchored on aniline-stacked graphene for hydrogen evolution reaction. *Energy Environ. Sci.* 12, 1000–1007. doi:10.1039/c8ee02888e

Yin, H., and Du, A. (2023). Activating the hydrogen evolution reaction in lowdimensional carbon by partial hydrogenation: role of the hybrid sp<sup>2</sup>-sp<sup>3</sup> orbital interface. *ChemPhysMater.* doi:10.1016/j.chphma.2022.12.001

Yu, X., Han, P., Wei, Z., Huang, L., Gu, Z., Peng, S., et al. (2018). Boron-doped graphene for electrocatalytic  $\rm N_2$  reduction. Joule 2, 1610–1622. doi:10.1016/j.joule.2018.06.007

Zha, W., Liu, D., Ma, Z., Wang, Y., Wei, Y., Ma, X., et al. (2021). Efficient electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction on C<sub>2</sub>N monolayer supported transition metals trimer catalysts: a DFT study. *Appl. Surf. Sci.* 564, 150331. doi:10.1016/j.apsusc.2021.150331

Zhang, B.-W., Yang, H.-L., Wang, Y.-X., Dou, S.-X., and Liu, H.-K. (2018). A comprehensive review on controlling surface composition of Pt-based bimetallic electrocatalysts. *Adv. Energy Mater* 8, 1703597. doi:10.1002/aenm.201703597

Zhang, H., Liu, Y., Chen, T., Zhang, J., Zhang, J., and D Lou, X. W. (2019). Unveiling the activity origin of electrocatalytic oxygen evolution over isolated Ni atoms supported on a N-doped carbon matrix. *Adv. Mater* 31, e1904548. doi:10.1002/adma.201904548

Zhang, I. Y., and Xu, X. (2020). On the top rung of Jacob's ladder of density functional theory: toward resolving the dilemma of SIE and NCE. *WIREs Comput. Mol. Sci.* 11. doi:10.1002/wcms.1490

Zhang, L., Fischer, J. M. T. A., Jia, Y., Yan, X., Xu, W., Wang, X., et al. (2018). Coordination of atomic Co-Pt coupling species at carbon defects as active sites for oxygen reduction reaction. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 140, 10757–10763. doi:10.1021/jacs.8b04647

Zhang, L., Jia, Y., Yan, X., and Yao, X. (2018). Activity origins in nanocarbons for the electrocatalytic hydrogen evolution reaction. *Small* 14, 1800235. doi:10.1002/smll. 201800235

Zhang, N., Yang, B., Liu, K., Li, H., Chen, G., Qiu, X., et al. (2021). Machine learning in screening high performance electrocatalysts for  $CO_2$  reduction. *Small Methods* 5, 2100987. doi:10.1002/smtd.202100987

Zhao, X., and Liu, Y. (2021). Origin of selective production of hydrogen peroxide by electrochemical oxygen reduction. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 143, 9423–9428. doi:10.1021/jacs.1c02186

Zhao, X., Zhao, K., Liu, Y., Su, Y., Chen, S., Yu, H., et al. (2022). Highly efficient electrochemical CO2 reduction on a precise homonuclear diatomic Fe–Fe catalyst. *ACS Catal.* 12, 11412–11420. doi:10.1021/acscatal.2c03149

Zhao, Y., Schultz, N. E., and Truhlar, D. G. (2006). Design of density functionals by combining the method of constraint satisfaction with parametrization for thermochemistry, thermochemical kinetics, and noncovalent interactions. *J. Chem. Theory Comput.* 2, 364–382. doi:10.1021/ct0502763

Zhao, Y., and Truhlar, D. G. (2006). A new local density functional for maingroup thermochemistry, transition metal bonding, thermochemical kinetics, and noncovalent interactions. *J. Chem. Phys.* 125, 194101. doi:10.1063/1. 2370993

Zhao, Y., and Truhlar, D. G. (2008). Density functionals with broad applicability in chemistry. Acc. Chem. Res. 41, 157–167. doi:10.1021/ar700111a

Zheng, J., Sun, X., Qiu, C., Yan, Y., Yao, Z., Deng, S., et al. (2020). High-throughput screening of hydrogen evolution reaction catalysts in MXene materials. *J. Phys. Chem. C* 124, 13695–13705. doi:10.1021/acs.jpcc.0c02265

Zheng, Y., Jiao, Y., and Qiao, S. Z. (2015). Engineering of carbon-based electrocatalysts for emerging energy conversion: from fundamentality to functionality. *Adv. Mater* 27, 5372–5378. doi:10.1002/adma.201500821

Zhou, S., Yang, X., Pei, W., Liu, N., and Zhao, J. (2018). Heterostructures of MXenes and N-doped graphene as highly active bifunctional electrocatalysts. *Nanoscale* 10, 10876–10883. doi:10.1039/c8nr01090k

Zhou, S., Yang, X., Xu, X., Dou, S. X., Du, Y., and Zhao, J. (2020). Boron nitride nanotubes for ammonia synthesis: activation by filling transition metals. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 142, 308–317. doi:10.1021/jacs.9b10588

Zhou, Y., Wei, B., Cao, H., An, Z., Li, M., Huo, Y., et al. (2022). Electroreduction of nitrogen to ammonia by single-atom catalysis with synergistic boron-carbon nitrogen nanotubes. *J. Environ. Chem. Eng.* 10, 107752. doi:10.1016/j.jece.2022.107752

Zhu, B., Zhang, L., Xu, D., Cheng, B., and Yu, J. (2017). Adsorption investigation of CO<sub>2</sub> on g-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> surface by DFT calculation. J. CO2 Util. 21, 327–335. doi:10.1016/j.jcou. 2017.07.021

Zhu, M., Zhou, Y., Sun, Y., Zhu, C., Hu, L., Gao, J., et al. (2018). Cobalt phosphide/ carbon dots composite as an efficient electrocatalyst for oxygen evolution reaction. *Dalton Trans.* 47, 5459–5464. doi:10.1039/c7dt04291d

Zhu, X., Yan, J., Gu, M., Liu, T., Dai, Y., Gu, Y., et al. (2019). Activity origin and design principles for oxygen reduction on dual-metal-site catalysts: a combined density functional theory and machine learning study. *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.* 10, 7760–7766. doi:10.1021/acs.jpclett.9b03392

Zhuo, J., Wang, T., Zhang, G., Liu, L., Gan, L., and Li, M. (2013). Salts of  $C_{60}(OH)_8$ electrodeposited onto a glassy carbon electrode: surprising catalytic performance in the hydrogen evolution reaction. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed.* 52, 10867–10870. doi:10.1002/anie.201305328

Zou, X., and Zhang, Y. (2015). Noble metal-free hydrogen evolution catalysts for water splitting. *Chem. Soc. Rev.* 44, 5148–5180. doi:10.1039/c4cs00448e