



# Creating Multicultural Opportunities in Music Teacher Education: Sharing Diversity Through Online Competitions

Svetlana Karkina<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Balwant Singh<sup>3</sup>, Gulnara Batyrshina<sup>1</sup> and Nelya Nurgayanova<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Institute of Philology and Intercultural Communication, Kazan Federal University, Kazan, Russia, <sup>2</sup> Department of Education, University of Salamanca, Salamanca, Spain, <sup>3</sup> Partap College of Education, Ludhiana, India

## OPEN ACCESS

### Edited by:

Mandeep Bhullar,  
Bhutta College of Education, India

### Reviewed by:

Almighty C. Tabuena,  
Philippine Normal University,  
Philippines  
María Del Mar Bernabé Villodre,  
University of Valencia, Spain  
Ildar Khannanov,  
Johns Hopkins University,  
United States

### \*Correspondence:

Svetlana Karkina  
s.karkina@mail.ru

### Specialty section:

This article was submitted to  
Teacher Education,  
a section of the journal  
Frontiers in Education

**Received:** 16 November 2021

**Accepted:** 28 February 2022

**Published:** 01 April 2022

### Citation:

Karkina S, Singh B, Batyrshina G  
and Nurgayanova N (2022) Creating  
Multicultural Opportunities in Music  
Teacher Education: Sharing Diversity  
Through Online Competitions.  
Front. Educ. 7:816121.  
doi: 10.3389/educ.2022.816121

Facing the emergency of the COVID19 pandemic, Higher Education faced new challenges which required the design and implementation of new types of multicultural interaction by the means of online tools. Online competition is the new form of international interaction popularity of which is growing rapidly at present. This study aimed to assess the advantages of online competitions in promoting multicultural opportunities in the education of music teachers. The research work was organized in two stages at Kazan Federal University (Russia) in the collaboration with Partap College of Education (India) where two online competitions—an international competition of students' research works, and a vocal singing competition—were organized. The jury committee included nine members who represented three countries (Russia, India, and Armenia). During the competitions, 95 students' research reports and 75 vocal performance records were collected. The results were analyzed by using the average rating method. The most significant criteria to assess the research work included the knowledge in the field of cultural diversity and the research scope demonstrating global experience. The vocal records were compared by the criteria such as art and technical level of performance, artistic style, expressive performance, and others. The comparative analysis was used for studying cultural diversity in the vocal records which presented more than fifteen different cultures delivering Western and Eastern musical traditions and featured differences in genres, fret-harmonic structure, performance style, and national instruments. The obtained results showed a high level of sharing of musical cultural diversity through these two online competitions. It was concluded that online competition demonstrates advantages in sharing the diversity of music cultures. The criteria based on multiculturalism allows evaluating competitive works objectively while focusing at the same time on their diversity. The implementation of a multicultural approach in online competitions will promote sharing in the world of music, allowing participants to experience diversities in order to preserve each artistic tradition in the context of its original cultural heritage.

**Keywords:** music education, teacher, online, competition, multicultural, arts

## INTRODUCTION

The situation of the COVID19 pandemic demonstrated new challenges in Higher Education when all usual forms of activity were shifted from face-to-face to online. In order to maintain student learning at all levels, schools designed online teaching activities for adapting the educational process during the pandemic (Wu, 2021). Among the teachers who were looking for new methods for delivering knowledge, the most unpredictable situation was faced by those of them who teach subjects that require personal interaction. For example, laboratory hours in the fields of engineering or medicine where clinical courses are a crucial part of the professional preparation process (Tran et al., 2021). Despite this, remote learning expanded rapidly, researchers emphasizing the need for its careful construction to ensure deep learning. Developing an active online learning environment should promote student commitment and performance, and meet learning objectives more efficiently by providing unique opportunities to satisfy individual learning preferences (Lamon et al., 2020). At the same time, the implementation of educational processes in new conditions needs to demonstrate more efforts for equal access to online learning as well as in managing the process to ensure professional development by the improvement of the educational programs design and policymaking (Cutri et al., 2020).

Critical difficulties in delivering education during the period of COVID19 were met in culturally diverse countries, like Brazil where a huge number of people from small nations live, preserving their unique cultures and languages. To enhance the multicultural intersectional educational perspectives in countries such as Brazil, educational policies and support from the government accompanied by ideas that could promote the emotional and cultural dimensions of students in complex times need to be analyzed (Ivenicki, 2021). Some researchers point out the valuable role of designing a special approach in order to preserve cultural and linguistic diversity as a precious heritage (Gul et al., 2021). A similar problem preserving the cultural heritage of national minorities was encountered in China, in particular, the Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region. In order to support national traditions, the author offers an educational model of preserving and developing the culture of ethnic minorities in the region, which includes “various forms and genres of Mongolian folk music and dance—ethnographic expeditions, international conferences, publication of printed works, organization of folklore competitions and festivals, art projects in museums and libraries, thematic programs, lectures and concerts for students of secondary schools and other categories of the population” (Jing, 2021). For encouraging students in folklore music, the author promotes multimedia platforms to support ethnic projects, motivate the learners to improve practical skills in art, and learn the native language (Jing, 2021). During the time of the COVID19 emergency, the effects in students’ transformational experiences were reached by the means of project-based learning implementation in a multicultural virtual environment (Stoica et al., 2021).

## BACKGROUND

Before the pandemic researchers pointed to the significant role of computer and digital technologies in general in education for providing equality and limitless access to knowledge for different cohorts of students (González-González et al., 2018). The experimental teaching of piano online for people deprived of the opportunity to enroll in the musical program at school demonstrated the successful possibility of developing musical performance skills without face-to-face interaction’ moreover improvement methods which allowed reaching educational purposes more quickly if the instructions will be delivered in a more direct way proved fruitful (Pike, 2017). A wide range of issues in the field of multiculturalism in arts and preserving cultural diversity by the means of computer-based technologies were not studied in detail.

### Multicultural Approach in Teacher Education

Modern researchers point to a policy aiming to preserve cultural diversity as a crucial investment in the world’s future, as well as necessary for a successful globalization process (Singh, 2019). In this process, intercultural education development is a way to “create and maintain conditions for coexistence in a multicultural society” (Malović and Vujica, 2021). Today, the majority of countries around the world, including Western Europe, are witnessing an increase in international migration. Studies demonstrate a more optimistic perspective on the development of multi-ethnic cities when its citizens have active experience of social mobility and facilitate reflexivity in personal relations (Kraus and Daenekindt, 2021). The current discussion on multicultural education among teacher educators in different countries tends to prevent racialization and reproduction of inequalities in teacher education (Hummelstedt et al., 2021).

The multicultural approach had become an important trend in education since the late 1970s. Researchers characterized it as “a central feature of the world in which we live” (Seglow, 2003). The increased value of this trend reflected the rising demographic and cultural diversity within many countries. After the events of World War II, the term “multiculturalism” was used to accommodate newfound social diversity. Since that time, a society that contained a variety of cultural groups rather than just one has been called “multicultural” (Ashcroft and Bevir, 2019). Currently, the multicultural approach in education features a trend of preparation for the social, political, and economic realities which people experience in complex human cultures (Davidman and Davidman, 1988).

The most progressive schools at all levels in the world value multicultural attitudes as desirable qualities for good teaching practice. The results of a study exhibited a positive correlation between multicultural attitudes and multicultural ideology development (Mlinar and Krammer, 2021). Due to the active movement of students from different countries for enrollment in western higher education, the multicultural classroom environment needs additional support such as culture and learning style based on active teaching methods empowering

learning expectations and outcomes (Razzaque et al., 2021). The critical purpose of the multicultural classroom is to implement the model of peaceful education in order to eliminate conflicts that are inevitable for an environment consisting of people of different nationalities (McConnell et al., 2021).

For the promotion of the study of different cultures in the classroom, researchers offer an intercultural education approach. In order to “help teacher educators to foster a dynamic and complex understanding of culture and cultural difference” (Ogay and Edelmann, 2016), authors suggest a heuristic tool based on a “dialectical square of cultural difference and three metaphors of culture” (Ogay and Edelmann, 2016). Close to the issue, researchers argue for a post-intercultural teacher’s education (Dervin, 2015) implemented by the means of “intercultural dialogue” (Dervin, 2015). In the framework of the process of globalization, Italian researchers point to the “need for intercultural education and competencies at the cognitive, emotional and relational levels” (Portera and Milani, 2021) in the school environment. In Vietnamese schools, researchers propose the development of intercultural competence through practical skills training (Gómez-Parra and Hà, 2021).

Sharing cultural diversity through modern digital technologies has a valuable role in developing multiculturalism nowadays. At the same time studies in current information technologies in the music field show a western-centered approach is prioritized, which causes culturally biased data and models. Despite the fact that western commercial music is spread widely by the means of digital technology more intensively than the music of other cultures the implementation of a multicultural approach seems to be a crucial decision in the preservation of equal rights for original traditions of different folk groups (Serra, 2011). Studying arts for promoting a multicultural approach is the next pivotal element according to current studies. Scholars suggest the effective development of students’ creativity and critical thinking skills through learning arts integration in a multicultural classroom which stimulates communication skills and at the same time fosters collaboration (Goldberg, 2021).

Since the last decade, the challenges in multicultural art education have been exacerbated in countries where people from different nationalities are living at the same places and they facing the problem of figuring out their personal identity in a contemporary society. The population of the Australian state of Victoria consists the migrants from more than 280 countries, who speak approximately 250 languages and follow more than a hundred faiths. Moreover, “the population diversity is constantly changing which challenges music educators to respond to classroom demographics” (Southcott and Joseph, 2010), schools need to educate their teachers to be culturally responsive. An environment containing multiple identities influences the way a person understands music and cultural dialogue. Thus, the learning method in the multicultural classroom becomes a critical tool for assuring educational expectations and outcomes. The demographic factors in Victoria fostered the development of multicultural education programs in order to satisfy diverse students’ needs. Researchers noted the gap between governmental regulations, curriculum frameworks, and teachers’ competencies in the field of music education which could be eliminated through

the invitation of artists for teaching “multicultural music in schools as an alternative strategy” (Nethsinghe, 2012).

The demographic factor has equally impacted music education in China as well as Australia. Several dozen nations living in this Asian country constitute the cultural diversity which needs government policy support, special methods, and curricula for “China’s music education from the perspective of multicultural view” (Law and Ho, 2011). National policy in China describes the country as a unity of diverse ethnic minorities, which need special equipment like textbooks and other tools based on unique cultural traditions for learning purposes (Zhang, 2017). Current China’s music education support students in studying western culture, but from the point of view of an outsider. Researchers point out the gap between western music and providing valuable references with “Chinese multicultural music education” (Yinuo, 2020).

The population in Africa has featured a high level of demographic diversity, even more than in China. In the last decade, the increasing number of cultural festivals in South Africa demonstrated the audience’s attention and interest in multicultural events as a means to improve social cohesion and national capacity (Snowball and Antrobus, 2021). In South Africa, the multicultural approach reflecting the population features became a priority strategy in art education. Researchers emphasize the crucial role of choral singing for multidimensional experiences in a various culture university environment as a “key indicator leading to personal resilience, and social values” (Barrett and Vermeulen, 2019). In this work, Barrett and Vermeulen (2019) pointed the positive correlation between collective music-making and the increasing level of enjoyment, health benefits of singers, their accountability, and camaraderie. Equality in education as a major concern in culturally diverse societies at high schools of Indonesia and New Zealand has been achieved by the development of students’ cross-cultural competence (Zamroni et al., 2021). In the American music teacher education program, the teaching of multicultural music “has been the stated goal of music education policymakers for many decades” (Wang and Humphreys, 2009). So, while the migration process increases all over the world, the governments of many countries state the problem of preserving cultural diversity. Among such means upgrading policy, the design of new curricula, and the development of educational content and teaching methods noted an increased attention toward multicultural events, like festivals and/or competitions, which have the capacity to bring together a variety of cultures.

## Music Competitions

Currently, the competitions featured a visible part of musical activity all around the world. During the last decades, sociologists for the first time noticed the significance of learning cultural variety from the aspect of ideologies, interpretations of competitors’ performances (McCormick, 2009), and musical perceptions. The frameworks of the sociological study stated that contemporary music composers value competitions “as meaningful in their efforts to professionalize and as mechanisms through which they reconcile legibility within the field with an authentic pursuit of their artistic voice” (Sutton, 2020). The

valuable role of music competitions in the popularization of cultural trends was pointed out much earlier. The diversity of cultural environment facilitates critical comparisons which stimulate innovation. According to researchers, the competitions between composers in Western Europe from the fourteenth to seventeenth centuries promoted the intensive rise of baroque and renaissance music (Vaubel, 2005). Besides, the comparative study of competition in music and dance education demonstrated the meaning of competitions for stimulating motivation for high achievements (Robson, 2004).

Nowadays the great variety of vocal competitions provides opportunities for a wide range of competitors to demonstrate their singing skills. Among them, it is necessary to distinguish several types. Firstly, the competitions suggest the participation of people on different professional levels. Some of them invite masters only to compete, while for others the educational and culture sharing purposes are the priority. If competitions between masters tend to establish the best trends in professional singing, competitions for everyone popularize the vocal arts and promote cultural preservation. Besides, the latter allows for competitors to engage at any age, educational background, and even skill level. What is more, the popularity of vocal competitions as a TV show increases extremely. Currently, in Russia, the United States, and other countries vocal TV projects offer world fame for talented unknown singers of all ages. Some of the projects focus on the support professional artists to discover themselves in a new way or preserve unique national music heritage.

The analysis of studies describing competitions manifested some challenges which touch personal and national differences. Any competition brings strong emotions to all of its participants whether they win or lose the main prize. Personal psychological factors determined the contrary emotions of young musicians in research that studied their views after music competitions, whether they won a prize or not (Rucsanda et al., 2020). The voting methods used in classical music competitions can be changed by organizing committees in different events, so comparisons between them could be important for evaluating the objectives of the competition and opportunities to win the prize for competitors representing different cultures (Sosnowska, 2017).

It is stated as fact that “the music itself does not have anything to do with extra-musical phenomena such as gender, nationality, race and ethnicity” (Leppänen, 2015). Researchers stated the phenomena of ethnicity and racism in a specific context, “the media coverage of the 1995 International Jean Sibelius Violin Competition, which was held in Finland” (Leppänen, 2015). Based on objective arguments, the author asserted the fact of generalizing competitors’ performances by using race affiliation in media. Journalists described the technical aspects in young musicians’ performances and their ability for self-expression as a consequence of competitors’ national features. This case proves the relevance of studying multicultural diversities in musical performance in more detail and logically, as well as designing effective strategies to evaluate and comment on them without bias during events that unite participants from different countries and folk groups.

## Online Competitions

Online competition is one of the newer forms of interaction, and its popularity is growing rapidly lately. This form is actively used in science for the implementation of multiculturalism in the development of the subjects such as computers, engineering, digital technologies, robotics (Panwar et al., 2020), and mathematics (Kenderov et al., 2021). Some researchers point to the online competition as a way to join participants from different countries to find new solutions for global problems including air pollution, climate change, deforestation, and other problems in the field of ecology (Sangiorgio et al., 2017). The online competition format significantly allows the candidates to participate irrespective of geographical boundaries. These advantages are critically important in the case of border lockdown which began in 2019 because of the pandemic COVID-19.

Online competition as a form of professional activity was known in the field of music for a long time. Regular American television competitions of vocal singing became widespread and popular in different countries and had a substantial influence on the multicultural music market (Cho et al., 2019). Currently, the number of online music competitions is increasing, they take place in different countries, and competitors from any continent can participate. Despite the huge popularity of online music competitions in modern life, we did not find research works which compared the data on featured participants, competition results, and assessment criteria.

As a traditional music competition, online competitions were based on the universal criteria in the assessment that they required an absolutely equal quality of musical performances excluding any variety. At the same time, modern technologies allow assessing musical performances more flexibly. For instance, using online evaluation in social media such as ranking, commenting, liking, and rating in musical sites, videos, blogs, photographs, and performances in a digital environment and could be a more direct tool for the objective criticism of creativity and the arts (Suhr, 2014). The assessment of musical performance characterized by diversity which is a pivotal feature in arts requires the design of new criteria that allowed distinct quality in a way loyal to the different cultural traditions. This way offers new opportunities for improvement in music teacher education through the sharing of diverse cultural traditions for the purpose of learning.

## Objectives

Based on background studies reflecting the relevant issues in the fields of multiculturalism and preservation of national diversity, art education, and online competitions the objectives were stated:

- i. What are the contrary features of musical artworks of competitors from different countries?
- ii. Which trend should be followed for the improvement of the assessment tool in order to keep the tolerance to different cultural traditions?
- iii. What advantages do online music competitions bring for promoting multicultural opportunities in music teachers’ education?

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

### Data Collection and Participants

This study mainly investigates students who had participated in two online competitions (the competitions of research works and a vocal singing competition) because of the pandemic. Convenience sampling was adopted. Data were collected from 7 to 15 May 2021, by using quantitative and qualitative analysis of the results of the two competitions based on the method of an average rating. A total of 340 competitors have taken part in these competitions (171 persons in the competition of research works, and 169 persons in the vocal singing competition), who presented 170 competitive works (95 research works, and 75 vocal performances). Among them were competitors from Russia, India, Belarus, Armenia, Kazakhstan, and China. The competition results were obtained by the work of a jury committee where experts from three countries—Russia, India, and Armenia—were included.

### Design

This study was approved by the Kazan Federal University Human Ethics Advisory Group based on the Ethical guidelines for educational research proposed by the British Educational Research Association (British Educational Research Association [BERA], 2018). The research work was organized in two stages at Kazan Federal University (Russia) in the collaboration with Partap College of Education (India). The platform of Microsoft Teams was chosen as the official place for the events. In the first stage, the international competition of students' research works was organized in an online way, during which 95 research reports were presented. In the second stage, an International vocal competition was organized in which 75 vocal performance records were received. The participants during both competitions represented five countries: Russia, India, Armenia, Kazakhstan, and China. The research reports and records were prepared partly by authors individually and partly by research groups.

According to official competition rules research works covered several assignments such as theory and history of arts, methods of art education, information technology in arts, and national arts. Also, the competitors' works had been divided according to educational institution type (college, university, conservatory). Participants sent their reports in advance, and on the competition day they presented their research online with presentations and replied to jury questions.

The official competition rules for the musical performances covered the categories – academic, folk, pop, and ensemble singing. The competition results assessment took into account the educational institution where competitors were studying (general or music school, college, university, conservatory, non-university competitors). Participants sent their vocal records in advance, and on the competition day, the organizing committee demonstrated all of them through Microsoft Teams.

### Materials

The research materials contained the competitors' works presented in both competitions. According to the rules for the

first competition, the competitors had to prepare the research work reflecting the current issues in the field of art and art education. The work had to be relevant for modern scholarly trends, demonstrate deep knowledge of the background, provide an appropriate methodology and a high level of originality. The main arguments had to be supported by data, analysis of the results, the discussion should cover the critical points, and the conclusion deliver significant statements.

For the second competition, there were special rules for choosing musical programs. Regardless of solo or ensemble performance form, competitors had to prepare the vocal program including two musical art pieces. These pieces should be quite different in order to show a variety of styles for the demonstration of competitors' artistic skills and mastery.

### Measures and Methods

The study was based on the mixed-method analysis by using quantitative and qualitative methods. The data were proved by the statistical method of standard deviation.

In the beginning, the average rating method was used for counting the competitions' scores in order to merge the research's quantitative data. These data were collected from the forms filled out by jury members. The forms were designed for both competitions separately. Each form represented the set of assessments for rating research reports and vocal singing and was developed based on criteria relevant for these types of activities. The assessment set for the research works competition included the criteria: research relevance, content, originality, methodology, scholarly literacy, the quality of presentation, and responses. In order to collect the data in the frameworks of multiculturalism two criteria were added: knowledge in the field of cultural diversity and a research scope which demonstrates global experience.

The jury members evaluated the reports by using the assessment set and put values for each criterion, average rating method was used for counting the final assessments.

The assessment set for the vocal singing competition included the criteria: artistic and technical level of performance, artistic style, expressive performance, ensemble quality, and interpretation. In order to collect the data in the frameworks of multiculturalism, the cultural diversity in the vocal performances was studied. For this purpose, the criterion of the quality in singing in regards to original national traditions of performing music was added. Besides, we counted how many times competitors presented vocal music demonstrating non-original traditions for them personally. In other words, did they perform close vocal national music according to their nationality, or foreign, which they learned during their education? Jury members evaluated the vocal performances by using the assessment set and putting values for each criterion, the method of average rating was used for counting the final assessments.

The average rating method was used to compare the total result for each criterion, which demonstrated the competitors' research competencies, especially in the aspect of multicultural vocal skills including their capacity to perform non-original music traditions.

In order to prove the data, the statistical method of standard deviation was used. It allowed establishing the differences for each criterion's results obtained from both competitions. The comparison of research works' results allowed to establish the capacity of competitors in multicultural knowledge in relation to other skills in researching. The analysis of vocal competition data allowed us to obtain the average level of vocal skills of the competitors in total in relation to their competencies for performing music in different national traditions.

For the qualitative study, an interview method was used. It allowed comparing the personal opinion of each member in regards to the quality of competitors' research works and vocal performances. They kindly gave their comments to the competition in general, characterized memorable reports and performances, and highlighted specific topics. During the interviews, we specially asked jury members their critical assessment of the multicultural capacity of the competition, and its perspectives in improving the trend of preserving cultural heritage. Also, we noted their comments about the quality of assessment tools from the point of view such as the multicultural approach.

## RESULTS

### Demographics

Due to the research purpose, the features of artworks of competitors from different countries, and the main characteristics of the competitions' participants were studied. **Table 1** summarizes the demographics of the competitors in two competitions who had taken part. It shows the separation

**TABLE 1** | Sample demographics.

Variables	Attributes	Research work competition		Vocal singing competition	
		N	%	N	%
Sex	Male	78	45.61	56	33.13
	Female	93	54.38	113	66.86
Age	11–15 years old	–	–	2	1.18
	16–18 years old	61	35.67	23	13.6
	19–24 years old	78	45.61	109	64.49
	25–29 years old	28	16.37	29	17.15
	30–40 years old	4	2.33	6	3.55
School level	General school	–	–	12	7.1
	Music school	–	–	15	8.87
	College	28	16.37	6	3.55
	Classic universities	138	80.70	94	55.62
	Conservatory	5	2.92	11	6.5
	Non-university competitors	–	–	31	18.34
Total number of competitors	Research works	171	100	–	–
	Vocal performance records	–	–	169	100

of competitors into cohorts by variables of gender, age, and school level. The analysis of the results let us state approximately similar competitors' characteristics in both competitions at least in general. So, there were more women than men among the total number of participants; most of the competitors were between the ages of 19–24 years old, while there were few people older than 30 years; the majority of the competitors studied in classic universities, rather than in schools, colleges, or conservatories. The total number of competitors was higher in the research work competition (171 persons), while in the vocal singing competition, fewer participants had taken part (169 persons). It is critical to note the differences between the number of presented research works and vocal records, and the total number of persons who took part in the events. The fact is that more than half of the research works were prepared by the research groups included two or three people, as is shown in **Table 2**. Whereas, competitors for vocal performances often performed in larger vocal ensembles.

**Table 2** summarizes the features of competitors directly in relation to the research work or vocal performance presented they presented. The data showed the number of competitors from different countries: most of them were from Russia, while there were also competitors from India, Belarus, Armenia, Kazakhstan, and China. It seems to be valuable to point out that the represented countries have unique national traditions in art, and some elements of their cultures need in special approach for analysis because of their differences. Especially, a variety of opposing elements feature the original music of China, India, and Russia.

### Competition Score

The competitors' works were evaluated by two sets of criteria. Nine criteria were included in the jury form in the Competition of research work (**Table 3**) and eight criteria were included in the jury form in the Vocal singing competition (**Table 4**). For each

**TABLE 2** | Competitors groups' characteristics.

Variables	Attributes	Research work competition		Vocal singing competition	
		N	%	N	%
Country	Russia	86	90.52	63	84
	India	3	3.15	3	4
	Belarus	–	–	1	1.33
	Armenia	1	1.05	–	–
	Kazakhstan	2	2.1	3	1.77
Collaboration	China	3	3.15	5	2.95
	Solo	28	29.47	59	78.66
Total number of competition-works	Competition collective	67	70.52	16	21.33
	Research works	95	100	–	–
	Vocal performance records	–	–	75	100

**TABLE 3** | Analysis of research work competition results.

Criteria	Number of competitors	Average rating	Standard deviation
Research relevance	95	7	1.428285
Content		9	1.222058
Originality		6	1.530564
Methodology		6	1.627218
Scholarly literacy		7	1.141844
Presentation		9	0.780532
Responses for jury questions		8	0.615265
Multicultural knowledge		8	1.874945
Multicultural research scope		7	1.719265

**TABLE 4** | Analysis of vocal singing competition results.

Criteria	Number of competitors	Average rating	Standard deviation
Artistic level of performance	75	9	0.736657
Technical level of performance		8	0.991292
Artistic style		8	0.534562
Expressive performance		9	0.543943
Ensemble quality		7	0.225653
Interpretation		6	1.370043
National compliance of performance		8	1.627874
Presenting non-original traditions		4	0.453483

criterion, a 10 point scale was used where 1 point demonstrated the lowest level and 10 points the highest. During the analysis of completed jury forms, we tried to establish the average rating for each criterion covering competitors' scores in total. The statistical method of standard deviation allowed us to prove the level of difference obtained in the results in order to establish its frequency among the competitors.

The use of the average rating method showed the highest level in research works competition for two criteria: the content of the report and the quality of presentation. This means that the competitors in most parts of their works described the subject matter correctly and in detail (AvR 9, StD < 1.3); besides, mostly the competitors presented the reports on the competition day properly (AvR 9, StD < 1). The low indicator of standard deviation proves the evidence that according to these two criteria the works of the competitors, in general, were of the same quality. Among other criteria, we noted high results for multiculturalism. At the same time despite the competitors demonstrating a good level of knowledge of cultural diversity in relation to multiculturalism, the results of standard deviation show that there were sufficient variations in evaluation of the works in this criterion (AvR 8, StD > 1.5), which means that all the participants did not possess the knowledge in the field of multiculturalism. Another valuable criterion for multicultural study pointed out the ability of competitors to demonstrate global experience in their reports (multicultural research scope). The obtained results for this criterion reached to a high level, while the results of standard deviation indicated sufficient variations in the evaluation of the competitors' works (AvR 7, StD > 1.5). So,

analysis of the results exhibited a comparison to the high quality of competitors' research works in general, as well as in the aspect of multiculturalism, the gap in knowledge in the field of cultural diversity in some competitors' works (Table 3).

A similar analysis was used for studying the completed jury forms of the vocal singing competition. By using the average method, the highest level of vocal performance for two criteria: the artistic level of performance and its expressiveness was established. So, most parts of the competitors' performances demonstrated excellent singing, artistic merit (AvR 9, StD < 0.8), and expressiveness (AvR 9, StD < 0.6). The low indicator of standard deviation proves that according to these two criteria the works of the competitors, in general, were of the same quality. Among other criteria, we noted high results for multiculturalism. It was noted that the vocal singing satisfied national traditions in most parts of the performances (AvR 8, StD > 1.5). At the same time, the indicator of standard deviation showed sufficient variations in evaluation of the works by this criterion, which means that the participants did not perform vocal elements featuring cultural traditions. Result of standard deviation (AvR 4, StD < 0.5) indicated the lowest result for the criterion of performing non-original traditions. Probably, this shows that competitors rarely performed the art pieces from not their culture of origin because they had some doubts about rules. The low standard deviation proved, that this choice characterized the most part of the competitors. The obtained results proved the high quality of competitors' vocal singing in general. Also, they showed, that they have a sufficient level of knowledge in national traditions and vocal skills to sing music from their original cultures. At the same time, the gaps in the interest in the music from non-original cultures and perhaps some doubts about how to sing it in a proper way were noted (Table 4).

## Jury Review for Competitions Works

The jury committee in both competitions included nine members who represented three countries (Russia, India, and Armenia). From Russia were six members (66%), two members were from India (22%), and a single jury member was from Armenia (11%). Seven members (77%) have professional experience in the field of music and had graduated from conservatories (66%) or were music faculty in universities (11%). Two members (22%) have expansive experience in the arts, including management of the musical educational process and additional musical educational activities. All of them have experience as jury members and organizing committees in different types of events in the arts fields. Additionally, all jury members are working in educational organizations where students are studying music teacher education programs.

After the final assessment of each competition, results were announced to the competitors, and the qualitative data were collected by interview method. The interview questions were designed according to the research and aimed at the issues of multiculturalism and preserving the diversity of cultural heritage. The interview included questions about the satisfaction with the results of results, as well as the quality of presented works in general. Also, questions about the relevance of research topics, cultural variety demonstrated in research works and

vocal programs, compliance of performances with national traditions, and the capacity of these events for the promotion of a multicultural approach were asked. During the interview, the comments of the jury about the relevance of evaluation criteria to assess cultural differences, as well as the crucial trends in the improvement of assessment tools were the most valuable.

### Performance Assessment

The quality of competitors' works is a critical characteristic for any competition, which provides its perspectives in the nearest future. Normally the competition attracts guests who are planning to participate in the event next time. The satisfaction of the jury, in general, becomes a significant indicator, which allows predicting the future of the event, and improving it, if it is necessary. During the different interviews, we received only positive responses, such as:

"In both these competitions, excellent research works and vocal art pieces were presented by the competitors. I have no doubts, that they should be continued in the future, while they provide a fruitful platform for sharing art experiences, including cultural diversity"

The data of competitions works assessment prove these words entirely. In research works competition the average rating in criteria of content and presentation was the highest. Scholarly literacy is a valuable criterion that reflects the engagement of students into the subject field and deep research background. Taking into account the requirements, the average rating of this criterion was lower. For the criteria of originality and methodology the average ratings were a little more than half of the maximum score. In order to satisfy these criteria, research work needs to contribute to global science and be reproducible. In this respect students' works demonstrate the knowledge of the subject, ability to design a study, and ability to argue the results strongly according to the university educational process requirements. Only a few students who studied at the bachelor or master level were able to show self-independence in research competence.

The analysis of vocal competition results confirms the jury's independent opinion in the point of the quality of competitors' works. The use of recording allowed participants to prepare the video performance in a comfortable environment. The highest score in the criteria of the art level of performance and expressiveness verified that. The technical level and artistic style were rated highly also. The criterion of ensemble quality is the most difficult for any musical group, so the average result seems to be sufficient. The same result was received for the criterion of interpretation, which features to mediate the level of students' performances. The personal interpretation of the art piece is a unique quality of the real master's work, and very few people are able to demonstrate it. So, for a student competition, the received results seem to reflect reality.

### Satisfaction of Using an Online Format

In the current year due to the emergency situation of COVID-19, the competitions were shifted from face-to-face to online for the first time for these events. So, the organization of the jury's work was not like usual, and the expectations of meeting some troubles,

such as technical errors, gaps in communication, or any other problems, existed in the early stages. Contrary to expectations, nobody from the jury expressed dissatisfaction about the new form of the competition, and some even emphasized some advantages brought by online communication [sic]:

"Using online way for competitions, organized in face-to-face interaction in the past only, was extremal decision due to pandemic situation in the world and allowed to save the tradition of these competitions. At the same time, new ways brought some benefits, such as the availability of these events for participants from different countries without mandatory conditions to move abroad. So, online events in the future will be common practice, allowing to eliminate location, time, or social limitations."

The jury's opinion about the use of the online format pointed to the future perspectives of the competitions and engagement participants from different countries and continents. Despite their positive assessment it seems crucial to note the difficulties of remote interaction. The discussion of the study findings is the core of any research event. This activity needs awareness in the research field, communicative skills, and good technical equipment providing a stable internet connection. Taking into account that online interaction is not preferable for many people, the high results of the criterion of responses for jury questions could be interpreted as a significant indicator. This result proves the appropriate level of research discussion.

In respect to the vocal competition, the online format provided an opportunity to eliminate the gaps of location and time. Despite there being no matched criteria in the average rating list, it was verified by the data of demographics. The critical indicator for the multicultural event of the presented competitors from a variety of towns and countries was satisfied.

### Competition Works Relevance

After studying all the research reports and listening to vocal art pieces presented by competitors, the jury noted a wide range of research topics and a variety of vocal programs. All of them agreed that competitors highlighted current trends in art, such as art skills improvement, design, and implementation of digital technology for studying and delivering arts, unique art pieces, and preservation of national heritage. Also, they stated a variety of musical art pieces in vocal programs, which demonstrated different styles, characters, national traditions:

"Studying all the works presented in the competitions, I would like to emphasize the careful relation and respectfulness demonstrated by the participants. In my opinion, the ability to deliver art so gently proved the mastery of competitors."

I thoroughly discussed the research reports and vocal art pieces with my colleagues and we started the pivotal role of such events for spreading the best experiences in art, as well as sharing unique national traditions."

The average rating of research relevance in the first competition reached a mediate level. This result seems to be satisfactory while reflecting students' awareness in their field of study. Despite in both competitions students presenting a variety of national traditions, it seems pivotal to note the difference

among all presented works only. That means, every student performed cultural traditions of his or her own country. The number of vocal art pieces demonstrated non-native national traditions were lower-mediate.

### Variety of National Cultural Traditions

Giving a positive assessment to competitions in general, some jury members noted, the widespread geographical location of the online event brings more cultural diversity which required a sufficient level of competency to evaluate art pieces that deliver contrasting national traditions. Several members stated that the music traditions in China, India, or Russia have different backgrounds, the features of different genres, styles, and expressive standards. Further, sometimes proper understanding of the meaning and specific knowledge is not available outside the country to perceive all different types of music.

“During the competitions, we met research issues and musical art pieces that belonged to so contrary cultural traditions as China, India, Kazakhstan, Armenia, and Russia. All of them featured different elements, significant for understanding its meaning. Competitors from these countries demonstrated mostly their national traditions, but we needed to compare all of them by using universal criteria. I guess, in the future, we should seriously upgrade our assessment tools in order to evaluate objective criteria including enough respect to national variety.”

The jury’s replies in the interview verify the high level of multicultural criteria results in the assessment of the presented works. In the reports, students showed high-level knowledge about different cultures and their comparisons. The topics also demonstrated a wide multicultural research scope. These data prove the students’ interest in different cultural traditions and engagement in the comparative analysis of them. The vocal competition results verified the high level of professional competence in musical performance according to the national features. The obtained results proved the jury’s opinion, that students demonstrated awareness of multicultural traditions. Despite this, such events require developing the universal criteria in the future in order to evaluate the artistic works without leveling the national variety.

So, the interview with jury members after two competitions let us state their positive assessment of these events in general, as well as the capacity for sharing national traditions and exchanging the unique experience. All the received responses were generalized and it was realized that many jury members commented on varieties of art traditions, presented in the competitions, which need an objective evaluation. Because of huge differences in genres, styles, and expressiveness, they agree with each other that universal criteria eliminate specific features of contrasting cultures, and that is why the critical trend in improvement of competition criteria should include respects to multiculturalism.

## DISCUSSION

### Western Music Culture

The modern world features “the idiomatic hegemony of the Western classical tradition” (Johnson, 2004). This tradition today

has a status as only academic music, which illustrates the development of this art. In art schools all over the world, students learn this tradition as a main attribute of music. “Western music” is used as a general term that includes academic music in the Western European countries, and also in Russia; even in the United States and countries in South America composers produce such music. When somebody talks about the history and theory of music, all people understand the narrative subject as Western scholarly music. The priority position afforded to this music is proven by the spread of its universal standards, such as the notation system, the knowledge about chords and melody, harmony, and a variety of characteristics like: dynamics, genres, and styles.

Providing equal music education opportunities is a relevant challenge in multicultural issues in music education for the last decades (Johnson, 2004). This process needs the adaptation of curricula and methods according to the cultural background of each student at times when the population is rapidly changing. Nowadays, the teaching practice in different countries is contrary to each other. For instance, in Russia or Western European countries, music education is based on a personal approach. Each student is never left alone, “[on] the contrary, they are under the wings of their teachers” (Leppänen, 2015). At the same time, they must follow strict instructions from their teachers and general rules, such as the composers’ text, in musical performance. They are not free to change elements of music, written by another person, while they must reproduce the composer’s idea directly. The art of improvisation does exist, but this practice is not so common, rather a specific trend which supports a smaller section of musicians (Orlov, 1992). Despite this, the pivotal issue in western musical education is the ability to recognize distinct musical elements for the purpose of analyzing them and explaining their meaning based on a logical approach.

### Indian Music Culture

Thinking globally, music as art features a wide range of cultural diversity. In order to characterize opposing ways in which the composing and performance of music, researchers divide music into Western and Eastern musical traditions (Orlov, 1992). Furthermore, researchers have found such contrasting elements between Russian and Indian musical traditions as genres, fret-harmonic structure, performance style, and national instruments. From the European point of view, Indian instruments sound frustrating. The basic scale has several similar elements such as main tones, but the tones are not fixed in Indian tradition, unlike the European. Besides, the Indian scale is not divided into equal tones, and the distance between each can be changed (Orlov, 1992).

Musical genres in India, such as raga or others, feature deep philosophy and have a poetic structure. The music knowledge which an Indian teacher delivers to a student consists of a huge set of tunes, where each one responds to a special time or daily event. Learning all the ragas carefully, a musician feels free to improvise it, following specific rules on how to do so in a proper way. Any performance represents improvisation, and there is no way to sing or play on the instrument the same piece of art that was created in the past. The Indian music features as its main

purpose to bring positive emotions to all listeners, providing the feeling of happiness (Karkina et al., 2019). So, the elements of Indian music, as well as its rules and meaning are contrary to Western musical traditions and could not be analyzed in a line by the means of universal tools.

## Chinese Music Culture

The musical culture of China is quite unique in comparison with European music as well as with India's. It has its own system of genres, rhythms, scales, and styles. For instance, the unique elements of Chinese musical art are frequent rhythm changes and pentatonics without semitones. So, it is very easy even for a person without professional musical education to distinguish all these three types of music. While in Chinese vocal music singing in unison dominates, it seems to be ridiculous to compare Chinese ensemble with European, where complicated harmony is an important criterion of quality of any vocal ensemble singing. Besides, all three analyzed cultures have their own unique set of musical instruments that produce very different sounds.

Despite significant differences, Chinese music culture has very old traditions and a serious background. Some modern researchers argue for the "effects of listening to Chinese folk music on mathematical thinking skills" (Wang and Luo, 2021). Currently, Chinese students try to learn the Western musical culture and have achieved great success in that field as is proved by a huge number of examples when musicians from this country won competitions all over the world. This fact seems incomprehensible if we remember that the popular Chinese Suzuki teaching method characterized the tuition in groups excluding personal attention from the teacher to each student directly (Leppänen, 2015). The evidence is much more intricate if the absence of regular European genres or instruments in China are taken into account. So, in two top Chinese music conservatories, there are courses on chamber music despite this genre not being local to this country. This is an example of following a Western tradition that is developing now noticeably (Feng, 2020). Also, European modern Chinese music teacher education uses digital technology such as augmented reality, for learning to play musical instruments (Mei and Yang, 2021).

## Multicultural Approach in Music Education

According to Davidman and Davidman (1988), multicultural education includes human experience which tries to eliminate confronting issues like racism, religious controversy, examine the dynamics of cultural variety, and develop teaching strategies based on the idea of equal rights for any diversity. The art of music has historically been characterized as a universal language, which contains elements that deliver global philosophical ideas about human behavior, the analysis of different people's music showed opposing features which make it difficult for understanding the meaning for persons who do not have specific experience of the same tradition (Karkina, 2020). This fact as well as the increasing globalization are the reasons that modern students strive to learn the musical traditions of foreign countries. Annually a great number of youngsters go abroad for enrollment

in musical programs with the aim to master another musical culture. Some of them attain success in this way and become world-famous musicians.

The study of new cultural realities serves great impetus for students to learn new languages and develop their cultural and professional competencies. At the same time, researchers noted, that learning about foreign cultures provides a deeper understanding of one's own culture (Gabdrakhmanova, 2020). Each culture if perceived in a dynamic way, and reached by elements from another culture, ensures more perspectives for maintaining itself. Currently pluralism, as a mandatory part of globalization, becomes a significant part of the educational process. In such context, multiculturalism involves attention to the native culture from the perspectives of foreign cultures. That means educational methods based on a multicultural approach provide deep study of any culture, including the native one. This purpose today could be reached by the means of digital technologies, such as online communication, that eliminates geographical or social limitations. Taking the opportunities of online connection, including through universities, it is possible to establish and develop musical communities (Lei and Li, 2021) ensuring the sustainable existence of common, popular, or minority cultures.

In the frameworks of the study, it seems to be valuable to note the contribution of multicultural knowledge above than just in the field of music or research practice. The analysis of different musical styles' expressiveness, including various national traditions, and competitive assessment of them requires the awareness of the way of artistic content expression, i.e., types of artistic thinking. Russian, Indian, and Chinese music, as was mentioned above, each promote unique ways of artistic thinking. In this respect, the results of this study reflect the knowledge about the contrary Western and Eastern ways of thinking. Researchers emphasize the opposite values of Western people, who focus on self-individuality, and Eastern people, follow the collective need rather than individual functions (Sfera, 2015). Through various experiments, researchers list some more differences:

- Western people more than Asian people focus on an object as an isolated whole rather than as a part of its surroundings or background.
- In response to a question, a Western person will take a polarized view according to their beliefs, while Asian people tend to moderation.

The focus on personal features rather than on situational factors characterized the Western way of thinking more than Eastern (Nisbett, 2003).

In these frameworks, researchers note, that the group of students from different countries means more than cultural diversity only. Such group features "different ways of perceiving and reasoning" (Sfera, 2015) about the subject. This theory complements the psychological study in the issue of thinking types, such as subject, figurative, signs, and symbolic (Lisyanskaya, 2020). Psychologists recommend testing the students in order to provide a more effective type of teacher

explanation for any subject (Smolova, 2019). The concept of differences in outlook raised earlier could provide the background for designing the optimal set of teaching methods, which complement each other in their diversity and promote the teaching explanation in contrasting ways for efficiency of education and improvement learning outcomes.

## CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The research work allowed us to establish the different characteristics of research reports and musical artworks presented by competitors from various countries in two competitions. European, Indian or Chinese music features unique elements including genres, tunes, harmony, instruments, and styles. So, the basic seven-step scale in India does not have strict fixing of the sound pitch, while the European scale features mechanical division into 12 equal segments, fixing the tones directly. The scale in China looks in general very similar to the European, but some tones differ in pitch. In such a context, the perception of pure sound would demonstrate opposite judgments. European, Indian, and Chinese music are attributed by different systems of genres and styles, which do not have any similar elements but are characterized by specifications, delivering meanings, and mandatory requirements. The system of harmony and polyphony features only European music, while the crucial role of improvisation characterizes the core of Indian musical performance. Generalizing the differences, it seems to be accurate to emphasize discretization as the main trend in European music, while Asian art is mostly defined by flow. Many more differences could be found by comparing music from different continents. Visible contrasts among all of them eliminate the possibility of evaluating them fairly by using a simple universal set of criteria. The evaluation process imposes higher requirements on the jury competence about the background of each cultural tradition and research scope in order to provide adequate assessment for research results as well as of vocal performance.

Musical online competitions serve a valuable role in sharing and preserving national traditions. Competitions held on virtual platforms also promote multicultural opportunities in music teacher education such as sharing a national variety of musical styles and elements, approaches to explain the meaning of the music, challenges and relevant issues in the research work of music art and education, collecting e-source records which demonstrate the diversity of traditional musical performances in different countries and gathering musical experiences to preserve cultural heritage for the future, especially timed of crisis.

The process of comparison stimulates cultural interaction and motivates one to understand another culture as well as one's native traditions more deeply. In order to improve regular assessment tools, which included the criteria relevance of the presented issue in the context of national traditions, world perspectives, the depth, justification of the data, structural

logic of the study, confident presentation of research work in front of the jury during the competition; representation of an expressive artistic image, artistic performance confidence, performing arts culture, and technical level in sound proficiency for the vocal competition, we established the main trend of development which will allow fostering tolerance for different cultural traditions. This trend should include a set of criteria for the evaluation of national color and traditional features of musical art in the context of its history, theory, and artistic performance presented by competitors from different countries.

In order to suggest the multicultural approach as providing pivotal opportunities in music teacher education and online competitions in research work or musical performance, the following recommendations should be considered-

- i. Experts who are able to give professional judgment for research studies presenting folk traditions or/and national musical performances should be appointed as a member of the jury.
- ii. In the design of assessment tools, criteria that reflect or depend on a national culture's unique features should be included.
- iii. The pivotal principles such as national culture-specific genres; traditional musical expressions; approach for delivering meaning; relevant issues in the research field; traditional musical performance style features ought to be considered while developing an assessment tool.

In addition to all of the above, the multicultural approach in education by the means of art contributes to the subsequent teaching performance. The variety of artistic images using wide expressiveness which reflects the type of thinking could be a clue for a design of a new set of pedagogical methods and technics covering opposing ways of human thinking. The expressive means can stimulate inspiration in creating new teaching approaches. The choosing of a proper method becomes mandatory in cases, "when students feel normative pressure to perform learning by saying the "right things" instead of expressing a whole spectrum of emotions" (Lanas, 2014). If a student feels a problem responding by their own voice, the teacher's flexibility in delivering learning information based on the awareness of thinking types will facilitate the process. Based on these arguments it seems to be possible to point out the relevant trend for future research in the field of teaching methods designed in accordance with the concept of human thinking types.

## LIMITATIONS

In this research, the authors tried to gather the contrast musical experiences, such as music cultures in Western Europe, India, and China, that provided opposite examples in music that could not be evaluated by universal criteria. At the same time, we need to point out some limitations such as the gap in the analysis of musical traditions from other continents: America, Africa, or Australia, which feature significant differences.

Besides, in our two competitions, competitors from several countries participated owing to which it was impossible to compare the results more widely. Perhaps, the geographical expansion of competitors in the future will allow us to get more detailed data.

## DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The original contributions presented in the study are included in the article/supplementary material, further inquiries can be directed to the corresponding author/s.

## ETHICS STATEMENT

This study was approved by the Kazan Federal University Human Ethics Advisory Group based on the Ethical guidelines for educational research proposed by British Educational Research

## REFERENCES

- Ashcroft, R. T., and Bevir, M. (2019). "Multicultural Teacher Education in the State of California: the Challenge of Definition and Implementation," in *Multiculturalism in the British Commonwealth*, eds R. T. Ashcroft and M. Bevir (Berkeley, California: University of California Press), 2–25.
- Barrett, M., and Vermeulen, D. (2019). Drop everything and sing the music: choristers' perceptions of the value of participating in a multicultural south african university choir. *Muziki* 16, 31–60. doi: 10.1080/18125980.2019.1611384
- British Educational Research Association [BERA] (2018). *Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research, fourth edition*. London: British Educational Research Association.
- Cho, D., Lee, S. H., Yoo, Y., and Chu, H. (2019). Television singing competitions create stars? empirical evidence from the digital music chart in south korea. *J. Cult. Econ.* 43, 1–20. doi: 10.1007/s10824-018-9327-3
- Cutri, R. M., Mena, J., and Whiting, E. F. (2020). Faculty readiness for online crisis teaching: transitioning to online teaching during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Eur. J. Teach. Educ.* 43, 523–541. doi: 10.1080/02619768.2020.1815702
- Davidman, L., and Davidman, P. (1988). Multicultural Teacher Education in the State of California: the Challenge of Definition and Implementation. *Teach. Educ. Q.* 15, 50–67.
- Dervin, F. (2015). Towards post-intercultural teacher education: analysing "extreme" intercultural dialogue to reconstruct interculturality. *Eur. J. Teach. Educ.* 38, 71–86. doi: 10.1080/02619768.2014.902441
- Feng, C. (2020). Exploring chinese college chamber music education: a case study of students' conceptions. *Br. J. Music Educ.* 37, 247–259. doi: 10.1017/S0265051720000194
- Gabdrakhmanova, R. R. (2020). "Multiculturalism in music education through comparison of Turkish and Tatar music," in *Professionalism in Education: Cross-Border and Multicultural Perspectives in Professional Development of Teachers, New Delhi*, eds B. Singh and M. Kaur (Kazan: Kazan Federal University), 182–184.
- Goldberg, M. (2021). *Arts integration: teaching subject matter through the arts in multicultural settings*. Milton Park: Routledge, 1–306. doi: 10.4324/9780367809805
- Gómez-Parra, M. E., and Hà, T.-A. (2021). First steps towards intercultural education in Vietnam: exploring primary education teachers' level of intercultural competence (Primeros pasos hacia una educación intercultural en Vietnam: explorando la competencia intercultural de los maestros de primaria). *Cult. Educ.* 33, 78–105. doi: 10.1080/11356405.2020.1859740
- González-González, C. S., García-Holgado, A., García-Peñalvo, F. J., and Mena, J. (2018). "Towards equality in higher education: innovative teaching experiences in computer education," in *Paper presented at the ACM International Conference Proceeding Series*, (New York: ACM), doi: 10.1145/3233824.3233869
- Association [BERA] (2018). The patients/participants provided their written informed consent to participate in this study.

## AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

The research was the result of the collaboration of all the authors. However, sections "Introduction," "Background," "Materials and Methods," and "Discussion" are attributed to SK, section "Conclusions and Recommendations" to SK with BS, and sections "Results" and "Limitations" to GB with NN.

## FUNDING

This manuscript has been supported by the Kazan Federal University Strategic Academic Leadership Program (PRIORITY-2030).

- Gul, R., Ayub, A., Mazhar, S., Uddin, S. S., and Khanum, M. (2021). Teachers' perceptions on students' cultural and linguistic diversity and its impact on their approaches towards culturally teaching practices. *TESOL Int. J.* 16, 89–105.
- Hummelstedt, I. P., Holm, G. I. M., Sahlström, F. J., and Zilliacus, H. A. (2021). Diversity as the new normal and persistent constructions of the immigrant other – discourses on multicultural education among teacher educators. *Teach. Teach. Educ.* 108:103510. doi: 10.1016/j.tate.2021.103510
- Ivenicki, A. (2021). COVID-19 and multicultural education in brazil. *Perspect. Educ.* 39, 231–241. doi: 10.18820/2519593X/pie.v39.i1.14
- Jing, F. (2021). Current state and prospects of development of the ethnic component of music education in inner Mongolia. *Musical Art Educ.* 9, 167–178. doi: 10.31862/2309-1428-2021-9-1-167-178
- Johnson, B. L. Jr. (2004). A sound education for all: multicultural issues in music education. *Educ. Policy* 18, 116–141. doi: 10.1177/0895904803260028
- Karkina, S. (2020). "Multicultural approach in professional development of future music teachers through Russian and Indian traditions," in *Professionalism in Education. Cross-Border and Multicultural Perspectives in Professional Development of Teacher, New Delhi*, eds B. Singh and M. Kaur (Kazan: Kazan Federal University), 118–124.
- Karkina, S. V., Singh, B., and Valeeva, R. A. (2019). "Signature pedagogies of music learning by the Means of MOODLE across Russian and Indian Approach," in *ACM International Conference Proceeding Series*, (New York: Association for Computing Machinery), 575–581.
- Kenderov, P., Chehlarova, T., and Gachev, G. (2021). Online Competition "Viva Mathematics with computer". *Math. Inform.* 64, 36–51. doi: 10.53656/math2021-1-3-onl
- Kraus, L., and Daenekindt, S. (2021). Moving into multiculturalism. multicultural attitudes of socially mobile individuals without a migration background. *Eur. Soc.* 24, 7–28. doi: 10.1080/14616696.2021.1976415
- Lamon, S., Knowles, O., Hendy, A., Story, I., and Currey, J. (2020). Active Learning to Improve Student Learning Experiences in an Online Postgraduate Course. *Front. Educ.* 5:598560. doi: 10.3389/educ.2020.598560
- Lanas, M. (2014). Failing intercultural education? "Thoughtfulness" in intercultural education for student teachers. *Eur. J. Teach. Educ.* 37, 171–182. doi: 10.1080/02619768.2014.882310
- Law, W., and Ho, W. (2011). Music education in China: in search of social harmony and Chinese nationalism. *Br. J. Music Educ.* 28, 371–388. doi: 10.1017/S0265051711000258
- Lei, W. S. C., and Li, C. C. C. (2021). The mechanism of linkages between online community participation and festival attendance: A case study of A chinese music festival. *Event Manag.* 25, 27–40. doi: 10.3727/152599520X15894679115457
- Leppänen, T. (2015). The west and the rest of classical music: asian musicians in the finnish media coverage of the 1995 jean sibelius violin

- competition. *Eur. J. Cult. Stud.* 18, 19–34. doi: 10.1177/1367549414557804
- Lisyanskaya, T. (2020). Types of thinking as an action at knowledge formation. *Psychol. J.* 6, 75–83. doi: 10.31108/1.2020.6.6.8
- Malović, N., and Vujica, K. (2021). Multicultural society as a challenge for coexistence in Europe. *Religions* 12:615. doi: 10.3390/rel12080615
- McConnell, J. M., Liu, T., Brown, E. M., Fort, C. J., Azcuna, D. R., Tabiolo, C. A. M., et al. (2021). The multicultural peace and justice collaborative: critical peace education in a research training environment. *Peace Confl.* 27, 191–202. doi: 10.1037/pac0000539
- McCormick, L. (2009). Higher, faster, louder: representations of the international music competition. *Cult. Sociol.* 3, 5–30. doi: 10.1177/1749975508100669
- Mei, B., and Yang, S. (2021). Chinese pre-service music teachers' perceptions of augmented reality-assisted musical instrument learning. *Front. Psychol.* 12:609028. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2021.609028
- Mlinar, K., and Krammer, G. (2021). Multicultural attitudes of prospective teachers: the influence of multicultural ideology and national pride. *Int. J. Intercult. Relat.* 84, 107–118. doi: 10.1016/j.ijintrel.2021.07.008
- Nethsinghe, R. N. (2012). A snapshot: multicultural music teaching in schools in Victoria, Australia, portrayed by school teachers. *Aust. J. Music Educ.* 1, 57–70.
- Nisbett, R. (2003). *The Geography of Thought: how Asians and Westerners Think Differently – and Why*. London: Nicholas Brealey.
- Ogay, T., and Edelman, D. (2016). “Taking culture seriously”: implications for intercultural education and training. *Eur. J. Teach. Educ.* 39, 388–400. doi: 10.1080/02619768.2016.1157160
- Orlov, G. (1992). *The Tree of Music*. Washington-Sanct Petersburg: Sovietytsky Kompozitor. 408.
- Panwar, A., Chauhan, A., and Arya, K. (2020). “Analyzing learning outcomes for a massive online competition through a project-based learning engagement,” in *Paper presented at the IEEE Global Engineering Education Conference, EDUCON*, (Porto, Portugal: IEEE), 1246–1251.
- Pike, P. D. (2017). Improving music teaching and learning through online service: a case study of a synchronous online teaching internship. *Int. J. Music Educ.* 35, 107–117. doi: 10.1177/0255761415613534
- Portera, A., and Milani, M. (2021). Intercultural education and competences at school. Results of an exploratory study in Italy. *Profesorado* 25, 49–67. doi: 10.30827/PROFESORADO.V25I3.21527
- Razzaque, A., AlArayedh, H. M., and Moylan, C. (2021). Culture and learning style's sensitive learning outcomes aid multicultural classrooms. *Int. J. Innov. Learn.* 30, 65–90. doi: 10.1504/IJIL.2021.116573
- Robson, B. E. (2004). Competition in sport, music, and dance. *Med. Probl. Perform. Art.* 19, 160–166. doi: 10.21091/mppa.2004.4026
- Rucsanda, M. D., Cazan, A., and Truța, C. (2020). Musical performance and emotions in children: the case of musical competitions. *Psychol. Music* 48, 480–494. doi: 10.1177/0305735618810791
- Sangiorgio, F., Gjoni, V., Fiore, N., Tarantino, D., and Basset, A. (2017). An international online competition to stimulate student's interest on ecological issues. *SCIRES-IT* 7, 35–42.
- Seglow, J. (2003). “Multiculturalism,” in *Political concepts*, eds R. Bellamy and A. Mason (Manchester: Manchester University Press), 156–168.
- Serra, X. (2011). “A multicultural approach in music information research,” in *Paper presented at the Proceedings of the 12th International Society for Music Information Retrieval Conference, ISMIR*, (Miami: University of Miami), 151–156.
- Sfera, A. (2015). Thinking Pattern East and West. *SOJ Psychol.* 1, 1–2.
- Singh, B. (2019). “Promoting international cultural integration through education, art and language,” in *Art and Art Education in the Context of Intercultural Interaction: Materials of the VIII International Scientific and Practical Conference*, ed. G. Batyrshina (Kazan: Kazan Federal University press), 7–21. doi: 10.1186/s12913-016-1423-5
- Smolova, L. (2019). Types of thinking and their value for ecological education. *Psychol. J. High. Sch. Econ.* 16, 50–66. doi: 10.17323/1813-8918-2019-1-50-66
- Snowball, J. D., and Antrobus, G. G. (2021). Festival value in multicultural contexts: city festivals in south africa. *Tour. Econ.* 27, 1256–1275. doi: 10.1177/1354816620932808
- Sosnowska, H. (2017). Comparison of voting methods used in some classical music. *Trans. Comput. Collect. Intell.* 27, 108–117. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-70647-4\_8
- Southcott, J. E., and Joseph, D. (2010). Many layers of meaning: multicultural music education in victoria, australia. *Int. J. Humanit.* 8, 189–200. doi: 10.18848/1447-9508/cgp/v08i02/42850
- Stoica, M., Nizovtsev, D., and Smith, R. E. (2021). “Four corners of the world: project-based learning in a multicultural virtual environment,” in *Paper presented at the 8th International Conference on Educational Technologies 2021, ICEDuTech 2021 and 17th International Conference on Mobile Learning 2021, ML 2021*, (Geneva: World Health Organization), 27–34.
- Suhr, H. C. (2014). Online evaluation of creativity and the arts. *Digit. Scholarsh. Humanit.* 30, 609–611. doi: 10.4324/9781315795836
- Sutton, A. C. (2020). The composition of success: competition and the creative self in contemporary art music. *Qual. Sociol.* 43, 489–513. doi: 10.1007/s11133-020-09465-w
- Tran, A., Kerkstra, R. L., Gardocki, S. L., and Papuga, S. C. (2021). Lessons Learned: teaching In-Person During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *Front. Educ.* 6:690646. doi: 10.3389/educ.2021.690646
- Vaubel, R. (2005). The role of competition in the rise of baroque and renaissance music. *J. Cult. Econ.* 29, 277–297. doi: 10.1007/s10824-005-00699-9
- Wang, J., and Humphreys, J. T. (2009). Multicultural and popular music content in an american music teacher education program. *Int. J. Music Educ.* 27, 19–36. doi: 10.1177/0255761408099062
- Wang, Q., and Luo, J. (2021). Chinese folk music and its effect on human mathematical thinking skills. *Interdiscip. Sci. Rev.* 47, 97–106. doi: 10.1080/03080188.2021.1956798
- Wu, S. Y. (2021). How Teachers Conduct Online Teaching During the COVID-19 Pandemic: a Case Study of Taiwan. *Front. Educ.* 6:675434. doi: 10.3389/educ.2021.675434
- Yinuo, L. (2020). “Study on the Problems and Countermeasures of Chinese Multicultural Music Education,” in *Conference: international Conference on Arts, Humanity and Economics, Management (ICAHM 2019)*, (Dordrecht: Atlantis Press), doi: 10.2991/assehr.k.200328.022
- Zamroni, Z., Dwiningrum, S. I. A., Hope, J., Kartowagiran, B., Sudartinah, T., Siteine, A., et al. (2021). Cross-cultural competence in multicultural education in indonesian and new zealand high schools. *Int. J. Instruct.* 14, 597–612. doi: 10.29333/iji.2021.14335a
- Zhang, W. (2017). Multicultural ethnic music education in communist China. *Int. J. Multicult. Educ.* 19, 65–84. doi: 10.18251/ijme.v19i3.1359

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

**Publisher's Note:** All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

Copyright © 2022 Karkina, Singh, Batyrshina and Nurgayanova. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.