



Fermented Foods as a Dietary Source of Live Organisms

Shannon Rezac, Car Reen Kok, Melanie Heermann and Robert Hutkins*

Department of Food Science and Technology, University of Nebraska-Lincoln, Lincoln, NE, United States

The popularity of fermented foods and beverages is due to their enhanced shelf-life, safety, functionality, sensory, and nutritional properties. The latter includes the presence of bioactive molecules, vitamins, and other constituents with increased availability due to the process of fermentation. Many fermented foods also contain live microorganisms that may improve gastrointestinal health and provide other health benefits, including lowering the risk of type two diabetes and cardiovascular diseases. The number of organisms in fermented foods can vary significantly, depending on how products were manufactured and processed, as well as conditions and duration of storage. In this review, we surveyed published studies in which lactic acid and other relevant bacteria were enumerated from the most commonly consumed fermented foods, including cultured dairy products, cheese, fermented sausage, fermented vegetables, soy-fermented foods, and fermented cereal products. Most of the reported data were based on retail food samples, rather than experimentally produced products made on a laboratory scale. Results indicated that many of these fermented foods contained 10⁵⁻⁷ lactic acid bacteria per mL or gram, although there was considerable variation based on geographical region and sampling time. In general, cultured dairy products consistently contained higher levels, up to 10⁹/mL or g. Although few specific recommendations and claim legislations for what constitutes a relevant dose exist, the findings from this survey revealed that many fermented foods are a good source of live lactic acid bacteria, including species that reportedly provide human health benefits.

Keywords: fermented foods, live microbes, lactic acid bacteria, health benefits, probiotics

INTRODUCTION

Fermentation has long been used to preserve and enhance the shelf-life, flavor, texture, and functional properties of food (Hutkins, 2018). More recently, the consumption of fermented foods containing live microorganisms has emerged as an important dietary strategy for improving human health (Marco et al., 2017). In general, lactic acid bacteria (LAB) from several genera, including *Lactobacillus, Streptococcus*, and *Leuconostoc* are predominant in fermented foods, but other bacteria as well as yeast and fungi also contribute to food fermentations. Commercially-produced fermented foods also frequently serve as carriers for probiotic bacteria. Despite this interest and the potential public health benefits of these foods, there is still considerable confusion about which fermented foods actually contain live microorganisms, as well as understanding the role of these microbes on the gut microbiome (Slashinski et al., 2012).

Nonetheless, yogurt and other cultured dairy products are generally perceived by consumers as good sources of live and health-promoting organisms (Panahi et al., 2016). Moreover, in a survey of

OPEN ACCESS

Edited by:

Jyoti Prakash Tamang, Sikkim University, India

Reviewed by:

Victor Ladero, Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas (CSIC), Spain Baltasar Mayo, Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas (CSIC), Spain Fernanda Mozzi, CERELA-CONICET, Argentina

*Correspondence:

Robert Hutkins rhutkins1@unl.edu

Specialty section:

This article was submitted to Food Microbiology, a section of the journal Frontiers in Microbiology

Received: 13 May 2018 Accepted: 17 July 2018 Published: 24 August 2018

Citation:

Rezac S, Kok CR, Heermann M and Hutkins R (2018) Fermented Foods as a Dietary Source of Live Organisms. Front. Microbiol. 9:1785. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2018.01785

335 adults, yogurt was the main food associated with probiotic bacteria (Stanczak and Heuberger, 2009). However, the actual concept of fermentation is evidently not so familiar—a survey of 233 college students attending Brescia University College in London, Ontario revealed that nearly two-thirds were unfamiliar with the term "fermented dairy products," and about the same percent were unsure that several cultured dairy products were fermented (Hekmat and Koba, 2006).

That a particular food or beverage is produced by fermentation does not necessarily indicate that it contains live microorganisms. Bread, beer, wine, and distilled alcoholic beverages require yeasts for fermentation, but the production organisms are either inactivated by heat (in the case of bread and some beers) or are physically removed by filtration or other means (in the case of wine and beer). Moreover, many fermented foods are heat-treated after fermentation to enhance food safety or to extend shelf-life. Thus, fermented sausages are often cooked after fermentation, and soy sauce and sauerkraut and other fermented vegetables are made shelf-stable by thermal processing. Some products, such as many of the commercial pickles and olives, are not fermented at all, but rather are placed into brines containing salt and organic acids. Even non-thermally processed fermented foods may yet contain low levels of live or viable organisms simply due to inhospitable environmental conditions that reduce microbial populations over time. It is important to note, however, that the absence of live microbes in the final product does not preclude a positive functional role. For example, food fermentation microbes may produce vitamins or other bioactive molecules in situ or inactivate anti-nutritional factors and yet be absent at the time of consumption.

LABELING LIVE MICROBES IN FERMENTED FOODS AND BEVERAGES

Yogurt, kefir, and other cultured dairy product manufacturers have long promoted the presence of live cultures. Indeed, the "live and active" seal was created by the National Yogurt Association (NYA), for yogurt products in the United States containing at least 100 million cells or cfu per gram at the time of manufacture (Frye and Kilara, 2016). According to the NYA, the "live and active" seal refers only to yogurt cultures, and specifically to the two species that comprise such cultures, *Streptococcus thermophilus* and *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus*. However, frozen yogurt, kefir and other cultured dairy products also claim the presence of live and active cultures, even though the microorganisms may be different than those found in yogurt. In the U.S., there is no regulatory requirement to state microbial levels, thus these label declarations are strictly voluntary.

In contrast, in other regions, the number of live microbes present in yogurt and other cultured dairy products must satisfy regulatory requirements. For example, according to the CODEX standards for fermented milk products, the minimum number of starter culture bacteria in yogurt is 10^7 cfu per g (CODEX STAN 243-2003). If other organisms are indicated on the label, they must be present at 10^6 cfu per g. Nonetheless, in Europe, to make a claim for yogurt containing live cultures for improving lactose digestion, the European Food Safety Agency requires a minimum of 10⁸ cfu per g of live bacteria (EFSA Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies, 2010). In contrast, in Australia and New Zealand, a minimum of only 10⁶ cfu per g is required (Commonwealth of Australia Gazette, 2015).

For many years, cultured dairy products were the only fermented foods that included label declarations regarding the presence of live microorganisms. Label declarations on sauerkraut or kimchi or miso, had, until recently, been rare. The popularity of artisan-style fermented foods (Johnson, 2016) and interest in their health properties (Marco et al., 2017) has led more manufacturers to inform consumers, via food labels, that their products contain live microorganisms. In some cases, the species in these types of foods have been identified and then compared to label claims (Yeung et al., 2002; Scourboutakos et al., 2017). However, to our knowledge, data on the actual levels of live microorganisms in most fermented retail products has not readily been reported or summarized in an organized form. Therefore, consumers, despite their interest in probiotics and functional fermented foods (Linares et al., 2017), have had little access to this useful information.

SURVEY DESIGN

The purpose of this study, therefore, was to survey the scientific literature and identify published papers in which the number of live microorganisms in a range of fermented foods was reported. Included were so-called western-fermented foods such as yogurt, cheese, and sausage, as well as soy-based and cerealbased fermented foods that are widely consumed in other regions (Tamang et al., 2016). We then organized and summarized the quantitative data from those reports. Our interest was focused on those reports in which foods were obtained from retail locations or were made under manufacturing conditions. Thus, reports describing results from experimentally-produced fermented foods on a laboratory or pilot scale were excluded, in part because they do not reflect commercial processing, distribution, and storage conditions as do retail products. A large number of the reports in the literature in which levels of microbes in fermented foods were described were of this sort. In addition, many reports have analyzed the importance of microbial food safety and hygienic conditions of fermented food products and have reported the presence of spoilage microorganisms or food pathogens. However, the organisms responsible for fermentation and that are commonly present in the finished products were the focus of this current study.

Search Criteria

Scientific articles were chosen that satisfied specific parameters relevant to our stated goals. Specifically, our database search (Google Scholar, WorldCat, Scopus, and PubMed) focused on those studies that enumerated microorganisms exclusively in fermented food products. Keywords for these searches included, but were not limited to, the type of fermented food analyzed and, "commercially produced," "commercial product," "enumerated," "lactic acid bacteria," "microbial characterization," "probiotic," and "culture." Food products that served only as vehicles for delivery of probiotic microorganisms were not included. Thus, studies that reported counts for frozen yogurt were included, but studies on ice cream containing probiotic microorganisms were not. In general, results were only included for commercial products, bought at retail locations, or those experimentallyproduced under industrial manufacturing conditions. Thus, strictly experimental products (e.g., made in a laboratory or under small experimental-scale conditions) were not considered. The only exceptions were for products for which little or no data from retail or industrially manufactured sources was available. In those cases, lab- or pilot-scale-produced products were included, provided they were made using traditional manufacturing methods. No restrictions for date, location, or language were applied.

Data Reporting

For most products, quantitative data relied on cultural methods using well-established types of differential, selective, and general purpose media, as well as appropriate incubation conditions. LAB were the main group described, although other bacterial groups were occasionally reported. Some studies reported single microbial counts, whereas other reported ranges. Although papers reported counts either as log or as actual values, all of the data described in this review are shown as logs. For some products, values were estimated from graphs or figures. When products were held for shelflife or aging studies, the counts from multiple times points are shown. Otherwise, single time-point data was reported. The region or origin of product manufacture was also noted.

GENERAL SURVEY RESULTS

Approximately 400 published studies were reviewed in which fermented foods were characterized for the presence of live microorganisms. However, about three-fourths were excluded and not used in our results. Several excluded studies focused on development of selective methods for distinguishing between different species of LAB, determining ratios (e.g., cocci-torods in yogurt), or for enumerating only probiotics organisms. Although most studies reported data based on traditional plating methods, many of the more recent studies reported abundance data (i.e., 16S rRNA-based community sequencing). Because the latter 16S-based methods also detect non-viable cells, these studies were excluded unless total counts were also reported. Ultimately, more than 140 studies were included in our survey. Although the literature from which the results were assembled covers a 50 year period and a range of different regions and methodologies, the results are remarkably consistent. As summarized below, nine groups of fermented foods were reviewed in this survey. These included yogurt and other cultured dairy products, cheese, fermented meats, fermented vegetables, traditional fermented Asian products, fermented cereals, beer, and fermented tea (Kombucha).

Yogurt and Other Cultured Dairy Products

Studies were conducted for retail or commercially manufactured yogurts and other cultured dairy products obtained in the U.S., Australia, Spain, France, Norway, Greece, Argentina, and South Africa (Table 1). All of the yogurts examined contained the yogurt culture organisms, S. thermophilus and L. delbrueckii subsp. bulgaricus, at levels ranging from <10⁴ to 10⁹ cfu/g or ml. In general, counts for S. thermophilus were somewhat higher than for L. delbrueckii subsp. bulgaricus. In several studies, other microorganisms, including Bifidobacterium spp. and Lactobacillus spp., were also enumerated. Levels of the latter ranged from undetectable (<10 cfu/g) to 10^8 cfu/g. The addition of these probiotic bacteria did not appear to have any effect on levels of the yogurt culture organisms. Although most studies reported counts at only a single time point, other studies reported initial counts as well as at a second time point, usually considered end-of-shelf-life. In such cases, counts were generally similar at both time points (> 10^6 cfu/g), provided samples were stored at refrigeration temperatures (Hamann and Marth, 1984).

In addition to fresh yogurt, frozen yogurt was also examined for bacteria. Results from several studies indicates that when these products were assessed for the relevant yogurt LAB, levels were generally similar to fresh yogurt, with counts ranging from 10^4 to 10^9 cfu/g. The stability of lactic cultures in frozen yogurt during long-term storage at freezer temperature (-23 C) has also been studied (Lopez et al., 1998). In general, LAB (*S. thermophilus* and *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus*) survived beyond the designated shelf-life period (1 year), with less than a 0.5 log reduction for most samples.

The number and type of live microorganisms in other cultured dairy products have also been reported (**Table 2**). These include kefir, cultured buttermilk and simply "fermented milk." As for other cultured dairy products, populations of LAB were in the $10^{5}-10^{9}$ cfu/g range.

Cheese

Although considerable microbiological data for cheese exists, most of these reports are concerned with microorganisms having public health or cheese quality implications. Still, levels of lactic acid and related bacteria were reported for more than 30 types of cheese from 18 countries including the United States, Italy, France, Germany, Mexico, Ireland, and South Africa (Table 3). Many papers reported the microorganisms as mesophilic streptococci, lactococci, and lactobacilli or as thermophilic streptococci and lactobacilli. Others reported total microorganisms and total LAB. For most products, only one time period was recorded (usually the most aged sample). Microbial counts ranged from undetectable ($<10^3$ cfu/g) to 10^9 cfu/g, with the highest levels found in Tilsit cheese (typically aged 2-4 months). In contrast, Grana Padano aged 1 year, Parmesan aged greater than 1 year, and Swiss Gruyere aged greater than 1 year all showed no detectable microorganisms $(<10^3 \text{ cfu/g})$. As noted for other products, the methods used by the investigators may have influenced the reported data. Thus, enumeration of selected organisms (e.g., S. thermophilus) was only possible if the appropriate medium and growth conditions were used.

Argentina Full and reduced Retail fat yogurt Set, skimmed set, Industrially drinkting, and set manufactured with "dulce de leche" yogurt ^c		microorganisms	(log cfu/mL or g)	(log cfu/mL or g) (log cfu/mL or g)	2		
		S. thermophilus	8.87–9.46	I	Within shelf life	Q	Vinderola and Reinheimer, 2000
		L. bulgaricus ^a	5.58-7.95	I			
		Bifidobacteria ^a	2.60-8.71	I			
		L. acidophilus ^a	4.62-8.39	I			
		L. casei ^b	8.02-8.33	I			
	ally ctured	Total LAB	7.54–8.62	I	Within shelf life	25	Birollo et al., 2000
		S. thermophilus	7.72-8.58	I			
		L. bulgaricus	7.29-7.38	I			
Australia Full and reduced Commercially fat yogurt ^d Manufactured	srcially ctured	Streptococci	9.15–9.6	8.79–9.15	After manufacture and by expiration	4	Micanel et al., 1997
		L. bulgaricus	9.08	8.36			
		L. acidophilus	6.66-8.08	6.38-8.04			
		Bifidobacteria	5.81	7.54			
Skim milk and Did not specify regular yogurt ^e	specify	L. casei	I	3.41–7.49	Did not specify	5	Ravula and Shah, 1998
Variety of flavored, Retail natural, and skinny yogurt ^f		S. thermophilus	8.62–9.17	I	After purchase	Q	Tharmaraj and Shah, 2003
		L. bulgaricus	4.92-7.68	I			
		L. rhamnosus	7.36-7.72	I			
		L. casei	4.01-5.53	I			
		B. lactis	6.36-7.4	I			
		L. acidophilus	5.23-7.83	I			
Variety of flavored Retail yogurts ^g		L. acidophilus	< 2-8.34	<2-8	After purchase (around 20–30 days before expiration) and at expiration	26 CP from 14 companies	Shah et al., 2000
		Bifidobacteria	<2-6.86	<2-6.18			
		L. casei	5.65-8.18	<2-8.08			
Yogurt ^h Did not specify	specify	L. acidophilus	I	6.56	I	18	Talwalkar and Kailasapathy, 2004
		Bifidobacteria	I	6.54			
		L. casei	I	6.38			
Yogurt ^{i,j} Obtained from manufacturer	id from cturer	L. acidophilus	4-8.5	7.7-0VN	After manufacture and 30 days	QJ	Shah et al., 1995

4

Frontiers in Microbiology | www.frontiersin.org

Rezac et al.

MotionMotionStoresMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMotionMoti	IABLE 1 Continued								
Ngart Read Section 3.3-1 NO-2.5 NO-2.5 <th>Region</th> <th>Type</th> <th>Source</th> <th>Analyzed microorganisms</th> <th>Initial Count (log cfu/mL or g)</th> <th>Final Count (log cfu/mL or g)</th> <th>Age</th> <th>CP*</th> <th>References</th>	Region	Type	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Initial Count (log cfu/mL or g)	Final Count (log cfu/mL or g)	Age	CP*	References
VogurtRealStannophas+-40-318End of shelline31Dorg et al. 201VogurtLexbondusLexbondus $-$ 49-762Does not specify800VogurtCerebondusS trannophas $-$ 49-762Does not specify800VogurtCerebondusS trannophas $-$ 49-762Does not specify80VogurtRealExtranophas $ 49-762$ Does not specify80VogurtRealS trannophas $ 49-762$ Does not specify80VogurtLoubspecies $ 49-762$ Does not specify800VogurtS trannophas $ -$ VogurtLoubspecies $ -$ VogurtCerebondusReal $ -$				B. bifidum	3.3-7	NVO-2.5			
Vogut ⁴ Relations Biologications of a manufacture in a manufacture	China	Yogurt	Retail	S. thermophilus + Lactobacillus	I	4.0–8.18	End of shelf life	31	Dong et al., 2014
col Cerkhore yogur Chilandeform Sharmophiashop 31 35 60 days product shelp 1 Amonoblashop Handiashop Landiashop 2 detranoidiashop 88 7.9 1 Do Non et al., 2 Yogur L bodynovgur 5 detranoidiashop 81 7.1-8.9 1 1 Do Non et al., 2 Yogur L bodynovgur 5 detranoidiashop 8.4-8.16 - 1 1 Do Non et al., 2 Sylvoyogur Felai S hemophilis 5.4-8.16 - 1 1 Do Non et al., 2 Affect Loviet in the invalued time S hemophilis 3.4-3.5 1 1 1 Do Non et al., 2 Affect Loviet in the invalued time S hemophilis 3.4-3.5 1 1 1 1 1 1 Affect Loviet in the invalued time 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	England	Yogurt ^k	Retail	Bifidobacteria	I	4.9-7.62	Does not specify	ω	Iwana et al., 1993
	Greece	Greek type yogurt	Obtained from manufacturer	S. thermophilus	9.1	8.5	50 days (product shelf life)		Alexopoulos et al., 2017
Plan at mod syleRead Z thermophies <th< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>L. delbrueckii subsp. bulgaricus</td><td>80.00</td><td>7.9</td><td></td><td></td><td></td></th<>				L. delbrueckii subsp. bulgaricus	80.00	7.9			
Swettend stract Labigations 5.46-6.41 - Industrue De Noniet.a., 2 style yogurt 2. themphiles 5. themphiles $3.40-6.41$ - 10 days after 11 De Noniet.a., 2 style yogurt Lubgaticus $3.themphiles$ $3.4-6.16$ $3.4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$ $-4-6.16$	Italy	Plain stirred style yogurt	Retail	S. thermophilus	7.71–8.9	I	10 days after manufacture	11	De Noni et al., 2004
Sweatmed strind sylp yogurt Ratio Sthermophis				L. bulgaricus	5.48-8.41	I			
		Sweetened stirred style yogurt	Retail	S. thermophilus	8.3–9.59	I	10 days after manufacture	11	De Noni et al., 2004
				L. bulgaricus	<4-8.18	I			
If accred manufacturer vigen:: $7.3.5$ production, and at expiration data vigen:: $1.5.7$ vigen:: $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$ $1.6.7$	South Africa	Low fat, fruit	Obtained from	S. thermophilus	8.7–9.5	7.9–9.5	Directly after	ი	Lourens-Hattingh and
L bugarcus $7-8.6$ 5.7 $1-bugarcus7-8.75.71-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcus1-bugarcu$		flavored	manufacturer				production, and at expiration date		Viljoen, 2002
L actophiles $7.8.7$ $4.9.7$ Custard syleRatalL actophiles $7.8.7$ $4.9.7$ Custard syleRatalTotal LAB 9.1 $ 15$ days after 2 CP from 1vogurt-plain and vogurt-flax andS thermophiles 9.1 $ 15$ days after 2 CP from 1ValueL bulgaricus 9.1 $ 15$ days after 2 CP from 1Noolati VBaby, Voblati VBaby, Value Arti-iudL bulgaricus 8.1 $ -$ Damon, Breyers, Value Arti-iudL bulgaricus 8.1 $ -$ Damon, Breyers, Value Arti-iudL bulgaricus 8.1 $ -$ Damon, Breyers, Value Arti-iudRetail $ 7.68-8.98$ before expirationNooge varielies Flaved vogurtRetailL bulgaricus 8.1 $ -$ Pain notat vogurRetailL bulgaricus $5.2.887$ $6.15-8.69$ Dand 4 weeks after $5.0C77$ brandsPain notat vogurRetailT. bulgaricus $7.58-8.98$ Dand 4 weeks after $5.0C77$ brands $10^{-0.102}$ Pain notat vogurRetailCF and 9 $7.58-8.98$ 0 and 4 weeks after $5.0C77$ brands $10^{-0.102}$ Pain notat vogurRetailCF and 9 $7.58-8.98$ $7.58-8.98$ 0 and 4 weeks after $5.0C77$ brands $10^{-0.102}$ Pain notat vogurRetailCF and 9 $7.58-8.98$ $7.58-8.98$ $7.58-8.98$ $10^{-0.102}$ $10^{-0.102}$ Pain notat vogur				L. bulgaricus	7–8.6	5.5-7			
Custand style B. bindum 2-5.2 2.2-49 Total LAB B. bindum Haman and Ma vogurt-plain and theored Total LAB 9.1 - 15 days after 2 CP from 1 Haman and Ma vogurt-plain and theored S. thermophilus 9.1 - 15 days after 2 CP from 1 Haman and Ma vogurt-plain and theored S. thermophilus 9.1 - 10 Dunlap et al. 20 Vogurt-plain and theored Lactobacilus - 7.68-8.98 before expiration 10 Dunlap et al. 20 Vogurt-plain and theored yogurt Retai L. buigaricus - 7.68-8.98 before expiration 10 Dunlap et al. 20 Vogurt-laxed Retai L. buigaricus 5.2-8.87 6.16-8.69 0 and 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands brand Can Konger vanieles Retai - 7.68-8.98 0 and 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands brand Can Konger vanieles L. buigaricus - 7.68-8.98 0 and 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands brand Can Flavord yogurt Retai S. thermophilus - -				L. acidophilus	7-8.7	4.9-7			
				B. bifidum	2-5.2	2.2-4.9			
S. thermophiles 9.1 - L. bulgaricus 8.1 - L. bulgaricus 8.1 - L. bulgaricus 8.1 - Retail L. bulgaricus 8.1 - Retail L. bulgaricus 6.15-8.69 before expiration 10 Dunlap et al., 20 Retail L. bulgaricus 5.2-8.87 6.15-8.69 0 and 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr urt Retail L. bulgaricus 7.51-8.94 7.9-8.99 purchase 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr urt Retail S. thermophilus 7.51-8.94 7.9-8.99 ond 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr urt Retail S. thermophilus 7.51-8.94 7.9-8.99 ond 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr urt Retail S. thermophilus 7.9-8.99 ond 4 weeks after 3 Laye et al., 1903 L. bulgaricus 9.04-9.33 - After manufacture 3 Laye et al., 1903	United States		Retail	Total LAB	9.1	I	15 days after manufacture	2 CP from 1 manufacturer	Hamann and Marth, 1984
L. bulgaricus 8.1 - s. Retail L. bulgaricus 8.1 - 7.68–8.98 before expiration 10 Dunlap et al., 20 Retail L. bulgaricus 5.2–8.87 6.15–8.69 0 and 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr Int Retail L. bulgaricus 5.2–8.87 6.15–8.69 0 and 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr Int Retail L. bulgaricus 7.51–8.94 7.9–8.99 Purchase 10 Dunlap et al., 1903 Int Retail S. thermophilus 7.51–8.94 7.9–8.99 After manufacture 3 Laye et al., 1903 Int Retail S. thermophilus 8.14–9.83 - After manufacture 3 Laye et al., 1903 Int Retail Tota LAB 8.6 - 6.days after 1 Hamann and Ma				S. thermophilus	9.1	I			
3. Retail Lactobacilus - 7.68-8.98 before expiration 10 Dunlap et al., 20 Retail L. <i>bulgaricus</i> 5.2-8.87 6.15-8.69 0 and 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr Int Retail L. <i>bulgaricus</i> 5.2-8.87 6.15-8.69 0 and 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr Int Retail 7.51-8.94 7.9-8.99 Purchase 10 Dunlap et al., 20 Int Retail 2. <i>thermophilus</i> 7.51-8.94 7.9-8.99 Purchase 10 Dunlap et al., 20 Int Retail 2. <i>thermophilus</i> 7.51-8.94 7.9-8.99 Purchase 10 Dunlap et al., 20 Int Retail 2. <i>thermophilus</i> 7.51-8.94 7.9-8.99 140-8.8 1493 Int Retail 2. <i>thermophilus</i> 1-4.7 N/O** After manufacture 3 Laye et al., 1993 Int Retail Total LAB 8.6 - 6 days after 1 Haman and Ma				L. bulgaricus	8.1	I			
Retail L. bulgaricus 5.2–8.87 6.15–8.69 0 and 4 weeks after 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr Number S. thermophilus 7.51–8.94 7.9–8.99 purchase 58 CP/7 brands Ibrahim and Carr Nut Bifidobacteria 7.51–8.94 7.9–8.99 purchase 5. thermophilus 7.51–8.94 7.9–8.99 Nt Retail <1–4.7		Dannon, Breyers, Yoplait, YoBaby, Wal-Mart, and Kroger varieties	Retail	Lactobacillus	I	7.68–8.98	before expiration	10	Dunlap et al., 2009
S. thermophilus 7,51-8.94 7,9-8.99 Bifidobacteria <1-4.7		Flavored yogurt	Retail	L. bulgaricus	5.2–8.87	6.15–8.69	0 and 4 weeks after purchase	58 CP/7 brands	Ibrahim and Carr, 2006
Bifidobacteria <1-4.7 NVC** urt Retail S. <i>thermophilus</i> 8.14-9.83 - After manufacture 3 Laye et al., 1993 L. <i>buigaricus</i> 9.04-9.33 - 6 days after 1 Hamann and Ma manufacture				S. thermophilus	7.51–8.94	7.9–8.99			
urt Retail S. thermophilus 8.14–9.83 - After manufacture 3 Laye et al., 1903 L L. bulgaricus 9.04–9.33 - After manufacture 3 Laye et al., 1903 Retail Total LAB 8.6 - 6 days after 1 Hamann and Ma				Bifidobacteria	<1-4.7	NVO**			
L. bulgaricus 9.04-9.33 – Retail Total LAB 8.6 – 6 days after 1 Hamann and Ma manufacture		Plain nonfat yogurt		S. thermophilus	8.14–9.83	I	After manufacture	ო	Laye et al., 1993
Retail Total LAB 8.6 – 6 days after 1 Hamann and Ma manufacture 1 manufacture				L. bulgaricus	9.04-9.33	I			
		Stirred style	Retail	Total LAB	8.6	I	6 days after manufacture	. 	Hamann and Marth, 1984
									(Continued)

References

å

Åge

Final Count

Initial Count

log cfu/mL or g) (log cfu/mL or g)

nicroorganisms

Analyzed

Source

Type

Region

S. thermophilus

L. bulgaricus

Fotal LAB

Retail

Yogurt

Bifidobacteria

Shin et al., 2000

N

expiration date

¥

7.2-8.1 6.5-7.1

8.6 7.3 i.

Live Organisms in Fe	ermented Foods
----------------------	----------------

Fermented Meats

Microbial counts for fermented sausages are shown in Table 4. In general, samples were either obtained from retail, directly from manufacturers, or were produced via industrial conditions. Most samples were from the United States, Spain, Portugal, and Italy and were composed of pork and/or beef. The levels of microorganisms (LAB and total) ranged from undetectable $(<10^2 \text{ cfu/g})$ to 10^{10} cfu/g . Data were reported as either within the product shelf life or after ripening or maturation of the sausage. Counts of viable microorganisms in sausages from the United States were generally lower ($<10^7$ cfu/g) compared to sausages from other countries. In particular, LAB levels were all $<10^6$ cfu/g. In contrast, several of the European sausages contained high levels of LAB (> 10^8 cfu/g.). European sausages were more often artisan sausages from smaller manufacturers, although similar microorganisms are used in comparison to sausages from the United States.

Fermented Vegetables

Microbial counts for fermented vegetables, including sauerkraut, olives, mustard pickles, pickles, and kimchi are summarized in Table 5. Fermented cucumbers products were also considered (listed as pickles). Laboratory-manufactured products, using industrial or traditional practices, were included due to the lack of literature on fermented vegetables from retail sources.

Microbial counts for sauerkraut were generally reported as LAB with counts ranging from 10^3 to 10^8 cfu/g. Reported samples were for sauerkraut originating from the United States, Finland, and Croatia. Levels of LAB and Lactobacillus were reported for olives produced in Italy, Greece, Portugal, Spain, and the United States. These products contained 10⁴ to 10⁸ cfu/g and were between 30 and 200 days.

Other products for which quantitative data were reported included mustard pickles and kimchi from Taiwan and pickled cucumbers from China, India, and the United States. Microbial counts ranged from undetectable $(<10^1)$ to 10^8 cfu/g. For several of these products, levels of species (e.g., Lactobacillus plantarum, Lactobacillus brevis, and Pediococcus cerevisiae) were reported. Species of Leuconostoc, Weissella and Lactobacillus were also reported for Korean kimchi, where they were generally present between 10⁷ and 10⁸ cfu/g.

Traditional Asian Fermented Products

Another group of fermented foods that contain lactic acid bacteria and other bacteria are those products traditionally manufactured in Asia and that rely on grain or legume substrates. One important difference in the fermentation of these food products compared to other fermented foods is the reliance on fungal enzymes to convert complex carbohydrates to simple sugars. Aerobic conditions are another unique characteristic used in various parts of the fermentation process. Data were collected for several products, including miso, tempeh, fish sauce, and fermented fish (Table 6). Similar to the fermented vegetables, there were few reports on products from retail sources. Therefore, laboratory manufactured products made using industrial or traditional practices were included. In general, aerobic bacteria counts of miso ranged from 10^2 to 10^7 cfu/g. Similar bacterial

FABLE 1 | Continued

Frontiers	in Microbiology	y www.frontiersin.org
-----------	-----------------	-------------------------

S. thermophilus – Seen in 5 of 5 CP, "yogurt culture" claimed in all 5 CP. L. bulgaricus–Seen in 2 of 5 CP, "yogurt culture" claimed in all 5 CP. L. rhannous–Claimed in 2 of 5 CP. L. action of a la context of a co

^dL. delbrueckii spp. bulgaricus – reported in only one product. L. acidophilus –1 of 4 CP had NVO. Bifidobacteria–1 of 4 CP had NVO and 1 product had no detectable counts at initial enumeration (week 0).

^eLower end of range are microbial counts for skim milk yogurt and higher end are for regular yogurt. Both products claimed to contain L. casei

^cReported as average on duplicate agar plates

NVO, No viable organisms.

CP, commercial products. ¹Only viable in 4 of 6 CP. ⁵Only viable in 3 of 6 CP. ^gL. acidophilus—Claimed in 24 CP. Bifidobacteria—Claimed in 18 CP. L. casei—Claimed in 8 CP.

of 5 CP. L. acidophilus -- Claimed in 4 of 5 CP.

^hL. acidophilus-9 of 18 CP. Bifidobacteria--8 of 18 CP. L. casei-6 of 18 CP.

B. bifidum -4 of 5 CP had NVO.

Observed in 5 of 8 CP, claimed in all products.

L. acidophilus -2 of 5 CP had NVO.

Interpreted from graph.

Dairy product	Region	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Initial Count (log cfu/mL or g)	Final Count (log cfu/mL or g)	Age	CP*	References
Amasi	South Africa	Retail	LAB	5.1-6.29	I	Did not specify	IJ	Moyane and Jideani, 2013
			Total bacteria count	3.62-4.96	I			
Cultured Buttermilk	Ethiopia ^a	Dairy farms and processing units	Lactococci	6.07–9.25	I	Does not specify	16	Gebreselassie et al., 2016
			Lactobacilli	6.07-8.61	I			
	India	Restaurant	Total viable count	9	I	Does not specify		Jayashree et al., 2013
	United States	Retail	Total bacteria count	7.3–8.64	6.08-7.24	After purchase and 7 days after	œ	Vasavada and White, 1979
Fermented Milk	Argentina	Retail	S. themophilus	9.11–9.49	I	Within shelf life	0	Vinderola and Reinheimer, 2000
			L. acidophilus	4.62-6.60	I			
	Spain	Commercially Manufactured	S. thermophilus	8.42	8.37	After manufacture and at shelf life (24 days)	50	Medina and Jordano, 1994
			L. bulgaricus	7.71	6.87			
			Bifidobacteria	6.87	6.62			
	Spain ^b	Retail	S. themophilus	თ	7	30 days	10	Gueimonde et al., 2004
			Lactobacillus	7-7.3	5.1-6.8			
			Bifidobacteria	5.6-7.5	4.1–7.6			
	Spain	Retail	S. thermophilus	9.27	I	Within shelf life (28 days)	-	García-Cayuela et al., 2009
			L. bulgaricus	7.64	I			
			L. acidophilus	6.65	I			
			L. casei	6.79	I			
			B. lactis	8.2	I			
Frozen Yogurt	France	Obtained from manufacturer ^c	S. thermophilus	8.19	I	5 weeks after manufacture	. 	Lopez et al., 1998
	Spain	Obtained from manufacturer	S. thermophilus	7.57-7.58	I	1 week after manufacture	0	Lopez et al., 1998
			L. bulgaricus	4.29-6.79	I			
	United States	United States Variety of flavors soft/hard from retail and the manufacturer ^d	Total bacteria	<5.52-8.81	I	Does not specify	34	Kosikowski, 1981
		Vanilla flavors from retail ^e	LAB	6.11–9.32	I	Does not specify	10	Schmidt et al., 1997
		Variety of flavors from retail	Total viable bacteria	2.30–8.53	I	Within shelf life	19	Tieszen and Baer, 1989
Kefir	Greece ^f	Retail	Yeast	Q	I	15 days before expiration	Ø	Kalamaki and Angelidis, 2017
								(Continued)

TABLE 2 Continued	pant							
Dairy product	Region	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Initial Count (log cfu/mL or g)	Final Count (log cfu/mL or g)	Age	CP*	References
	Korea	Manufactured with commercial grain	LAB	9.62	1	After fermentation	0	Kim et al., 2015
			Acetic acid bacteria	9.52	I			
			Yeast	7.67	I			
	Norway ^{b,h}	Obtained from TINE Meieret dairy company	Leuconostoc	7.1	6.3	After production and at expiration	Ð	Grønnevik et al., 2011
			Lactobacillus	8.1	6.4			
			Lactococcus	8.1	5.8			
			Yeast	3.3	3.9			
	Turkey	Retail	Lactobacillus	6.51-8.01	I	Does not specify	4	Kesmen and Kacmaz, 2011
			Lactococcus	7.53-8.30	I			
	United States	United States ¹ Manufactured with commercial starter culture	Lactobacillus	9.15	1	After fermentation	ත 	OBrien et al., 2016
			Lactococcus	0	I			
			Yeast	7.2	I			
*CP, Commercial Products.	Products.							
^a Analyzed sour cream bu ^b Interpreted from araph.	eam buttermilk an araph.	^a Analyzed sour cream buttermilk and sour milk buttermilk. ^b Interpreted from araph.						
^c No significant decrease in <i>S. thermophilus c</i> ^d Only 23 CP of 34 CP had viable organisms.	crease in S. therm. CP had viable on	nophilus over time. L. bulga qanisms.	ON significant decrease in S. thermophilus over time. L. bulgaricus was absent in this CP dOIN 23 CP of 34 CP had viable organisms.					
eNVO in 6 CPs (<1 log).	1 log).							
⁹ Unly viable counts seen in 8 of the 9 CFS. ⁹ Lab-scale fermentation with commercial k	s seen in 8 of the tation with comm	' Unly viable counts seen in 8 or the 9 CPS. ⁹ Lab-scale fermentation with commercial kefir grain/starter						
^h Presumptive (95:5 ratio) for lactobacillus and la ⁱ Pannted as average from trinilizate area plates	5 ratio) for lactobé	^h Presumptive (95:5 ratio) for lactobacillus and lactococcus. Leonoted as everyone from trivilicate area relates						
	190 II 011 II IDII0010	agai piacos						

Cheese	Region (Type)	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	čP*	References
Afuega'l Pitu	Spain	Traditionally manufactured	Total viable bacteria count	8.06	60 days	N	Cuesta et al., 1996
			Lactococci	6.77			
			Leuconostocs	6.76			
			Lactobacilli	8.01			
Amada ^a	Spain	Traditionally manufactured	Aerobic Mesophiles	4.39–8.14	16 weeks	0	Tornadijo et al., 1995
			Lactococci	4.17-6.38			
			Lactobacilli	4.19–8.09			
			Leuconostocs	3.38-7.58			
Asiago	Italy (Asiago Allevo)	Commercial sample	Meso. streptococci	5.7	3–10 months	-	Gatti et al., 1999
			Therm. streptococci	8.9			
			Meso. lactobacilli	4.5			
			Them. lactobacilli	7.2			
Blue Cheese ^b	United States	Retail	Total plate count	7.32	Within shelf		Genigeorgis et al., 1991
Brie	Italv	Commercial samples	Meso.	5.3	1–2 months		Gatti et al 1999
	(max		streptococci	0			
			Them.	ςγ			
			streptococci				
			Meso. lactobacilli	n.d.**			
			Therm. lactobacilli	~3			
	South Africa ^a	Commercially manufactured	LAB	7-8.8	8 weeks	00	Viljoen et al., 2003
Burgos	Spain	Retail	LAB	4.6-8.8	Time of purchase	36	Garcia et al., 1987
Cabrales	Spain	Obtained from manufacturers	Aerobic mesophiles	7.45–8.36	90 days	N	Flórez et al., 2006
			Lactococci	7.44-8.12			
			Lactobacilli	5.85-7.15			
			Leuconostoc spp.	5.40-6.14			
		Obtained from manufacturers ^{c,d}	Total viable count	6.8–7.9	120 days	0	Nuñez, 1978
			Streptococci	3.5-5.9			
			Leuconostocs	3–3.8			
			Lactobacilli	3.2-6.5			
			Yeast+Molds	4.1–7.2			
Camembert ^a	South Africa	Commercially manufactured	LAB	7.6-8.5	8 weeks	00	Viljoen et al., 2003

Cheese	Region (Type)	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	čD*	References
Cheddar	Ireland	Commercially manufactured	L. paracasei	ω	39 weeks	m	Fitzsimons et al., 2001
	Ireland ^c	Obtained from manufacturer	NSLAB***	1.70-6.90	8 weeks	8	Jordan and Cogan, 1993
			NSLAB	6.15	52 weeks	2	
	U.S. ^e	Traditionally manufactured with commercial starter culture	Lactobacillus	5.1	180 days	I	Madkor et al., 2000
Colby ^b	United States	Retail	Total plate count	7.6	Writhin shelf life	←	Genigeorgis et al., 1991
Comte	France ^f	Obtained from manufacturer	Lb. paracasei	6.28-7.59	168–280 days	4	Depouilly et al., 2004
			Lb. mamnosus	5.37-6.9			
	Switzerland ^{c,g}	Commercially manufactured	Thermophilic streptococci	6.75	24 weeks	ო	Bouton et al., 1998
			Thermophilic lactobacilli	2			
			Facultative heterofermentative lactobacilli	7.5			
			Propionibacteria	7.75			
Danbo	Denmark	Industrially manufactured	Lactococcus	5.76	6 weeks	-	Gori et al., 2013
			Lactobacillus	5.82-5.87			
Edam	Egypt (Edam-like cheese) ^h	Manufactured with commercial starter culture	Total viable bacteria count	7.76	15 weeks	-	Ayana and El-Deeb, 2016
	Italy	Commercial samples	Meso.	2.9	1-2 months		Gatti et al., 1999
			streptococci				
			Therm. streptococci	4.3			
			Meso. lactobacilli	5.8			
			Them. lactobacilli	5.3			
Feta	Greece	Obtained from manufacturer ^b	LAB	6.1	60 days	←	Alexopoulos et al., 2017
		Retail ⁱ	Lactobacillus	5.95-7.19	>60 days	4	Rantsiou et al., 2008
			Lactococcus	4.18-< 5			
	Iran (Probiotic feta)	Commercially manufactured	Lactobacillus acidophilus	6.7	Did not specify		Mohammadmoradi et al., 2015
			Bifidobacterium lactis	6.7			
Fontina	Italy	Commercial sample	Meso. streptococci	8. 9.	3–10 months	-	Gatti et al., 1999
			Therm. strentococci	8.3			

(Continued)

TABLE 3 | Continued

Cheese	Region (Type)	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	CP*	References
			Meso. lactobacilli	4.6			
			Therm. lactobacilli	8.6			
	Italy (Fontal)	Commercial samples	Meso. streptococci	ŝ	1-2 months	-	Gatti et al., 1999
			F	C			
			I herm. streptococci	5.2			
			Meso. lactobacilli	~3			
			Them. lactobacilli	4.4			
Galotyri ^j	Greece	Retail	Total viable count	8.03	Time of	-	Samelis and Kakouri, 2007
			l actobacilli	7 55	purcnase		
			Lactococciii	α 11 2			
	14-11			- L		,	
GUIGUIZUIA	Italy		iviesu. streptococci	0.0		_	Galii el al., 1999
			Them. strentococci	7.4			
			Meso. lactobacilli	3.1			
			Them. lactobacilli	6.4			
		Obtained from manufacturer ^d	Total mesophilic bacteria	7.36-7.56	86 days	-	Gobbetti et al., 1997
			S. thermophilus	7.85-7.92			
			Lb. delbrueckii subsp. bulgaricus	3.67–5.77			
			Mesophilic lactobacilli	5.57-5.69			
			Lactococci	7.73-7.87			
			Mold	6.81-7.44			
Gouda	Belgium ^k	Commercially manufactured	Total microflora count	5.8	42 days		Messens et al., 1999
			LAB	7.1			
			Lactococcus lactis	6.1			
	Belgium (Bellie) ^c	Commercial starter culture	Enterococcus	6.45-6.90	12 weeks	-	Van Hoorde et al., 2008
			Lactobacillus	6.3-7.3			
			Lactococcus	7.2-7.7			
			Leuconostoc	7.4–7.6			
	Belgium (Dulses) ^c	Commercial starter culture	Enterococcus	6.40-6.55	12 weeks	-	Van Hoorde et al., 2008
			Lactobacillus	6.90-7.20			
			Lactococcus	7.50-7.70			
			Leuconostoc	7.60-7.90			
	South Africa	Commercially manufactured	l actobacillus	8.96	32 davs	-	Welthagen and Viligen, 1998

Cheese	Region (Type)	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	CP*	References
			Lactococcus Total plate count	9.1			
Gubbeen	Germany ^m	Traditionally manufactured with commercial starter culture	Total bacterial count	5.7	16 days	÷	Mounier et al., 2006
Grana Padano	Italy ⁿ	Commercially manufactured	Lactobacillus	4.94-6.22	9 months	-	Monfredini et al., 2012
			Lactococcus	3.15-6.05			
	Italy	Commercial samples	Meso. streptococci	ŝ	>1 year	ო	Gatti et al., 1999
			Therm. streptococci	<3			
			Meso. lactobacilli	<3			
			Them. lactobacilli	ő			
	Italy	Commercial samples	Meso. streptococci	ŝ	3 days ripened	-	Gatti et al., 1999
			Them.	~3			
			streptococci				
			Meso. lactobacilli	4.4			
			Them. lactobacilli	7			
	Italy ^f	Obtained from manufacturer	Lactobacillus	4.53	13 months	9	Santarelli et al., 2013
			Total viable count	7.11			
Havarti	Denmark (Pasteurized milk havarti)	Traditionally manufactured	Lactococcus	5.69	12 weeks		Gori et al., 2013
			Lactobacillus	3.65-5.54			
	Denmark (Raw milk Havarti)	Traditionally manufactured	Lactococcus	7.56	12 weeks	-	Gori et al., 2013
			Lactobacillus	6.45-7.75			
Livarot	France	Retail	Total bacteria count	8.58	Does not specify	-	Mounier et al., 2009
			Yeast	6.38			
Limburger ^b	United States	Retail	Total plate count	7.98	Within shelf lífe	÷	Genigeorgis et al., 1991
Manchego	Spain	Retail	LAB	4.6-10.03	Time of purchase	36	Garcia et al., 1987
		Manufactured with commercial starter culture ^c	Lactococcus	5.9	150 days	-	Poveda et al., 2003
			l actobacillus	لد بر			

Cheese	Region (Type)	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	CP*	References
Monterey Jack ^b	United States	Retail	Total plate count	>6.0-8.62	Within shelf life	4	Genigeorgis et al., 1991
Mozzarella	Italy	Commercial Samples	Meso. streptococci	6.3	<20 days	-	Gatti et al., 1999
			Therm. streptococci	7.6			
			Meso. lactobacilli	4.3			
			Therm. lactobacilli	<3			
	Italy (Buffalo milk)	Retail	LAB	4.82	Writhin expiration date	48	Pisano et al., 2016
	ltaly (Mozzarella Bufala)	Commercial samples	Meso. streptococci	5.6	<20 days	-	Gatti et al., 1999
			Therm. streptococci	5.6			
			Meso. lactobacilli	4.8			
	ltaly (Mozzarella Bufala Campana)	Local markets	LAB	4.0–7.8	Within shelf life	с	Devirgiliis et al., 2008
	Italy (Cow milk)	Commercially manufactured with commercial starter	Therm. lactobacilli	4.6	15 days	-	De Angelis et al., 2008
			Meso. lactobacilli	4.81			
			Streptococcus	7.85			
			Enterococcus	3.87			
	Italy (Cow milk)	Retail	LAB	7.08	Within expiration date	14	Pisano et al., 2016
Muenster ^b	United States	Retail	Total plate count	4.53	Within shelf life	-	Genigeorgis et al., 1991
Parmesan	ltaly (Parmigiano Reggiano)	Obtained from manufacturer	LAB	7.52	150 days	15	Coppola R. et al., 2000
	Italy (Parmigiano Reggiano)	Commercially manufactured	LAB	6.18	2 months	-	Gatti et al., 2008
			LAB	2.3	24 months		
	Italy (Parmigiano Reggiano)	Commercial samples	Meso. streptococci	ŝ	>1 year	-	Gatti et al., 1999
			Therm. streptococci	ŝ			
			Meso. lactobacilli	ŝ			
			Them. lactobacilli	ŝ			
Puzzone di Moena ^o	Italy	Traditionally manufactured	Lactobacillus	7.1–7.7	3 months	5	Franciosi et al., 2008
			l actococcus	7.5-7.7			

Live Organisms in Fermented Foods

(Continued)

Cheese	Region (Type)	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	CP*	References
Pecorino Romano	Italy	Commercial sample	Meso. streptococci	3.5	3–10 months	-	Gatti et al., 1999
			Therm. streptococci	5.5			
			Meso. lactobacilli	3.7			
			Therm. lactobacilli	ю			
Provolone	Italy (Piquant provolone)	Commercial sample	Meso. streptococci	2.5-3.4	3-10 months	0	Gatti et al., 1999
			Therm.	5.4-8.3			
			Mana Jantahaaili	0 0 0			
			INIESO. Iactobacilli Therm Tactobacilli	2.01-2.2 02-1-7.7			
	Italy (Sweet	Commercial sample	Meso.	<3-4.3	3-10 months	0٦	Gatti et al., 1999
			There	т 1 1			
			l herm. streptococci	1.7–C.4			
			Meso. lactobacilli	° ∼			
			Therm. lactobacilli	<3-7.1			
Queso Fresco ^p	Mexico	Obtained from manufacturer	Mesophilic streptococci	6.85–9.07	Within 5 days of manufacturer	Q	Renye et al., 2008
			Thermophilic streptococci	5.04-9.02			
			Mesophilic lactobacilli	7.13-8.99			
			Thermophilic lactobacilli	5.01-9.01			
			Leuconostoc	5.86-9.23			
			Enterococcus	5.05-7.91			
Serrano	Brazil	Retail	Lactococcus	8.60-9.10	Within shelf life	10	Delamare et al., 2012
			Lactobacillus	7.95–9.10			
Stilton	United Kingdom ^q	Retail	Mesophilic LAB	8.87	Within shelf life	16	Ercolini et al., 2003
			Lactobacinus Mesonbilic	07.7			
			streptococci	0.0			
			Mesophilic, anaerobic LAB	8.85			
	United Kingdom (blue-veined raw milk cheese) ^d	Obtained from manufacturer	LAB	6.90-7.41	After aging (12 weeks)	-	Yunita and Dodd, 2018
			Lactobacillus	A 85_6 18			

August 2018 | Volume 9 | Article 1785

Cases (a) (a) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b	Hotor (k) Backon Backon Controls Advoices Controls Advoices Advoices <t< th=""><th>-</th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th></t<>	-							
Fano Tackbord Tackbord <thtackbord< th=""> Tackbord <tht< th=""><th>Tano Take <th< th=""><th>Cheese</th><th>Region (Type)</th><th>Source</th><th>Analyzed microorganisms</th><th>Count (log CFU/g)</th><th>Age</th><th>CP*</th><th>References</th></th<></th></tht<></thtackbord<>	Tano Take Take <th< th=""><th>Cheese</th><th>Region (Type)</th><th>Source</th><th>Analyzed microorganisms</th><th>Count (log CFU/g)</th><th>Age</th><th>CP*</th><th>References</th></th<>	Cheese	Region (Type)	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	CP*	References
Fanoe Tanoe Toto motion cleate 25-7.6 24 weeks 2 Faultive intervention 24.47.9 24.47.9 24 1 Faultive intervention 20.56.6 24.47.9 1 1 Faultive intervention 20.56.7 20.56.6 1 1 Faultive intervention 20.56.7 20.56.7 1 1 1 Faultive intervention 20.56.7 20.56.7 2 1 1 1 Faultive intervention 20.56.7 2 2 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Fanoe Tachonal manufactured Recondincteries 24-16 24 weeks 24 Recondencies 74-79 74-79 74-79 74 74 Recondencies 74-76 74-79 74-79 74 74 Recondencies 74-76 74-79 74 74 74 Recondencies 74-76 74-79 74 74 74 74 Recondencies 74-76 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 7				Lactococcus	7.83-8.65			
Factor indexing Currant of the index of the	Forthand Torushio	Swiss ^{c,r}	France	Traditionally manufactured	Propionibacteria	7.5-7.6	24 weeks	2	Demarigny et al., 1996
Taby Connection according to the connection according to t	Ibly Commonie 20-56 1 Tempolicie 20-56 1 1 Tempolicie 26-59 1 1 Tempolicie 26-59 1 1 Tempolicie 26-59 1 1 Tempolicie 26-59 1 1 Match Maschilicie 26 1 1 Tempolicie 26 1 1 1 Austral Ottainot string 1 1 1 1 Austral Ottainot string 1 1 1 1 1 Austral Ottainot string 1 1 1 1 1 1 Austral Ottainot string 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 Austral Ottainot string 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1				Facultatively	7.4–7.9			
Thermonilie 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56 30-56	The mobility is the control of the control of the control is the control of the control of the control of the control is the control of the control				Lactobacillus				
Table Connected sample 26-59 Isolation Memorylic 26-59 Isolation Memorylic 3 Astria Connected sample 3 Astria Obaland from monutacture 3 3 Memorylic 3 3 3 Astria Obaland from monutacture 3 3 Memorylic 3 3	Tampolic 26-69 Italy Connectal sample Remobilic 26-69 Mesohilic Vestebilic Col 1 Austria Connectal sample Resolution Col 1 Manual Col Col Col 1 1 Manual Col Col Col Col 1 Marcal Col Col Col Col 1 Marcal Col Col Col Col 1 Marcal Col Col Col Col 1 1 Marcal Col Col Col Col Col 1 1 Marcal Cole Col Col				Thermophilic streptococci	3.0–5.6			
Idy Connectal sample Mesophic Cl 1 year 1 Response Response Cl	Italy Connectal sample Mescphilo -3 >1 year 1 The model				Thermophilic lactobacilli	2.6–5.9			
Themophic -3 steptococi Mesophic -3 lectobacili -3 Tetal bacterial -3 Total bacterial -3 total bacterial -3 -3 -3 -3 -3 -3 -3 -3 -3 -3 -3 -3 -3 -	Themophic -3 steptococi Mesophic -3 Internophic -3 tectobacili -3 tectobacili -3 tectobacili -3 actobacili -3 stetobacili -3 s	Swiss Gruyere	Italy	Commercial sample	Mesophilic streptococci	ŝ	>1 year	£	Gatti et al., 1999
Mesophic -3 lactobacili -3 Themophic -3 lactobacili -3 Total bacterial -3 St-9.7 -13 St-9.7 -13 St-	Mesophilic -3 lactobacili -3 lactobacili -3 Total bacterial -3 ount -3 13 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14				Thermophilic streptococci	ŝ			
Themophilic -3 lactobacili 2014 21 days 13 count - 21 days 13	Themophic 3 lactoracil 84-9.7 21 days 13 count 22 days 13				Mesophilic lactobacilli	~ ~			
Total bacterial 8.4-9.7 D1 days 13 count	Total bacterial 8.4-9.7 2.1 days 13				Thermophilic lactobacilli	~			
CP: Commercial Products. "n. d. not determined. "What and summer chease and procedure. "What and summer chease and procedure. "Did not support L. monocytogenes surface growth when enumerated. "Instance and interform grayh. "Cates non-state (Catese was analyzed on surface and in center. "Did not support L. monocytogenes surface growth when enumerated. "Instances and interform grayh. "Grass and interfor of chease was analyzed. "Lactobacillits scorin of control chease (Int adjunct cuture added). "Lactobacillits scorin of control chease when the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP. "Ammosis and Lb. paracasel ware the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP. "Ammosis and Lb. paracasel ware the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP. "In the control from a Edam-like chease experiment of goat's diet. "In the control from a Edam-like charter. "The control from a Edam-like chease experiment of goat's diet. "In a 4 CP maporter of the approxements from microbacillits section and core. "The control from a Edam-like charters. "The control from of O on these experiment of goat's diet. "The contro	CP: Commercial Products. ".a.d. and determined. ".a.d. and determined. ".a.d. and astrater ALB count. "NaLA, and summer cheese analyzed on surface and in conter. "Minter and summer cheese was analyzed. "Estatopabellis count of control cheese may analyzed. "Surface and interv of cheese was analyzed. "Surface and interv of cheese was analyzed. "Surface and interv of cheese may analyzed. "I.b. namonic heese may analyzed. "On his control cheese may and cheese surface. "On his control cheese may and cheese surface. "On his control cheese surface. "On his control cheese and cheese surface. "On his control cheese may and cheese surface. "Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese surface. "The surface of the cheese of the	Tilsit	Austria	Obtained from manufacturer	Total bacterial count	8.4–9.7	21 days	13	Eliskases-Lechner and Ginzinger, 1995
 n.G., not determined. n. G., not determined. n.M. and summer chease analyzed on surface and in center Writer and summer chease analyzed on surface and in center and summer chease analyzed. Dibli not support L. monocytogenes surface growth when enumerated. Dibli not support L. monocytogenes surface growth when enumerated. Dibli not support L. monocytogenes surface growth when enumerated. Dibli not support L. monocytogenes surface growth when enumerated. Chrideo and interior of cheese (not adjunct culture added). L. Artemnoss and LD. paracase were the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP. Sureage of CR. "The control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goarts dist. So if 4 CP reported "not appreable" (-5) tog clug). Industral Cheese with comprised starter cultures. Freessen teatment of 0.1 MPa. "Only licensed cheese at adjoed. "Tense control fraction and core. "Winter and summer cheese at 20"C. "Paperade as average of tripicale agar plates. "Rew and pasterial of tripicale agar plates. "Rew and microfilered rulk: reported. 	n. d., not determined. 	*CP, Commercial	Products.						
^a Writer and summer cheese analyzed on surface and in center. ^b Did not support L. monocytogenes surface growth when enumerated. ^c Interpret from growth or cheese was analyzed. ^c Surface and integr of cheese was analyzed. ^c Lactobacillus count of control cheese (not adjunct culture addec). ^c Lactobacillus count of control cheese into adjunct culture addec). ^c Lib. thatmosus and Lb. paracasei were the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP. ^c Amergened of CP. ^c Inter calmarkie cheeses experiment of goat's diet. ^c of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log clug). ^c Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. ^c Pressue treatment of 0.1 LM ² . ^c Only is constant of a corte. ^c Only is constant of a corte. ^c Only is constant of the corte. ^c of a cortenese adjort. ^c of a cortenese inductor and core. ^c On a frantine of the corte. ^c On a growth on cheese surface. ^c Only is constant of a parters. ^c Measurements from middle section and core. ^c Ontime and gar plates. ^c Prevent of milk reported.	¹⁴ Writer and summer chease analyzed on surface and in center. ¹⁰ Did not support. In monocytogenes surface growth when enumerated. ¹⁰ Eurdace and interior of cheese was analyzed. ²¹ Surface and interior of the advisor and consection and consec	"n.d., not determ ""NSLAB, non-st	iined. arter LAB count.						
 The support from 12monocytogenes structed growth when entimerated. Current support of control cheese was analyzed. Surface and interior of cheese was analyzed. L. Iharmosus and LD. prarecasel were the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP. L. Iharmosus and LD. prarecasel were the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP. Alwanges of CP. The control three cheese experiment of goat's driet. So 14 CP reported "not applicable" (~5.log cfug). Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. Pressure treatment of 0.1 MPa. Measurement of 0.1 MPa. Measurements from middle section and core. Winter and summer cheese at 30°C. Perprind as average of triplicate ager plates. Flaw and microfiltered milk reported. 	Control support 1. Intolucy/logenes strated growin what enumerated. Confere and interfor of chease was analyzed. d. Curtere and interfor of chease was analyzed. L. Ib. Intarmostis and L. paracaseli ware the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP. gwarege of the chease was priment of goat's diet. 1. The control from an Etam-like chease experiment of goat's diet. 3 of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (~5 log cutu). Introstrati Chease with commercial starter cultures. 1. Industrial Chease with commercial starter cultures. 4. Pressure tranement of 1. MPa. 1. Only licensa analyzed. 1. Measurements from middle section and core. 1. Measurements from middle section and core. 1. Witter and asstrumer cheases at 30°C. 1. Paw and microfilered milk reported.	^a Winter and sum	mer cheese analyzed on surface	e and in center.					
^d Surface and interior of cheese was analyzed. ^e Lactobacillus count of control cheese (not adjunct culture added). ¹ Lb. mamnosus and Lb. paracasel were the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP. ² Average of CP. ¹ The control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goat's cliet. ¹ S of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (-5 log clug). ¹ Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. ¹ S of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (-5 log clug). ¹ Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. ¹ S of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (-5 log clug). ¹ Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. ¹ S of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (-5 log clug). ¹ Measurement of 0.1 MPa. ¹ Only licensed cheeses analyzed. ¹ Measurement of not cheese surface. ¹ Gran Tirentino cheese at analyzed. ¹ Measurement of pasteurized milk cheese. ² Minter and surface after pasteure. ² Minter and surface after pasteure.	^d Surface and interior of cheese was analyzed. ^L Lax manual of control cheese find adjunct culture addeol. ^L Lax manual of control cheese find adjunct culture addeol. ^L Lax manual control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goarts diet. ^{The} control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goarts diet. ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported 'not applicable' (-5 log cfug). ^{Joa} of 4 CP reported at average of triplicate ager plates. ^{Preprint} fraw and microfiltered mik reported.	^c Interpreted from	L. monocyrogenes sunace grov graph.	wiri wrien erumerateu.					
¹ Lactobacellus count of control cheese (not adjunct cuture acdeo). ¹ Lb. rhamnosus and Lb. paracasei were the only microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP ² Are cortool from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goat's diet. ¹ The control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goat's diet. ¹ S of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (<5 log cfu/g). ¹ Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. ¹ Pressure treatment of 0.1 MPa. ¹ Measurement of 0.1 MPa. ¹ Measurement of 0.1 MPa. ¹ Measurements from middle section and core. ⁰ Minter and summer cheese at 30°C. ² Peave and pasteurized mik cheese. ¹ Rew and pasteurized mik reported.	^{-L} actorbacillus count of control cheese (not adjunct cuture acted). ^{-L} Lactorbacillus count of control cheese (not microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP ^g Average of CP Th recontrol from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goat's diet. Th control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goat's diet. Th control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of 0.1 M/Ma th control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of 0.1 M/Ma th control from an Edam-like cheese analyzed. th analyzed cheeses analyzed. th Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese surface. th control from and cone. th control from and cone. th an and pastelurized milk cheese. th faw and microfitered milk reported.	^d Surface and inte	srior of cheese was analyzed.	-					
 ⁹ Average of CP. ⁹ The control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goat's diet. ¹⁰ 3 of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (<5 log cturg). ¹¹ Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. ¹¹ Pressure treatment of 0.1 MPa. ¹⁰ Only licensed cheeses analyzed. ¹⁰ Miniter and Summer cheeses urface. ¹⁰ Miniter and summer cheeses use and core. ¹⁰ Pressure milts from middle section and core. ¹⁰ Pressure of triplicate agar plates. ¹⁰ Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. 	9 Average of CP 17The control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goats diet. 13 of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (<5 log cturg). 1ndustrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. Resurce treatment of 0.1 MP-a. 10hy licensed cheeses analyzed. 10hy licensed production on cheese surface. 10hy licensed production and core. 10hy and maxument cheese at 30°C. 17 Resurce and protection and core. 18 Resorted as average of triplicate agar plates. 19 Resorted in treported.	^e Lactobacillus co. ^f Lb. mamnosus a	unt of control cheese (not adjun and Lb. paracasei were the only	nct culture added). microorganisms enumerated in all 4 CP					
¹ The control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goat's diet. ³ of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (<5 log cturg). ¹ Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. ^k Pressure treatment of 0.1 MPa. ^k Pressure treatment of 0.1 M	^{In} The control from an Edam-like cheese experiment of goat's diet. ¹ 3 of 4 <i>CP</i> reported "not applicable" (-5 log ctug). ¹ Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. ¹ Pressure treatment of cheeses analyzed. ¹ Only licensed cheeses analyzed. ¹ Measurement of bacterial gouth on cheese surface. ¹ Measurement of bacterial gouth on cheese surface. ¹ Grana Trentino cheese. Measurements from middle section and core. ⁰ Winter and summer cheese at 30°C. ¹ Rew and pasteurized milk cheese. ¹ Rew and microlitered milk reported.	^g Average of CP.							
13 of 4 <i>CP</i> reported "not applicable" (~5 log ctu/g). Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. <i>Pressure treatment of 0.1 MPa.</i> <i>Const increment of Descerial provith on cheese surface.</i> <i>Const Trentino cheese; Measurements from middle section and core.</i> <i>Construmer cheese at 30°C.</i> <i>Plaw and pasteurized milk cheese.</i> <i>Pressure agen plates.</i>	13 of 4 CP reported "not applicable" (-5 log ctug). ¹ Industrial Cheese with commercial starter cultures. ¹ Pressure treatment of not cheeses analyzed. ¹ Only licensed cheeses analyzed. ¹ Measurement of bacterial govuth on cheese surface. ¹ Grana Trentino cheese. Measurements from middle section and core. ¹ Grana Trentino cheese at 30° C. ¹ Raw and pasteurized milk cheese. ² Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ¹ Faw and microliftered milk reported.	^h The control from) an Edam-like cheese experime	ent of goat's diet.					
^k Pressure treatment of 0.1 MPa. ¹ Only licensed cheeses analyzed. ¹ Only licensed cheeses analyzed. ¹ Measurements from middle section and core. ⁰ Winter and summer cheese at 30°C. ² PRaw and pasteurized milk cheese. ² Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ¹ Raw and microfiltered milk reported.	 ^k Pressure treatment of 0.1 MPa. ^(Dn) licensed cheeses analyzed. ^(Dn) licensed cheeses analyzed. ^(Dn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese surface. ^(Dn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Dn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Dn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Dn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Dn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Dn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Dn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Pn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Pn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Pn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Pn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. ^(Pn) Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese and surface. 	¹ 3 of 4 CP reporte ¹ Industrial Cheese	ed "not applicable" (<5 log cfu/ç e with commercial starter culture	g). Se					
¹ Only licensed cheeses analyzed. ^m Maasurement of bacterial growth on cheese surface. ⁿ Grana Trentino cheese; Measurements from middle section and core. ^o Winter and summer cheese at 30°C. ^P Raw and pasteurized milk cheese. ^q Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ^r Raw and microfiltered milk reported.	¹ Only licensed cheeses analyzed. ^m Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese surface. ^m Grana Trentino cheese; Measurements from middle section and core. ^o Winter and summer cheese at 30° C. ^P Raw and pasteurized mik cheese. ^q Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ^r Rew and microfiltered mik reported.	^k Pressure treatme	ent of 0.1 MPa.	Ĩ					
^m Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese surface. ⁿ Grana Trentino cheese; Measurements from middle section and core. ^o Winter and summer cheese at 30°C. ^P Rew and pasteurized milk cheese. ^q Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ^r Paw and microfittered milk reported.	^m Measurement of bacterial growth on cheese surface. ⁿ Grana Trentino cheese; Measurements from middle section and core. ⁿ Winter and summer cheese at 30°C. ^P Raw and pasteurized milk cheese. ^q Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ^r Rew and microfiltered milk reported.	¹ Only licensed ch	eeses analyzed.						
uraria menuncureese, meesuaments munue securi and core. ^o Winter cheese at 30° C. PRaw and pasteurized milk cheese. ^q Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ^r Raw and microfittered milk reported.	ura ra menuru uneess, waasaremanis mummuue secunt and cure. º Wimter and summer cheese at 30°C. P Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ^r Paw and microfiltered milk reported.	Measurement o	if bacterial growth on cheese su	irface. Join continue and point					
P Raw and pasterumed muscle agar plates. 9 Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. 7 Raw and microfiltered milk reported.	Prevention of the contract of	^o Minter and sumr	ineese, ivieasurerrierius irorri rrin. mer cheese at 30°C	Jule section and core.					
^q Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ^r Raw and microfiltered milk reported.	^q Reported as average of triplicate agar plates. ^r Raw and microfiltered mik reported.	PRaw and pasteu	irized milk cheese.						
r Paw and microfittered milk reported.	r Raw and microfiltered mik reported.	^q Reported as ave	srage of triplicate agar plates.						
		^r Raw and microfil	ttered milk reported.						

country	lype	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	СР	References
France	Dry fermented sausage	Obtained from manufacturer	LAB	6.50-7.74	End of drying (9 weeks)	-	Chevallier et al., 2006
Greece	Dry fermented sausage	Obtained from manufacturer	LAB	7.63-8.20	28 days after formulation	-	Samelis et al., 1994
		Commercially produced ^a	LAB	8.1–8.2	End of curing period	0	Papamanoli et al., 2003
Italy	Ciauscolo salami	Commercially produced ^a	LAB	7.5	End of ripening (45 days)	-	Aquilanti et al., 2007
			Yeast	5.5			
		Obtained from manufacturer	Total bacteria	2.7-5.95	End of ripening	22	Silvestri et al., 2007
			LAB	6.77-8.65			
	Fermented Sausage, Friuli Venezia Giulia region	Commercially produced ^a	Total bacteria	6.1	End of ripening (45 days)	-	Cocolin et al., 2001
			LAB	8.3			
		Commercially produced ^b	Total aerobic count	6.62–9.11	End of ripening (21 days)	Ю	Comi et al., 2005
			LAB	8.39-8.47			
		Obtained from manufacturer	Total bacteria	4.19-9.11	End of maturation	С	Rantsiou et al., 2005
			LAB	8.34-8.78			
	Salami bergamasco	Obtained from manufacturer	Total bacteria	6-7.17	After maturation of 60 days	0	Cocolin et al., 2009
			LAB	9-9.14			
	Salami Brianza	Local markets	Mesophilic lactobacilli	8.6	After purchase		Di Cagno et al., 2008
	Salami cremonese	Obtained from manufacturer	Total bacteria	5.17-6.69	After maturation of 60 days	ŋ	Capita et al., 2006
			LAB	7.54-9.38			
	Salami Mantovano	Obtained from manufacturer	Total bacteria	4.23–9.87	After maturation of 60 days	4	Capita et al., 2006
			LAB	7.6–9.38			
		Commercially produced ^c	Lactobacilli	8.01-8.73	End of ripening (60 days)	0	Pisacane et al., 2015
	Salami Milano	Obtained from manufacturer	LAB	8.0	End of ripening (60 davs)	, -	Rebecchi et al., 1998
	Salami Napoli	Obtained from	Mesophilic	6.7	End of ripening (30 davs)	,	Coppola et al., 1995
		manufacturer ^a	lactobacilli				
		Commercially produced ^d	Mesophilic LAB	5.5	End of ripening (41 days)	-	Coppola S. et al., 2000
	Salami Piacentino	Local markets	Mesophilic lactobacilli	0.0 0.0	After purchase	-	Di Cagno et al., 2008
		Obtained from manufacturer ^e	LAB	8.02–8.84	End of ripening (63 days)	9	Połka et al., 2015
	Salami Piedmontese	Commercially produced	LAB	7.84	End of ripening (45 days)		Greppi et al., 2015
	Salami Varzi	Local markets	Mesophilic lactobacilli	8.6	After purchase	. 	Di Cagno et al., 2008
	Salsiccia Basilicata ^a	Commercially produced	LAB	4-7.23	End of ripening (40 days)	10	Parente et al., 2001
			Yeast	6-6.6			
	Soppressata Basilicata ^a	Commercially produced	LAB	8-8.4	End of ripening (40 days)	0	Parente et al., 2001
			Yeast	5.2-7			
	Soppressata Molisana ^a	Commercially produced	LAB	8.4	End of ripening (28 days)	0	Coppola et al., 1998

TABLE 4 | Organisms in commercial sausage products by region.

Otop Tate Date Date Date Op Op<								
I Real Rea Real Real Rea	Country	Type	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	СР	References
Andle Cubine formmentering meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning meaning mea	Spain and Portugal	Alheiras	Retail	LAB	5.9–10.5	Within shelf life	12	Capita et al., 2006; Ferreira et al., 2006
Lot Bit Bit <td>,</td> <td>Androlla</td> <td>Obtained from manufacturer</td> <td>Total aerobic mesophilic bacteria</td> <td>7.81–9.52</td> <td>After 20–30 days of ripening</td> <td>20</td> <td>García Fontán et al., 2007b</td>	,	Androlla	Obtained from manufacturer	Total aerobic mesophilic bacteria	7.81–9.52	After 20–30 days of ripening	20	García Fontán et al., 2007b
Obtained from manufacturer acception bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate bedrate be				LAB	8.78-9.36			
NB NB S34-9.56 NHIn shell file 8 Set Tod bacteria 7.3 WHIn shell file 8 No Tod bacteria 5.46 WHIn shell file 8 No Tod bacteria 5.46 WHIn shell file 8 No Felai Tod bacteria 8.26 WHIn shell file 8 No Felai Tod bacteria 8.26 WHIn shell file 8 OEHCH Felai Tod bacteria 8.26 WHIn shell file 8 OEHCH Felai Tod bacteria 8.26 WHIn shell file 8 OEHCH Felai Tod bacteria 8.26 WHIn shell file 8 Ford Tod bacteria 8.26 WHIn shell file 8 8 Ford Tod bacteria 7.5 Does not specify 1 Ford Tod bacteria 7.6 Does not specify 1 Ford Tod bacteria 7.6 Does not specify 1 Ford <		Botillo	Obtained from manufacturer	Total aerobic mesophilic bacteria	7.63-9.37	After 15–20 days of ripening	15	García Fontán et al., 2007a
Bitch Relat Total bacteria 7.3 Within shell file 8 Bera Total bacteria 5.45 Within shell file 8 More Faela Total bacteria 5.45 Within shell file 8 More Faela Total bacteria 5.45 Within shell file 8 More Faela Total bacteria 6.28 Within shell file 8 More Faela Total bacteria 6.28 Within shell file 8 More Faela Total bacteria 6.28 Within shell file 8 More Faela Total bacteria 8.26 Within shell file 8 More Faela Total bacteria 8.26 Does not specify 19 More Faela Total bacteria 8.26 Does not specify 16 More Faela Total bacteria 8.26 Does not specify 16 More Faela Total bacteria 7.4 Does not specify 16				LAB	8.34-9.56			
Matrix LAB Clash Clash <thc< td=""><td></td><td>Chorizo Ostrich</td><td>Retail</td><td>Total bacteria</td><td>7.3</td><td>Within shelf life</td><td>00</td><td>Capita et al., 2006</td></thc<>		Chorizo Ostrich	Retail	Total bacteria	7.3	Within shelf life	00	Capita et al., 2006
Der Fetal Total bacteta 5.45 Withn shaft file 6 Ork Total bacteta 8.25 Withn shaft file 12 Ork Fetal Total bacteta 8.25 Withn shaft file 12 Otk Fetal Total bacteta 8.26 Withn shaft file 12 Obstrict Fetal Total bacteta 6.28 Withn shaft file 12 Obstrict Fetal Total bacteta 6.28 Withn shaft file 12 Iber Fetal Total bacteta 6.28 Withn shaft file 12 Iber Fetal Total bacteta 6.29 Des not specify 11 Iber Fetal Total bacteta 2.4 Des not specify 12 Iber Fetal Total bacteta 2.4 Des not specify 14 Iber Fetal Total bacteta 2.4 Des not specify 14 Iber Fetal Total bacteta 2.4 Des not specify 14				LAB	6.23			
MG File UAB 5.15 Wrthm shelf file 16 Cost bacteria 5.15 Wrthm shelf file 16 22 Cost bacteria 5.61 Wrthm shelf file 22 Deer Total bacteria 5.63 Wrthm shelf file 22 Pork Retai Total bacteria 5.63 Wrthm shelf file 22 Pork Retai Total bacteria 5.63 Wrthm shelf file 22 Pork Retai Total bacteria 5.63 Wrthm shelf file 23 Imm Retai Total bacteria 3.75 Does not spocity 11 Molin Retai Total bacteria 7.3 Does not spocity 14 Molin Retai Total bacteria 7.4 Does not spocity 14 Molin Retai Total bacteria 7.4 Does not spocity 14 Molin Retai Total bacteria 7.4 Does not spocity 14 Molin Retai Total bacteria		Chorizo Deer	Retail	Total bacteria	5.46	Within shelf life	9	
ork Retail Total bacteria 8.25 Within shell file 18 Obtrich Retail Total bacteria 6.09 Within shell file 22 Obtrich Retail Total bacteria 6.09 Within shell file 22 Deer Retail Total bacteria 6.09 Within shell file 22 Prock Retail Total bacteria 6.09 Within shell file 23 Prock Retail Total bacteria 6.09 Within shell file 23 Ini Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 14 Lob Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 Lob Total bacteria 2-7 Does not specify 14 Lob Total bacteria 2-7 Does not specify 14 Seco dry Retail Total bacteria 2-7 Does not specify 14 Retail Total bacteria 2-7 Does not specify 14 14 Seco dry				LAB	5.15			
LMB LMB <td></td> <td>Chorizo Pork</td> <td>Retail</td> <td>Total bacteria</td> <td>8.25</td> <td>Within shelf life</td> <td>18</td> <td></td>		Chorizo Pork	Retail	Total bacteria	8.25	Within shelf life	18	
Option Real Total bacteria 6.09 Within shell file 22 Deer Real Total bacteria 6.09 Within shell file 23 LMB Total bacteria 6.29 Within shell file 24 LMB Total bacteria 6.29 Within shell file 24 LMB Total bacteria 6.29 Within shell file 24 LMB Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 14 LMB Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 14 LMB Total bacteria 2-7 Does not specify 14 LMB Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 LMB Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 LMB Total bacteria 2				LAB	8.46			
LAB 5.61 Within shelf file 8 I-Pork Fetal 1.04B 6.29 Within shelf file 8 I-Pork Fetal 1.04B 6.29 Within shelf file 19 I-Pork Fetal Torial bacteria 8.09 Within shelf file 19 I-Pork Fetal Torial bacteria 3.7 Does not specify 11 Iami Fetal Torial bacteria 3.7 Does not specify 11 Iami Fetal Torial bacteria 2.4 Does not specify 14 LAB Torial bacteria 2.4 Does not specify 14 LAB Torial bacteria 3.4 Does not specify 15 LAB Torial bacteria 3.4 Does not specify 15		Salchicón Ostrich	Retail	Total bacteria	6.09	Within shelf life	22	
Defer Retail Total bacteria 6.28 Within shelf life 8 IPOrk Retail Total bacteria 6.29 Within shelf life 19 Ini Retail Total bacteria 6.29 Within shelf life 19 Ini Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 11 Ini Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 11 Ini Retail Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 Ini Retail Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 Ini Retail Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 Inicolabacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 14 Inicolabacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 14 Inicolabacteria 10 10 10 14 14 Inicolabacteria 10 10 10 14 14 Inicolabacteria 10				LAB	5.61			
LMB LMB 6.26 Within shell file 19 in Total bacteria 8.09 Within shell file 19 in Fetal Total bacteria 8.09 Within shell file 19 in Fetal Total bacteria 3-5 Does not specify 11 ini Fetal Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 bobgna Fetal Total bacteria 7-8 Does not specify 14 bobgna Fetal Total bacteria 7-8 Does not specify 14 bobgna Fetal Total bacteria 6-7 Does not specify 14 sico dry Fetal Total bacteria 6-7 Does not specify 14 sico dry Fetal Total bacteria 6-7 Does not specify 14 sico dry Fetal Total bacteria 6-7 Does not specify 14 sico dry Fetal Total bacteria 6-7 Does not specify 14 sico dry		Salchicón Deer	Retail	Total bacteria	6.28	Within shelf life	00	
Pork Retail Total bacteria 8.09 Within shaff life 19 in Retail LAB 3-5 Does not specify 11 in Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 11 ini Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 11 ini Retail Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 8 bologna Retail Total bacteria 2-7 Does not specify 14 bologna Retail Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 biologna Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 14 silenti Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 14 salarti Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 14 salarti Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 14 salarti Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify				LAB	6.26			
IdB 7.5 Inclabutation 7.5 Inclabutation 3-6 Does not specify 11 Inclabutation 1.4B 3-7 Does not specify 11 Inclabutation 1.4B 3-7 Does not specify 8 Inclabutation 1.4B 2-6 Does not specify 14 Inclabutation 1.4B 1.7-8 Does not specify 14 Inclabutation 1.4B 1.7-8 Does not specify 14 Inclabutation 1.4B 1.7-8 Does not specify 14 Inclabutation 1.4B 1.01a bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 Inclabutation 1.4B 1.01a bacteria 3-4 Does not specify 14 Inclabutation 1.4B 1.01a bacteria 3-4 Does not specify 15 Inclabutation 1.4B 1.01a bacteria 3-4 Does not specify 16 Inclabutation 1.4B 1.01a bacteria 3-4 Does not specify 16 <		Salchicón Pork	Retail	Total bacteria	8.09	Within shelf life	19	
ii Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 11 lami Retail Total bacteria 3-5 Does not specify 8 lami Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 8 bologna Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 8 bologna Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 8 in Retail Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify 14 in Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 14 isso dry Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 14 satami Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 14 ausage Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 14 i Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify 14 i Uable Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify 14 i Ital Ital Ital Does not specify 14 i Ital Ital Ital Does not specify 14 i Ital Ital Ital				LAB	7.5			
Immi Retail ILAB 3–5 Idmi Total bacteria 3–7 Does not specify Iologna Retail Total bacteria 7–8 Does not specify Iol Retail Total bacteria 7–8 Does not specify Iol Retail Total bacteria 7–8 Does not specify Iol Retail Total bacteria 2–6 Does not specify Iol LAB 3–4 Does not specify Iol LAB Iol Does not specify	United States	Dry salami	Retail	Total bacteria	3–6	Does not specify	11	Acton and Dick, 1976
Iami Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify bologna Retail Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify bologna Retail Total bacteria 7-8 Does not specify bologna Retail Total bacteria 7-8 Does not specify bologna Retail Total bacteria 4-7 Does not specify bisco dry Retail Total bacteria 2-6 Does not specify bisco dry Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify salarni Retail Total bacteria 3-6 Does not specify sausage Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify sausage Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify casings were used. Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify casings were used. Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify				LAB	3-5			
bologna Retai I.AB 2-6 bologna Retai Total bacteria 7-8 Does not specify LAB 7-8 Does not specify LAB 2-6 Does not specify LAB 2-6 Does not specify LAB 7-9 Does not specify alami Retai 7-8 Does not specify LAB 7-9 Does		Genoa salami	Retail	Total bacteria	3-7	Does not specify	00	
bologna Retal Total bacteria 7–8 Does not specify LAB -3 -3 -3 Does not specify LAB LAB 2–6 Does not specify Disco dry Retal 104 Does not specify Disco dry Retal 2–6 Does not specify Disco dry Retal 2–6 Does not specify Disco dry Retal 3–6 Does not specify Sausage Retal 104 Does not specify Sausage Retal 14 Does not specify Sausage Retal 14 Does not specify LAB Total bacteria 3–4 Does not specify <				LAB	2–6			
in Retain Cital bacteria -3 Total bacteria -4-7 Does not specify LAB 2-6 LAB 2-6 Does not specify alami Retain -3-6 LAB -3-6 LAB -3-6 LAB -3-6 LAB -3-7 LAB		Lebanon bologna	Retail	Total bacteria	7–8	Does not specify	2	
iFetalTotal bacteria4-7Does not specifyLABLAB2-6Does not specifycisco dryRetalTotal bacteria3-6cisco dryRetal7-6Does not specifycisco dryRetal7-6Does not specifyalamiRetal7-6Does not specifycisco dryRetal7-6Does not specifyalamiRetal7-6Does not specifysausageRetal7-6Does not specifycisto dryLAB7-7Does not specifycisto dryLAB7-7Does not specifycisto server used.5-6Does not specifycasings were usedstarter cutures				LAB	ς Υ			
cisco dry Retail LAB 2-6 cisco dry Retail Total bacteria 2-6 calami Retail Cotal bacteria 3-4 Does not specify LAB 2-4 Does not specify LAB 2-6 Does not specify LAB 2-7 Does not specify Cotal bacteria 3-7 Does not specify LAB 2-7 Does not specify casings were used.		Pepperoni	Retail	Total bacteria	4-7	Does not specify	14	
isto dry Retal Total bacteria 6–7 Does not specify alami Retal Total bacteria 3–6 Does not specify LAB 2.4 Does not specify LAB 2.4 Does not specify LAB 2.4 Does not specify LAB 2.4 Does not specify LAB 2.7 Does not specify LAB 2.7 Does not specify LAB 2.7 Does not specify LAB 2.7 Does not specify starter cutures.		:		LAB	2–6	• -		
alami Retail LAB 3-6 alami Retail Total bacteria 3-4 Does not specify LAB - 2 Betail Total bacteria 3-4 Does not specify LAB - 4 LAB - 4 LAB - 6 LAB - 6 LAB - 6 LAB - 7 Costal bacteria 3-7 LAB - 7 LAB - 7 L		San Francisco dry	Retail	Total bacteria	6-7	Does not specify	4	
alami Retail LAB 3-6 alami Retail Total bacteria 3-4 Does not specify LAB 3-6 sausage Retail Total bacteria 3-4 Does not specify sausage Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify . Retail Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify . . . 3-7 Does not specify 		salami						
alami Petal Total bacteria 3-4 Does not specify LAB < 2 sausage Petal Total bacteria 3-4 Does not specify LAB / Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify LAB / Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify LAB / Total bacteria 5-6 / Does not specify casings were used.				LAB	3-6			
ausage Retail LAB <2 ausage Retail Total bacteria 3-4 Does not specify LAB 1 LAB 3-7 Does not specify Casings were used.		Semidry salami	Retail	Total bacteria	3-4	Does not specify	80	
sausage Retail Total bacteria 3-4 Does not specify LAB 4 Does not specify LAB 3-7 Does not specify Casings were used. Starter cutures.				LAB	<2			
LAB 4 Retail Total bacteria 3-7 LAB 5-6 Does not specify casings were used. starter cultures.		Summer sausage	Retail	Total bacteria	3-4	Does not specify	19	
Petal Total bacteria 3-7 Does not specify LAB 5-6 Does not specify casings were used.		0		LAB	4	-		
LAB 5-6 control down		Thuringer	Betail	Total bacteria	3-2	Dres not specify	1. C	
^{al} Interpreted from graph. ^b Three seasons were analyzed. ^c Crespone casings and Gentile casings were used. ^d Core and edge data reposited starter cultures.		0		LAB	51–Q		1	
^b Three seasons were analyzed. ^c Crespone casings and Gentile casings were used. ^d Core and edge data reported. ^e With and without commercial starter cultures.	^a Interpreted from	ı graph.						
^с Crespone casings and Gentlie casings were used. ^d Core and edge data reported. ^e With and without commercial starter cultures.	^b Three seasons i	were analyzed.						
eWith and why user provides its fast of the second se	^d Crespone casin,	igs and Gentile casings were u: data renorted	sed.					
	ell/lith and withou	data roportod. It commercial starter cultures						

Kinch Taww ¹ Summutes Summutes <th< th=""><th>Product</th><th>Region (Type)</th><th>Source/Fermentation style</th><th>Analyzed microorganisms</th><th>Count (log cfu/mL or g)</th><th>Age</th><th>References</th></th<>	Product	Region (Type)	Source/Fermentation style	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log cfu/mL or g)	Age	References
Sourtification Total secondation	Kimchi	Taiwan ^a	Supermarkets	Aerobic bacteria	1-7.2	Within shelf life	Tsai et al 2005
outload mutately protocot win a soortandos documoso 1 0.005 Recordstant proconstant proconstant 8 7.4 0.005 Recordstant proconstant proconstant 8 7.4 9 0.005 Recordstant proconstant proconstant proconstant 8 7.4 9 0.005 Recordstant proconstant proconstant proconstant 1.4 2.5 5 9 9 0 9 1 4 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9 0 9					1		
Image: Construction of the second s		South Korea	industrially produced with a spontaneous fermentation ^{b,c}	Leuconostoc citreum	1.4	90 days	UNO ET AI., ZUUG
Image: Second and second and short with second and short with second and sec				Leuconostoc	œ		
Mission (memory and software service) Mission (memory and software service) Mission (memory and software service) Mission (memory and software service) Mission (memory and software service) Mission (memory and software service) Mission (memory and software service) Mission (memory and software service) Mission (memory and software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software software softwa				gasicomitatum)		
Conservations Conserva				Weissella	ω		
International (International (International) Lectonomise saids (International) Lectonomise saids (Inte				koreensis			
Real (online and material) with starter cutures LB 714-23 5 (she after a grantmanus termination became Real (on corrinedial (strbuture) ¹ /d Tani viets 79-8,3 4 weeks of termination Data with frame Tani viets 79-8,3 4 weeks of termination Data with frame Supermetrial Tani viets 79-8,3 4 weeks of termination Data with frame Supermetrial Supermetrial Tani viets 79-8,3 4 weeks of termination Data with frame Supermetrial Supermetrial Matherial 79-8,3 4 weeks of termination Decens (corservolian nuturally back olives) Laboratory manufactured with a sportaneous MB count 79-8,3 3 days Laboratory manufactured with a sportaneous Laboratory manufactured with a sportaneous MB count 79-8,3 3 days Laporatory manufactured with a sportaneous Laboratory manufactured with a sportaneous MB count 6 days Laporatory manufactured with a sportaneous Laboratory manufactured with a sportaneous 8 days 3 days Laporatory manufactured with a sportaneous Laboratory manufactured with a sportaneous 8 days 3 days Laporatory manufactured with a sportaneous Laboratory manufactured with a sportaneous 4 days 10 days Laporatory manufactured with a sportan				Lactobacillus sakei	7.4		
and sportareous formentations and sportareous formentations Obtained from commercial distributions ¹ a Data intervention Data intervention D			Retail (online and markets) with starter cultures	LAB	7.14–9.23	5 days after	Kim et al., 2016
Odaned from commercial distributors ¹ / ₁ Teal viable 7.9-8.3 4 weeks of termentation Imaerif Taiwerf Tai viable 7.9-8.3 4 weeks of termentation Imaerif Taiwerf Calaned from commercial distributors ¹⁰ Calaviable 7.9-8.3 4 weeks of termentation Imaerif Taiwerf Supermarkets Supermarkets Leototio bacteria 7.9 2 weeks of termentation Imaerif Taiwerf Supermarkets Leototio bacteria 7.1-7.2 Within shelf file Imaerif Latoratory manufactured with a spontaneous LAB count 8 3 days Italy Roladar and Balce-Spanish-style green olves ^{1/3} Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous LAB count 6.5 9 days Italy Roladar and Balce-Spanish-style green olves ^{1/3} Individuation Laboratory 1/4 days 1/1 days Italy Rocadar and Balce-Spanish-style green Italy spontaneous Vable cell count 6.5 2 days Italy Rocadar and Balce-Spanish-style green dives Individuation LAB count 6.5 2 days Italy Rocadar and Balce-Spanish-style green dives			and spontaneous fermentations			purchase	
Link Link <thlink< th=""> Link Link <thl< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>Obtained from commercial distributors^{b,d}</td><td>Total viable bacteria</td><td>7.9–8.3</td><td>4 weeks of fermentation</td><td>Lee et al., 2018</td></thl<></thlink<>			Obtained from commercial distributors ^{b,d}	Total viable bacteria	7.9–8.3	4 weeks of fermentation	Lee et al., 2018
d Take of the control of the contro of the contro of the contro of the control of the control of the				LAB	7.8-8.3		
d Taiwerf Tai Tai Tai d Taiwerf Supermarkets Supermarkets Tai Tai Greece (Conservolea raturally black olives) Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous LAB count 7.9 30 days Taivy (Field D) Carignola - Debtitrend green table Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous LAB count 7.9 30 days Taivy (Field D) Carignola - Debtitrend green table Commercial LAB count 7.9 30 days Taivy (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-syle green Commercial manufactured with a spontaneous LAB count 6.83-7.40 131 days Taivy (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-syle green Iduotation Urble cell count 6.83-7.40 131 days Taivy (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-syle green Taindaf rom ontinactured with a spontaneous Lacrobaci/lus 7.21-7.35 7.10 months Taivy (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-syle green table olives) Cotrained from commercial manufacturer with Lacrobaci/lus 7.21-7.35 7.10 months Portugal (Calega and Cordov) Each Cordit 6.89-6.95 7.21-7.35 7.10 months Southern Spain (Spanish-syle green olives) Industrial with a spontaneous Lacrobaci/lus 7.21-7.35 7.10 months Southern Spain (Spanish-syle green olives) Industrined with a spontaneou			Obtained from commercial distributors ^{b,e}	Total viable bacteria	7.9	4 weeks of farmantation	Lee M. et al., 2017
d Taiworf Construction Supermeteration Construction				LAB	7.8		
Greece (Conservolar naturally black olives) Latoratory manufactured with a spontaneous Lab count 7.9 30 days Iay (Bella D) Cerignola - Debittered green table olives) ^{1/3} Laboratory manufactured with a commercial statter cuture Lab count 8 30 days Iay (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-style green olives) ^{1/3} Commercial manufactured with a spontaneous statter cuture LaB count 6.5 90 days Iay (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-style green olives) ^{1/3} Iad count 6.5 90 days Iay (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-style green olives) ^{1/3} Lab count 6.5 90 days Iay (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-style green olives) ^{1/3} Datamed from commercial manufactured with a spontaneous streptococid 1.48 count 5.5 90 days Iay (Nocellara del Belice-green table olives) Industrially manufacturer with spontaneous Uable count 6.55 1.10 months Noves) ^{1/3} Lacrobacillus 7.21-7.35 1.21 days 1.21 days Portugal (Galega and Cordon) ^{1/3} Lacrobacillus 7.21-7.35 1.20 days Southern Spain (Spanish-style green olives) Iad spontaneous 1.26 days 1.20 days Iand (Galega and Cordon) ^{1/3} Iad spontaneous Lacrobacillus 5.5 1.20 days Southern Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^{1/3} Iad spontaneous 1.4.9	Mustard	Taiwan ^f	Supermarkets	Aerobic bacteria	<1.0-4.2	Within shelf life	Kung et al., 2006a
Greecs (Conservoled naturally black ofwes) Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous 20 days Iay (Bella Di Carignola -Debittered green table Laboratory manufactured with a commercial Laboratory manufactured with a commercial Laboratory manufactured with a commercial 20 days Iay (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-style green Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Laboratory wanufactured with a spontaneous Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous 8 30 days Iay (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-style green Iadoratory manufactured with a spontaneous Laboratory wanufactured with a spontaneous 128 count 7.3 7.10 months Iay (Nocellara del Belice-Green table ofwes) Iadoratory manufacturer with Laboratory manufacturer with a spontaneous 1.45 count 7.3 7.10 months Iay (Nocellara del Belice-Green table ofwes) Iadoratory manufacturer with a spontaneous Vable LAB count 1.3 1.50 days Portugal (Calega and Cordon) ¹ ¹ ¹ Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Vable LAB count 2.5 1.20 days Portugal (Calega and Cordon) ¹ ¹ ¹ Iaboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Vable LAB count 2.9 120 days Southern Spanish-style green olives) ¹ ¹ Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Vable LAB count 2.9 12	Pickles						
Induction Laboratory manufactured with a commercial stature cuture Laboratory manufactured with a commercial stature cuture Laboratory manufactured with a commercial stature cuture Lab count 5.5 90 days Interesting and belice-Spanish-style green spontaneous fermentation Lab count 5.5 90 days Interesting and belice-Spanish-style green fermentation Lab count 5.5 90 days Interesting and belice-Spanish-style green fermentation Lactobac/lus 7.21-7.35 131 days Interaction Datained from commercial manufacturer with spontaneous fermentation 1.45 7.21-7.35 Balga and Cordowl ^b Lactobac/lus 7.21-7.35 7.10 months Balga and Cordowl ^b Lactobac/lus 1.45 7.21-7.35 Spain (Spanish-style green olives) Datained from commercial manufacturer with fermentation Viable LAB count 4.9 150 days Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^b Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Viable LAB count 4.9 150 days Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^b Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobac/lus 5.5 120 days Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^b Industrially manufactured with commercial Lactobac/lus 5.9 120 days Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^b Industrially manufactured with a spontaneo	Olives	Greece (Conservolea naturally black olives)	Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	LAB count	7.9	30 days	Panagou et al., 2008
Di Cerignota -Debittered green table Commercially manufactured with a spontaneous LAB court 5.5 90 days Ilara del Belice-Spanish-style green Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Vable cell count 6.58-7.40 131 days Ilara del Belice-Spanish-style green Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Vable cell count 6.58-7.40 131 days Ilara del Belice-Spanish-style green Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Vable cell count 6.49-6.95 7.21-7.35 Ilara del Belice-green table olive) Obtained from commercial manufacturer with Lactobac/lus 7.21-7.35 7-10 months Balega and Cordovil ¹⁰ Dotained from commercial manufacturer with Lactobac/lus 7.21-7.35 7-10 months Balega and Cordovil ¹⁰ Dotained from commercial manufacturer with Lactobac/lus 14.9 7.00 days Balega and Cordovil ¹⁰ Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Viable LAB count 4.53 7-10 months Balega and Cordovil ¹⁰ Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Viable LAB count 1.90 150 days Balega and Cordovil ¹⁰ Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobac/lus 5.5 120 days Balega and Cordovil ¹⁰ Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobac/lus 5.9 120 days <tr< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>Laboratory manufactured with a commercial starter culture</td><td>LAB count</td><td>ω</td><td>30 days</td><td>Panagou et al., 2008</td></tr<>			Laboratory manufactured with a commercial starter culture	LAB count	ω	30 days	Panagou et al., 2008
Iara del Belice-Spanish-style green Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Vable cell count 6.58–7.40 131 days Iara del Belice-Spanish-style green Lactobacillus 7.21–7.35 7.21–7.35 Iara del Belice-green table olives) Datained from commercial manufacturer with Lactobacillus 7.21–7.35 Salega and Cordovil) ^b Laboratory manufacturer with Lactic 6.49–6.95 7–10 months Salega and Cordovil) ^b Laboratory manufacturer with a spontaneous Vable LAB count 4.5 7–10 months Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^b Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Vable LAB count 4.9 150 days Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^b Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobacillus 5.5 120 days Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^b Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobacillus 5.9 120 days Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^b Industrially manufactured with a commercial Lactobacillus 5.9 120 days		Italy (Bella Di Cerignola - Debittered green table olives) ^{b,g}	Commercially manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	LAB count	ວ.ວ	90 days	De Bellis et al., 2010
Lactobacillus 7,21–7,35 Lactobacillus 6,49–6,95 streptococci 6,49–6,95 Streptococci 6,49–6,95 Cobrained from commercial manufacturer with spontaneous fermentation LAB Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Viable LAB count 4,9 Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobacillus 5,5 120 days Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobacillus 5,5 120 days Industrially manufactured with commercial Lactobacillus 5,5 120 days Industrially manufactured with commercial Lactobacillus 5,9 120 days Industrially manufactured with commercial Lactobacillus 5,9 120 days		Italy (Nocellara del Belice-Spanish-style green olives) ^h	Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	Viable cell count	6.58-7.40	131 days	Aponte et al., 2012
Lactic streptococci 6.49–6.95 Obtained from commercial manufacturer with spontaneous fermentation LAB 4.53 7–10 months Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation Viable LAB count 4.9 150 days Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous <i>Lactobacillus</i> 5.5 120 days Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous <i>Lactobacillus</i> 5.5 120 days Industrially manufactured with commercial <i>Lactobacillus</i> 5.9 120 days Industrially manufactured with commercial <i>Lactobacillus</i> 5.9 120 days Industrially manufactured with commercial <i>Lactobacillus</i> 5.9 120 days				Lactobacillus	7.21-7.35		
Obtained from commercial manufacturer with spontaneous fermentation Laboratory manufacturer with a spontaneous fermentation 4.53 7–10 months spontaneous is the laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Viable LAB count 4.9 150 days is the manufactured with a spontaneous Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobacillus 5.5 120 days is the manufactured with a spontaneous Industrially manufactured with commercial Lactobacillus 5.9 120 days is the count is the concillus Industrially manufactured with commercial Lactobacillus 5.9 120 days is the count is the concillus				Lactic streptococci	6.49–6.95		
Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous Viable LAB count 4.9 150 days fermentation Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobacillus 5.5 120 days Industrially manufactured with commercial Lactobacillus 5.9 120 days		Italy (Nocellara del Belice-green table olives)	Obtained from commercial manufacturer with spontaneous fermentation	LAB	4.53	7–10 months	Romeo et al., 2012
Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous Lactobacillus 5.5 120 days fermentation Lactobacillus 5.9 120 days Industrially manufactured with commercial Lactobacillus 5.9 120 days starter culture ^D Lactobacillus 4 120 days		Portugal (Galega and Cordovi)) ^b	Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	Viable LAB count	4.9	150 days	Silva et al., 2011
Lactic cocciNVO*120 daysLactobacillus5.9120 daysLactic cocci4120 days		Southern Spain (Spanish-style green olives) ^b	Industrially manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	Lactobacillus	5.5	120 days	Ruiz-Barba and Jiménez-Díaz, 2012
Lactobacillus 5.9 120 days Lactic cocci 4 120 days				Lactic cocci	*OVN	120 days	
4			Industrially manufactured with commercial starter culture ^b	Lactobacillus	5.9	120 days	Ruiz-Barba and Jiménez-Díaz, 2012
				Lactic cocci	4	120 days	

18

TABLE 5 Continued	tinued					
Product	Region (Type)	Source/Fermentation style	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log cfu/mL or g)	Age	References
	United States (Sicilian-style green olive-colossal Sevillano olives) ^b	Commercially manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	LAB count	7.4	200 days	Golomb et al., 2013
Pickles	India ^{b,i}	Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	LAB	7.1	3 days	Singh and Ramesh, 2008
	United States ^{b,j}	Laboratory manufactured with a pure culture fermentation	P. cerevisiae	8.26–8.77	Did not specify	Etchells et al., 1964
			L. plantarum	8.72-8.96		
			L. brevis	7.79–8.45		
Sauerkraut	United States ^b	Commercially manufactured with starter culture	LAB	8.3	10 days	Johanningsmeier et al., 2004
			Heterofermentative LAB	2.7		
	United States ^b	Commercially manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	Total microbial count	2	60 days	Lu et al., 2003
			LAB	7		
	Croatiak	Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	Total microbial count	6.04	42 days	Beganović et al., 2011
			LAB	3.79	42 days	
	Finland	Large-scale manufacturing with a spontaneous fermentation	LAB	7.3	15 days	Viander et al., 2003
*NVO, No viable organisms. ^a 20 commercial products. ^b Interpreted from graph.	organisms. products. i graph.					
^c Incubation of microorganisms ^d Three seasons were analyzed	^o Incubation of microorganisms were at 15°C.					

^e 19 out of 44 Chinese cabbage samples (88 total samples using other vegetables) were provided by commercial suppliers. ¹14 CP (Commercial Products).

⁹Data from control set (no inoculation) with 8% NaCl. ¹⁰Olive from both irrigated and not irrigated fields. ¹³O cucumber samples were used. ¹Individual fermentations of each microorganism. ^kFermentations with 1.2% NaCl. counts were reported for fish sauce. LAB counts for tempeh and fermented fish were between 10^3 to 10^7 cfu/g with fermented fish being at the lower end of the range.

Fermented Cereals

Fermented porridges and gruels are widely consumed in many African countries. Here, studies were reported from Burkina Faso, Uganda, Ghana, Benin, Tanzania, and Mexico (**Table 7**). These cereals were made using pearl millet, millet, sorghum, and maize as starting grains. In general, the cereals contained LAB and mesophilic aerobic bacteria with a range of 10^5 to 10^9 cfu/g.

Beer

Several sour beer products from Belgium, such as lambic and gueuze, were included in the survey (**Table 8**). LAB counts were reported for these products, ranging from 10^2 to 10^5 cfu/g. The age of the products reported in the table refers to the longest time the beer was left to age. This maximum aging time was found to range from 40 days to 5 years across the different products.

Fermented Tea (Kombucha)

Kombucha is a fermented beverage made from sweetened tea to which a specialized culture is added. The latter is comprised of a symbiotic culture of bacteria and yeast or SCOBY, normally within a cellulose-type membrane. Bacteria commonly found in kombucha include the acetic acid bacteria belonging to the genera, Acetobacter, Gluconacetobacter, and Gluconobacter, as well as LAB. Most of the yeasts associated with kombucha are species of Saccharomyces, although other yeast genera may also be present (Teoh et al., 2004; Coton et al., 2017). While this product is now widely consumed, and manufacturers promote the presence of live microorganisms on product labels, there are few published data on the levels of microbes present in retail products. One recent study reported both bacterial and yeast counts for two kombucha products that were produced under industrial manufacturing conditions (Coton et al., 2017). In general, acetic acid bacteria levels ranged from 10^6 to 10^7 cfu/mL at the end of the fermentation, and similar counts were reported for LAB and total aerobic bacteria. Total yeast counts of about 10⁷ cfu/mL were also reported.

DISCUSSION

Food-Associated Microbes Travel and Interact in the Gut

The human gastrointestinal tract is home to more than 10¹² microbes. This diverse ecosystem provides protection against pathogens, extracts nutrients from dietary components, and modulates the immune system (Lozupone et al., 2013). The gut microbiota is also very stable, although several factors, including exposure to antibiotics, stress, and disease can disrupt this community, leading to dysbiosis (Sommer et al., 2017). The ability of diet and dietary components to modulate the gastrointestinal microbiota, redress dysbiosis, and enhance human health is now well- established (David et al., 2014; Graf et al., 2015; Sonnenburg and Bäckhed, 2016).

TABLE 6 Org	TABLE 6 Organisms present in traditional Asian fermented products separated by product.	mented products separated by produ	ct.			
Product	Region (Type)	Source	Analyzed microorganism	Count (log cfu/g)	Age	References
Fermented Fish	Japan (Funazushi – fermented sushi)	Obtained from commercial manufacturer	LAB	3.48-5.43	Does not specify	Tsuda et al., 2012
Fish Sauce	Malaysia (anchovy) ^a	Obtained from commercial manufacturer	Aerobic bacteria	4.92-5.53	6-12 months	Zaman et al., 2010
Miso	Taiwan ^b	Supermarkets	Aerobic bacteria	2.1-7.1	Within shelf life	Kung et al., 2006b
	Japan	Laboratory manufactured with a spontaneous fermentation	Aerobic bacteria	4.3	15 weeks	Onda et al., 2003
Tempeh	Netherlands	Laboratory manufactured with industrial processes and a spontaneous fermentation ^c	LAB	7.01	Does not specify	Nout et al., 1987
		Shops, production places, and restaurants ^{d,e}	LAB	0 -ෆ	24 h after purchase	Samson et al., 1987
^a 5 CP. ^b 27 CP (Commercial Products).	srcial Products).					
^c Measure of tempeh and not th ^d 81% of samples > 10^7 CFU/g. ^e 110 samples were analyzed.	^C Measure of tempeh and not the soak. ^d 81% of samples > 10 ⁷ CFU/g. ^{e 110} samnles were analyzed					

Product (Region)	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g) Grain	Grain	СР	References
Ben-saalga (Burkina Faso)	Obtained from manufacturer	Total aerobic mesophiles	7.1	Pearl millet	12	Tou et al., 2006
		LAB	7			
		Yeast	5.5			
Bushera (Uganda)	Markets	LAB	8.1-8.4	Millet	Ŋ	Muyanja et al., 2003
		LAB	8.4	Sorghum	Ω	
		LAB	8.9–9	Millet and Sorghum	Q	
Fura (Ghana)	Obtained from manufacturer	LAB	6.6-8	Does not specify	œ	Owusu-Kwarteng et al., 2012
Koko Sour Water (Ghana) ^a	Obtained from manufacturer	LAB	80	Does not specify	ო	Lei and Jakobsen, 2004
Mawè (Benin)	Market and manufacturer	Total aerobic mesophiles	8.8	Does not specify	30	Hounhouigan et al., 1993
		LAB	8.9			
		Yeast	6.4-6.9			
Pozol (Mexico) ^b	Market	Total bacteria	9.5	Does not specify	-	Omar and Ampe, 2000
		LAB	6			
Togwa (Tanzania) ^c	Obtained from manufacturer	LAB	O	Sorghum, maize, millet, and maize	36	Mugula et al., 2003
		Yeast	7			

Among the food components known to influence the composition of the microbiota are fermentable fibers and prebiotics that enrich for particular members of the gut microbiota. Another route by which the gastrointestinal microbiota may be modulated is via consumption of probioticslive microbes consumed at a dose sufficient to provide beneficial effects (Hill et al., 2014). Probiotics, however, are temporary members of the microbiome and rarely persist more than a few days (Tannock, 2003; Derrien and van Hylckama Vlieg, 2015; Zhang et al., 2016).

Perhaps the easiest and most common way to introduce potentially beneficial microbes to the gastrointestinal tract is via consumption of microbe-containing foods, and fermented foods and beverages, in particular. Like many probiotics, many microbes associated with fermented foods may also have the capacity to survive digestion, reach the gastrointestinal tract, and ultimately provide similar health benefits (Marco et al., 2017). When consumed regularly, these fermentation-associated microbes form what some researchers have called the "transient microbiome" (Derrien and van Hylckama Vlieg, 2015).

In general, the microorganisms present in fermented foods and beverages originate via one of two ways. For so-called natural or spontaneous fermented foods, the microorganisms are autochthonous and are naturally present in the raw material or manufacturing environment. To survive fermentation and processing, the LAB, yeasts, and any other microorganisms present in the finished product must manage a range of selective and competitive pressures, including salt, organic acids, ethanol, anaerobiosis, and low pH. Many of the fermented foods reviewed in this survey, including fermented cereals, sauerkraut, kimchi, and other fermented vegetables, and fermented soybased products are made by natural fermentation. In addition, many wines and even some fermented sausages and beers are made in this manner.

Other fermented foods rely on the addition of a starter cultures. Cultured dairy products, cheese, and fermented sausages are commonly made using starter cultures. When cultures are used, their selection is based on the performance characteristics specific to the product. In addition, the incubation temperature during fermentation and the nutrient content are usually well-suited to the needs of the microorganisms. In many cases, the culture is added at such high inoculum levels, there would be little competition from other organisms. Collectively, most food fermentation microorganisms are well-adapted to the food environment.

In contrast, once the organisms present in fermented foods are consumed, they become foreign or allochthonous to the gastrointestinal tract. In most cases, they lack the physiological and biochemical resources to compete in this ecological niche. If they survive transit, they do not become stable members of this community (Zhang et al., 2016). Nonetheless, the presence of food fermentation-associated microorganisms in the GI tract, even if they are just "passing through," is now well-documented (Lee et al., 1996; Walter et al., 2001; Dal Bello et al., 2003; David et al., 2014; Derrien and van Hylckama Vlieg, 2015; Zhang et al., 2016; Lisko et al., 2017).

Samples were obtained from manufacturer before fermentation.

TABLE 8 | Organisms in commercial sour beer products.

Product	Region	Source	Analyzed microorganisms	Count (log CFU/g)	Age	References
Gueuze	Belgium	Obtained from a traditional brewery	LAB	5.25–5.31	2 years	Spitaels et al., 2015a
			LAB	3.87-3.88	4 years	
			LAB	3.49-3.96	5 years	
Lambic	Belgium	Obtained from a traditional brewery ^a	LAB	3.08-4.26	24 months	Spitaels et al., 2014
		Obtained from industrial brewery	LAB	4.33-4.38	12 months	Spitaels et al., 2015b
		Obtained from two breweries ^b	LAB	2.3-2.75	40 days	Martens et al., 1991

^a Incubated at 28°C aerobically or 20°C anaerobically on MRS agar.

^bInterpreted from graph.

Evidence of Health Benefits Associated With Fermented Foods

The evidence for the potential health benefits of fermented foods is based on numerous epidemiological as well as clinical reports (reviewed in Marco and Golomb, 2016; Kok and Hutkins, in press). In general, epidemiological studies have shown that consumption of fermented foods is associated with improvements of health status or reductions in disease risk. For example, yogurt-rich diets were associated with a reduced risk of metabolic syndrome in older Mediterranean adults (Babio et al., 2015). A similar finding was reported in another large cohort study that showed cultured milk consumption reduced the risk of bladder cancer (Larsson et al., 2008). Yogurt consumption has also been associated with reduced weight gain (Mozaffarian et al., 2011). Epidemiological data also suggests that consumption of other fermented foods may be correlated to beneficial health outcomes. Consumption of kimchi and other fermented vegetables, for example, correlated with reduced incidence of asthma and atopic dermatitis in Korean adults (Park and Bae, 2016; Kim et al., 2017). Reduced risks of type 2 diabetes and high blood pressure among Japanese adults was associated with consumption of fermented soybean foods rich in phytoestrogens and bioactive peptides (Kwon et al., 2010; Nozue et al., 2017). In contrast, the large European Prospective Investigation into Cancer and Nutrition cohort study from the Netherlands reported no association between fermented foods consumption and overall mortality (Praagman et al., 2015).

Although many human clinical studies have assessed the effects of probiotic-containing fermented foods on health biomarkers, fewer randomized controlled trials (RCT) have considered fermented foods alone. Nonetheless, several reports provide evidence that fermented foods, such as kimchi, fermented soy products, and yogurt, can improve relevant biomarkers. For example, kimchi consumption improved fasting blood glucose and other metabolic syndrome symptoms in overweight and obese adults (Kim et al., 2011), and similar improvements were observed in healthy adults (Choi et al., 2013). Consumption of a fermented soybean paste also improved plasma triglyceride levels in obese adults (Lee Y. et al., 2017). Perhaps the strongest evidence is for yogurt and improved

lactose tolerance, due to *in vivo* expression and release of β -galactosidase by the yogurt culture microbes, *S. thermophilus* and *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* (Kolars et al., 1984; Martini et al., 1987; Pelletier et al., 2001; Savaiano, 2014). This is the only approved health claim approved by the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies, 2010).

As noted previously, some fermented foods could impart health benefits even in the absence of live microorganisms in the finished products. For example, in sour dough bread manufacture, LAB may express phytase enzymes that degrade phytates and therefore enhance mineral absorption (Nuobariene et al., 2015). In the manufacture of red wine, ethanol produced early in the fermentation enhances extraction of polyphenolic compounds from the grape skins. Fermented foods may also contain vitamins and other bioactive molecules produced in situ from microbial metabolism that are not present in the original food. Recently, Saubade et al. (2017) noted that folic acid deficiency is a global health problem and suggested that fermented foods could be a food-based alternative for delivering folic acid to at-risk populations. Although some LAB are able to produce modest levels of folate (Leblanc et al., 2011), amounts produced in foods may be too low to be reach required levels (Saubade et al., 2017). Thus, selection of over-producing strains, as well as combining strains with non-LAB may be necessary to enhance production of this vitamin in foods.

If present, fermentation-derived microorganisms, despite their transient nature, may yet have the potential to influence gut microbiota diversity, structure, and function (Zhang et al., 2016). Notably, they may also affect health due to their ability to out-compete pathogens for resources, produce short chain fatty acids from available carbohydrates, secrete anti-microbial agents, contribute to immune homeostasis, and produce vitamins, *in situ* (Derrien and van Hylckama Vlieg, 2015).

The Number of Fermentation-Associated Microbes Depends on Region and Product Age

In this survey, we reviewed the literature for studies that included quantitative data on microorganisms present in commercial





fermented food products. To our knowledge, this is the first time that there has been a compilation of the hundreds of previous studies that enumerated microbes in fermented foods from retail samples or commercial products. In general, most of the products for which data were available contained at least 10⁶ cells/mL or g. However, there was considerable variation depending on product age and region, and several relevant bacterial species or groups were present at less than that amount.

Although regular consumption of yogurt is often included in dietary guidelines (Smug et al., 2014), recommendations for other fermented foods rarely exist (Chilton et al., 2015). Likewise, to our knowledge, there are few guidelines for what constitutes a minimum dose of live microorganisms. The one exception is the yogurt health claim for "improved lactose tolerance" that was approved in 2010 by the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies, 2010). The claim states that yogurt should contain at least 10⁸ cfu live starter microorganisms per gram- the same count the NYA requires for the "live and active" seal, as noted above.

Even in the absence of a seal or stamp, many commercial yogurt products, as well as kefir, fermented vegetables, and miso, also provide numerical information on their labels. Recently, Derrien and van Hylckama Vlieg (2015) suggested that consumption of 10^{10} cells would be necessary to induce an effect on the microbiota and host health. This could be achieved by consuming 100 g of fermented food containing 10^8 cells/g.

According to the results reported in this survey, many commercial fermented food products would be close to meeting this requirement (**Figure 1**). However, several caveats are relevant. First, there was a wide range of reported microbial counts (over several logs) within the various product groups. Some products also reported total LAB, whereas other reported specific genera or species or as thermophilic or mesophilic. Second, for most products, enumeration relied on standard cultural methods for LAB (including medium and incubation conditions), which may have under-estimated more fastidious species. This can be attributed to the high stress conditions of fermented products that can occasionally lead to injured microorganisms that are viable but not culturable.

Finally, the age or time at which the products were analyzed also varied considerably. In general, "fresher" products had higher numbers. These would include yogurt and cultured dairy products, as well as kimchi, sauerkraut, and other fermented vegetables. The counts from the cheeses also varied widely, with the longer aged cheeses (e.g., Parmesan, Grana) consistently having the lowest counts.

Recommendation of Fermented Foods as Part of Dietary Guidelines

many cultures, fermented foods containing live In microorganisms are consumed on a regular or even daily basis (Hutkins, 2018). Based on the data reported in this survey, consumption of fermented foods would not only provide important macronutrients, they could also deliver large numbers of potentially beneficial microorganisms to the gastrointestinal tract. For example, if Korean kimchi contains 108 lactic acid bacteria per g (Table 5), and given per capita consumption of kimchi is estimated at 100 g per person per day, then the daily consumption of live microbes from kimchi alone would be 10¹⁰. Likewise, in the Netherlands, where yogurt consumption is also around 100 g per day, similar levels of microbes (i.e., 10¹⁰ cfu per day) would be ingested. These are the doses noted above that can influence the gut microbiota and provide a potential health benefit (Derrien and van Hylckama Vlieg, 2015).

Recently, the concept of "shared core benefits" was introduced to explain how and why phylogenetically related organisms

Live Organisms in Fermented Foods

could deliver similar health benefits (Sanders et al., 2018). Thus, although the microbes in fermented foods cannot, by definition, be considered probiotic, many of them are evolutionarily highly related to probiotic organisms, and they often share the same molecular mechanisms responsible for health-promoting properties in probiotic organisms. The application of various omic approaches to understand functional properties of fermentation-derived microbes will also likely reveal new attributes relevant to the health benefits these microbes may provide (Macori and Cotter, 2018).

In part, this is why several prominent groups have recommended that health care professionals should promote fermented foods containing live microbes as part of public health policy (Ebner et al., 2014; Sanders et al., 2014; Chilton et al., 2015; Bell et al., 2017; Hill et al., 2017). In particular, including fermented foods in dietary guidelines for specific populations has also been recommended. For example, Bell et al. (2018) recently suggested fermented foods should be introduced

REFERENCES

- Acton, J. C., and Dick, R. L. (1976). Composition of some commercial dry sausages. J. Food Sci. 41, 971–972. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2621.1976.tb00768_41_4.x
- Alexopoulos, A., Plessas, S., Kourkoutas, Y., Stefanis, C., Vavias, S., Voidarou, C., et al. (2017). Experimental effect of ozone upon the microbial flora of commercially produced dairy fermented products. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 246, 5–11. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2017.01.018
- Aponte, M., Blaiotta, G., La Croce, F., Mazzaglia, A., Farina, V., Settanni, L., et al. (2012). Use of selected autochthonous lactic acid bacteria for Spanish-style table olive fermentation. *Food Microbiol.* 30, 8–16. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2011.10.005
- Aquilanti, L., Santarelli, S., Silvestri, G., Osimani, A., Petruzzelli, A., and Clementi, F. (2007). The microbial ecology of a typical Italian salami during its natural fermentation. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 120, 136–145. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2007.06.010
- Ayana, I. A. A., and El-Deeb, A. M. (2016). Quality enhancement of Edam-like cheese made from goat's milk. Am. J. Food Technol. 11, 44–53. doi: 10.3923/ajft.2016.44.53
- Babio, N., Becerra-Tomas, N., Martinez-Gonzalez, M. A., Corella, D., Estruch, R., Ros, E., et al. (2015). Consumption of yogurt, low-fat milk, and other low-fat dairy products is associated with lower risk of metabolic syndrome incidence in an elderly Mediterranean population. J. Nutr. 145, 2308–2316. doi: 10.3945/jn.115.214593
- Beganović, J., Pavunc, A. L., Gjuračić, K., Špoljarec, M., Šušković, J., and Kos, B. (2011). Improved sauerkraut production with probiotic strain *Lactobacillus plantarum* L4 and Leuconostoc mesenteroides LMG 7954. J. Food Sci. 76, 124–129. doi: 10.1111/j.1750-3841.2010.02030.x
- Bell, V., Ferrão, J., and Fernandes, T. (2017). Nutritional guidelines and fermented food frameworks. *Foods* 6, 1–17. doi: 10.3390/foods6080065
- Bell, V., Ferrão, J., and Fernandes, T. (2018). Fermented food guidelines for children. J. Pediatr. Pediatr. Med. 2, 1-4.
- Birollo, G. A., Reinheimer, J. A., and Vinderola, C. G. (2000). Viability of lactic acid microflora in different types of yoghurt. *Food Res. Int.* 33, 799–805. doi: 10.1016/S0963-9969(00)00101-0
- Bouton, Y., Guyot, P., and Grappin, R. (1998). Preliminary characterization of microflora of Comté cheese. J. Appl. Microbiol. 85, 123–131. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2672.1998.00476.x
- Capita, R., Llorente-Marigómez, S., Prieto, M., and Alonso-Calleja, C. (2006). Microbiological profiles, pH, and titratable acidity of chorizo and salchichón (two Spanish dry fermented sausages) manufactured with ostrich, deer, or pork meat. J. Food Prot. 69, 1183–1189. doi: 10.4315/0362-028X-69.5.1183
- Chevallier, I., Ammor, S., Laguet, A., Labayle, S., Castanet, V., Dufour, E., et al. (2006). Microbial ecology of a small-scale facility producing traditional

to children early in life and incorporated into their everyday meal plans. In addition, regular consumption of fermented foods could be especially important for low income, resourcechallenged communities that are disproportionally susceptible to gastrointestinal infections (Kort et al., 2015).

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

SR, CK, and RH each contributed 30% to data collection. MH contributed 10% to data collection. SR, CK, and RH wrote the manuscript.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This project was funded by the National Dairy Council and facilitated by the International Scientific Association for Probiotics and Prebiotics. We thank Mary Ellen Sanders for her helpful comments.

dry sausage. Food Control 17, 446-453. doi: 10.1016/j.foodcont.2005. 02.005

- Chilton, S. N., Burton, J. P., and Reid, G. (2015). Inclusion of fermented foods in food guides around the world. *Nutrients* 7, 390–404. doi: 10.3390/nu70 10390
- Cho, J., Lee, D., Yang, C., Jeon, J., Kim, J., and Han, H. (2006). Microbial population dynamics of kimchi, a fermented cabbage product. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* 257, 262–267. doi: 10.1111/j.1574-6968.2006.00186.x
- Choi, I. H., Noh, J. S., Han, J.-S., Kim, H. J., Han, E.-S., and Song, Y. O. (2013). Kimchi, a fermented vegetable, improves serum lipid profiles in healthy young adults: randomized clinical trial. *J. Med. Food* 16, 223–229. doi: 10.1089/jmf.2012.2563
- Cocolin, L., Dolci, P., Rantsiou, K., Urso, R., Cantoni, C., and Comi, G. (2009). Lactic acid bacteria ecology of three traditional fermented sausages produced in the North of Italy as determined by molecular methods. *Meat Sci.* 82, 125–132. doi: 10.1016/j.meatsci.2009.01.004
- Cocolin, L., Manzano, M., Cantoni, C., and Comi, G. (2001). Denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis analysis of the 16S rRNA gene V1 region to monitor dynamic changes in the bacterial population during fermentation of Italian sausages. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 67, 5113–5121. doi: 10.1128/AEM.67.11.5113-5121.2001
- Comi, G., Urso, R., Iacumin, L., Rantsiou, K., Cattaneo, P., Cantoni, C., et al. (2005). Characterisation of naturally fermented sausages produced in the North East of Italy. *Meat Sci.* 69, 381–382. doi: 10.1016/j.meatsci.2004.08.007
- Commonwealth of Australia Gazette (2015). *Australia New Zealand Food Standards Code, Amendment No. 154-2015.* Commonwealth of Australia Gazette No. FSC 96.
- Coppola, R., Giagnacovo, B., Iorizzo, M., and Grazia, L. (1998). Characterization of lactobacilli involved in the ripening of soppressata molisana, a typical southern Italy fermented sausage. *Food Microbiol.* 15, 347–353. doi: 10.1006/fmic.1997.0179
- Coppola, R., Marconi, E., Rossi, F., and Dellaglio, F. (1995). Artisanal production of Naples-type salami: chemical and microbiological aspects. *Ital. J. Food Sci.* 1, 57–61.
- Coppola, R., Nanni, M., Iorizzo, M., Sorrentino, A., Sorrentino, E., Chiavari, C., et al. (2000). Microbiological characteristics of Parmigiano Reggiano cheese during the cheesemaking and the first months of the ripening. *Lait* 80, 479–490. doi: 10.1051/lait:2000139
- Coppola, S., Mauriello, G., Aponte, M., Moschetti, G., and Villani, F. (2000). Microbial succession during ripening of Naples-type salami, a southern Italian fermented sausage. *Meat Sci.* 56, 321–329. doi: 10.1016/S0309-1740(00)00046-2
- Coton, M., Pawtowski, A., Taminiau, B., Burgaud, G., Deniel, F., Coulloumme-Labarthe, L., et al. (2017). Unraveling microbial ecology of industrial-scale

Kombucha fermentations by metabarcoding and culture-based methods. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* 93:fix048. doi: 10.1093/femsec/fix048

- Cuesta, P., Fernández-Garcia, E., González de Llano, D., Montilla, A., and Rodriguez, A. (1996). Evolution of the microbiological and biochemical characteristics of Afuega'l Pitu cheese during ripening. *J. Dairy Sci.* 79, 1693–1698.
- Dal Bello, F., Walter, J., Hammes, W. P., and Hertel, C. (2003). Increased complexity of the species composition of lactic acid bacteria in human feces revealed by alternative incubation condition. *Microb. Ecol.* 45, 455–463. doi: 10.1007/s00248-003-2001-z
- David, L. A., Maurice, C. F., Carmody, R. N., Gootenberg, D. B., Button, J. E., Wolfe, B. E., et al. (2014). Diet rapidly and reproducibly alters the human gut microbiome. *Nature* 505, 559–563. doi: 10.1038/nature12820
- De Angelis, M., de Candia, S., Calasso, M. P., Faccia, M., Guinee, T. P., Simonetti, M. C., et al. (2008). Selection and use of autochthonous multiple strain cultures for the manufacture of high-moisture traditional Mozzarella cheese. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 125, 123–132. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2008.03.043
- De Bellis, P., Valerio, F., Sisto, A., Lonigro, S. L., and Lavermicocca, P. (2010). Probiotic table olives: microbial populations adhering on olive surface in fermentation sets inoculated with the probiotic strain *Lactobacillus paracasei* IMPC2.1 in an industrial plant. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 140, 6–13. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2010.02.024
- De Noni, I., Pellegrino, L., and Masotti, F. (2004). Survey of selected chemical and microbiological characteristics of (plain or sweetened) natural yoghurts from the Italian market. *Lait* 84, 421–433. doi: 10.1051/lait:2004020
- Delamare, A. P. L., de Andrade, C. C. P., Mandelli, F., Chequeller De Almeida, R., and Echeverrigaray, S. (2012). Microbiological, physico-chemical and sensorial characteristics of Serrano, an artisanal Brazilian cheese. *Food Nutr. Sci.* 3, 1068–1075. doi: 10.4236/fns.2012.38142
- Demarigny, Y., Beuvier, E., Dasen, A., and Duboz, G. (1996). Influence of raw milk microflora on the characteristics of Swiss-type cheeses. I. Evolution of microflora during ripening and characterization of facultatively heterofermentative lactobacilli. *Lait* 76, 371–387. doi: 10.1051/lait:19 96428
- Depouilly, A., Dufrene, F., Beuvier, É., and Berthier, F. (2004). Genotypic characterisation of the dynamics of the lactic acid bacterial population of Comté cheese. *Lait* 84, 155–167. doi: 10.1051/lait:2003036
- Derrien, M., and van Hylckama Vlieg, J. E. T. (2015). Fate, activity, and impact of ingested bacteria within the human gut microbiota. *Trends Microbiol.* 23, 354–366. doi: 10.1016/j.tim.2015.03.002
- Devirgiliis, C., Caravelli, A., Coppola, D., Barile, S., and Perozzi, G. (2008). Antibiotic resistance and microbial composition along the manufacturing process of Mozzarella di Bufala Campana. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 128, 378–384. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2008.09.021
- Di Cagno, R., Chaves Lòpez, C., Tofalo, R., Gallo, G., De Angelis, M., Paparella, A., et al. (2008). Comparison of the compositional, microbiological, biochemical and volatile profile characteristics of three Italian PDO fermented sausages. *Meat Sci.* 79, 223–235. doi: 10.1016/j.meatsci.2007.09.006
- Dong, Y. P., Chen, Q., Cui, S. H., and Li, F. Q. (2014). Enumeration, Genetic characterization and antimicrobial susceptibility of lactobacillus and streptococcus isolates from retail yoghurt in Beijing, China. *Biomed. Env. Sci* 27, 740–748. doi: 10.3967/bes2014.109
- Dunlap, B. S., Yu, H., and Elitsur, Y. (2009). The probiotic content of commercial yogurts in West Virginia. *Clin. Pediatr.* 48, 522–527. doi: 10.1177/0009922809331802
- Ebner, S., Smug, L. N., Kneifel, W., Salminen, S. J., and Sanders, M. E. (2014). Probiotics in dietary guidelines and clinical recommendations outside the European Union. *World J. Gastroenterol.* 20, 16095–16100. doi: 10.3748/wjg.v20.i43.16095
- EFSA Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies (2010). Scientific opinion on the substantiation of health claims related to live yoghurt cultures and improved lactose digestion. *EFSA J.* 8:1763. doi: 10.2903/j.efsa.2010.1763
- Eliskases-Lechner, F., and Ginzinger, W. (1995). The bacterial flora of surfaceripened cheeses with special regard to coryneforms. *Lait* 75, 571–584. doi: 10.1051/lait:1995644
- Ercolini, D., Hill, P. J., and Dodd, C. E. R. (2003). Bacterial community structure and location in Stilton cheese. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 69, 3540–3548. doi: 10.1128/AEM.69.6.3540-3548.2003

- Etchells, J. L., Costilow, R. N., Anderson, T. E., and Bell, T. A. (1964). Pure culture fermentation of brined cucumbers. *Appl. Microbiol.* 12, 523–535.
- Ferreira, V., Barbosa, J., Vendeiro, S., Mota, A., Silva, F., Monteiro, M. J., et al. (2006). Chemical and microbiological characterization of alheira: a typical Portuguese fermented sausage with particular reference to factors relating to food safety. *Meat Sci.* 73, 570–575. doi: 10.1016/j.meatsci.2006.02.011
- Fitzsimons, N. A., Cogan, T. M., Condon, S., and Beresford, T. (2001). Spatial and temporal distribution of non-starter lactic acid bacteria in Cheddar cheese. J. Appl. Microbiol. 90, 600–608. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2672.2001.01285.x
- Flórez, A. B., María López-Díaz, T., Alvarez-Martín, P., and Mayo, B. (2006). Microbial characterisation of the traditional Spanish blue-veined Cabrales cheese: identification of dominant lactic acid bacteria. *Eur. Food Res. Technol* 223, 503–508. doi: 10.1007/s00217-005-0230-8
- Franciosi, E., Settanni, L., Carlin, S., Cavazza, A., and Poznanski, E. (2008). A factory-scale application of secondary adjunct cultures selected from lactic acid bacteria during Puzzone di Moena cheese ripening. J. Dairy Sci. 91, 2981–2991. doi: 10.3168/jds.2007-0764
- Frye, C. P., and Kilara, A. (2016). "Regulations for product standards and labeling," in *Dairy Processing and Quality Assurance*, eds R. C. Chandan, A. Kilara, and N. P. Shah (Chichester: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd), 152–177.
- García Fontán, M. C., Lorenzo, J. M., Martínez, S., Franco, I., and Carballo, J. (2007a). Microbiological characteristics of Botillo, a Spanish traditional pork sausage. LWT Food Sci. Technol. 40, 1610–1622. doi: 10.1016/j.lwt.2006.10.007
- García Fontán, M. C., Lorenzo, J. M., Parada, A., Franco, I., and Carballo, J. (2007b). Microbiological characteristics of "androlla," a Spanish traditional pork sausage. *Food Microbiol.* 24, 52–58. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2006.03.007
- García-Cayuela, T., Tabasco, R., Peláez, C., and Requena, T. (2009). Simultaneous detection and enumeration of viable lactic acid bacteria and bifidobacteria in fermented milk by using propidium monoazide and real-time PCR. *Int. Dairy* J. 19, 405–409. doi: 10.1016/j.idairyj.2009.02.001
- Garcia, M. C., Otero, A., Garcia, M. L., and Moreno, B. (1987). Microbiological quality and composition of two types of Spanish sheep's milk cheeses (Manchego and Burgos varieties). J. Dairy Res. 54, 551–557.
- Gatti, M., Fornasari, M. E., Mucchetti, G., Addeo, F., and Neviani, E. (1999). Presence of peptidase activities in different varieties of cheese. *Lett. Appl. Microbiol.* 28, 368–372. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2672.1999.00541.x
- Gatti, M., Lindner, J. D. D., De Lorentiis, A., Bottari, B., Santarelli, M., Bernini, V., et al. (2008). Dynamics of whole and lysed bacterial cells during Parmigiano-Reggiano cheese production and ripening. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 74, 6161–6167. doi: 10.1128/AEM.00871-08
- Gebreselassie, N., Abay, F., and Beyene, F. (2016). Biochemical and molecular identification and characterization of lactic acid bacteria and yeasts isolated from Ethiopian naturally fermented buttermilk. J. Food Sci. Technol. 53, 184–196. doi: 10.1007/s13197-015-2049-z
- Genigeorgis, C., Carniciu, M., Dutulescu, D., and Farver, T. B. (1991). Growth and survival of Listeria monocytogenes in market cheeses stored at 4 to 30°C. J. Food Prot. 54, 662–668. doi: 10.4315/0362-028X-54.9.662
- Gobbetti, M., Burzigotti, R., Smacchi, E., Corsetti, A., and De Angelis, M. (1997). Microbiology and Biochemistry of Gorgonzola cheese during ripening. *Int. Dairy J.* 7, 519–529. doi: 10.1016/S0958-6946(97)00047-2
- Golomb, B. L., Morales, V., Jung, A., Yau, B., Boundy-Mills, K. L., and Marco, M. L. (2013). Effects of pectinolytic yeast on the microbial composition and spoilage of olive fermentations. *Food Microbiol.* 33, 97–106. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2012.09.004
- Gori, K., Ryssel, M., Arneborg, N., and Jespersen, L. (2013). Isolation and identification of the microbiota of Danish farmhouse and industrially produced surface-ripened cheeses. *Microb. Ecol.* 65, 602–615. doi: 10.1007/s00248-012-0138-3
- Graf, D., Di Cagno, R., Fåk, F., Flint, H. J., Nyman, M., Saarela, M., et al. (2015). Contribution of diet to the composition of the human gut microbiota. *Microb. Ecol. Health Dis.* 26:26164. doi: 10.3402/mehd.v26.26164
- Greppi, A., Ferrocino, I., La Storia, A., Rantsiou, K., Ercolini, D., and Cocolin, L. (2015). Monitoring of the microbiota of fermented sausages by culture independent rRNA-based approaches. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 212, 67–75. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2015.01.016
- Grønnevik, H., Falstad, M., and Narvhus, J. A. (2011). Microbiological and chemical properties of Norwegian kefir during storage. *Int. Dairy J.* 21, 601–606. doi: 10.1016/j.idairyj.2011.01.001

- Gueimonde, M., Delgado, S., Mayo, B., Ruas-Madiedo, P., Margolles, A., and De Los Reyes-Gavil, C. G. (2004). Viability and diversity of probiotic Lactobacillus and Bifidobacterium populations included in commercial fermented milks. *Food Res. Int.* 37, 839–850. doi: 10.1016/j.foodres.2004.04.006
- Hamann, W. T., and Marth, E. H. (1984). Survival of *Streptococcus thermophilus* and Lactobacillus bulgaricus in commercial and experimental yogurts. *J. Food Prot.* 47, 781–786. doi: 10.4315/0362-028X-47.10.781
- Hekmat, S., and Koba, L. (2006). Fermented dairy products: knowledge and consumption. Can. J. Diet. Pract. Res. 67, 199–201. doi: 10.3148/67.4.2006.199
- Hill, C., Guarner, F., Reid, G., Gibson, G. R., Merenstein, D. J., Pot, B., et al. (2014). Expert consensus document: the International Scientific Association for Probiotics and Prebiotics consensus statement on the scope and appropriate use of the term probiotic. *Nat. Rev. Gastroenterol. Hepatol.* 11, 506–514. doi: 10.1038/nrgastro.2014.66
- Hill, D., Sugrue, I., Arendt, E., Hill, C., Stanton, C., and Ross, R. P. (2017). Recent advances in microbial fermentation for dairy and health. *F1000Res.* 6:751. doi: 10.12688/f1000research.10896.1
- Hounhouigan, D. J., Nout, M. J. R., Nago, C. M., Houben, J. H., and Rombouts, F. M. (1993). Composition and microbiological and physical attributes of mawe a fermented dough from Benin. *Int. J. Food Sci. Technol.* 28, 513–517. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2621.1993.tb01300.x
- Hutkins, R. W. (2018). *Microbiology and Technology of Fermented Foods*, 2nd Edn. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley.
- Ibrahim, S. A., and Carr, J. P. (2006). Viability of bifidobacteria in commercial yogurt products in North Carolina during refrigerated storage. *Int. J. Dairy Technol.* 59, 272–277. doi: 10.1111/j.1471-0307.2006.00282.x
- Iwana, H., Masuda, H., Fujisawa, T., Suzuki, H., and Mitsuoka, T. (1993). Isolation and identification of *Bifidobacterium* spp. in commercial yogurts sold in Europe. *Bifidobact. Microflora* 12, 39–45. doi: 10.12938/bifidus1982.12.1_39
- Jayashree, S., Pushpanathan, M., Rajendhran, J., and Gunasekaran, P. (2013). Microbial diversity and phylogeny analysis of buttermilk, a fermented milk product, employing 16S rRNA-based pyrosequencing. *Food Biotechnol.* 27, 213–221. doi: 10.1080/08905436.2013.811084
- Johanningsmeier, S. D., Fleming, H. P., and Breidt, F. Jr. (2004). Malolactic activity of lactic acid bacteria during sauerkraut fermentation. J. Food Sci. 69, M222–M227. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2621.2004.tb09891.x
- Johnson, A. J. (2016). Artisanal food microbiology. Nat. Microbiol. 1:16039. doi: 10.1038/nmicrobiol.2016.39
- Jordan, K. N., and Cogan, T. M. (1993). Identification and growth of non-starter lactic acid bacteria in Irish Cheddar cheese. *Irish J. Agric. Food Res.* 32, 47–55.
- Kalamaki, M. S., and Angelidis, A. S. (2017). Isolation and molecular identification of yeasts in Greek kefir. Int. J. Dairy Technol. 70, 261–268. doi: 10.1111/1471-0307.12329
- Kesmen, Z., and Kacmaz, N. (2011). Determination of lactic microflora of kefir grains and kefir beverage by using culture-dependent and culture-independent methods. J. Food Sci. 76, M276–M283. doi: 10.1111/j.1750-3841.2011.02191.x
- Kim, D. H., Chon, J. W., Kim, H., Kim, H. S., Choi, D., Hwang, D. G., et al. (2015). Detection and enumeration of lactic acid bacteria, acetic acid bacteria and yeast in kefir grain and milk using quantitative real-time PCR. J. Food Saf. 35, 102–107. doi: 10.1111/jfs.12153
- Kim, E. K., An, S. Y., Lee, M. S., Kim, T. H., Lee, H. K., Hwang, W. S., et al. (2011). Fermented kimchi reduces body weight and improves metabolic parameters in overweight and obese patients. *Nutr. Res.* 31, 436–443. doi: 10.1016/j.nutres.2011.05.011
- Kim, H.-Y., Bong, Y.-J., Jeong, J.-K., Lee, S., Kim, B.-Y., and Park, K.-Y. (2016). Heterofermentative lactic acid bacteria dominate in Korean commercial kimchi. *Food Sci. Biotechnol.* 25, 541–545. doi: 10.1007/s10068-016-0075-x
- Kim, H. J., Ju, S., and Park, Y. K. (2017). Kimchi intake and atopic dermatitis in Korean aged 19-49 years: The Korea National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey 2010-2012. Asia Pac. J. Clin. Nutr. 26, 914–922. doi: 10.6133/apjcn.022017
- Kok, C., and Hutkins, R. W. (in press). Yogurt and other fermented foods as a source of health-promoting bacteria. *Nutr. Rev.*
- Kolars, J. C., Michael, D. L., Aouji, M., and Savaiano, D. A. (1984). Yogurt - an autodigesting source of lactose. N. Engl. J. Med. 310, 1–3. doi: 10.1056/NEJM198401053100101
- Kort, R., Westerik, N., Mariela Serrano, L., Douillard, F. P., Gottstein, W., Mukisa, I. M., et al. (2015). A novel consortium of *Lactobacillus rhamnosus* and

Streptococcus thermophilus for increased access to functional fermented foods. *Microb. Cell Fact.* 14:195. doi: 10.1186/s12934-015-0370-x

- Kosikowski, F. V. (1981). Properties of commercial flavored frozen yogurts. *J. Food Prot.* 44, 853–856. doi: 10.4315/0362-028X-44.11.853
- Kung, H. F., Lee, Y. H., Teng, D. F., Hsieh, P. C., Wei, C. I., and Tsai, Y. H. (2006a). Histamine formation by histamine-forming bacteria and yeast in mustard pickle products in Taiwan. *Food Chem.* 99, 579–585. doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem. 2005.08.025
- Kung, H. F., Tsai, Y. H., and Wei, C. I. (2006b). Histamine and other biogenic amines and histamine-forming bacteria in miso products. *Food Chem.* 101, 351–356. doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2005.12.057
- Kwon, D. Y., Daily, J. W. III, Kim, H. J., and Park, S. (2010). Antidiabetic effects of fermented soybean products on type 2 diabetes. *Nutr. Res.* 30, 1–13. doi: 10.1016/j.nutres.2009.11.004
- Larsson, S. C., Andersson, S., Johansson, J. E., and Wolk, A. (2008). Cultured milk, yogurt, and dairy intake in relation to bladder cancer risk in a prospective study of Swedish women and men. Am. J. Clin. Nutr. 88, 1083–1087. doi: 10.1093/ajcn/88.4.1083
- Laye, I., Karleskind, D., and Morr, C. V. (1993). Chemical, microbiological and sensory properties of plain nonfat yogurt. J. Food Sci. 58, 991–995. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2621.1993.tb06096.x
- Leblanc, J. G., Laiño, J. E., del Valle, M. J., Vannini, V., van Sinderen, D., Taranto, M. P., et al. (2011). B-group vitamin production by lactic acid bacteria - current knowledge and potential applications. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* 111, 1297–1309. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2672.2011.05157.x
- Lee, K. E., Cho, U. H., and Ji, G. E. (1996). Effect of kimchi intake on the composition of human large intestinal bacteria. *Korean J. Food Sci. Technol.* 28, 981–986.
- Lee, M., Song, J. H., Jung, M. Y., Lee, S. H., and Chang, J. Y. (2017). Large-scale targeted metagenomics analysis of bacterial ecological changes in 88 kimchi samples during fermentation. *Food Microbiol.* 66, 173–183. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2017.05.002
- Lee, M., Song, J. H., Lee, S. H., Jung, M. Y., and Chang, J. Y. (2018). Effect of seasonal production on bacterial communities in Korean industrial kimchi fermentation. *Food Control* 91, 381–389. doi: 10.1016/j.foodcont.2018. 04.023
- Lee, Y., Cha, Y. S., Park, Y., and Lee, M. (2017). PPARγ2 C1431T polymorphism interacts with the antiobesogenic effects of Kochujang, a Korean fermented, soybean-based red pepper paste, in overweight/obese subjects: a 12week, double-blind randomized clinical trial. *J. Med. Food* 20, 610–617. doi: 10.1089/jmf.2016.3911
- Lei, V., and Jakobsen, M. (2004). Microbiological characterization and probiotic potential of koko and koko sour water, African spontaneously fermented millet porridge and drink. J. Appl. Microbiol. 96, 384–397. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2672.2004.02162.x
- Linares, D. M., Gómez, C., Renes, E., Fresno, J. M., Tornadijo, M. E., Ross, R. P., et al. (2017). Lactic acid bacteria and bifidobacteria with potential to design natural biofunctional health-promoting dairy foods. *Front. Microbiol.* 8:846. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2017.00846
- Lisko, D., Johnston, G., and Johnston, C. (2017). Effects of dietary yogurt on the healthy human gastrointestinal (GI) microbiome. *Microorganisms* 5:E6. doi: 10.3390/microorganisms5010006
- Lopez, M. C., Medina, L. M., and Jordano, R. (1998). Survival of lactic acid bacteria in commercial frozen yogurt. J. Food Sci. 63, 706–708. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2621.1998.tb15818.x
- Lourens-Hattingh, A., and Viljoen, B. C. (2002). Survival of probiotic bacteria in South African commercial bio-yogurt. S. Afr. J. Sci. 98, 298–300. Available online at: http://hdl.handle.net/10520/EJC97483
- Lozupone, C. A., Li, M., Campbell, T. B., Flores, S. C., Linderman, D., Gebert, M. J., et al. (2013). Alterations in the gut microbiota associated with HIV-1 infection. *Cell Host Microbe* 14, 329–339. doi: 10.1016/j.chom.2013. 08.006
- Lu, Z., Breidt, F., Plengvidhya, V., and Fleming, H. P. (2003). Bacteriophage ecology in commercial sauerkraut fermentations. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 69, 3192–3202. doi: 10.1128/AEM.69.6.3192-3202.2003
- Macori, G., and Cotter, P. D. (2018). Novel insights into the microbiology of fermented dairy foods. *Curr. Opin. Biotechnol.* 49, 172–178. doi: 10.1016/j.copbio.2017.09.002

- Madkor, S. A., Tong, P. S., and El Soda, M. (2000). Ripening of Cheddar cheese with added attenuated adjunct cultures of lactobacilli. J. Dairy Sci. 83, 1684–1691. doi: 10.3168/jds.S0022-0302(00)75037-5
- Marco, M. L., and Golomb, B. L. (2016). Fermented foods, Lactobacillus, and health. *Microbe* 11, 349–354. doi: 10.1128/microbe.1 1.349.1
- Marco, M. L., Heeney, D., Binda, S., Cifelli, C. J., Cotter, P. D., Foligné, B., et al. (2017). Health benefits of fermented foods: microbiota and beyond. *Curr. Opin. Biotechnol.* 44, 94–102. doi: 10.1016/j.copbio.2016.11.010
- Martens, H., Dawoud, E., and Verachtert, H. (1991). Wort enterobacteria and other microbial populations involved during the first month of lambic fermentation. *J. Insitute Brew.* 97, 435–439. doi: 10.1002/j.2050-0416.1991.tb01082.x
- Martini, M. C., Bollweg, G. L., Levitt, M. D., and Savaiano, D. A. (1987). Lactose digestion by yogurt beta-galactosidase: influence of pH and microbial cell integrity. Am. J. Clin. Nutr. 45, 432–436. doi: 10.1093/ajcn/45.2.432
- Medina, L. M., and Jordano, R. (1994). Survival of constitutive microflora in commercially fermented milk containing bifidobacteria during refrigerated storage. J. Food Prot. 57, 731–733. doi: 10.4315/0362-028X-57.8.731
- Messens, W., Estepar-Garcia, J., Dewettinck, K., and Huyghebaert, A. (1999). Proteolysis of high-pressure-treated Gouda cheese. *Int. Dairy J.* 9, 775–782. doi: 10.1016/S0958-6946(99)00152-1
- Micanel, N., Haynes, I. N., and Playne, M. J. (1997). Viability of probiotic cultures in commercial Australian yogurts. *Aust. J. Dairy Technol.* 52, 24–27.
- Mohammadmoradi, S., Javidan, A., Kordi, J., and Goudarzi, M. H. (2015). Comparing the effect of ultra-filtered feta cheese and yoghurt as probiotic carriers on lipid profile: a double blinded randomized controlled trial. *Med. J. Nutr. Metab.* 8, 27–36. doi: 10.3233/MNM-140026
- Monfredini, L., Settanni, L., Poznanski, E., Cavazza, A., and Franciosi, E. (2012). The spatial distribution of bacteria in Grana-cheese during ripening. Syst. Appl. Microbiol. 35, 54–63. doi: 10.1016/j.syapm.2011.07.002
- Mounier, J., Goerges, S., Gelsomino, R., Vancanneyt, M., Vandemeulebroecke, K., Hoste, B., et al. (2006). Sources of the adventitious microflora of a smear-ripened cheese. J. Appl. Microbiol. 101, 668–681. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2672.2006.02922.x
- Mounier, J., Monnet, C., Jacques, N., Antoinette, A., and Irlinger, F. (2009). Assessment of the microbial diversity at the surface of Livarot cheese using culture-dependent and independent approaches. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 133, 31–37. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2009.04.020
- Moyane, J. N., and Jideani, A. I. O. (2013). The physicochemical and sensory evaluation of commercial sour milk (amasi) products. *Afr. J. Food Sci.* 7, 56–62. doi: 10.5897/AJFS12.089
- Mozaffarian, D., Hao, T., Rimm, E. B., Willett, W. C., and Hu, F. B. (2011). Changes in diet and lifestyle and long- term weight gain in women and men. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 364, 2392–2404. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa1014296
- Mugula, J. K., Nnko, S. A. M., Narvhus, J. A., and Sørhaug, T. (2003). Microbiological and fermentation characteristics of togwa, a Tanzanian fermented food. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 80, 187–199. doi: 10.1016/S0168-1605(02)00141-1
- Muyanja, C. M. B. K., Narvhus, J. A., Treimo, J., and Langsrud, T. (2003). Isolation, characterisation and identification of lactic acid bacteria from bushera: a Ugandan traditional fermented beverage. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 80, 201–210. doi: 10.1016/S0168-1605(02)00148-4
- Nout, M. J. R., de Dreu, M. A., Zuurbier, A. M., and Bonants-van Laarhoven, T. M. G. (1987). Ecology of controlled soyabean acidification for tempe manufacture. *Food Microbiol.* 4, 165–172. doi: 10.1016/0740-0020(87)90032-3
- Nozue, M., Shimazu, T., Sasazuki, S., Charvat, H., Mori, N., Mutoh, M., et al. (2017). Fermented soy product intake is inversely associated with the development of high blood pressure: the Japan public health centerbased prospective study. J. Nutr. 147, 1749–1756. doi: 10.3945/jn.117.2 50282
- Nuñez, M. (1978). Microflora of cabrales cheese: changes during maturation. J. Dairy Res. 45, 501–508. doi: 10.1017/S0022029900016721
- Nuobariene, L., Cizeikiene, D., Gradzeviciute, E., Hansen, Å. S., Rasmussen, S. K., Juodeikiene, G., et al. (2015). Phytase-active lactic acid bacteria from sourdoughs: isolation and identification. *LWT Food Sci. Technol.* 63, 766–772. doi: 10.1016/j.lwt.2015.03.018
- OBrien, K., Aryana, K., Prinyawiwatkul, W., Carabante Ordonez, K., and Boeneke, C. (2016). Short communication: the effects of frozen storage on the

survival of probiotic microorganisms found in traditionally and commercially manufactured kefir. J. Dairy Sci. 99, 7043–7048. doi: 10.3168/jds.2015-10284

- Omar, N. B., and Ampe, F. (2000). Microbial community dynamics during production of the Mexican fermented maize dough pozol. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 66, 3664–3673. doi: 10.1128/AEM.66.9.3664-3673.2000
- Onda, T., Yanagida, F., Tsuji, M., Shinohara, T., and Yokotsuka, K. (2003). Time series analysis of aerobic bacterial flora during miso fermentation. *Lett. Appl. Microbiol.* 37, 162–168. doi: 10.1046/j.1472-765X.2003.01371.x
- Owusu-Kwarteng, J., Akabanda, F., Nielsen, D. S., Tano-Debrah, K., Glover, R. L. K., and Jespersen, L. (2012). Identification of lactic acid bacteria isolated during traditional fura processing in Ghana. *Food Microbiol.* 32, 72–78. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2012.04.010
- Panagou, E. Z., Schillinger, U., Franz, C. M. A. P., and Nychas, G. J. E. (2008). Microbiological and biochemical profile of cv. conservolea naturally black olives during controlled fermentation with selected strains of lactic acid bacteria. *Food Microbiol.* 25, 348–358. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2007.10.005
- Panahi, S., Fernandez, M., Marette, A., and Tremblay, A. (2016). Yogurt, diet quality and lifestyle factors. *Eur. J. Clin. Nutr.* 71, 573–579. doi: 10.1038/ejcn.2016.214
- Papamanoli, E., Tzanetakis, N., Litopoulou-Tzanetaki, E., and Kotzekidou, P. (2003). Characterization of lactic acid bacteria isolated from a Greek dryfermented sausage in respect of their technological and probiotic properties. *Meat Sci.* 65, 859–867. doi: 10.1016/S0309-1740(02)00292-9
- Parente, E., Martuscelli, M., and Gardini, F. (2001). Evolution of microbial populations and biogenic amine production in dry sausages produced in Southern Italy. J. Appl. Microbiol. 90, 882–891. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2672.2001.01322.x
- Park, S., and Bae, J. H. (2016). Fermented food intake is associated with a reduced likelihood of atopic dermatitis in an adult population (Korean National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey 2012-2013). *Nutr. Res.* 36, 125–133. doi: 10.1016/j.nutres.2015.11.011
- Pelletier, X., Laure-Boussuge, S., and Donazzolo, Y. (2001). Hydrogen excretion upon ingestion of dairy products in lactose- intolerant male subjects : importance of the live flora. *Eur. J. Clin. Nutr.* 55, 509–512. doi: 10.1038/sj.ejcn.1601169
- Pisacane, V., Callegari, M. L., Puglisi, E., Dallolio, G., and Rebecchi, A. (2015). Microbial analyses of traditional Italian salami reveal microorganisms transfer from the natural casing to the meat matrix. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 207, 57–65. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2015.04.029
- Pisano, M. B., Scano, P., Murgia, A., Cosentino, S., and Caboni, P. (2016). Metabolomics and microbiological profile of Italian mozzarella cheese produced with buffalo and cow milk. *Food Chem.* 192, 618–624. doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2015.07.061
- Połka, J., Rebecchi, A., Pisacane, V., Morelli, L., and Puglisi, E. (2015). Bacterial diversity in typical Italian salami at different ripening stages as revealed by highthroughput sequencing of 16S rRNA amplicons. *Food Microbiol.* 46, 342–356. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2014.08.023
- Poveda, J. M., Sousa, M. J., Cabezas, L., and McSweeney, P. L. H. (2003). Preliminary observations on proteolysis in Manchego cheese made with a defined-strain starter culture and adjunct starter (*Lactobacillus plantarum*) or a commercial starter. *Int. Dairy J.* 13, 169–178. doi: 10.1016/S0958-6946(02)00150-4
- Praagman, J., Dalmeijer, G. W., van der Schouw, Y. T., Soedamah-Muthu, S. S., Monique Verschuren, W. M., Bas Bueno-de-Mesquita, H., et al. (2015). The relationship between fermented food intake and mortality risk in the European prospective investigation into cancer and nutrition-Netherlands cohort. *Br. J. Nutr.* 113, 498–506. doi: 10.1017/S00071145140 03766
- Rantsiou, K., Urso, R., Dolci, P., Comi, G., and Cocolin, L. (2008). Microflora of feta cheese from four Greek manufacturers. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 126, 36–42. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2008.04.031
- Rantsiou, K., Urso, R., Iacumin, L., Cantoni, C., Cattaneo, P., Comi, G., et al. (2005). Culture-dependent and -independent methods to investigate the microbial ecology of Italian fermented sausages. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 71, 1977–1986. doi: 10.1128/AEM.71.4.1977-1986.2005
- Ravula, R. R., and Shah, N. P. (1998). Selective enumeration of *Lactobacillus casei* from yogurts and fermented milk drinks. *Biotechnol. Tech.* 12, 819–822. doi: 10.1023/A:1008829004888

- Rebecchi, A., Crivori, S., Sarra, P. G., and Cocconcelli, P. S. (1998). Physiological and molecular techniques for the study of bacterial community development in sausage fermentation. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* 84, 1043–1049. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2672.1998.00442.x
- Renye, J. A., Somkuti, G. A., Vallejo-Cordoba, B., Van Hekken, D. L., and Gonzalez-Cordova, A. F. (2008). Characterization of the microflora isolated from *Queso fresco* made from raw and pasteurized milk. *J. Food Saf.* 28, 59–75. doi: 10.1111/j.1745-4565.2007.00095.x
- Romeo, F. V., Piscopo, A., Mincione, A., and Poiana, M. (2012). Quality evaluation of different typical table olive preparations (cv Nocellara del Belice). *Grasas y Aceites* 63, 19–25. doi: 10.3989/gya.058511
- Ruiz-Barba, J. L., and Jiménez-Díaz, R. (2012). A novel Lactobacillus pentosuspaired starter culture for Spanish-style green olive fermentation. Food Microbiol. 30, 253–259. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2011.11.004
- Samelis, J., and Kakouri, A. (2007). Microbial and safety qualities of PDO Galotyri cheese manufactured at the industrial or artisan scale in Epirus, Greece. *Ital. J. Food Sci.* 19, 81–90.
- Samelis, J., Stavropoulos, S., Kakouri, A., and Metaxopoulos, J. (1994). Quantification and characterization of microbial populations associated with naturally fermented Greek dry salami. *Food Microbiol.* 11, 447–460. doi: 10.1006/fmic.1994.1050
- Samson, R. A., Van Kooij, J. A., and De Boer, E. (1987). Microbiological quality of commercial tempeh in the Netherlands. J. Food Prot. 50, 92–94. doi: 10.4315/0362-028X-50.2.92
- Sanders, M. E., Benson, A., Lebeer, S., Merenstein, D. J., and Klaenhammer, T. R. (2018). Shared mechanisms among probiotic taxa: implications for general probiotic claims. *Curr. Opin. Biotechnol.* 49, 207–216. doi: 10.1016/j.copbio.2017.09.007
- Sanders, M. E., Lenoir-Wijnkoop, I., Salminen, S., Merenstein, D. J., Gibson, G. R., Petschow, B. W., et al. (2014). Probiotics and prebiotics: prospects for public health and nutritional recommendations. *Ann. N. Y. Acad. Sci.* 1309, 19–29. doi: 10.1111/nyas.12377
- Santarelli, M., Bottari, B., Lazzi, C., Neviani, E., and Gatti, M. (2013). Survey on the community and dynamics of lactic acid bacteria in Grana Padano cheese. *Syst. Appl. Microbiol.* 36, 593–600. doi: 10.1016/j.syapm.2013.04.007
- Saubade, F., Hemery, Y. M., Guyot, J. P., and Humblot, C. (2017). Lactic acid fermentation as a tool for increasing the folate content of foods. *Crit. Rev. Food Sci. Nutr.* 57, 3894–3910. doi: 10.1080/10408398.2016.1192986
- Savaiano, D. A. (2014). Lactose digestion from yogurt: mechanism and relevance. Am. J. Clin. Nutr. 99, 1251S-1255S. doi: 10.3945/ajcn.113.073023
- Schmidt, K. A., Kim, J., and Jeon, I. J. (1997). Composition of carbohydrates and concentration of β-galactosidase of commercial frozen yogurt. J. Food Qual. 20, 349–358. doi: 10.1111/j.1745-4557.1997.tb00478.x
- Scourboutakos, M. J., Franco-Arellano, B., Murphy, S. A., Norsen, S., Comelli, E. M., and L'Abbé, M. R. (2017). Mismatch between probiotic benefits in trials versus food products. *Nutrients* 9:E400. doi: 10.3390/nu9040400.
- Shah, N. P., Ali, J. F., and Ravula, R. R. (2000). Populations of Lactobacillus acidophilus, Bifidobacterium spp., and Lactobacillus casei in commercial fermented milk products. Biosci. Microflora 19, 35–39. doi: 10.12938/bifidus1996.19.35
- Shah, N. P., Lankaputhra, W. E. V., Britzb, M. L., and Kyle, W. S. A. (1995). Survival of *Lactobacillus acidophilus* and Bifidobacterium bifidum in commercial yoghurt during refrigerated storage. *Int. Dairy J.* 5, 515–521. doi: 10.1016/0958-6946(95)00028-2
- Shin, H. S., Lee, J. H., Pestka, J. J., and Ustunol, Z. (2000). Viability of bifidobacteria in commercial dairy products during refrigerated storage. J. Food Prot. 63, 327–331. doi: 10.4315/0362-028X-63.3.327
- Silva, T., Reto, M., Sol, M., Peito, A., Peres, C. M., Peres, C., et al. (2011). Characterization of yeasts from Portuguese brined olives, with a focus on their potentially probiotic behavior. *LWT Food Sci. Technol.* 44, 1349–1354. doi: 10.1016/j.lwt.2011.01.029
- Silvestri, G., Santarelli, S., Aquilanti, L., Beccaceci, A., Osimani, A., Tonucci, F., et al. (2007). Investigation of the microbial ecology of Ciauscolo, a traditional Italian salami, by culture-dependent techniques and PCR-DGGE. *Meat Sci.* 77, 413–423. doi: 10.1016/j.meatsci.2007.04.015
- Singh, A. K., and Ramesh, A. (2008). Succession of dominant and antagonistic lactic acid bacteria in fermented cucumber: insights from a PCR-based approach. *Food Microbiol.* 25, 278–287. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2007.10.010

- Slashinski, M. J., McCurdy, S. A., Achenbaum, L. S., Whitney, S. N., and McGuire, A. L. (2012). "Snake-oil," "quack medicine," and "industrially cultured organisms:" biovalue and the commercialization of human microbiome research. *BMC Med. Ethics* 13:28. doi: 10.1186/1472-6939-13-28
- Smug, L. N., Salminen, S., Sanders, M. E., and Ebner, S. (2014). Yoghurt and probiotic bacteria in dietary guidelines of the member states of the European Union. *Benef. Microbes* 5, 61–66. doi: 10.3920/BM2013.0050
- Sommer, F., Anderson, J. M., Bharti, R., Raes, J., and Rosenstiel, P. (2017). The resilience of the intestinal microbiota influences health and disease. *Nat. Microbiol.* 15, 630–638. doi: 10.1038/nrmicro.2017.58
- Sonnenburg, J. L., and Bäckhed, F. (2016). Diet-microbiota interactions as moderators of human metabolism. *Nature* 535, 56-64. doi: 10.1038/nature18846
- Spitaels, F., Kerrebroeck, S., Snauwaert, I., Aerts, M., and Landschoot, A., et al. (2015a). Microbiota and metabolites of aged bottled gueuze beers converge to the same composition. *Food Microbiol.* 47, 1–11. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2014.10.004
- Spitaels, F., Wieme, A. D., Janssens, M., Aerts, M., Daniel, H. M., Van Landschoot, A., et al. (2014). The microbial diversity of traditional spontaneously fermented lambic beer. *PLoS ONE* 9:e95384. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone. 0095384
- Spitaels, F., Wieme, A. D., Janssens, M., Aerts, M., Van Landschoot, A., De Vuyst, L., et al. (2015b). The microbial diversity of an industrially produced lambic beer shares members of a traditionally produced one and reveals a core microbiota for lambic beer fermentation. *Food Microbiol.* 49, 23–32. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2015.01.008
- Stanczak, M., and Heuberger, R. (2009). Assessment of the knowledge and beliefs regarding probiotic use. Am. J. Heal. Educ. 40, 207–211. doi: 10.1080/19325037.2009.10599095
- Talwalkar, A., and Kailasapathy, K. (2004). Comparison of selective and differential media for the accurate enumeration of strains of *Lactobacillus acidophilus*, *Bifidobacterium* spp. and Lactobacillus casei complex from commercial yoghurts. *Int. Dairy J.* 14, 143–149. doi: 10.1016/S0958-6946(03)00172-9
- Tamang, J. P., Watanabe, K., and Holzapfel, W. H. (2016). Review: diversity of microorganisms in global fermented foods and beverages. *Front. Microbiol.* 7:377. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2016.00377
- Tannock, G. W. (2003). Probiotics: time for a dose of realism. Curr. Issues Intest. Microbiol. 4, 33–42. doi: 10.3920/BM2016.0140
- Teoh, A. L., Heard, G., and Cox, J. (2004). Yeast ecology of Kombucha fermentation. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 95, 119–126. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2003.12.020
- Tharmaraj, N., and Shah, N. P. (2003). Selective enumeration of Lactobacillus delbrueckii ssp. bulgaricus, Streptococcus thermophilus, Lactobacillus acidophilus, Bifidobacteria, Lactobacillus casei, Lactobacillus rhamnosus, and Propionibacteria. J. Dairy Sci. 86, 2288–2296. doi: 10.3168/jds.S0022-0302(03)73821-1
- Tieszen, K. M., and Baer, R. J. (1989). Composition and microbiological quality of frozen yogurts. *Cult. Dairy Prod. J.* 24, 11–14.
- Tornadijo, M., Fresno, J., Bernardo, A., Martin Sarmiento, R., and Carballo, J. (1995). Microbiological changes throughout the manufacturing and ripening of a Spanish goat's raw milk cheese (Armada variety). *Lait* 75, 551–570.
- Tou, E. H., Guyot, J. P., Mouquet-Rivier, C., Rochette, I., Counil, E., Traoré, A. S., et al. (2006). Study through surveys and fermentation kinetics of the traditional processing of pearl millet (*Pennisetum glaucum*) into ben-saalga, a fermented gruel from Burkina Faso. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 106, 52–60. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2005.05.010
- Tsai, Y. H., Kung, H. F., Lin, Q. L., Hwang, J. H., Cheng, S. H., Wei, C. I., et al. (2005). Occurrence of histamine and histamineforming bacteria in kimchi products in Taiwan. *Food Chem.* 90, 635–641. doi: 10.1016/j.foodchem.2004.04.024
- Tsuda, H., Kubota, K., Matsumoto, T., and Ishimi, Y. (2012). Isolation and identification of Lactic Acid Bacteria in traditional fermented sushi, Funazushi, from Japan. *Food Sci. Technol. Res.* 18, 77–82. doi: 10.3136/fstr. 18.77
- Van Hoorde, K., Verstraete, T., Vandamme, P., and Huys, G. (2008). Diversity of lactic acid bacteria in two Flemish artisan raw milk Gouda-type cheeses. *Food Microbiol.* 25, 929–935. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2008.06.006
- Vasavada, P. C., and White, C. H. (1979). Quality of commercial buttermilk. J. Dairy Sci. 62, 802–806. doi: 10.3168/jds.S0022-0302(79)83329-9

- Viander, B., Aki, M. M., and Palva, A. (2003). Impact of low salt concentration, salt quality on natural large-scale sauerkraut fermentation. *Food Microbiol.* 20, 391–395. doi: 10.1016/S0740-0020(02) 00150-8
- Viljoen, B. C., Khoury, A. R., and Hattingh, A. (2003). Seasonal diversity of yeasts associated with white-surface mould-ripened cheeses. *Food Res. Int.* 36, 275–283. doi: 10.1016/S0963-9969(02)00 169-2
- Vinderola, C. G., and Reinheimer, J. A. (2000). Enumeration of Lactobacillus casei in the presence of L. acidophilus bifidobacteria and lactic starter bacteria in fermented dairy products. Int. Dairy, J. 10, 271–275. doi: 10.1016/S0958-6946(00)00045-5
- Walter, J., Hertel, C., Tannock, G. W., Lis, C. M., Munro, K., and Hammes, W. P. (2001). Detection of Lactobacillus, Pediococcus, Leuconostoc, and Weissella species in human feces by using groupspecific PCR primers and denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 67, 2578–2585. doi: 10.1128/AEM.67.6.2578-258 5.2001
- Welthagen, J. J., and Viljoen, B. C. (1998). Yeast profile in Gouda cheese during processing and ripening. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 41, 185–194. doi: 10.1016/S0168-1605(98)00042-7
- Yeung, P. S. M., Sanders, M. E., Kitts, C. L., Cano, R., and Tong, P. S. (2002). Species-specific identification of commercial probiotic

strains. J. Dairy Sci. 85, 1039-1051. doi: 10.3168/jds.S0022-0302(02)7 4164-7

- Yunita, D., and Dodd, C. E. R. (2018). Microbial community dynamics of a blueveined raw milk cheese from the United Kingdom. *J. Dairy Sci.* 101, 4923–4935. doi: 10.3168/jds.2017-14104
- Zaman, M. Z., Bakar, F. A., Selamat, J., and Bakar, J. (2010). Occurrence of biogenic amines and amines degrading bacteria in fish sauce. *Czech J. Food Sci.* 28, 440–449. doi: 10.17221/312/2009-CJFS
- Zhang, C., Derrien, M., Levenez, F., Brazeilles, R., Ballal, S. A., Kim, J., et al. (2016). Ecological robustness of the gut microbiota in response to ingestion of transient food-borne microbes. *ISME J.* 10, 2235–2245. doi: 10.1038/ismej.2016.13

Conflict of Interest Statement: The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Copyright © 2018 Rezac, Kok, Heermann and Hutkins. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.