



The Effects of Sports Drinks During High-Intensity Exercise on the Carbohydrate Oxidation Rate Among Athletes: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

Xudong Li¹, Wanxia Wang², Rui Guo², Anqi Wang² and Chaojun Wei^{2*}

¹ Department of Physical Education, Lanzhou University, Lanzhou, China, ² The Institute of Clinical Research and Translational Medicine, Gansu Provincial Hospital, Lanzhou, China

Background: This study examines the effects of sports drinks ingestion during high-intensity exercise for carbohydrate oxidation rate (CHO-O) among athletes.

Methods: PubMed, Embase, and the Cochrane library were searched for available papers published up to November 2019. The primary outcome is the carbohydrate

OPEN ACCESS

Edited by:

Beat Knechtle, University Hospital Zurich, Switzerland

Reviewed by:

Rania A. Mekary, MCPHS University, United States Vladimir Lj Jakovljevic, University of Kragujevac, Serbia

> ***Correspondence:** Chaojun Wei

weichaojun-GSPH@hotmail.com

Specialty section:

This article was submitted to Exercise Physiology, a section of the journal Frontiers in Physiology

Received: 19 June 2020 Accepted: 14 October 2020 Published: 11 December 2020

Citation:

Li X, Wang W, Guo R, Wang A and Wei C (2020) The Effects of Sports Drinks During High-Intensity Exercise on the Carbohydrate Oxidation Rate Among Athletes: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. Front. Physiol. 11:574172. doi: 10.3389/fphys.2020.574172 oxidation rate (CHO-O), and the secondary outcome is the fat oxidation rate (Fat-O). Statistical heterogeneity among the included studies was evaluated using Cochran's Q test and the I² index. The random-effects model was used for all analyses, regardless of the I² index. **Results:** Five studies are included, with a total of 58 participants (range, 8–14/study). All five studies are randomized crossover trials. Compared to the control beverages, sports

Results: Five studies are included, with a total of 58 participants (range, 8–14/study). All five studies are randomized crossover trials. Compared to the control beverages, sports drinks have no impact on the CHO-O of athletes [weighted mean difference (WMD) = 0.29; 95% CI, -0.06 to 0.65, P = 0.106; $I^2 = 97.4\%$, P < 0.001] and on the Fat-O of athletes (WMD = -0.074; 95% CI, -0.19 to 0.06, P = 0.297; $I^2 = 97.5\%$, P < 0.001). Carbohydrate–electrolyte solutions increase CHO-O (WMD = 0.47; 95% CI, 0.08–0.87, P = 0.020; $I^2 = 97.8\%$, P < 0.001) but not Fat-O (WMD = -0.14; 95% CI, -0.31 to 0.03, P = 0.103; $I^2 = 98.2\%$, P < 0.001). Caffeine has a borderline effect on Fat-O (WMD = 0.05; 95% CI, 0.00–0.10, P = 0.050).

Conclusions: Compared with the control beverages, sports drinks show no significant improvement in CHO-O and Fat-O in athletes. Carbohydrate–electrolyte solutions increase CHO-O in athletes but not Fat-O.

Keywords: dietary carbohydrates, lipids, oxidation, energy drinks, athletes, meta-analysis

INTRODUCTION

Energy drinks, also denominated as sports drinks, generally refer to a class of beverages containing sugar and various combinations of ingredients purported to "energize" the body and mind. Such drinks have become widespread in recreational and elite athletes due to their proposed ergogenic effects. A variety of energy drinks are designed to have optimal levels of carbohydrate (CHO)

1

for glycogen replenishment and electrolytes for ion maintenance and prevention of dehydration. They are currently available on the market and are publicized to increase the energy level of the individuals consuming them (Rahnama et al., 2010). Because sports drinks are well recognized for their effect of delaying fatigue during prolonged exercise, various studies have been performed to investigate their performance-enhancing mechanisms (Ishak et al., 2012; Salinero et al., 2014; Shearer and Graham, 2014; Alsunni, 2015).

A previous study has demonstrated that the rate of carbohydrate absorption could exceed 1.2 g/min during exercise when only glucose is fed (Jeukendrup, 2017). Moreover, by ingesting mixtures of glucose and fructose, exogenous carbohydrate oxidation (CHO-O) rates have been demonstrated to increase 1.2-1.7-fold during prolonged exercise (Jentjens and Jeukendrup, 2005). Those studies indicate the efficacy of carbohydrate ingestion for enhancing performance during exercise. Other studies have also investigated the effect of sports drinks on performance during exercise (Byars et al., 2010; Rahnama et al., 2010; Hornsby, 2011; Brink-Elfegoun et al., 2014; Orru et al., 2018). Elite athletes represent a special population in whom the basal metabolism and energy utilization during exercise are different from that of the general population (Sjodin et al., 1996; Koshimizu et al., 2012; Trexler et al., 2014). In addition, the available studies about sports drinks in athletes report conflicting results.

With the recent public interest in the accuracy of the claims of commercially available sports drinks about their benefits for substrate oxidation among athletes, the present meta-analysis is designed to examine the effects of sports drinks ingestion on CHO-O rate among athletes.

METHODS

Literature Search

This meta-analysis was conducted according to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines. Relevant articles were searched using the PICO principle, followed by screening on the basis of the inclusion and exclusion criteria: (1) population—elite athletes with high-endurance prolonged exercise; (2) interventions—sports drink; (3) control placebo or no control group; (4) study type—cohort study, randomized control trial, case–control study, and crossover study; and (5) language was limited to English. PubMed, Embase, and the Cochrane library were searched for available papers published up to November 2019 using the MeSH keywords "Energy drinks," "Athletes," as well as relevant keywords.

Data Extraction

Study characteristics (authors, year of publication, the country where the study performed, study design, disease type, and sample size), treatment parameters (beverage type and volume of ingestion), the primary outcome (CHO-O), and secondary outcome [fat oxidation rate (Fat-O)] were extracted from the included studies. The selection and

inclusion of studies were performed in two stages by two independent reviewers (Anqi Wang and Wanxia Wang). This included the analysis of titles/abstracts, followed by the full texts. Disagreements were resolved by a third reviewer (Rui Guo).

Quality of the Evidence

The level of evidence of all articles was assessed independently by two authors (Xudong Li and Chaojun Wei), using the Cochrane tool for assessing the risk of bias, as specified in the Cochrane Handbook (Higgins et al., 2019).

Data Synthesis

Three out of five included studies poorly reported their statistical parameters, and thus, we decided to estimate the means from the provided figures and standard deviations for means of outcome value by using the coefficient of variance (CV) (Jacobs and Viechtbauer, 2017). After excluding studies with imputed standard deviations for all different outcome parameters, the estimates were reasonably robust for standard deviation.

Statistical Analysis

All analyses were performed using the STATA SE 14.0 software (StataCorp, College Station, TX, USA). Weighted mean difference (WMD) and corresponding 95% confidence intervals (CIs) were used to compare the outcomes. Statistical heterogeneity among the included studies was evaluated using Cochran's Q test and the I² index. I² > 50% and P < 0.10 in the Q test indicated high heterogeneity. The randomeffects model was used for all analyses, regardless of the I² index. P < 0.05 are considered statistically significant. We planned to assess potential publication bias by funnel plots and Egger's test but actually did not do so because the number of studies included in every meta-analysis is fewer than 10, in which case, the funnel plots and Egger's test could yield misleading results and are not recommended (Higgins and Green, 2011).

RESULTS

Study Selection

Figure 1 presents the study selection process. A total of 234 records were retrieved from PubMed, Embase, and the Cochrane Library, and 154 records were left after removing the duplicates. Two records were excluded because they were note/report, six because they were conference abstracts, and five because they were reviews. Then, 141 full-text papers were assessed, and 136 were excluded because of the publication type (n = 3), study aim or design (n = 11), study population (n = 7), exposures (n = 58), and outcomes (n = 57). Therefore, five studies (Clarke et al., 2005; Hodgson et al., 2013b; Roberts et al., 2014; Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018; Pettersson et al., 2019) are included in the present meta-analysis. Some studies fell short in terms of quality, owing to small numbers of participants, unclear reporting of study methods, and reporting of data in a format that was not easy to combine with other data.



Characteristics of the Included Studies

Table 1 presents the characteristics of the five studies (Clarke et al., 2005; Hodgson et al., 2013b; Roberts et al., 2014; Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018; Pettersson et al., 2019). There were a total of 58 participants (range, 8–14/study). All five studies are randomized crossover trials. Three studies used a carbohydrate-electrolyte solution (500, 270, and 220 ml), one used caffeine (600 ml), and one used beetroot juice (70 ml). The participants' mean age ranges from 25 ± 3 to 41 ± 7 years. All five studies report the CHO-O and Fat-O. All five trials are from Europe.

Supplementary Table 1 presents the Cochrane criteria for the evaluation of randomized controlled trials. All included studies (Clarke et al., 2005; Hodgson et al., 2013b; Roberts et al., 2014; Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018; Pettersson et al., 2019) have a high risk of selection bias regarding the randomization, two studies (Clarke et al., 2005; Pettersson et al., 2019) have a high risk of selection bias regarding allocation concealment, and one study (Hodgson et al., 2013b) has a high risk of performance bias regarding the blinding of the participants and personnel.

ReferencesCountryStudy designType of beverage per testConsumptionFortamentTotalTreatmentControlMaleMana age (years)OutonClarke et al. (2005)United KingdomRandomizedCarbohydrate500 mlSoccer12121225 ± 3CHOClarke et al. (2014)United KingdomRandomizedCarbohydrate500 mlSoccer12121225 ± 3CHOClarke et al. (2014)United KingdomRandomizedCarbohydrate-270 mlCycling88NR41 ± 7Fat-Roberts et al. (2014)United KingdomRandomizedCarbohydrate-270 mlCycling14141431.8 ± 10CHORoberts et al. (2014)United KingdomRandomizedCarbohydrate-270 mlCycling14141431.8 ± 10CHORoberts et al. (2013)United KingdomRandomizedRentoriulee270 mlCycling1212121325.2 ± 5CHORotarsho-CastanoSpainRandomizedCarbohydrate20 mlSi12121212625.2 ± 5CHORotarshoreRandomizedCarbohydrate20 mlSi12121212625.2 ± 5CHORotarshoreRentonicedRandomizedCarbohydrate20 mlSi121212625.2 ± 5CHORotarshoreRentonicedRandomized <td< th=""><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th>Sample size</th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th></td<>								Sample size				
Clarke et al. (2005) United Kingdom Randomized Carbohydrate 500 ml Soccer 12 12 12 25 ± 3 CHO Hodgson et al. United Kingdom Randomized Carbohydrate 600 ml Cycling 8 8 NR 41 ± 7 CHO 2013a,b) United Kingdom Randomized Carbohydrate 270 ml Cycling 8 8 8 NR 41 ± 7 CHO 2013a,b) United Kingdom Randomized Carbohydrate 270 ml Cycling 14 14 14 31.8 ± 10 CHO Roberts et al. (2014) United Kingdom Randomized Carbohydrate 270 ml Cycling 14 14 14 31.8 ± 10 CHO Roberts et al. (2014) United Kingdom Randomized Carbohydrate 270 ml Cycling 14 14 14 31.8 ± 10 CHO Garaccho-Castano Spain Randomized Carbohydrate 20 ml Cycling 12 12 12 39.3 ± 7.5 CHO Returnson et al. (2018) Sweden Randomized	References	Country	Study design	Type of beverage	Consumption per test	Sports	Total	Treatment	Control	Male	Mean age (years)	Outcome of interest
Hodgson et al.United KingdomRandomizedCaffeine600 mlCycling888NR41 ± 7CHO(2013a,b)crossovercrossovercrossoverCarbohydrate-270 mlCycling1414141431.8 ± 10CHORoberts et al. (2014)United KingdomRandomizedCarbohydrate-270 mlCycling1414141431.8 ± 10CHORoberts et al. (2014)United KingdomRandomizedCarbohydrate-270 mlCycling1414141431.8 ± 10CHORoberts et al. (2014)NationRandomizedBeetroot juice70 mlCycling12121239.3 ± 7.5CHOGaracho-CastanoSpainRandomizedBeetroot juice70 mlCycling12121239.3 ± 7.5CHOGaracho-CastanoSpainRandomizedCarbohydrate220 mlSki12121239.3 ± 7.5CHOPetterson et al. (2019)SwedenRandomizedCarbohydrate220 mlSki1212625.2 ± 5CHOPetterson et al. (2019)SwedenRandomizedCarbohydrate220 mlSki121212625.2 ± 5CHOPetterson et al. (2019)SwedenRandomizedBectrolyte solution211212126CHOPetterson et al. (2019)SwedenRandomizedRandomizedRandomized20 ml <td< td=""><td>Clarke et al. (2005)</td><td>United Kingdom</td><td>Randomized crossover</td><td>Carbohydrate electrolyte solution</td><td>500 ml</td><td>Soccer</td><td>12</td><td>12</td><td>12</td><td>12</td><td>25 ± 3</td><td>CHO-O, Fat-O</td></td<>	Clarke et al. (2005)	United Kingdom	Randomized crossover	Carbohydrate electrolyte solution	500 ml	Soccer	12	12	12	12	25 ± 3	CHO-O, Fat-O
Boberts et al. (2014) United Kingdom Randomized Carbohydrate- 270 ml Cycling 14 14 14 31.8 ± 10 CHO. Rat- crossover electrolyte solution solution 53.8 ± 7.5 CHO. Garnacho-Castano Spain Randomized Beetroot juice 70 ml Cycling 12 12 12 39.3 ± 7.5 CHO. Fat- stal. (2018) crossover Carbohydrate 220 ml Ski 12 12 12 39.3 ± 7.5 CHO. Pettersson et al. (2019) Sweden Randomized Carbohydrate 220 ml Ski 12 12 12 32.3 ± 7.5 CHO. Pettersson et al. (2019) Sweden Randomized Carbohydrate 220 ml Ski 12 12 6 25.2 ± 5 CHO.	Hodgson et al. (2013a,b)	United Kingdom	Randomized crossover	Caffeine	600 ml	Cycling	Ø	ω	œ	RN	41 ± 7	CHO-O, Fat-O
Garnacho-Castano Spain Randomized Beetroot juice 70ml Cycling 12 12 12 39.3 ± 7.5 CHO et al. (2018) crossover crossover Carbohydrate 220ml Ski 12 12 6 25.2 ± 5 CHO Pettersson et al. (2019) Sweden Randomized Carbohydrate 220ml Ski 12 12 6 25.2 ± 5 CHO Fattersson et al. (2019) Sweden Rendomized Carbohydrate 220ml Ski 12 12 6 25.2 ± 5 CHO	Roberts et al. (2014)	United Kingdom	Randomized crossover	Carbohydrate- electrolyte solution	270 ml	Cycling	14	14	14	14	31.8 ± 10	CHO-O, Fat-O
Pettersson et al. (2019) Sweden Randomized Carbohydrate 220 ml Ski 12 12 12 6 25.2 ± 5 CHO- crossover electrolyte solution 12 12 12 6 Fat-	Garnacho-Castano et al. (2018)	Spain	Randomized crossover	Beetroot juice	70 ml	Cycling	12	12	12	12	39.3 ± 7.5	CHO-O, Fat-O
	Pettersson et al. (2019)	Sweden	Randomized crossover	Carbohydrate electrolyte solution	220 ml	Ski	12	12	12	9	25.2 ± 5	CHO-O, Fat-O

Sports Drinks Have No Significant Effect on CHO-O

All five studies (Clarke et al., 2005; Hodgson et al., 2013b; Roberts et al., 2014; Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018; Pettersson et al., 2019) report the effect of the sports drink on CHO-O. The metaanalysis shows that sports drinks have no impact on the CHO-O of athletes (WMD = 0.29; 95% CI, -0.06 to 0.65, P = 0.106). Heterogeneity is observed (I² = 97.4%, P < 0.001) (Figure 2A).

Sports Drinks Have No Significant Effect on Fat-O

All five studies (Clarke et al., 2005; Hodgson et al., 2013b; Roberts et al., 2014; Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018; Pettersson et al., 2019) report the effect of the sports drink on Fat-O. The analysis of the combined trials shows that sports drinks have no impact on the Fat-O of athletes (WMD = -0.074; 95% CI, -0.19 to 0.06, P = 0.297). Heterogeneity is observed (I² = 97.5%, P < 0.001) (**Figure 2B**).

Carbohydrate–Electrolyte Solutions Have a Significant Effect on CHO-O

In the three studies (Clarke et al., 2005; Roberts et al., 2014; Pettersson et al., 2019) on carbohydrate–electrolyte solutions, the sports drinks increase CHO-O (WMD = 0.47; 95% CI, 0.08–0.87, P = 0.020). Heterogeneity is observed (I² = 97.8%, P < 0.001). Caffeine (Hodgson et al., 2013b) (WMD = -0.02; 95% CI, -0.14 to 0.10, P = 0.752) and beetroot juice (Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018) (WMD = -0.26; 95% CI, -1.20 to 0.68, P = 0.106) have no impact on CHO-O (**Figure 2C** and **Supplementary Table 2**), but a meta-analysis could not be performed because only one trial reported about each sports drink.

Carbohydrate–Electrolyte Solutions Have No Significant Effect on Fat-O

Carbohydrate-electrolyte solutions (Clarke et al., 2005; Roberts et al., 2014; Pettersson et al., 2019) (WMD = -0.14; 95% CI, -0.31 to 0.03, P = 0.103; I² = 98.2%, P < 0.001) and beetroot juice (Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018) (WMD = 0.05; 95% CI, -0.01 to 0.11, P = 0.121) have no significant impact on Fat-O, while caffeine (Hodgson et al., 2013b) has a borderline effect on Fat-O (WMD = 0.05; 95% CI, 0.00–0.10, P = 0.050) (Figure 2D and Supplementary Table 2), but a meta-analysis could not be performed for caffeine and beetroot juice because only one trial reported about each sports drink.

Small Intake of Sports Drinks Has a Significant Effect on CHO-O

An intake of >300 ml of sports drink (Clarke et al., 2005; Hodgson et al., 2013b) had no impact on CHO-O (WMD = 0.11; 95% CI, -0.14 to 0.37, P = 0.378; $I^2 = 91.7\%$, P =0.001), but a smaller intake (<300 ml) (Roberts et al., 2014; Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018; Pettersson et al., 2019) did have an impact on CHO-O (WMD = 0.50; 95% CI, 0.12– 0.87, P = 0.009; $I^2 = 82.6\%$, P = 0.003) (Figure 2E and Supplementary Table 2). A larger intake (WMD = 0.02; 95% CI, -0.04 to 0.17, P = 0.584; $I^2 = 76.2\%$, P = 0.041) or a smaller

TABLE 1 | Characteristics of the included studies



intake (WMD = -0.12; 95% CI, -0.30 to 0.06, P = 0.175; $I^2 = 97.1\%$, P < 0.001) had no impact Fat-O (**Figure 2F** and **Supplementary Table 2**).

Subgroup Analyses

Supplementary Table 2 shows that the sports drinks have benefits on CHO-O in soccer (WMD = 0.24; 95% CI, 0.16–0.32, P < 0.001) and skiing (WMD = 0.41; 95% CI, 0.17–0.65, P = 0.001) but not in cycling (WMD = 0.23; 95% CI, -0.44 to 0.90, P = 0.501). Regarding Fat-O, sports drinks have an important benefit in skiing (WMD = -0.16; 95% CI, -0.19 to 0.06, P < 0.001) but not in soccer (WMD = -0.01; 95% CI, -0.04 to 0.02, P = 0.488) or cycling (WMD = -0.05; 95% CI, -0.27 to 0.17, P = 0.637).

Sensitivity Analyses

Figure 3 presents the sensitivity analyses for CHO-O and Fat-O, respectively. When omitting each study sequentially, the observed effects on CHO-O and Fat-O remained consistent.

DISCUSSION

There is a public interest in the accuracy of the claims of commercially available sports drinks about their benefits for substrate oxidation among athletes. Therefore, the aim of this meta-analysis is to examine the effects of sports drinks ingestion during high-intensity exercise for the CHO-O among athletes. The results indicate that, compared with a placebo, sports drinks show no significant improvements on CHO-O and Fat-O in athletes. Carbohydrate–electrolyte solutions increase CHO-O in athletes but not Fat-O.

It was suggested that carbohydrate-electrolyte drinks might improve athletic performances over consecutive running sessions in men (Davison et al., 2008) and hydration after exerciseinduced dehydration during running in men (Wong and Chen, 2011). On the other hand, carbohydrate-protein drinks were suggested to improve time to exhaustion during cycling in men (Saunders et al., 2004, 2007), to attenuate creatine kinase increase during cycling in men (Skillen et al., 2008), and to increase glycogen stores after cycling in men (Ivy et al., 2002; Berardi et al., 2006). A previous meta-analysis showed that the consumption of chocolate milk (which contains carbohydrates, proteins, and electrolytes) by trained athletes has no impact on the time to exhaustion, perceived exhaustion, heart rate, and serum levels of lactate and creatinine kinase (Amiri et al., 2019). On the other hand, two energy drinks containing carbohydrates and caffeine lead to superior VO2max and time to exhaustion compared with placebo, without effect on heart rate and blood lactate during running in men (Rahnama et al., 2010). Brink-Elfegoun et al. (2014) showed that male tennis players consuming carbohydrate-electrolyte sports drinks have no decline in physical performance over consecutive matches. Byars et al. (2010) examined the effects of a modified pre-exercise sports drink in men and women performing aerobic fitness and showed that the drink improves VO2max, time to exhaustion, and the estimated proportion of nonprotein fat substrate utilization, compared with placebo. The aim of this meta-analysis is to examine the effects of sports drink ingestion during highintensity exercise on CHO-O and Fat-O, two indicators of energy consumption among athletes. The results indicate that, compared with a placebo, sports drink showed no significant improvement on CHO-O and Fat-O in athletes. The other studies described



above, even though they did report performance benefits, do not report those two quantitative outcomes and are not included in the present meta-analysis. Therefore, the present meta-analysis cannot conclude that the energy drinks have no effect on sports performance but that they have no effect on metabolic indexes of energy production. Nevertheless, the present meta-analysis and the above studies seem to conflict in terms of conclusions because of the different outcome measures, i.e., quantitative vs. semiquantitative or qualitative. The sports drinks included in the meta-analysis could still have effects on other sports outcomes such as exhaustion perception, hydration, and recuperation, but those outcomes are not examined in the present meta-analysis. A meta-analysis revealed that carbohydrate drinks improve sports endurance (Vandenbogaerde and Hopkins, 2011), but it does not examine CHO-O. Future studies about sports drinks should be carefully designed by including quantitative metabolic indexes that could explain the semiquantitative/qualitative indexes of sports performance.

When considering each of the five studies included in this meta-analysis, three studies (Clarke et al., 2005; Roberts et al., 2014; Pettersson et al., 2019) actually show higher CHO-O with the sports drinks (in male soccer players, male cyclists, and male cross-country skiers, respectively), while two studies (Hodgson et al., 2013b; Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018) (in male cyclists/triathletes and male triathletes, respectively) show no effect. Nevertheless, the sensitivity analysis shows that the sequential exclusion of any one of those study significantly did not change the result of this meta-analysis. Similarly, two studies (Roberts et al., 2014; Pettersson et al., 2019) show a decrease in Fat-O with sports drink, one study (Hodgson et al., 2013b) report an increase, while two studies (Clarke et al., 2005; Garnacho-Castano et al., 2018) show no effect. Again, the exclusion of any one study does not change the conclusion.

The present study includes three types of energy drinks: carbohydrate-electrolyte, caffeine, and beetroot juice (mainly carbohydrates). The analyses of all three types together show that energy drinks have no impact on CHO-O and Fat-O, but the subgroup analyses show that carbohydrate-electrolyte drinks have a positive impact on CHO-O, while the caffeine drink decreases Fat-O. This is in agreement with the view that carbohydrate-electrolyte drinks improve repeated exercise performance in men after running (Davison et al., 2008; Kalman et al., 2012) and workout (Orru et al., 2018). A study also reported high CHO-O with the use of carbohydrate-electrolyte gels in male cyclists (Willems et al., 2011). The higher rate of CHO-O observed with carbohydrate-electrolyte consumption might be due to readily available source of energy that allows the preservation of glycogen stores, decreases fatigue perception, and prevents acute hypoglycemia (Coggan and Coyle, 1987; Bosch et al., 1994; Jeukendrup, 2004; Willems et al., 2011; King et al., 2018), with positive effects on time trials (Currell and Jeukendrup, 2008; Triplett et al., 2010) and power output (Currell and Jeukendrup, 2008; Rowlands et al., 2012). In addition, the use of transportable carbohydrates also increases the transport of water from the intestine, improving hydration (Jentjens et al., 2006; Jeukendrup et al., 2009; Jeukendrup, 2010; Jeukendrup and Moseley, 2010). Regarding caffeine, green tea extract can increase Fat-O (Hodgson et al., 2013a). Caffeine increases Fat-O in hepatocytes (Sinha et al., 2014), and caffeine increases exercise tolerance (Kumar et al., 2019). Therefore, future studies should examine individual types of energy drinks because of their different metabolic effects.

The results of this meta-analysis must be considered together with its limitations. First, the outcomes of interest might be biased by the studies we included since they were conducted at various institutions in different countries. The baseline characteristics of athletes from different studies and experimental trials in each study are different, as well. Second, the outcome parameters are estimated from the provided figures if the parameters are not reported in the original documents, probably introducing biases. Third, the amounts of beverage ingested are different in different studies. Fourth, all included studies are crossover studies. Even though the effect between two consecutive ingestion of sports drinks might be nonsignificant, there is a risk of carry-out bias. Finally, due to the population in each study being elite athletes, and the experimental trial included high-endurance exercise, the applicability of the results should be limited to such a population. In addition, the total number of participants in each study is small. Only 58 participants are included in our meta-analysis.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, compared with placebo, sports drinks show no significant improvement on CHO-O and Fat-O in athletes. Carbohydrate-electrolyte solutions increase CHO-O in athletes but not Fat-O. Randomized controlled trials with large sample sizes should be conducted to investigate the effectiveness of sports drinks for athletes during exercise.

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The original contributions presented in the study are included in the article/**Supplementary Material**, further inquiries can be directed to the corresponding author/s.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

XL and CW carried out the studies, participated in collecting data, and drafted the manuscript. AW, WW, and RG participated in the acquisition, analysis, or interpretation of data and drafted the manuscript. All authors contributed to the article and approved the submitted version.

FUNDING

This work was supported by the National Key Research and Development Project (Grant No. 2018YFC2000301: A Study on the Characteristics and Regularity of Health Status Changes in Chinese Population).

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors acknowledge the support of the National Key Research and Development Project.

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

The Supplementary Material for this article can be found online at: https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fphys. 2020.574172/full#supplementary-material

REFERENCES

- Alsunni, A. A. (2015). Energy drink consumption: beneficial and adverse health effects. Int. J. Health Sci. 9, 468–474. doi: 10.12816/0031237
- Amiri, M., Ghiasvand, R., Kaviani, M., Forbes, S. C., and Salehi-Abargouei, A. (2019). Chocolate milk for recovery from exercise: a systematic review and meta-analysis of controlled clinical trials. *Eur. J. Clin. Nutr.* 73, 835–849. doi: 10.1038/s41430-018-0187-x
- Berardi, J. M., Price, T. B., Noreen, E. E., and Lemon, P. W. (2006). Postexercise muscle glycogen recovery enhanced with a carbohydrateprotein supplement. *Med. Sci. Sports Exerc.* 38, 1106–1113. doi: 10.1249/01.mss.0000222826.49358.f3
- Bosch, A. N., Dennis, S. C., and Noakes, T. D. (1994). Influence of carbohydrate ingestion on fuel substrate turnover and oxidation during prolonged exercise. *J. Appl. Physiol.* 76, 2364–2372. doi: 10.1152/jappl.1994.76.6.2364
- Brink-Elfegoun, T., Ratel, S., Lepretre, P. M., Metz, L., Ennequin, G., Dore, E., et al. (2014). Effects of sports drinks on the maintenance of physical performance during 3 tennis matches: a randomized controlled study. *J. Int. Soc. Sports Nutr.* 11:46. doi: 10.1186/s12970-014-0046-7
- Byars, A., Keith, S., Simpson, W., Mooneyhan, A., and Greenwood, M. (2010). The influence of a pre-exercise sports drink (PRX) on factors related to maximal aerobic performance. J. Int. Soc. Sports Nutr. 7:12. doi: 10.1186/1550-2783-7-12
- Clarke, N. D., Drust, B., MacLaren, D. P., and Reilly, T. (2005). Strategies for hydration and energy provision during soccer-specific exercise. *Int. J. Sport Nutr. Exerc. Metab.* 15, 625–640. doi: 10.1123/ijsnem.15.6.625
- Coggan, A. R., and Coyle, E.F. (1987). Reversal of fatigue during prolonged exercise by carbohydrate infusion or ingestion. J. Appl. Physiol. 63, 2388–2395. doi: 10.1152/jappl.1987.63.6.2388
- Currell, K., and Jeukendrup, A. E. (2008). Superior endurance performance with ingestion of multiple transportable carbohydrates. *Med. Sci. Sports Exerc.* 40, 275–281. doi: 10.1249/mss.0b013e31815adf19
- Davison, G. W., McClean, C., Brown, J., Madigan, S., Gamble, D., Trinick, T., et al. (2008). The effects of ingesting a carbohydrate-electrolyte beverage 15 minutes prior to high-intensity exercise performance. *Res. Sports Med.* 16, 155–166. doi: 10.1080/15438620802103155
- Garnacho-Castano, M. V., Palau-Salva, G., Cuenca, E., Munoz-Gonzalez, A., Garcia-Fernandez, P., Del Carmen Lozano-Estevan, M., et al. (2018). Effects of a single dose of beetroot juice on cycling time trial performance at ventilatory thresholds intensity in male triathletes. *J. Int. Soc. Sports Nutr.* 15:49. doi: 10.1186/s12970-018-0255-6
- Higgins, J. P., and Green, S. (2011). "Recommendations on testing for funnel plot asymmetry," in *Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Review of Interventions. [Version 5.1.0]*, eds. J. P. Higgins and S. Green (London: Cochrane Collaboration).
- Higgins, J. P. T., Thomas, J., Chandler, J., Cumpston, M., Li, T., Page, M. J., et al. (2019). Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions Version 6.0 (Updated July 2019). London: Cochrane Collaboration.
- Hodgson, A. B., Randell, R. K., and Jeukendrup, A. E. (2013a). The effect of green tea extract on fat oxidation at rest and during exercise: evidence of efficacy and proposed mechanisms. *Adv. Nutr.* 4, 129–140. doi: 10.3945/an.112. 003269
- Hodgson, A. B., Randell, R. K., and Jeukendrup, A. E. (2013b). The metabolic and performance effects of caffeine compared to coffee during endurance exercise. *PLoS ONE* 8:e59561. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0059561
- Hornsby, J. (2011). The effects of carbohydrate-electrolyte sports drinks on performance and physiological function during an 8km cycle time trial. *Plymouth Stud. Sci.* 4, 30–49.
- Ishak, W. W., Ugochukwu, C., Bagot, K., Khalili, D., and Zaky, C. (2012). Energy drinks: psychological effects and impact on well-being and quality of life-a literature review. *Innov. Clin. Neurosci.* 9, 25–34.
- Ivy, J. L., Goforth, H. W. Jr., Damon, B. M., McCauley, T. R., Parsons, E. C., and Price, T. B. (2002). Early postexercise muscle glycogen recovery is enhanced with a carbohydrate-protein supplement. *J Appl Physiol.* 93, 1337–1344. doi: 10.1152/japplphysiol.00394.2002
- Jacobs, P., and Viechtbauer, W. (2017). Estimation of the biserial correlation and its sampling variance for use in meta-analysis. *Res. Synth. Methods* 8, 161–180. doi: 10.1002/jrsm.1218

- Jentjens, R. L., and Jeukendrup, A. E. (2005). High rates of exogenous carbohydrate oxidation from a mixture of glucose and fructose ingested during prolonged cycling exercise. Br. J. Nutr. 93, 485–492. doi: 10.1079/BJN20041368
- Jentjens, R. L., Underwood, K., Achten, J., Currell, K., Mann, C. H., and Jeukendrup, A. E. (2006). Exogenous carbohydrate oxidation rates are elevated after combined ingestion of glucose and fructose during exercise in the heat. J. Appl. Physiol. 100, 807–816. doi: 10.1152/japplphysiol.00322.2005
- Jeukendrup, A. E. (2004). Carbohydrate intake during exercise and performance. Nutrition 20, 669–677. doi: 10.1016/j.nut.2004.04.017
- Jeukendrup, A. E. (2010). Carbohydrate and exercise performance: the role of multiple transportable carbohydrates. *Curr. Opin. Clin. Nutr. Metab. Care* 13, 452–457. doi: 10.1097/MCO.0b013e328339de9f
- Jeukendrup, A. E. (2017). Training the gut for athletes. Sports Med. 47 (Suppl. 1), 101–110. doi: 10.1007/s40279-017-0690-6
- Jeukendrup, A. E., Currell, K., Clarke, J., Cole, J., and Blannin, A. K. (2009). Effect of beverage glucose and sodium content on fluid delivery. *Nutr. Metab.* 6:9. doi: 10.1186/1743-7075-6-9
- Jeukendrup, A. E., and Moseley, L. (2010). Multiple transportable carbohydrates enhance gastric emptying and fluid delivery. *Scand. J. Med. Sci. Sports* 20, 112–121. doi: 10.1111/j.1600-0838.2008.00862.x
- Kalman, D. S., Feldman, S., Krieger, D. R., and Bloomer, R. J. (2012). Comparison of coconut water and a carbohydrate-electrolyte sport drink on measures of hydration and physical performance in exercise-trained men. J. Int. Soc. Sports Nutr. 9:1. doi: 10.1186/1550-2783-9-1
- King, A. J., O'Hara, J. P., Morrison, D. J., Preston, T., and King, R. (2018). Carbohydrate dose influences liver and muscle glycogen oxidation and performance during prolonged exercise. *Physiol. Rep.* 6:e13555. doi: 10.14814/phy2.13555
- Koshimizu, T., Matsushima, Y., Yokota, Y., Yanagisawa, K., Nagai, S., Okamura, K., et al. (2012). Basal metabolic rate and body composition of elite Japanese male athletes. J. Med. Invest. 59, 253–260. doi: 10.2152/jmi.59.253
- Kumar, N., Warren, G. L., Snow, T. K., and Millard-Stafford, M. (2019). Caffeine ingestion with or without low-dose carbohydrate improves exercise tolerance in sedentary adults. *Front. Nutr.* 6:9. doi: 10.3389/fnut.2019.00009
- Orru, S., Imperlini, E., Nigro, E., Alfieri, A., Cevenini, A., Polito, R., et al. (2018). Role of functional beverages on sport performance and recovery. *Nutrients* 10:1470. doi: 10.3390/nu10101470
- Pettersson, S., Edin, F., Bakkman, L., and McGawley, K. (2019). Effects of supplementing with an 18% carbohydrate-hydrogel drink versus a placebo during whole-body exercise in–5 degrees C with elite cross-country ski athletes: a crossover study. J. Int. Soc. Sports Nutr. 16:46. doi: 10.1186/s12970-019-0317-4
- Rahnama, N., Gaeini, A. A., and Kazemi, F. (2010). The effectiveness of two energy drinks on selected indices of maximal cardiorespiratory fitness and blood lactate levels in male athletes. J. Res. Med. Sci. 15, 127–132.
- Roberts, J. D., Tarpey, M. D., Kass, L. S., Tarpey, R. J., and Roberts, M. G. (2014). Assessing a commercially available sports drink on exogenous carbohydrate oxidation, fluid delivery and sustained exercise performance. J. Int. Soc. Sports Nutr. 11:8. doi: 10.1186/1550-2783-11-8
- Rowlands, D. S., Swift, M., Ros, M., and Green, J. G. (2012). Composite versus single transportable carbohydrate solution enhances race and laboratory cycling performance. *Appl. Physiol. Nutr. Metab.* 37, 425–436. doi: 10.1139/h2012-013
- Salinero, J. J., Lara, B., Abian-Vicen, J., Gonzalez-Millan, C., Areces, F., Gallo-Salazar, C., et al. (2014). The use of energy drinks in sport: perceived ergogenicity and side effects in male and female athletes. *Br. J. Nutr.* 112, 1494–1502. doi: 10.1017/S0007114514002189
- Saunders, M. J., Kane, M. D., and Todd, M. K. (2004). Effects of a carbohydrateprotein beverage on cycling endurance and muscle damage. *Med. Sci. Sports Exerc.* 36, 1233–1238. doi: 10.1249/01.MSS.0000132377.66177.9F
- Saunders, M. J., Luden, N. D., and Herrick, J. E. (2007). Consumption of an oral carbohydrate-protein gel improves cycling endurance and prevents postexercise muscle damage. J. Strength Cond. Res. 21, 678–684. doi: 10.1519/00124278-200708000-00005
- Shearer, J., and Graham, T. E. (2014). Performance effects and metabolic consequences of caffeine and caffeinated energy drink consumption on glucose disposal. *Nutr. Rev.* 72 (Suppl. 1), 121–136. doi: 10.1111/nure.12124

- Sinha, R. A., Farah, B. L., Singh, B. K., Siddique, M. M., Li, Y., Wu, Y., et al. (2014). Caffeine stimulates hepatic lipid metabolism by the autophagy-lysosomal pathway in mice. *Hepatology* 59, 1366–1380. doi: 10.1002/hep.26667
- Sjodin, A. M., Forslund, A. H., Westerterp, K. R., Andersson, A. B., Forslund, J. M., and Hambraeus, L.M. (1996). The influence of physical activity on BMR. *Med. Sci. Sports Exerc.* 28, 85–91. doi: 10.1097/00005768-199601000-00018
- Skillen, R. A., Testa, M., Applegate, E. A., Heiden, E. A., Fascetti, A. J., and Casazza, G. A. (2008). Effects of an amino acid carbohydrate drink on exercise performance after consecutive-day exercise bouts. *Int. J. Sport. Nutr. Exerc. Metab.* 18, 473–492. doi: 10.1123/ijsnem.18.5.473
- Trexler, E. T., Smith-Ryan, A. E., and Norton, L. E. (2014). Metabolic adaptation to weight loss: implications for the athlete. J. Int. Soc. Sports. Nutr. 11:7. doi: 10.1186/1550-2783-11-7
- Triplett, D., Doyle, J. A., Rupp, J. C., and Benardot, D. (2010). An isocaloric glucose-fructose beverage's effect on simulated 100-km cycling performance compared with a glucose-only beverage. *Int. J. Sport Nutr. Exerc. Metab.* 20, 122–131. doi: 10.1123/ijsnem.20.2.122
- Vandenbogaerde, T. J., and Hopkins, W. G. (2011). Effects of acute carbohydrate supplementation on endurance performance: a meta-analysis. Sports Med. 41, 773–792. doi: 10.2165/11590520-000000000-00000

- Willems, M. E. T., Toy, C. D. J., and Cox, A. M. (2011). "Effects of pre-exercise ingestion of a carbohydrate-electrolyte gel on cycling performance (P28)," in: Proceedings of the Eighth International Society of Sports Nutrition (ISSN) Conference and Expo.
- Wong, S. H., and Chen, Y. (2011). Effect of a carbohydrate-electrolyte beverage, lemon tea, or water on rehydration during short-term recovery from exercise. *Int. J. Sport Nutr. Exerc. Metab.* 21, 300–310. doi: 10.1123/ijsnem. 21.4.300

Conflict of Interest: The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Copyright © 2020 Li, Wang, Guo, Wang and Wei. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.